

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

---

APPENDIX TO THE REPORT  
OF  
THE COMMISSIONERS.

---

VOLUME XVII.

---

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND  
TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, and Bombay,

WITH

APPENDICES.

---

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.

---



LONDON:

PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE  
By EYRE AND SPOTTISWOODE, LTD., EAST HARDING STREET, E.C..  
PRINTERS TO THE KING'S MOST EXCELLENT MAJESTY

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from  
WYMAN AND SONS, LTD., 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C., and  
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF; or  
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH; or  
E. PONSONBY, LTD., 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN;  
or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,  
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of  
T. FISHER UNWIN, LONDON, W.C.

1915.

[Cd. 7905.]

Price 10d.

# CONTENTS.

	PAGE
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	2
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	3
APPENDICES	64
	100

## List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission.

At DELHI, MONDAY, 3rd NOVEMBER 1913.		PAGE
W. MAXWELL, Esq., C.I.E., M.V.O., Director General of Posts and Telegraphs in India	- - -	3
C. H. McMINN, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Kangra Division, Punjab	- - -	13
S. C. SINCLAIR, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Derajat Division, Punjab	- - -	13
SRI RAM, Esq., M.A., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Punjab and North-West Frontier Province	- - -	13
N. W. VAUGHAN, Esq., Postmaster, Lucknow	- - -	23
At DELHI, TUESDAY, 4th NOVEMBER 1913.		
C. STREATFIELD-JAMES, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, United Provinces	- - -	24
I. C. THOMAS, Esq., M.V.O., M.I.E.E., Director of Construction, Telegraph Department	- - -	24
P. N. MITRA, Esq., Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, Lucknow Division	- - -	30
At CALCUTTA, MONDAY, 19th JANUARY 1914.		
G. W. SCHÖNEMAN, Esq., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office	- - -	33
R. W. HANSON, Esq., Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office	- - -	37
C. D. RAE, Esq., Deputy Postmaster, Calcutta	- - -	37
H. K. RAHA, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Midnapur Division	- - -	37
At CALCUTTA, TUESDAY, 20th JANUARY 1914.		
H. MAYSTON, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Bengal	- - -	40
J. C. SHIELDS, Esq., Acting Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, Telegraph Department	- - -	40
G. P. ROY, Esq., M.I.E.E., Officiating Director of Telegraphs, Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle	- - -	42
J. W. THURLEY, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (Traffic)	- - -	46
R. G. WALKER, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (General)	- - -	49
At MADRAS, TUESDAY, 27th JANUARY 1914.		
H. C. A. GOODALL, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Madras	- - -	54
J. G. MORGAN, Esq., Superintendent, Telegraph Department, Trichinopoly Division	- - -	55
J. F. RODRIGUES, Esq., Officiating Presidency Postmaster, Madras	- - -	57
P. A. KRISHNAMA CHARLU, Esq., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Madras	- - -	57
At BOMBAY, MONDAY, 9th FEBRUARY 1914.		
D. S. CAPTAIN, Esq., Superintendent of the Post Office, Poona	- - -	59
C. J. E. CLERICI, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Rajputana Division	- - -	59
D. J. MURTRIE, Esq., I.S.O., Presidency Postmaster, Bombay	- - -	59
R. T. GIBBS, Esq., Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles	- - -	62

# MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

## ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

## PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

## POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT

At Delhi, Monday, 3rd November 1913.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.  
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.  
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.  
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. N. HUTCHINSON, Esq., I.C.S., Postmaster-  
General, Punjab.

H. S. STYAN, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Punjab  
Circle.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

W. MAXWELL, Esq., C.I.E., M.V.O., Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs in India.

*Written statement relating to the Post Office of  
India.*

75,144. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—Recruitment for the posts of Superintendent is effected in two ways, namely:—

(1) by the selection of qualified persons not already in the service of the Department, and

(2) by the promotion of officials from the subordinate ranks of the Department.

In the former case, the person selected is generally required to join as a Probationary Superintendent and is not appointed to the lowest grade of Superintendent until he has shown his fitness in every respect for the position and has passed the prescribed departmental examination. It is necessary, however, on occasion to appoint a non-domiciled European direct to the lowest grade of Superintendent and, when this course is followed, the person selected is placed on probation and is not confirmed until he has justified his selection, and has passed the departmental examination.

In the latter case, the official chosen is permitted to appear at the departmental examination, and if he passes he is eligible for a Superintendentship. When appointed as such, he is placed on probation for an appropriate period, usually a year.

During the last five years 60 officers were appointed permanently as Superintendents, and of these 27 began their service as Probationary Superintendents, and 29 were promoted from the subordinate ranks of the Department, while only four were appointed direct to the Superintendents' grade. During the same period four Probationary Superintendents and one non-domiciled European appointed direct to the grade of Superintendent were found unfit for the position of Superintendent, and were removed from their appointments.

An Indian who seeks admission to the Department as a Probationary Superintendent must as a general rule be a graduate of a recognised university, and in the case of all other candidates for Superintendentships

the possession of adequate educational qualifications is insisted on. In all cases regard is paid to social standing and physical fitness.

I am of opinion that the selection of Superintendents should, as in the recent past, continue to be made approximately equally from among outsiders and officials in the subordinate ranks of the Department. There is also, I consider, no objection to the occasional appointment of a non-domiciled European direct to the grade of Superintendent, provided that it is laid down that the person selected cannot move up in the grade until he has passed the Departmental examination and has been confirmed.

Recruitment for the appointments of Postmaster is almost invariably effected by the promotion of officials from the subordinate ranks of the Department, such as sub-postmasters and clerks, who usually start their careers as probationers. The rare exceptions to this rule are the Probationary Postmasters, eight of whom, including five Indians, have been appointed as Postmaster since 1909, in order to improve the personnel in the higher appointments. No alteration is required in regard to the recruitment of Postmasters.

75,145. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**

—Ordinarily a Probationary Superintendent is not allowed to act as a Superintendent until he has had a year's training in the practical work of the Department, that is to say, he performs the actual duties of a Postmaster, accompanies a Superintendent on tour, and is given an insight into the general working of the Department in the office of a Postmaster-General, a Superintendent and a Postmaster. There is, however, no maximum period fixed after which a Probationary Superintendent must, as a matter of course, receive a Superintendentship if he has shown himself to be qualified in every way. During the last three years 16 Probationary Superintendents were permanently appointed as Superintendents, and the average period for which they remained Probationary Superintendents was two years and two months.

3 November 1913.]

MR. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

As stated under the head "Methods of recruitment," all persons appointed to the grade of Superintendent are required to serve on probation for an appropriate period, and the minimum period is six months.

I am of opinion that no change is called for in the present arrangements.

As regards Postmasters, I have nothing to add to my remarks under the head "Methods of recruitment."

75,146. (IV.) Conditions of Salary.—In paragraph 27 of my predecessor's letter\* No. 464-S.G., dated the 13th November 1912, to the Government of India regarding the proposed amalgamation of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments, copies of which have been supplied to the Commission, it has been proposed that the pay of Postmasters-General should be revised as shown below, so as to permit of the withdrawal of Exchange Compensation Allowance and the removal of all distinction between members of the Indian Civil Service and other Postmasters-General, and the abolition of the special rate of pay admissible for one Postmaster-General, 1st grade, if a member of the Indian Civil Service:—

Present.	Proposed.
1 on Rs. 2,250—50—2,500.	2 on Rs. 2,500.
3 on Rs. 1,750—50—2,000.	2 on Rs. 2,250.
6 on Rs. 1,500—50—1,750.	3 on Rs. 2,000.
(plus Exchange Compensation Allowance in the case of each officer personally eligible).	3 on Rs. 1,750.

The arguments in favour of this proposal are given in the letter referred to and I have no modifications to suggest.

The present rates of pay for Deputy Postmasters-General (including Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service and Sorting) and Assistant Directors-General do not, in my opinion, require revision.

The recent history with regard to the matter of improving the pay of Superintendents is given at pages 6, 7 and 8 of the Memorandum on the Indian Postal Service that was prepared for the Commission by the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry. The time-scale actually proposed by my predecessor was one under which each Superintendent would rise from a minimum of Rs. 200 to a maximum of Rs. 700 by annual increments of Rs. 20; and I have no objection to its introduction provided that there is an efficiency bar at the Rs. 500 stage.

If, however, the existing system of grades is to be maintained, the following scale would probably be suitable, subject to the condition that promotion to the highest grade should be made solely by selection:—

Grades.	Number of appointments.	Percentage on total.
Rs. 500—25—70	17	10
„ 400—20—500	34	20
„ 300—20—400	51	30
„ 200—20—300	69	40

The great defect in the existing grading is that a Superintendent is required to remain on a fixed pay of Rs. 200 for an indefinite period and again on a fixed pay of Rs. 250 for a similar period. Every Superintendent should, I think, be certain of drawing a pay of Rs. 300 after five years' service, and this would be the case whether the time-scale or the revised grading shown above were adopted. Personally, I would have no objection if the only change made were the substitution of a Rs. 200—20—300 grade for the present grades of Rs. 200 and Rs. 250, the highest pay for a Superintendent remaining at Rs. 600 for some time to come.

Orders have recently been issued raising the minimum pay of Probationary Superintendents to Rs. 100

\* Appendix I. (enclosure).

and I consider that this is sufficient, except in Burma, where there is a special rate of Rs. 150.

The following table compares the grading sanctioned for Postmasters at the present time with that in force in 1907:—

Grades.	Number of appointments in 1907.	Number of appointments at present time.
Pay—Rs.		
1,000—40—1,200	0	2
800—40—1,000	0	1
600—50—1,000	2	0
600—50—900	1	0
600—40—800	0	2
500—20—600	0	5
450—25—600	1	0
400—20—500	3	9
300—20—400	5	11
300—10—350	1	0
300	4	0
250—10—300	7	0
200—20—300	0	32
250	1	0
200—10—250	9	0
200	3	0
150—10—200	28	60
150	20	0
100—10—150	0	58
140	1	0
100—8—140	46	0
120	2	0
100	85	74
80	46	0
70	2	0
Average Pay	Rs. 146·9	Rs. 194

It will be seen that the position of these officials is incomparably better than it was six years ago, and I am of opinion that all that is now required is to effect small improvements in the grading from time to time as the necessity arises, and this is actually done.

75,147. (V.) Conditions of Leave.—There are no special leave rules for officers of the Post Office, and it is not necessary, in my opinion, that they should be treated differently in the matter of leave from other uncovenanted officers. I think, however, that the general leave rules need modification in certain respects.

Under the rules as they stand, an officer is eligible for the grant of three months' privilege leave after 33 months' uninterrupted service, and this amount of privilege leave is not increased if the officer remains on duty after the expiry of the 33 months. It seems to me that, while an officer who voluntarily postpones taking the privilege leave that is due to him deserves no special consideration, an officer who is called upon by the Local Government, in the interests of the service, to postpone such leave should be treated more liberally. My suggestion is that in the latter case the officer in question should be allowed to accumulate privilege leave beyond a period of three months, that is to say, the whole of the period for which he is required to remain on duty, over and above the 33 months which rendered him eligible for privilege leave for three months, should be treated as service counting for privilege leave at the accepted rate of one day's leave for every eleven days' service, and that he should be allowed, when his services can be spared, to take the whole of this accumulated privilege leave on full pay either by itself or in combination, if he wishes, with any other leave to which he is entitled under the leave rules.

My second suggestion is that the period of service which an officer subject to the European service leave rules must render before he is eligible for first furlough should be reduced from eight to five years.



3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

I also think that the maximum leave allowances prescribed in Articles 314 and 341 of the Civil Service Regulations as admissible under the European and Indian Service Leave Rules, respectively, should be abolished. Having regard to the fall in the value of money both in Europe and in India, it goes without saying that allowances that were considered sufficient twenty years ago cannot possibly be adequate at the present time. Moreover, a very large number of officers serving under both rules take furlough in order to obtain medical treatment in Europe, and on this ground, if on no other, they have a distinct claim for more liberal treatment on Government, who should be a model employer. I understand that at present the covenanted employes of some of the larger mercantile firms in India are treated much more liberally in the matter of leave and leave allowances than Government officers. It seems to me inequitable that the leave allowances of the more senior and, generally speaking, the more efficient, officers should be limited as they are at present, and there is little doubt, I think, that if the rule under which privilege leave can be combined with other leave had not been introduced, the necessity for increasing the maximum leave allowances would have been urged on Government many years ago.

Another respect in which I consider that the present leave rules require alteration is the amendment of the definition of the term "average salary" for the purposes of calculating the leave allowances for furlough. The term "average salary" is defined in Article 16 of the Civil Service Regulations as "the average of the salary which an officer has earned during so much of the three years preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave."

I consider that the leave allowances for furlough should be not less than half the salary earned by an officer during so much of the two years preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave.

**75,148. (VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—There are no special pension rules for officers of the Post Office and it is not necessary, in my opinion, that they should be treated differently in this matter from other uncovenanted officers.

I have only two suggestions to make with regard to the existing general rules and orders relating to pensions. The first is that every officer should be entitled to commute one quarter of his pension for a lump sum *unconditionally*. The present rules lay down, among other things, that an applicant for commutation of pension must undergo a rigorous medical examination and that the Local Government should not only decide whether the commutation would be to the distinct and permanent advantage of the pensioner or his family but should also fix the proportion (not exceeding one-fourth) of the pension that may be commuted so as to leave sufficient to maintain the pensioner in accordance with his station in life after retirement. I am of opinion that, if an officer has earned his pension, he has served Government in full and the fact, for instance, that his health is broken possibly through that very service, is not a sufficient reason for imposing harder terms of commutation upon him. The Government of India do not deal with pensions on the principles of life insurance, and I consider it very desirable that, if the pension system is retained, all officers should be at liberty to commute without conditions of any sort one-fourth of the pensions granted to them on retirement, unless it is possible to introduce in India a system of superannuation allowances and gratuities similar to that prescribed in the English Superannuation Act of 1909 (9 Edw. VII., ch. 10), under which the proportion of annual salary on which the scale of pension is calculated was reduced from one-sixtieth to one-eightieth and the grant of a lump sum equal to one-thirtieth of the annual salary and emoluments of a retiring officer multiplied by the number of years' service rendered was introduced.

My second suggestion is that the exception in Article 644 (b) of the Civil Service Regulations, under

which a period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished. I do not think that the ordinary principle that two officers should not count service in the same appointment should be applied in this case, and I consider it desirable that the whole of the service rendered in a qualifying appointment should count towards the grant of an additional pension. The pension is given for approved service in the appointment, and there should be no distinction between service in a furlough vacancy and service in a privilege leave vacancy.

My own personal opinion is that the pension system should be abolished altogether and replaced by a system of deferred pay which might take the form of payments by Government into an officer's account in the General Provident Fund. The main disadvantage of the pension system is, that if an officer who has completed the period of service qualifying for full pension dies before the pension is sanctioned, or before he has drawn it for a reasonable period, neither he nor his family reap any benefit from the long service rendered by him to Government in the expectation of the receipt of a pension at the end of that service. Other disadvantages are the difficulty of giving effect to a set of rules which must necessarily be complex and, therefore, troublesome; the impossibility of dispensing with the services of an officer who is found to be no longer efficient without inflicting great hardship; the inequality of the system of granting additional pensions to a few selected officers which is in itself more or less a lottery; and the unfairness of limiting the pension of a thoroughly efficient officer who has attained a high position to the same amount as it is admissible to an indifferent officer of a much lower standing. The last-mentioned disadvantage is most marked in the case of officers drawing more than Rs. 1,000 at the time of retirement, as from that stage onwards the pension admissible bears absolutely no relation to the average salary of an officer before retirement. Thus the pension admissible to an officer on Rs. 1,500 and an officer on Rs. 900 is exactly the same. The fall in the value of money to which I have already referred in connection with leave allowances must sooner or later be recognized by increasing the scale of pensions, and the whole position will have to be reviewed. It seems to me, therefore, that the time has arrived for considering whether a system cannot be devised which will not present the disadvantages described above and which will enable Government to gauge accurately their liability for non-effective charges.

**75,149. (VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—In the Post Office there is no division of the kind referred to above and no such division is, in my opinion, necessary. In addition to the appointments of Director-General and of Postmaster-General, ten per cent. of the total number of Superintendships are open to non-domiciled Europeans because it is considered essential that there should be a leaven of such persons in the ranks of Superintendents. With these exceptions, no appointment in the Post Office carrying a pay or minimum pay of Rs. 200 or more can be bestowed on a person who is not a Statutory Native of India, without the special sanction of the Government of India; and the occasions on which such sanction is asked for are very rare. In short, it may be said that, with the few exceptions mentioned above, appointments in the Post Office are practically reserved for Statutory Natives of India, and this, I think, is as it ought to be.

**75,150. (VIII.) Relations of the service with Indian Civil service and other Services.**—The recommendation of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87 was as follows, "That of the seven highest appointments in the Department at present filled by Covenanted Civilians, not less than three should ordinarily be filled by promotion within the Department."

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

In addressing the Secretary of State on the subject of this recommendation, the Government of India expressed themselves in the following terms: "We accept the proposal to fill three of the seven highest appointments in the Department by promotion of departmental officers who do not belong to the Indian Civil Service, subject to the reservation that it shall be acted on only when men fit for this promotion are available. The greatest importance is attached to this reservation, as in view of past experience and of the nature of the arrangements under which it is proposed to recruit for the lower supervising appointments it is considered by no means improbable that there may sometimes be no Deputy Postmaster-General, or other officer in the Department below the rank of Postmaster-General, fit for promotion to that rank. Indeed, the development of the Post Office and the number of points at which it is now being connected with other branches of the administration render it perhaps less likely than formerly that an officer trained solely in the Department will make a thoroughly efficient Postmaster-General."

The Secretary of State replied saying that the views expressed by the Government of India had his general concurrence.

The appointment of Director-General has hitherto been conferred on a member of the Indian Civil Service.

There are now ten appointments of Postmasters-General. Four of these are at present held by officers promoted from the ranks of the Department and probably there will soon be five, but the normal number is likely to be four. I am of opinion that it may properly be laid down that four Postmaster-Generals should be filled by officers of the Post Office whenever men fit in every way to hold the position are available, but I should have no objection whatever if the number were fixed at five, subject to the proviso mentioned.

**75,151. (IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The only other point which I consider it necessary to bring to the notice of the Royal Commission is a general question relating to the travelling allowance admissible for journeys on transfer.

It is definitely stated in Article 995 of the Civil Service Regulations that travelling allowance is given to officers to cover the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in travelling in the interests of the public service, but under Article 1094 *ibid.* any gazetted officer, or any non-gazetted officer whose salary after transfer exceeds Rs. 400 a month, is allowed on transfer from one station to another only double the fare of the class in which he is entitled to accommodation in the case of journeys by rail, the ordinary mileage allowance in the case of journeys by road, and his bare fare in the case of steamer journeys. I understand that in the United Kingdom, where transfers are few, the rules regulating the grant of travelling allowance on transfer are such that the State bears the whole of the actual expenses incurred by the officer concerned, and although I would not at present propose that Government should bear the whole of the actual expenses incurred by a married officer in breaking up his home at one station and installing himself at his new station, it appears to me to be only equitable that Government should relieve all its officers of a reasonable share of the heavy expenses caused by frequent transfers. The number of transfers in a service like the Post Office in India must of necessity be numerous, and there is no doubt that the present rules operate harshly on married officers and constitute a real grievance especially in the case of officers drawing less than Rs. 1,000 a month.

Under Article 1098 of the Civil Service Regulations, a non-gazetted officer whose salary after transfer does not exceed Rs. 400 a month is, if the transfer is to a station more than 200 miles distant and is made for a period exceeding three months, granted his actual travelling expenses, subject in the case of railway and steamer

journeys to a maximum of four full fares of the class of accommodation to which he is ordinarily entitled for himself and his family, three full fares of the lowest class for his servants, and the actual cost of carriage of his personal effects within certain specified maxima; and in the case of journeys by road to three times the ordinary mileage allowance admissible and the actual cost of carriage of his personal effects within the scale laid down for railway and steamer journeys.

I recommend that the condition regarding the minimum distance to be travelled should be expunged from this rule and that the rule as thus modified should be made applicable to all classes of Government officials on transfer.

*Written statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.*

**75,152. (I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—The orders under which recruitment to the superior service of the Indian Telegraph Department has hitherto been regulated are, briefly, that five-eighths of the superior establishment is to be recruited in England by the Secretary of State, one-fourth from the Engineering Colleges and Technical Institutes in India by the Government of India on the nomination of the Director-General, and the remaining one-eighth by the promotion of selected subordinates. These orders are, however, in abeyance at present pending a decision on the proposals for the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department with the Post Office submitted to the Government of India on the 13th November 1912,\* copies of which have been supplied to the Commission, and no officers have been appointed to the Imperial Service of the department since 1906 or to the Provincial Service since 1910.

The predominant feature of the scheme of amalgamation is the separation of engineering and traffic work, which is now performed by the same officers. Under the proposals in paragraph 41 of the scheme, practically the whole of the staff of officers required for the superior Traffic Branch will be recruited in India by the promotion of qualified upper subordinates and subordinates of the Telegraph Department, and the prospects of the latter will be incomparably greater than at present. They cannot now rise above Rs. 500 a month whereas, with the creation of a separate Traffic Branch, thirteen appointments ranging from Rs. 800 to Rs. 2,000 a month will be open to them and three-fourths of these appointments will probably be held by promoted subordinates if they are qualified.

The staff of superior officers proposed for the Engineering Branch is very small and it is of the greatest importance that this staff should consist of highly trained and carefully selected electrical engineers. Instead of recruiting about four officers annually for an establishment of ninety-six, recruitment will be limited to the requirements of a staff of only forty-six and, after the claims of the subordinates of the Engineering Branch have been met by the promotion of three of them to the superior grades, it is probable that only two telegraph engineer officers will be required annually. It has been proposed in paragraph 38 of the amalgamation scheme that these should be obtained by the selection by the Secretary of State of one officer yearly in England, the selection by the Government of India of one officer every alternate year from an Engineering College or Technical Institute in India, and the promotion every alternate year of a selected subordinate of the Engineering Branch of the Telegraph Department. In this branch also provision has been made for the improvement of the prospects of subordinates and, in addition to the large number of superior appointments in the Traffic Branch for which they will be eligible, subordinates of the Telegraph Department will also be given in the reduced superior engineering establishment the same number of appointments for which they were nominally eligible when the total promotion of subordinates to the superior grades was limited to one promotion every two years.

I do not consider any modification of these proposals necessary or desirable.

\* These orders have now been passed—*vide* Appendix I. See also Appendix VI.

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

75,153. (II.) **System of training and probation.**—The existing system of training is summarised in paragraph 39 of the letter\* to the Government of India on the subject of the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department and the Post Office. Owing to the cessation of recruitment it has not been necessary to apply the system for some years, but it has not proved satisfactory in the past and will no longer be suitable if amalgamation is sanctioned. The system of training and probation which I consider should be adopted for the future is stated in detail in paragraphs 39 and 41 of the letter referred to above, and it has been designed with the object of ensuring that only really suitable officers should be retained in the department, either as engineers or as traffic officers.

75,154. (III.) **Conditions of service.**—With the exception of pay and pension, the present conditions of service of superior officers of the Telegraph Department are generally identical with those of the ordinary civil establishments of the State, and I do not consider that any special conditions of service are necessary. It appears desirable, however, to introduce a rule, similar to that in force in the case of the Indian Police, that all officers appointed, either in England or in India, direct to the Engineering Branch or the superior Traffic Branch under the arrangements for direct appointments proposed in paragraphs 38 and 41 of the scheme of amalgamation of the Telegraph Department and Post Office, should be liable to removal from the service if they fail to pass the departmental examinations specified in paragraphs 39 and 41 of the amalgamation scheme within the prescribed period, or if, within the same period, they are found unfit for the duties of the service to which they are appointed. It should also be ruled that any officer so removed will, if he was appointed in England, be furnished with a free passage to England provided he utilises such passage within three months from the date of removal.

75,155. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—So far as I am aware, the salaries admissible to superior officers of the Telegraph Department under the resolutions of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913-918-115 and No. 4276-4280-133, dated the 2nd February 1910 and 4th June 1912, respectively (copies of which were furnished to the Commission with the memorandum prepared by the Department of Commerce and Industry), are generally suitable and I have no modifications to suggest beyond those proposed in section III. of the amalgamation scheme. The proposals contained therein include a recommendation that, as the post of Director-General of Telegraphs has been abolished, the pay of the highest appointment in the Engineering Branch of the amalgamated departments, which will in future be the highest ordinarily attainable by a telegraph engineer, should be fixed at Rs. 2,750, partly to compensate officers now serving in the Telegraph Department for the loss of the Director-Generalship and partly to provide reasonably good prospects for telegraph engineers appointed in future. The prospects of the superior officers now in the department and of future entrants will be sufficiently favourable if the proposals referred to above are accepted in their entirety, and I am not in favour of making any other changes. The question of the eligibility of officers of the Telegraph Department for the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs is referred to in section VIII. of this memorandum.

75,156. (V.) **Conditions of leave.**—[Mr. Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—see paragraph 75,147.]

75,157. (VI.) **Conditions of pension.**—The ordinary maximum pension which can be earned by superior officers of the Telegraph Department is the same as for other uncovenanted services, viz., £437-£10-£0 after 25 years' service, but this maximum may be specially increased in certain exceptional circumstances to £525 or £613 in the case of officers appointed in England. In

reply to the memorials which were submitted to them in 1908 by the Imperial Service officers of the Telegraph Department the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry stated on the 15th September 1909 that "the question of the revision of the rates of pension of various services under Government, including the Telegraph Department, is at present under the consideration of the Government of India; but a considerable time must elapse before a final decision is likely to be arrived at on the subject."

There is no great inducement at present for an able officer to remain on in the service after he has earned his maximum pension; but in the past there has not been any marked tendency on the part of Telegraph Department officers to leave the service before they are 55 years of age and are obliged to go under the age clause, and the Provident Fund to which officers of the Telegraph Department are permitted to subscribe places these officers at the time of retirement in a more or less similar position to that in which members of the Indian Civil Service are placed by the contribution made by them towards pension. Recruitment for the superior service of the Telegraph Department has been stopped for some years, and it is not possible to form any well-founded opinion on the question whether the present scale of pensions is sufficiently attractive to induce suitable officers to join, and remain in, the Telegraph Department.

[The remainder of Mr. Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—see paragraph 75,148.]

75,158. (VII.) **Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—In the resolution of the Government of India in the Public Works Department, No. 156 T. E., dated the 25th August 1892, it was laid down, when the Provincial Service for the superior establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department was first formed, that the candidates for appointment to that service should be natives of India as defined in Statute 33, Vict. c. 3. s. 6, and this limitation still holds good. As I have pointed out in section I (paragraph 75,152) of this memorandum, recruitment for the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department is at present suspended. When recruitment is re-opened there will be no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the superior Traffic Branch and, except in the case of the very small number of appointments to be made in England which is provided for in paragraph 41 of the amalgamation scheme, vacancies in this branch will be filled by the appointment of selected subordinates of the Indian Telegraph Department whether Europeans or non-Europeans. The majority of the officers selected will naturally be statutory natives of India and I do not consider any restriction desirable.

In the case of the Imperial and Provincial Services of the Engineering Branch the only racial restriction will be that candidates for the latter service should be statutory natives of India. Non-Europeans will be eligible for selection in England by the Secretary of State for appointment to the Imperial Service provided they have received the particular training which will be specified by the Government of India when they request the Secretary of State from time to time to make appointments to this service, and domiciled Europeans will be eligible for appointment to the Provincial Service provided they are statutory natives of India and have received a suitable professional training.

As regards the working of the existing system of division of the superior establishment into Imperial and Provincial Services, I would invite attention to paragraph 18 of the resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913-918-115, dated the 2nd February 1910, referred to in chapter III. of the memorandum prepared for the Commission by the Department of Commerce and

\* Vide Appendix I. (enclosure).

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

Industry. The officers recruited for the Provincial Service in the past were not selected with special reference to their suitability for the Telegraph Department and had not as a whole received the technical education and training which will be demanded from candidates for the Provincial Service of the Engineering Branch when recruitment is re-opened. This will, however, be remedied under the new system of nomination by the Director-General, and I do not consider that there will be any difficulty in selecting suitable candidates in India to fill the single direct appointment to the Provincial Service every alternate year which has been proposed in paragraph 38 of the amalgamation scheme. As I have already stated in other sections of this memorandum I do not consider it necessary to make any changes in the pay or general conditions of service of the Provincial Service of the Telegraph Department.

75,159. (VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—There is, I believe, a feeling among a number of the officers of the Telegraph Department that their prospects have been materially injured by the decision that an officer

outside the Telegraph Department should hold charge of the department and there is naturally some resentment that this officer should have been a member of the Indian Civil Service. No orders have, however, been passed that the appointment of Director-General of the amalgamated department of Posts and Telegraphs should invariably be held by a member of the Indian Civil Service and there is no reason, so far as I am aware, why at any time in the future the appointment should not be filled by an officer of the Telegraph Department if he is considered fit for it and is the most suitable person available.

So far as I am aware, the relations of the officers of the Indian Telegraph Department with other services are quite satisfactory and I have no remarks to offer in this connection.

75,160. (IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—[Mr Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—see paragraph 75,151.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL called and examined.

75,161. (Lord Ronaldshay.) The witness said that he joined the Indian Civil Service in the year 1891 and served about nine years in Lower Bengal, entering the Post Office as Postmaster-General. He had been on special duty twice in regard to Telegraph matters, once in connection with the Amalgamation scheme and again on the Telegraph Committee. For a short time, in the year 1908, he acted as Secretary in the Finance Department, and in 1909-10 was Secretary in the Department of Commerce and Industry. In February last he took over the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs from Sir Charles Stewart Wilson, having already acted for about nine months in the year 1908 as Director-General of Posts. A despatch on the subject of the Amalgamation scheme had recently been sent to the Secretary of State, and he understood that practically no modification had been made in the proposals submitted to the Government of India. Care had been taken to safeguard the interests of all officers. The appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs would disappear from the cadre, but he presumed the joint appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs would be open to the whole Service. In the Telegraph Department, so far as the subordinates were concerned, he considered that much greater prospects would be open to them. Any apprehensions which might exist with regard to the scheme he believed to be groundless, so far as the officers in the Service were concerned.

75,162. The Post Office side of the department would be recruited in India as it had been up to the present; there was no proposal to alter anything with regard to the Post Office. On the Telegraph side there would be two sections, one for engineering work containing a strong element recruited in England; and the other for traffic work, mainly recruited in India. About one-fourth of the latter would be recruited direct, and three-fourths by promotion from the subordinate ranks. Again, on the Post Office side there would be one single Service as at present, whilst on the Telegraph side the Superior Service would be divided into an Imperial and a Provincial Branch. It was proposed to reduce the proportion of the Imperial Branch by one-eighth, the present proportion being five-eighths. The Provincial Branch of the Telegraph Service would run parallel to the Imperial Service; it would not be an inferior service in any way. The duties would be precisely the same, the only difference being that the officers in the Provincial Service would receive two-thirds of the pay of the officers in the Imperial Service, on the ground that their expenses were not so great.

75,163. With regard to the Post Office of India, there were five Postmasters in the larger cities who drew salaries at special rates, which approximated to

those of officers holding administrative rank. Below that came the first class or gazetted Postmasters, and below that the second class or non-gazetted Postmasters. The dividing line between the first class and the second class was a salary of Rs. 300, those drawing over that amount being gazetted and those drawing under non-gazetted. The number of first class officers was fixed with reference to the work of particular offices, and the pay of each office similarly depended on the volume of its work as was the case in the United Kingdom.

75,164. With regard to recruitment for the higher appointments of Postmaster until recently all officers had passed ordinarily through the lower ranks, but in the last four or five years the experiment had been tried of appointing a few men from outside at Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 200; it was not possible however to say yet whether the experiment had been justified. The change was made owing to the difficulty, which was occasionally experienced, of finding really efficient officers for the appointments. There was in practice an efficiency bar at the Rs. 500—Rs. 600 grade. Although it was not laid down in the rules, cases at that stage were very carefully scrutinised. For the highest appointments, that of Postmasters of the big towns, there was again selection. Twenty-five was the usual age limit for recruitment, but as a rule the men came in at about 21 or 22. The majority of Postmasters entered as subordinates, and the matriculation standard was generally the test. Men, however, who were brought in on the Rs. 150 to Rs. 200 grade were expected to have higher qualifications, some of them being graduates. The selection of the recruits was made by the Postmaster-General, who submitted the nominations to the Director-General, and frequently the latter saw the men himself. The men were on probation for a considerable time before being permanently appointed. Practically all Postmasters entered through the subordinate grade, being appointed as vacancies occurred. The work was gradually becoming more complex, and better men were needed than in the past. He did not advocate going any further than making an occasional appointment of an outsider, as if too many were appointed in the higher grades it would tend to lower the quality of the men who came in in the lower grades. He did not think it would be desirable to make a distinction between first class and second class Postmasters, with a view to recruiting a certain proportion of the former by direct appointment, because he thought the men who came in direct would probably be above their work. The highly educated man as a rule did not care for a Postmastership.

75,165. With regard to the distinction between Postmasters and Superintendents, postmasters as a rule were in charge of one large office in a big town, while the Superintendent was in charge of a large area,

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

probably extending over a couple of districts. The function of the Superintendent was the inspection and control of many offices, while the Postmaster's function was the direct control of one office. It could happen that a higher paid Postmaster might be inspected and reported upon by a lower paid Superintendent, but the inspection in such a case was confined practically to audit work and there was not in practice much friction. A Postmaster could become a Superintendent, but that did not often happen and was not encouraged, because the duties of the two classes were quite different. Superintendents were recruited to a certain extent from Postmasters, but not largely. The subordinates who became Superintendents were more frequently Inspectors, *i.e.* Assistants to Superintendents. Generally speaking, the two branches were kept in separate watertight compartments. The five prize Postmasterships had been occasionally filled in the past by Superintendents when it was thought there was no man of the right stamp amongst the Postmasters, but that was avoided as far as possible.

75,166. With regard to the large preponderance of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the higher grades of Postmasters, he thought that was due to the fact that in the past Indians were not recruited nearly so freely as was the case now. In the year 1893 out of 35 such appointments only 8 were held by Indians, but now there were 34 out of 76. As a rule, highly educated Indians were not very anxious to take up Postmasterships, they preferred a Superintendent's appointment. The large preponderance of Anglo-Indians and Europeans in the higher grades of the Postmaster's branch would tend to decrease, though not perhaps very rapidly. There were certain places where it was desirable to have an Anglo-Indian or European, as, for instance, military stations. He had heard no complaint on the part of the Indian public on the subject.

75,167. Turning to the Superintendents, the witness said that officers of that rank were appointed partly directly and partly by promotion from the lower ranks. Recruiting was determined by the number of vacancies likely to occur. The number of Superintendents in a circle was about 18 to 20 and probably there would be 2 vacancies in 5 years, and arrangements were made accordingly. Direct recruits were seen by the Postmaster-General, who sent up the names to the Director-General, who made the appointment. The men were kept on probation for about two years as probationary Superintendents, and afterwards on probation for about one year as Superintendents. The age limit was 25, but as a rule the men came in at about 22. There was no minimum fixed, but a man seldom became a graduate before he was 21 years of age. Sometimes a man was appointed on account of his physical qualities or family connections, though he might not be a graduate, and he thought it desirable to retain that discretion. It was not exercised in one case out of twenty, but it was a discretion worth having. No difficulty was experienced with regard to the nominations. The Postmaster-General, the Director-General, and probably the Deputy Director-General practically formed a Board of Selection. He should not recommend any form of competitive examination to take the place of the present system, because the men selected for the Service were now very good.

75,168. Generally speaking, the educational qualifications of Anglo-Indians were not as high as those of Indians, but they were sufficiently good for the purpose, and such officers had certain qualities, such as the power of controlling men, in a higher degree than Indians. In choosing Anglo-Indians it was better to take a man whose social standing was such that he would be received by ordinary society, and thus would be in a position to speak to a Magistrate or Deputy Collector on any matter of business on equal terms. Occasionally a mistake was made as to this, but he did not think there was much serious practical difficulty in deciding about a candidate's social standing, and he thought it well to leave it vague as at present.

75,169. He was against fixing any proportion for Indians. If a proportion were fixed, it might in practice work out to less than the department actually would give. Roughly speaking the numbers of Indians and Europeans holding higher appointments were now

about equal, but if it were found necessary to vary the proportion that would be done. The half and half position had not been worked out by any rule. There was power, he added, to appoint 10 per cent. of the Superintendents from non-domiciled Europeans, and this was necessary principally for field service. It was occasionally necessary to send half-a-dozen men on field service during war, and Indians were very averse to going, and domiciled Europeans were not very keen. The non-domiciled Europeans selected were men who could mix on equal terms with British officers. The 10 per cent. proportion had been found sufficient and at present the figure was rather below that. The men were often the sons of officers serving in this country. No particular examination was prescribed for them, but they were interviewed and their general education enquired into. They came in at about the same age as the other men in the service, and at present amongst them were two University men, a B.A. of Cambridge and a B.A. of Oxford.

75,170. There was no fixed age for promoting subordinates, to higher appointments but as a rule a man was not promoted after the age of 40, on account of the fact that a Superintendent had to be an active man ready to move about on the shortest notice.

75,171. With reference to the preponderance of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the higher grades, there was also the tendency there for the number of Indians to increase. Up to the 1st November the number of Indian Superintendents was 103 out of 172, so that since the 1st July the number of Indians had risen by 3, and he anticipated that that process would go on, although not so markedly in the future. In 1893 out of 118 Superintendents only 34 were Indians, so that there had been a marked tendency towards multiplying Indians in those appointments. He would not recommend reserving any definite proportion of the higher posts for Indians and he did not think that the Indians themselves considered that too few of them were employed.

75,172. The witness did not consider that putting probationary Superintendents on a single list instead of on circle lists would be a practical arrangement. At present in Bengal, when a vacancy of Probationary Superintendent occurred, a Bengali was appointed, but if he were on a general list, and it was his turn for promotion, and a vacancy of Superintendent occurred in the Panjab, he would have to go to the Panjab to take up the appointment, and consequently men would be rarely serving in their own Province. As things were, a Bengali served in Bengal, a Madras in Madras, and so on. The only men for whom a general list would be suitable would be Anglo-Indians or Europeans, who did not so much mind to what part of the country they went. There would be objection to taking a man from Bengal and appointing him to the Panjab or *vice versa*. Moreover the man would probably rather resign the Service than go.

75,173. For promotion to the higher administrative posts men could be drawn not only from the Superintendents but also from the Postmasters, but in practice the Superintendents obtained most of the appointments.

75,174. Indian Civil Service officers came into the department as Postmasters-General. They were usually put on special duty for a month or two before they finally took up their appointments, but a period of six months was really necessary. The maintenance of a certain number of Indian Civil Service officers was essential. In practice 12 men were required to fill the 10 Postmaster-Generalships, as 2 officers were ordinarily on leave. Two of these posts were to be given to the Telegraph Department, but one would be an acting appointment. It would work out, therefore, that there would ordinarily be 5 departmental, 2 telegraph, and 5 Indian Civil Service Postmasters-General, but 2 of the 12 would be acting men. At the present moment there were 3 Postmasters-General absent on leave.

75,175. Witness desired to remove all distinctions, as far as salaries were concerned, between the Indian Civil Service officers and the officers of the Post Office. The only distinction now made was in the first grade Postmaster-Generalship, which in practice was not



3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

open to a non-Civilian. That was not fair. No difficulty was anticipated in attracting suitable civilians. They were usually taken from a Province where promotion was bad, and one of the great attractions was the privilege of being allowed to spend five months every year in the hills. Also the officers had more independence and freedom than they had under a Local Government.

75,176. The Indian Civil Service officers received exchange compensation, but under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed to do away with that in pursuance of the admitted policy of Government.

75,177. With regard to the salary of the higher officers, he thought the pay of the Director-General had been put a little low, and that in the future it would probably have to be raised. It was an appointment at least as important as that of a Secretary to the Government of India, and should carry the same pay, namely, Rs. 4,000.

75,178. The witness then said that the graded system of Superintendents kept officers waiting unduly in the Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 grade, and he agreed with the arguments used by his predecessor in favour of a time-scale. It would be impossible, however, to apply a time-scale to Postmasters, so long as the system of fixing the pay according to the importance of the office was followed. When new appointments were created much discussion with the Government ensued, and sometimes a good deal worse was allowed than what was proposed. There was no satisfactory rule. The present Rs. 250 grade was an iniquity. Under the present graded system also an officer's prospects depended to a large extent on the expansion of the Service and the retirement of other officers. There would have been a very serious outcry on this subject but for the fact that the department had expanded so rapidly. If a time-scale were introduced for Superintendents, probably Rs. 500 would be fixed as the stage at which an officer's career would be examined to see if he should rise above that amount. There was no difficulty in obtaining and keeping suitable Indians for Superintendents on the present pay, but there had been a marked falling off in the personnel of the domiciled Europeans.

75,179. With reference to leave and pension proposals, witness thought the present rule with regard to the travelling allowance granted on transfer was unfair. Officers should not be put to any extra expense owing to a transfer but should be treated as a Government officer was treated in the United Kingdom, where practically all expenses were paid. In no circumstances when an officer was on tour, should he get less than the daily allowance. In certain circumstances men received considerably less than the minimum daily allowance. If an officer had to make a journey from Delhi to Rohtak for the purpose of inspection, he would either get single first class fare or the daily allowance minus the railway fare, whereas if he remained in the place he was halting at he would get Rs. 4. The rules for travelling by river steamer were excessively hard. It would be an easy thing to put the matter on a proper basis and see that an officer obtained his daily allowance and steamer fare.

75,180. With regard to the Telegraph side of the department, under the Amalgamation Scheme there would be a small engineering establishment consisting of 46 officers, 4 of whom would fill administrative posts, 24 executive posts, and 18 would be under training as Assistants. In order to maintain that cadre 2 officers would be recruited every year. The figure was, he believed, arrived at by the Public Works Department after actual experience extending over many years; they found that about one officer was required for every 24. The leave reserve was included in the 18 Assistants. The proposal was that one of the recruits every year should come from England and one from India, the Indian recruit being alternately appointed direct and promoted from the Subordinate ranks. The recruits would be officers who had undergone a technical course in a College in India, and would presumably be the best available technical men who could be obtained from any of the Colleges. He could not say how the selection was made in England,

but he believed there was a Board at the India Office, consisting of the Telegraph Adviser to the Secretary of State and one or two officers of the department who happened to be on leave.

75,181. On the subject of promotion from the Subordinate Service to the new Provincial Service, he allowed that the officers selected would ordinarily be in the second and not the first grade of Deputy Superintendents, as those in the latter would be generally too old. It was desired to promote men who had not passed 40, and who gave promise of doing really well. A man who had served in the subordinate ranks until after 40 as a rule was not a success in the higher appointments. He admitted that this would not be popular with the first grade men, and that they might be discouraged by seeing their juniors go over their heads, but it was impossible to avoid this if men of a suitable age were to be taken. If there was any exceptional merit in an officer who was above the age, a special case would, no doubt, be made out in his favour. In practice, under this scheme the specially promising men would get a chance of promotion at a comparatively young age. A man of Rs. 370 as a Deputy Superintendent, when transferred to the superior service, would draw Rs. 370 whether he was an Assistant or a Superintendent, because there was no distinction in the pay; it was all on one time scale. The fact that such a man was brought into the gazetted ranks would be a sufficient reward, and he would go up on the time-scale. In fixing the Rs. 370 stage it had been borne in mind that if too many of such officers were brought in at too high a stage they would block the other officers, but it was thought that bringing them in not higher than the Rs. 370 stage would be doing as little damage to the others as possible.

75,182. The Upper Subordinate Service, the witness went on to say, bore the same relation to the Superior Service in the Telegraph Department as the Provincial Civil Service bore to the Indian Civil Service, except that the Provincial Civil Service officers held gazetted rank and the others did not. So far as the Provincial Service officers in the Telegraph Department were concerned, they did exactly the same work as the other officers of the Superior Service, the only difference being the name and the pay, and they were all on one list for the purpose of promotion. There had been a listed arrangement in force for about two years, but it was withdrawn and the men were put on the same list again. The object of the distinction was to get men cheap, but that could be done without calling them Provincial Service officers, and he did not think the term Provincial Service was appropriate in the Telegraph Department, seeing that the officers were not in any sense confined to a Province and therefore he should like to abolish the term.

75,183. With regard to the possibility of having two separate time-scales, one for Assistant Superintendents and one for Superintendents, there had been no difficulty since the time scale was introduced on the score of blocks in promotion in the Telegraph Department, and he thought having two scales might lead to some practical difficulty. He did not think it would be easier to select the men if there were two separate compartments, and with two separate compartments there would be some necessity to revise the pay. At present an Assistant Superintendent in charge of a division, provided he was continually in charge, was allowed to go up the scale, but if there was a compartment for Assistant Superintendents directly he got to the top of that compartment he would not be allowed to draw his increment. If the two systems were in force a good deal of modification would be necessary in all the rules. For instance, the Superintendent of Telegraphs in Delhi would lose considerably if there were two compartments in the time-scale.

75,184. With reference to the traffic side of the Telegraph Department, three-fourths would be recruited in India, possibly seven-eighths. The Department had asked to be allowed to recruit one-fourth from outside. In the main recruitment would be by the promotion of subordinates, and the only direct recruitment would be the one-fourth. One reason for

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

not bringing in a larger proportion of direct recruits was that special knowledge was required for the Department and it took 4 or 5 years to learn the work.

75,185. The witness considered that the officers of the Superior Traffic Branch should be borne on one list for the whole of India and that was the intention. Although officers might be on a general list it was very often possible to keep them in their own circle by taking a little trouble about it. In the Post Office very few transfers were necessary.

75,186. With reference to probation and training in the Telegraph Department, study leave ought to be compulsory. Unless an officer went to England once in every seven years to bring himself up-to-date, he would not be an expert. For instance, most of the officers knew very little about wireless telegraphy unless they had gone to England and studied it. He thought six months' study leave every seven years would not be excessive, and he would go so far as to say that it should be compulsory in the case of a Scientific Department.

75,187. On the subject of the Guarantee Fund the witness handed in the reply\* which had been given to a question in Council on the subject, and this would furnish all the information the Commission needed.

75,188. A part of the fund was used for excellent purposes. In the year 1908 he asked the Government to be allowed to use one-fourth of the surplus for grants to widows and orphans of men who had not received a pension. He proposed to ask the Government to give him a freer hand in that matter and ultimately he would probably ask to be allowed to use the whole surplus.

75,189. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said that he did not lay stress upon the Postmaster-General being allowed to live five months in the hills, but it was one of the great attractions of the service. He thought it would be preferable if he took only three months in the hills, and it might be varied a little according to the Province. In one case two months might be sufficient and in another case four months might not be excessive. It was found as a rule that the Postmaster-General did a fair amount of work while in the hills. As a rule the officer took with him two clerks, whose travelling allowance and batta were not paid by the Government. One of the conditions of living in the hill station was that there should be no expense to Government.

75,190. With regard to non-domiciled Superintendents, their pay on first entering the service was occasionally Rs. 200, but more frequently Rs. 100 a month. Men occasionally came from England to take up the appointments and there were a great number of applications from men in India, planters and officers of other services, for posts for their sons. It had been considered whether the appointments should be made through the Secretary of State, but it was thought on the whole that the existing arrangement was working fairly well. There would be practical difficulties in getting a man through the Secretary of State, and on the whole it was believed that the department was in a better position to judge what was required. Officers selected in England might think the prospects were a good deal better than they were, and it was now possible to explain clearly to the officer what he had to expect if he came out. The proportion of non-domiciled men in appointments turned out of the service might be about one in seven, no larger than that of other classes. The number of appointments of non-domiciled Europeans in the year would be something under one for the whole of India. There were 17 vacancies open to them, and the vacancies were about 3 every 4 years. The higher officers were always on the look-out for a likely man, and if such a man was found, although he might be in Madras, it was possible he would be appointed to the Punjab. Care was taken as far as possible not to appoint men

who were not fit for the post. Waiting lists of appointments were kept by each Postmaster-General, and as the Director-General went round the country two or three times in the year he was told precisely how the matter stood and interviewed the likely men. Very often officers in India applied to the Director-General asking him to interview their sons for the appointments. There was no language test at present. Sometimes men were required for Burma or the Punjab as necessity arose, and it would be hard to propose any such test. For the work of the Post Office a knowledge of the vernaculars was important, and most of the officers picked up what was necessary, but he did not think it would be fair to impose any specific test on the non-domiciled European because he was more liable than any other class to move from one Province to another.

75,191. On the subject of allowances, witness thought it would be right that a man should receive his net daily allowance, *plus* his fare. He admitted that the allowance was given partly to cover the expenses of locomotion, but in practice there was a great deal of incidental expense which was not taken into account in the regulations, and the cost of moving had increased tremendously in the last few years. A man halting for a day received the same as he would receive if travelling by train. When living in camp he did not think the daily allowance meant an actual loss to the Indian officers, but he was not sure that the same would apply to the domiciled or non-domiciled Europeans. At the same time the desire was to raise no distinction but to treat them if possible alike. The expenses of transfer were so considerable that in any case it was only right a man should get a larger allowance than when ordinarily travelling. Transfers were particularly hard on the officers of the Telegraph Department, because as a rule they went from one Province to another, and the transfers in the Telegraph Department were more numerous than in any other Department owing to the fact that the staff was so small and had to be continually shifted about, especially in the leave season. In the Post Office it was not so bad, as there was always a local man to put in.

75,192. The work of Superintendents of the Post Office was hard. There was no absolute rule as to how much travelling Superintendents should do, but they were certainly expected to be out inspecting about 156 days during the year, and some probably were out for 200 days. Half their work was inspection, and in some divisions all the travelling had to be done by road. The Superintendents disposed of complaints received from the public, and sometimes the Postmaster-General himself would send complaints to them for investigation. When they went to larger towns they had to interview merchants and leading people in order to make convenient postal arrangements. They had also to do a certain amount of auditing, checking of receipts, and so on. The lowest pay of a Postmaster in complete charge of a post office might be Rs. 15 in a small branch office, which had only 20 letters a day to deliver, and there were post offices in which the number of letters was as low as three. In some cases the Postal Service was performed by the School-Master, but there might be cases where there was a Telegraph Office and a small number of letters, and in such cases the pay was generally Rs. 20 or Rs. 25. There was a certain difficulty in filling up appointments at the present time in the Central Provinces, but it was not very serious and was being met by improving the pay. The department had a very free hand in regard to raising pay up to Rs. 300 a month, and could not only raise the pay but could create new appointments to that amount.

75,193. The promotion of Postmasters to Superintendents did not very often occur, the Superintendents generally coming from Inspectors, some of whom rose from the ranks while others were recruited direct. Nineteen of the Punjab Inspectors were graduates and some of them were quite capable of becoming Superintendents. In the higher appointments, Deputy Postmasters-General and Assistant Directors-General were appointed from the Superintendents' grade chiefly.

\* *Vide* Appendix II.

3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

75,194. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that the Superintendent was regarded as a higher officer than the Postmaster. The salary of a first grade Superintendent was less than the salary of the highest Postmaster, but there were about 20 higher appointments, which were open to the Superintendents. Places above Rs. 1,000 were generally given to Superintendents. Postmasters in the three higher grades might be posted to the higher positions, if they were considered fit for the posts, but it was not the same class of work which they had been doing. The work of the Deputy Postmaster General more nearly resembled the work of Superintendents, and as a rule the Superintendent was more suited for the work. Many of the men rose from the ranks, having entered as clerks, and some were taken at Rs. 50 or Rs. 60. Graduates were often recruited for the Superintendent's posts. The positions were not advertised, as men could be obtained without doing so, and the matter was perfectly well known. Whenever there were Superintendentships vacant no advertisements or notifications were issued informing the public, and no intimation was given to the Heads of Colleges. As a rule, unsuccessful candidates for the Provincial Civil Service came straight to the Post Office.

75,195. With reference to his preference for the present system of recruitment over any system of competition witness said that ten years ago it was a system of competition. The Local Governments in Bombay and other Provinces held examinations for their Provincial Civil Services, and the Post Office would take the first or second man who just failed to get these posts. The men obtained by the present system were quite as good as the men obtained in those days. No particular educational qualification was prescribed for men in grades below Rs. 100, but an endeavour was made to obtain men who had passed the Matriculation, and of course higher pay was given to men with better qualifications.

75,196. With reference to Indians not being willing to take Postmasterships, he thought the whole Service looked upon the Superintendent's as the higher appointment. Many Superintendents, if asked to go as Postmasters on rates above their own salary, would not take the position, considering it to be an inferior appointment. The Postmaster had large pecuniary responsibilities, and this made the work unpopular.

75,197. (*Mr. Ramsay Macdonald.*) The witness said there was no objection to advertising a little more widely the fact that selections would be made for appointments. He preferred selection to competitive examination, and special care was taken in the Post Office to find good men. He believed the Post Office took more trouble in the matter of selection than most other Departments; there was a long period between the vacancies to find the best men and the Postmasters General were always looking out for the most suitable men. The selection was quite impartial, although considerations such as that of family came into the matter. Probably three-fourths of the probationers passed on the first occasion, but sometimes the man was appointed direct and went up for examination within 4 or 5 months, and it could be hardly expected he would pass. But where a man had had a reasonable chance the directly appointed man would pass in three cases out of four. He thought it would be a pity to limit a man to only one chance, because an officer might be good in three of the subjects, and deficient in one or two, and he preferred the present arrangement of giving the men a second chance.

75,198. As to the length of the probation, the longest period a man had remained as a probationary officer was about three years. The average of 2 years and 2 months had been taken from 16 cases extending over a period of three years. The matter, of course, depended upon vacancies, and if fewer were recruited the average period would be shorter. It did not depend only on success in departmental examinations but also depended on vacancies. The two years and two months did not mean the time taken by a man to pass the departmental examination; the average time for passing that examination was probably about 15 months.

75,199. Witness thought the efficiency bar was fairly effective in the department, and an officer's

career was always reviewed before he was transferred from one grade to another. There was no great difficulty in applying the bar.

75,200. As to pension, he had not worked out what the financial effect of his proposals would be. The power of an officer to commute one-fourth of his pension for a lump sum was given now in many cases on medical certificate, and witness desired a man should have the right to commute a portion of his pension whether he was fit or unfit. He associated himself with what the service had said on the subject.

75,201. With reference to his suggestion that the exception in Article 644 of the Civil Service Regulations, under which a period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished, witness pointed out that if he were an officer officiating as Postmaster-General for another officer who was qualifying for that pension, the period during which he officiated did not count in his period for qualifying for his own pension. His service qualified him for his own special pension of Rs. 5,000, but he would be officiating in an appointment which was entitled to Rs. 6,000.

75,202. It was possible it might be advantageous to the service to give men an earlier pension, but he thought the Decentralisation Committee's Report had suggested powers of turning out any inefficient officers. As a matter of fact, the tendency for officers was to stay on, and his trouble was occasioned by people imploring him to give them extensions. No doubt the service generally would like to go after 25 years, but if a man was fit he was only too glad to stay on.

75,203. On the subject of holidays, witness said the Post Office, especially the railway mail service, had a considerable amount of Sunday service for which they had no compensation and he should like to give them 50 per cent. extra privilege leave, the leave being allowed to accumulate up to three months. There was the possibility of paying people for Sunday duty, but that would be a very troublesome matter and lead to much difficulty.

75,204. On the subject of the Guarantee Fund he did not think the service really desired the surplus to be under the control of a Committee. He doubted whether any officer, who would give evidence before the Commission, had actually paid Rs. 5 into the Fund. He thought the men would be glad if a larger sum was given for widows and orphans; otherwise he did not think they were very much interested in the matter.

75,205. With reference to fines being handed over to the Committee for the general benefit of the subordinate staff, he would not object to that being done, but thought it would be a little difficult to work. The fines might be used for the purpose of helping Institutes, and so on, and in the course of time something like that might be suggested. In the Post Office there had been no great tendency to form mutual clubs and societies, but if that tendency occurred the idea of utilising money in that way might be considered.

75,206. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness thought that Government would appoint what they considered to be the best officer as Director-General whatever service he came from. With regard to selections made for Superintendents, the best men were selected for the position, everything being taken into consideration. In the Punjab it might be necessary to appoint a Hindu and Muhammadan alternately, with occasionally a Sikh or domiciled European. It was also necessary to see that a certain number were appointed from particular communities. That was one of the objections to examination. In Bengal the same course was taken. With regard to Indians not being adequately represented in the higher appointments in the Post Office, that matter was gradually being set right. He had received no complaints on the subject, nor had he seen much about it in the Press with regard to the Post Office. In fact, there had been frequent testimony that Indians had received very fair treatment in the Post Office. In the lower ranks of the Superintendents' grade there were more Indians now than there were before, and they would get promotion in course of time.



3 November 1913.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL.

[Continued.]

75,207. In the Telegraph Department, under the new scheme, one appointment would be made in England and one in India, and in the latter case the appointment would be from the subordinate service in one year and in the next year would be a direct appointment. The men would be taken from the engineering colleges or any college up to the proper standard at the time. The mode of selection would be nomination by the Director-General to Government, the Director-General seeing who were the best men available. The selection of an unfit man recoiled on the Director-General himself, as an inefficient man was of very little use and had to be turned out. Personally witness would not object if the so-called Provincial Service received the same pay as the others, if they went through the same technical training in England. There was no pending proposal to send candidates to England, but if there was any intention of levelling up the pay to that of the Imperial Officers the men would have to be equally competent, and in order to become equally competent it would be necessary for them to go to England, and take a proper course for two or three years. If they did that he had no objection to their getting the same pay.

75,208. One of the most important parts of the duty of the Superintendent was interviewing the public, and he kept diaries which were inspected by the Postmasters-General.

75,209. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness reiterated what was stated in his written answers that if an Indian was selected by the Secretary of State he should be eligible for the Imperial branch and should be paid full pay. The distinction made should depend entirely on the qualifications obtained in England. He would be willing to promote to the Imperial branch a man who was in the Provincial Service and went to England on study leave, but preferred that he should qualify straight away. In the Provincial branch in future he would have men recruited who were fit for the Imperial Service, or not recruited at all. The lower class work of the Telegraph Department could be done by the men already there, namely, the Deputy Superintendents. If the pay of Europeans and Indians was made the same, officers from Europe should get some special concessions as regards leave and as regards the expenses of their voyages to and from their homes. On a basis of that kind he did not see why an Indian officer doing the same work

as another officer should not get the same pay, but he would make a training in England essential, and he thought the same would apply to the Civil Service also.

75,210. With reference to commutation and the right to commute, he meant commutation of actual, earned pension. An officer who retired should have the right to say that he wanted a lump sum in place of one-fourth of the pension; in other words, he would treat one-fourth of the pension as deferred pay. In England officers formerly received two-thirds pension whereas in India they received only half their pay or less. The pension should be more favourable in India. In the case of an officer of high rank the pension was nothing like half his pay. Commuting less than one-fourth would not be sufficient in India. The pension arrangements in India were not sufficiently liberal, and had no relation to the pay the man had drawn or the services he had done. He had two objections, the quantity of the pension and the method by which it was paid, and he laid special stress upon the second one, by which a man's family might be deprived of the whole of it. He wished to see a change in both directions, or in the alternative a General Provident Fund, which he should prefer. If an officer died after 15 years' service his wife would then get something, whereas at present she was left destitute. He should like to see a fairly liberal Provident Fund to which the Government would contribute something like the amount the officer paid in himself.

75,211. (*Mr. Hutchinson.*) The witness said that in default of a time scale he would be willing to have a Rs. 200—20—300 grade in place of the Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 grades and keep the graded system. The existence of the Rs. 250 grade was a tremendous hardship and it ought to be done away with.

75,212. (*Mr. Styan.*) The witness considered that two appointments of Postmaster-General for the Telegraph Department were as many as could be expected, seeing that there was no obligation to provide any at all, and he thought it was about as many as suitable officers would be available for at one time. Practically, the appointments were those which would otherwise have been given to civilians, and he thought on the whole the civilian would be the more efficient officer. In the circumstances of the case, however, the department had said they would provide two.

(The witness withdrew.)

C. H. McMINN, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Kangra Division, Punjab;  
S. C. SINCLAIR, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Derajat Division, Punjab; and  
SRI RAM, Esq., M.A., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Punjab and North-West Frontier Province.

[These three witnesses were examined together upon the written statement given below.]

*Written statement on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters of the Post Office.*

75,213. **Introductory.**—The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs circulated to all Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service in India, a letter dated the 28th February 1913, from the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, inviting the expression of a corporate opinion upon nine indicated heads from the Gazetted Officers of the service or from a section of them. The Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General circulated this letter among the Deputy Postmasters-General, Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters throughout India.

These officers held local meetings in their respective circles, and deputed delegates to represent them at a central conference for all India at Nagpur. This conference sat on the 21st, 22nd, and 23rd April 1913. There were present as delegates, Deputy Postmaster-General, Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, who presided, 18 Superintendents, and 2 Postmasters. In addition, two other officers, namely, Mr. W. A. Roussac, Inspector-General, Railway Mail Service, Western Circle, and Mr. R. W. Hanson, Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, attended the conference.

At that conference the following Resolutions (paragraphs 75,214–23) confined to the nine heads referred to above, were passed:—

75,214. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—1. That recruitment into the grades of Superintendents should be from two sources—(a) by direct nomination of candidates outside the department; and (b) by selection from departmental officials, in the proportion of two to one.

2. That the existing system of giving 10 per cent. of the appointments of Superintendents to non-domiciled Europeans is suitable and may continue.

3. That there should be one general list of candidates who have passed the departmental examination from which Superintendents should be appointed.

4. That Indian candidates, selected for the appointment of Superintendent, be ordinarily graduates of a recognised University, and that domiciled European candidates be ordinarily undergraduates, both classes of officers being men of good social standing.

5. That 1st class Postmasters should be recruited from postal officials, subject to the condition that they pass the departmental examination and that there be no restriction as to the age at which they can go up for the examination.

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR, AND SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

75,215. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—6.\* That the minimum period of training of Probationary Superintendents should be one year, and maximum two years.

7. That non-domiciled Europeans selected for the Superintendents' cadre should be graded with Probationary Superintendents irrespective of their pay.

75,216. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—8. That the diem allowance of Superintendents of post offices should be raised from Rs. 4 to Rs. 5, that of Superintendents of the Railway Mail Service to Rs. 6 a day, and that when a Superintendent, Railway Mail Service, proceeds on deputation outside his jurisdiction he should be allowed travelling allowance at the same rate as Superintendents of post offices. That when an officer is transferred he should in case of railway journeys be allowed four fares in lieu of double the fare of the class he is entitled to at present.

9. (a) That 1st class Postmasters, in the grades of Rs. 300–400 and Rs. 400–500, should get first class travelling allowance on transfer; (b) that Probationary Superintendents should get first class travelling allowance.

10. That in divisions, where it is necessary, tents should be supplied to Superintendents of post offices and tentage granted.

11. Wherever difficulty is experienced by Superintendents in obtaining suitable house accommodation at a reasonable rent, Government should provide accommodation charging rent at the usual rates.

75,217. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—12.† That the pay of a Probationary Superintendent be fixed at Rs. 150 for the first year, and Rs. 200 thereafter.

13. That Superintendents of Post Offices be placed on the following graded scale of pay:—

1st grade - Rs. 750 to 850	- 20 appointments.
2nd " - " 600 to 700	- 25 "
3rd " - " 450 to 550	- 40 "
4th " - " 300 to 400	- 50 "
5th " - " Fixed at 250	- 37 "

That if Government should be unable to accept this proposal or to sanction the number of appointments specified in each grade, Superintendents be placed on a time scale of pay starting from Rs. 300 and rising to Rs. 900 at the end of 22 years as shown below:—

1st year - Rs. 300	12th year - Rs. 575
2nd " - " 325	13th " - " 600
3rd " - " 350	14th " - " 630
4th " - " 375	15th " - " 660
5th " - " 400	16th " - " 690
6th " - " 425	17th " - " 720
7th " - " 450	18th " - " 750
8th " - " 475	19th " - " 780
9th " - " 500	20th " - " 810
10th " - " 525	21st " - " 840
11th " - " 550	22nd " - " 870
23rd year - Rs. 900.	

14.‡ That the pay of Postmasters of gazetted rank should be improved so as to put them on a par with Superintendents.

15. That the pay of Deputy Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General should be Rs. 1,100–80–1,500.

75,218. (V.) **Conditions of Leave.**§—16. That Privilege leave be allowed to accumulate up to four months.

17. That, in view of the fact that officials of the Post Office do not get complete relaxation on Sundays and gazetted holidays, 45 days' privilege leave be granted on 10½ months' service.

18. That so long as an officer has earned title to leave by the necessary service, he should be allowed to avail himself of it, provided that he can be spared; and there should be no proviso that he must be on duty for a specified period after return from last leave before he can be granted leave again.

19. That officers of the Post Office, drawing pay at Rs. 500 and above, should be granted the privilege of European Service leave rules.

20. That three years' furlough, leave on medical certificate or on private affairs spent in India should count as service for pension.

75,219. (VI.) **Conditions of Pension.**—21. That in consideration of the hard and tedious work and the very few holidays enjoyed by the officials of the Post Office they should be allowed full retiring pension after a service of 25 years, and full invalid pension after a service of 20 years.

22. That for the purpose of calculating pension and leave allowances the average emoluments for two years be taken into account instead of for three years.

23. That the maximum amount of ordinary pension admissible to officers of the Post Office should be Rs. 6,000 per annum.

24. That the option of commutation of pension up to a limit of a quarter of the pension earned should be allowed as a matter of course, irrespective of the conditions set forth in the Government of India, Finance Department, Order No. 585–E. B. dated 27th September 1912. In the case of officials dying before retirement, the commuted value of a quarter of the pension which would have been admissible at the time of death should be paid to the widow and children, the nearest exact age of the officer, subject to a minimum of 50 years, being taken into calculation for determining the commuted value of pension.

25. That extension of service should not be granted to an officer who has attained the age of 55 years.

75,220. (VII.) **Such Limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—26. That there is at present no limitation to the employment of non-Europeans in the service and that it is neither necessary nor desirable to introduce any limitations.

75,221. (VIII.) **Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—27. That, as recommended by the Public Services Commission of 1886–87, not less than 50 per cent. of the highest

\* Mr. SINCLAIR submitted the following as an amendment in place of Resolution 6:—"That Probationary Superintendents who fail to pass the Departmental test after two attempts should be removed from the list."

† Mr. SINCLAIR submitted the following as an amendment in place of Resolution 12:—"That the pay of a Probationary Superintendent appointed by direct nomination should be fixed at Rs. 200 per mensem during his probationary period, while that of Probationary Superintendents selected from Departmental officials should be fixed at Rs. 150 per mensem for the first year and Rs. 200 per mensem thereafter."

‡ Mr. VAUGHAN, who was examined after Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair, and Sri Ram had withdrawn, submitted the following as an amendment for Resolution 14:—

(a) That the pay of Postmasters of gazetted rank should be improved so as to put them on a par with Superintendents.  
(b) That as Postmasters of gazetted rank are required to pass the same Departmental examination as Superintendents of Post Offices, the appointments of both should be interchangeable.  
(c) That the pay of Presidency Postmasters, i.e., officers in charge of the three Presidency Post Offices, should be the same as that of Deputy Postmaster-General and Inspectors-General, with whom they should also be graded.

(d) That Postmasters of gazetted rank and Superintendents of Post Offices should alike be eligible for the appointments of Deputy Postmasters-General, Inspectors-General, and Presidency Postmasters.

§ Mr. McMINN desired an addition to be made to the Resolutions under this head and wrote as follows:—

"The addition which I propose is in connection with the rules for leave out of India and is to the effect that such leave should be calculated as commencing from the date of departure from the nearest port of embarkation and as expiring on the date of return to such port. The object is to equalise, in the case of all officers, the amount of leave out of India. At present an officer who is stationed far up country is at a disadvantage in this respect. I trust that I am not out of order in making this suggestion, and as I have been selected to appear as a witness before the Commission, I shall be glad to give in full my reasons for the proposal."

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMinn, S. C. Sinclair, and Sri Ram.

[Continued.]

posts in the department should be reserved for departmental postal officers.

28. That the Telegraph Service should not have any claim to or be given any of the highest posts in the Post Office. It cannot be urged too strongly that it would be most unfair to give any of these posts to officers of the Telegraph Department.

29. That in view of the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, it is apprehended that the opportunities of postal officials rising to higher appointments might be diminished. This conference therefore prays for an assurance that the prospects of promotion of officials of the Post Office will not be interfered with in any manner.

75,222. (IX.) Any other points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding Heads.—30. That fines recovered from officials and the interest of the Guarantee Fund should be used for the benefit of postal officials, and that a committee representing all grades of the service be appointed for considering the best means of utilising the amount.

31. That the rules for the encouragement of the study of languages of different tribes in India should be made applicable to Superintendents of post offices and Postmasters, and that they should be allowed to appear at examinations and earn rewards under those rules.

75,223. The following (paragraphs 75,224–31) is submitted in explanation of such of the Resolutions as may appear to need comment or elucidation. The Resolutions are dealt with seriatim.

75,224. (I.) *Methods of Recruitment* (see also paragraph 75,214). Subhead 1.—The fixing of the proportion of two to one in the filling up of vacancies among Superintendents is suggested for four reasons: (i) because it is desirable that the interests of the nominated candidates should be secured as against unlimited selection from a large number of subordinates, (ii) because it is desirable that there should be a steady infusion of new blood into the Department, (iii) because adherence to the principle that only one in every three appointments shall be filled by selection from the Department would tend to determine the existing system of keeping Probationary Superintendents waiting unduly for preferment, and (iv) because, while at present the departmental subordinate has open to him two avenues of preferment, by either of which he can rise to the highest posts, namely, by adhering to the postmasters' line and working his way up by that means, or by entering into the Superintendent's grade; the Probationary Superintendent has only one avenue of preferment, and the suggested limitation would have the salutary effect of equalising the chances of promotion alike for nominated and departmental officers.

Subhead 3.—The general list here advocated is asked for on the ground that, at present, promotion in the various circles for qualified, departmental candidates and Probationary Superintendents is frequently local with the anomalous result that an officer of very junior standing gets preferment in his local circle to the grave disadvantage of his seniors in other circles. A rule abolishing circle promotion for such officers and promoting all officers from one general list according to seniority, no matter where employed, would act beneficially.

75,225. (II.) *Training and Probation* (see also paragraph 75,215). Subhead 7.—While exceptional circumstances require that non-domiciled Europeans should occasionally be drafted into the Superintendents' cadre by selection and appointment in India, the interests of the service require that they should pass through a period of training before being entrusted with the duties and responsibilities of a Superintendent. These are many and onerous. The seniority of a Probationary Superintendent dates only from the time of his appointment as a substantive Superintendent; it is manifestly unfair that a non-domiciled European wholly unacquainted with the duties of his post, should supersede a Probationary Superintendent who has, by actual training qualified himself for the post of a Superintendent.

75,226. (III.) *Conditions of Service* (see also paragraph 75,216). Subhead 8.—The proposal for an increase in daily, or halting, allowance is based upon the fact that owing to the general rise in the cost of living away from head-quarters the present allowance is insufficient.

The idea at present is that a Superintendent is entitled to a minimum daily allowance of Rs. 4. In many instances this is pure theory and nothing more. An illustration will suffice. A Superintendent travels by rail over a distance for which the railway fare is Rs. 2-8-0. If he claims his daily allowance of Rs. 4, from that is deducted his railway fare, so that he receives only a nett sum of Rs. 1-8-0. He has, however, the option of abandoning his daily allowance and of charging instead double railway fare or Rs. 5. From this sum is deducted the cost of a single railway fare, or Rs. 2-8-0, so that he receives a nett sum of Rs. 2-8-0 instead of Rs. 4. If, therefore, an officer starts by rail at 8 A.M., on a Monday, and, having reached his destination, say, at 10 A.M., works the whole of that day and the day following (Tuesday), and then leaves by rail at 11 P.M., on a further similar journey, arriving at his next destination, say, at 1 A.M., on the second day (Wednesday), he draws nothing for his actual halting expenses either for Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday, because of the rule that no daily allowance is claimable unless an officer halts from midnight to midnight at each station. If he claims his double first-class railway fare for the journey on the Tuesday, the result is that he is out of pocket for his actual halting expenses. And in this respect the officer has in truth no election. He cannot claim his Rs. 4 daily allowance for the second day (Tuesday). He has no alternative to charging the double fare less the usual deductions, and thereby ensuring his own financial loss. The claim is, accordingly, made that in no circumstances should an officer draw less for travelling allowances than his minimum daily allowance which, it has already been proposed, should be increased from 4 to 5 rupees a day. It may be added that a Superintendent of post offices is by departmental rules compelled to make shorter halts while on tour than other District Officers, and this places him at a financial disadvantage as seen above.

The Superintendent, Railway Mail Service, stands in a worse position than the Superintendent of post offices. He is treated as a railway officer, but is not given corresponding facilities, such as a specially fitted-up carriage with a kitchen and accommodation for servants. He draws a daily allowance of Rs. 4 if absent from head-quarters for over six hours. Being confined to the railway line, he has to pay for his meals in the dining cars and at the various railway refreshment rooms on the line, and on a journey involving an absence of over six hours from head-quarters these charges aggregate to an appreciable amount. He has in addition to pay for his sleeping accommodation, portage, &c. He is, therefore, entitled to ask that his daily allowance be increased from Rs. 4 to Rs. 6.

Subhead 9 (a).—The position of a first-class Postmaster is in certain respects anomalous and invidious. He is not a first-class officer within the meaning of the Civil Service Regulations. His rank of first-class Postmaster is a departmental distinction. All Postmasters whose salaries are above Rs. 300 are first-class Postmasters. They are also Gazetted Officers. They are classified, however, for purposes of travelling allowances as second-class officers.

No Gazetted Officer is entitled to claim an allowance for transporting his family on a transfer. The first-class Postmaster whose pay ranges from Rs. 300 to Rs. 500 falls within the purview of this forfeiture. The honour of the Gazette operates on him as a fine.

Concurrently, as a second-class officer, the first-class Postmaster receives on transfer only a double second-class fare for himself, one-half of which is expended on the purchase of a ticket. The other half does not cover even the incidental expenses of the journey.

Subhead 9 (b).—The Probationary Superintendent is not infrequently sent on deputation. The cost of

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

locomotion is always constant and is never decreased to suit the Probationer's rank or purse. It seems but fair, therefore, that he should be provided with first-class travelling allowance.

*Subhead 10.*—In many localities which an officer is compelled to visit there is no accommodation, and tents are there absolutely necessary. In other localities the various bungalows belonging to the Public Works Department or other Departments are not open as of right to the officers of the Post Office. In Divisions where tents are necessary either from permanent want of proper buildings or when the permanent buildings are occupied, it is submitted that these officers should be provided with the cost of their upkeep and transport by the Department, as allowed by Article 1042 of the Civil Service Regulations.

*Subhead 11.*—In other Government Departments provision is made for house accommodation at a fixed rate; postal Superintendents often experience serious difficulty in securing accommodation. If Government were either to build or acquire suitable houses this would be obviated.

75,227. (IV. *Conditions of Salary* (see also paragraph 75,217.)

*Subhead 12.*—A Probationary Superintendent now starts on a pay of Rs. 80 or Rs. 100 a month. This scale is obviously too low to attract candidates of the required qualifications or to enable them to live suitably after entering the Department. In other Departments—e.g., the Telegraph, Finance, Railways—no probationer starts on less than Rs. 150, and that is conceived to be the minimum on which an officer can support himself, and then only with difficulty. The proposed increase after the first year represents more nearly the lowest living wage.

*Subhead 13.*—Originally the pay of Superintendents in the lowest grade was fixed at Rs. 200. At the date of the Public Service Commission in 1887 the pay of the highest grade was Rs. 400–500, and the number of appointments in all grades was 120. The Sub-Committee of the Public Service Commission at that time prefaced their report with the following observations:—“It will be apparent that not only are the “several branches of business undertaken by the “Postal Department of a more or less complicated “character, but that they demand even in the lowest “grades strict integrity and some intelligence, in “most grades education, method, energy, and tact, “and in the superior grades these qualities in a high “degree combined with administrative ability. In “some grades the necessity for economy has com- “pelled the adjustment of salaries on a scale which, “perhaps, errs on the side of inadequacy, but which “has not entailed a sacrifice of efficiency.” However, it was not until 1904 that a new grade of Rs. 500 to 600 was introduced. At the present day there are 172 appointments, which are distributed thus:—

	Rs.	Rs.	Appointments.
1st grade	500 to 600	- - -	11
2nd „	400 „ 500	- - -	33
3rd „	300 „ 400	- - -	48
4th „	250	- - -	48
5th „	200	- - -	32

The scale of pay and grading are to-day totally inadequate. Since they were fixed the cost of living has risen greatly, and in consideration of this the salaries of officers holding similar rank in other Government Departments has been revised and increased. It is, therefore, necessary that the present grading and scale of pay of Postal Superintendents should be correspondingly improved. There has been of late years an enormous expansion in the business of the Post Office which has considerably augmented the labour and responsibilities of Superintendents. Concurrently with its increased scope the revenue of the Department has grown proportionately. It is not unfair to ask that increased duties and responsibilities should meet with the adequate remuneration from a flourishing Department which is now working at a large profit in spite of numerous substantial concessions to the public, which have made the Indian postal

service the cheapest in the world. A statement showing the increase of business within the past 25 years is attached and marked A.

Whilst on the one hand the business and financial prospects of the Department have grown annually, the prospects of the Superintendents have been lessened and their hopes of advancement checked.

In 1887 the number of higher appointments held by uncovenanted officers in the Post Office was 19, being 15·8 per cent. of the total number of Superintendents. To-day the number of these higher appointments is 20, but the number of Superintendents has risen to 172, the percentage of posts to candidates being reduced to about 11·6. The prospects of the Superintendent are, therefore, worse now than they were 25 years ago. (See statement.)

	1887.	1912.
Postmaster-General - - -	1	4
Deputy Postmasters-General - - -	9	5
Assistant Directors-General - - -	3	4
Presy. Postmasters - - -	3	3
Inspector-General, R.M.S. - - -	0	4
Comptroller P.O. - - -	1	0
Deputy Comptroller P.O. - - -	1	0
Assistant Comptroller P.O. - - -	1	0
	19	20
Superintendents - - -	120	172

Apart from the increased number of officers eligible for the higher appointments which have not themselves increased proportionately, Superintendents have now lost appointments once held in the Accounts Branch, which, since they have been lost, have increased in number. That is all dead loss.

In 1887 the Superintendents were entitled to fill 9 posts of Deputy Postmaster-General. Of these 4 have been abolished and 5 survive. Four new appointments of Postmaster-General were created and added to the 6 similar posts already existing, thus raising the number to 10. Of these appointments, departmental officers hold 4. The Public Service Commission of 1887 recommended that of the 7 higher appointments (1 Director-General and 6 Postmasters-General) the uncovenanted officers of the Post Office should ordinarily hold not less than 3. The Director-Generalship has in practice always been held by a Covenanted Civilian. The recommendation, therefore, meant that in practice the Uncovenanted officers of the Post Office should ordinarily hold *not less than half* of the total number of appointments of Postmaster-General. In this view they ought to-day to be holding at least 5 out of the existing 10, whereas they hold only 4. Their loss, therefore, on these much-prized posts is at least one appointment.

As above stated, 4 out of 9 appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General were abolished. The claim, therefore, of the Superintendents is that their total loss of the chief posts is at least 5. If it be objected that Government have after the abolition of the 4 appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General created 4 similar appointments of Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service, and one of Assistant Director-General, all of which are at present held by officers promoted from the Superintendents' cadre, the objection, it is submitted, has no force. These 5 new appointments have all been solely necessitated by the constant increase and development of work in the Railway Mail Service and the Director-General's Office, work which always has been and still is supervised, and administered by officers from the ranks of Postal Superintendents. Statistics show beyond all contradiction that had not the Deputy Postmasters-General been abolished, the steady growth of business would have required the creation of the appointments referred to above, which, therefore, can from no point of view be regarded as in substitution of these abolished posts.

The nett loss, therefore, is, as stated, five chief appointments, which has also retarded the much needed flow of promotion amongst Superintendents.

The Superintendent of post offices is the sole administrative officer representing his Department in a Division which usually includes two or more Revenue Districts. He has therefore to associate on terms of equality with officers and Heads of other Departments and to maintain the dignity and repute of an important service, which enters intimately into the daily life of all classes of the public. To enable him to uphold his position and discharge functions from which he cannot escape, it is essential that his remuneration should be substantially increased. It is worthy of notice that the number of Superintendents is increasing and, with the continual development of Post Office business, must further increase. This increase is out of all ratio to that of the higher or prize appointments. While the aspirants for such prize appointments multiply, the number of these appointments practically remains stationary. Recognising that these higher posts must be reserved for the most expert of the Superintendents, there remains a large body of these officers who must be precluded from any fair expectation of preferment. To such men now, and in a greater degree in the future, their pay is inadequate both in itself and in its effect upon their pension. For such men the proposed enhancement of pay appears to be a reasonable and pressing need.

*Subhead 14.*—Gazetted Postmasters are executive officers. Their duties are many and difficult. They are personally and directly responsible for the custody, account and disbursement of very large sums of money. This increasing burden of responsibility furnishes sufficient grounds for the request that Postmasters who, like other members of the service, are met with the constant rise in the cost of living, should have an increase in their pay.

*Subhead 15.*—The Deputy Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General reside mainly in the largest towns where the cost of living is higher than in the Mufassal. Their responsibilities are greater, their duties socially and departmentally are exacting in consequence of their higher position. They also hold, in the Railway Mail Service, entire charge of circles containing a number of Superintendents' Divisions, where they in many respects exercise the powers of Postmasters-General.

75,228. (V.) *Conditions of Leave* (see also paragraph 75,218). *Subheads 16 and 17.*—These must be read together. Shortly the proposal is that in every 32 months, 4 months' privilege leave should be earned. The present system permits 1 month in every 12 to be earned up to a maximum of 3 months in every 36 months. The two resolutions combined formulate the proposal that in lieu thereof privilege leave should be earned at the rate of 1 month in every 8 months up to a maximum of 4 months.

The reasons for this concession are stated in resolution 17. The request for the longer holiday in the shorter period rests upon the fact that generally throughout the postal service the officers work on Sundays as well as on holidays. Broadly speaking, all officers lose about 30 days in every year which are enjoyed as holidays by other Departments of the Government. The proposed scheme asks that one-half of these lost days of rest be restored.

*Subhead 18.*—The restriction on leave under the existing rules, which forbid an officer who has returned to duty to avail himself of leave either already due to him or which he may subsequently earn, unless and until he shall have been on duty for certain specified and varying periods, are vexatious, embarrassing and unreasonable. Reference is invited to Articles 260 and 338 of the Civil Service Regulations. Subject always to the exigencies of the public service, every officer should be entitled to avail himself forthwith of all leave which, at the time of his application for leave, he has actually earned.

One example will illustrate the hardship complained of. By Article 338 above quoted, if an officer entitled to 2 years' furlough after 18 years' service goes on leave for one year only and returns to duty, he is compelled to serve another 8 years before he is permitted to enjoy the balance of his one year's furlough,

although he has already earned it by duty rendered to the State. The only device by which this can be evaded is for the officer to apply for leave on medical certificate when he is not sick. If, in such circumstances, the leave is granted, the privilege is won on a false issue; if it is refused the officer is robbed of his leave. In neither event is the Government well served. Neither result can be ethically upheld. It is morally impossible to uphold differential treatment applied to officers who fall under the European Service leave rules.

*Subhead 19.*—Short leave rules apply at present equally to all Government services. Long leave rules vary for European and Indian services, to the advantage of the former. They are not, however, founded on any purely class distinction. Thus, Deputy Postmasters-General, whether Europeans or Indians, fall under the European leave rules. All officers below the rank of Deputy Postmasters-General range under the Indian Service leave rules. Under these the maximum furlough for an officer's whole service is 2 years. The first furlough cannot be taken until the completion of 10 years' service and a second furlough until after a further service of 8 years. These rules press harshly upon the senior officers, who, by that time (generally 20 years and more), have earned, and in many instances have exhausted, the full period of their furlough. For instance, if an officer has a family of his own, the members of which are being educated out of India, he is unable to share in his children's society or personally to supervise their education at a period when the presence and influence of a father are most needed. To obviate this, it is proposed that officers drawing Rs. 500 and upwards should enjoy the privilege of the European Service leave rules, which entitle an officer to longer periods of leave at shorter intervals. Under the present rules officers below the rank of Deputy Postmaster-General can only claim 2 years' furlough in their whole service, which may extend to 35 years. Of this they can take 1 year after their first 10 years' service and another after a further service of 8 years. Should they serve, as they often do, a further 14 years after they have used up their 2 years' furlough, they are debarred from all further furlough. Their only hope then is to try their chance of being sent home on sick leave when not sick.

*Subhead 20.*—The rule to-day for reckoning service for pension, itself not due till after 30 years' service, is as follows. During that period only 4 years' leave on allowance count. This is the maximum. If the whole 4 years' leave is spent in India, only 2 years count. If the whole is spent out of India, the whole counts. If a portion be spent in India and a portion out of India the latter portion will count in full, and of the former not more than 2 years as a maximum. This is unfair to the officer to whom the Indian Service rules apply, and to any officer who, owing to financial or other reasons, is unable to spend his leave out of India. From this point of view 2 years' furlough counting for pension is wholly insufficient in consideration of the strain of work. The conditions under which such an officer labours are the same as those of an officer who spends his leave out of India. The present rule prolongs unfairly the period of effective service which the officer who spends his leave in India must put in for pension. While one officer who spends all his leave out of India need only serve 26 years, the other who does not is forced to serve 28. This resolution must be read with the next.

75,229. (VI.) *Conditions of Pension* (see also paragraph 75,219). *Subhead 21.*—The rules, as they now stand, permit only 3 years' leave with allowances to count towards pension earned after 25 years' service, and they lay down that if these 3 years are spent in India, only one shall count towards pension; if all be spent out of India all count.

An officer who spends 3 years' leave in India must, in order to earn his pension after 25 years' service, render an actual service of 24 years, whereas the officer who spends his leave out of India renders only 22 years' service. The combined effect of Resolutions 20 and 21 is to level up the differences pointed out and to place all officers on a footing of equality.



3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

*Subhead 23.*—A maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 a year is inadequate to the needs of those officers who earn it. A fair proportion of the officers who attain their pension are in fact European though falling technically within the definition of "Natives of India." A definition, however, cannot change a fact, and the fact remains that these Statutory "Natives of India" are Europeans of European education, surroundings, traditions and needs. Like their non-domiciled European brothers in the Department their relatives live either in Europe or the British Colonies and as a rule when they themselves earn their pension they leave the country. To such men a pension of Rs. 5,000 means a ceaseless scrutiny of ways and means. Nor need this argument be confined to the European element. In several instances Indian officers of the Department have adopted European habits of life and are educating their children in Europe. These instances will increase in number year by year to a marked degree. Even the Indian officer who has not followed English habits of life in their entirety has often, by virtue of his official position, been compelled to adopt a standard of living which entails many extra expenses. It is a hardship that at an age when such habits have become crystallised into a custom he should be required to readjust his mode of living to an insufficient pension. To all these the same argument is applicable. The present pensionable limit was fixed half a century ago. In the interval the purchasing power of the rupee has been greatly diminished, the necessities of life have been nearly doubled, and many of its minor luxuries placed permanently out of reach. The proposed increase would be but an equitable recognition that here, as elsewhere, there have been developments in the world which, while they are out of the control of the officers in the Post Office, weigh heavily upon the resources of these officers.

*Subhead 24.*—The request for permission to free from existing restrictions commutations of an officer's pension is based upon the feeling that these restrictions are inquisitorial and therefore objectionable. While recognising the wisdom of the policy upon which pensions and their freedom from attachment is founded and admitting that that policy should be supported, it also recognised in the Department that permission to commute a portion is rarely conferred except on reasonable grounds. The desire to advance a portion to a child in marriage, to purchase land which shall become the family homestead, to educate growing children, even to be quit of an accumulated burden of debt, is a commendable desire. The owner of the pension may safely be trusted as to his intent. Government have frequently stated that pension is deferred pay. That profession is accepted as sincere. If such be the case, it follows that the person who has earned such deferred pay should be able to lay his hands upon at least a portion of it for a conscionable purpose.

So, too, if an officer of 50 years of age and upwards dies in service before touching his pension, it does not seem unreasonable that his widow and children should have some claim upon a portion of that which authority has itself labelled as deferred pay. The exemption in such a case from the burden of a pension is a pure matter of gain to Government. The loss falls entirely upon the officer's family. The objection sometimes officially expounded that officers should make provision for their family during their lives is in the majority of cases a counsel of perfection. Where a widow—the resolution deals only with the case of the widow and children—applies for a commuted portion of her husband's pension, it may, despite such counsel, be *prima facie* and, as a rule, truthfully accepted, that her petition for help is due to unfortunate circumstances outside her husband's control. But, even were it not so, the request comes with exceptional force from persons suddenly deprived of the assistance of the

chief breadwinner whose pension, it has been conceded, represents earnings in consideration of the postponement of which his salary throughout his service was based. The widow's claim is not purely eleemosynary; it is rooted upon an equity which cannot easily be ignored.

75,230. (VIII.) *Relation of Service with other Services* (see also paragraph 75,220).

*Sub-heads 27, 28, and 29.*—The Public Service Commission of 1887 recommended that the highest posts, exclusive of the Director-Generalship, in the Post Office, should be divided at least equally between the Indian Civil Service and the Department. Out of 10 such posts, the Department should hold at least 5. It has already been shown (*ante Subhead 14*) that the Department at the present moment hold only 4 against 6 held by the Indian Civil Service. Lately, 1 of these 6 posts, being temporarily vacant, has been filled by the appointment of a Superintendent of Telegraphs as Postmaster-General. The post should have fallen to the Post Office, under the recommendation of the Public Service Commission. The introduction of an officer from the Telegraph Department to officiate is, presumably, in anticipation of his confirmation. To that an emphatic, if respectful, protest is immediately necessary.

The Telegraph Department is gradually to be absorbed, it is believed, into the Post Office. Such officers as are at present in the service of the Telegraph Department have had, it is also believed, their prospects assured by the promise that they shall not personally suffer. Though their Department is numerically inferior to the Post Office, they hold 11 appointments rising from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,250, as against 10 appointments rising from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,000 in the Post Office, of which 6 are at present held by members of the Indian Civil Service. The obstacles to promotion in the Post Office have already been dealt with. A new obstacle now threatens by importation from the Telegraph Department. Resolutions 28 and 69 are directed against this new danger. It is essential that an effective protest be lodged while the end of the inserted wedge is still thin.

75,231. (IX.) *Other Points.*

*Sub-head 30.*—The present Guarantee Fund was started in 1883. It was fed by deductions from the salaries of all officials below the rank of Deputy Postmaster-General. At present no deductions are being made. Its object was, *inter alia*, to guarantee Government against loss arising from the negligence or dishonesty of Post Office officials up to a maximum on each loss of Rs. 3,000. It now amounts to nearly 11 lakhs of rupees in Government Securities and cash on which interest accrues annually. The uses to which the interest is put include many deserving objects, but it is under Government control and sanction, and the chief characteristic of the amount expended for the benefit of the subscribers is its disproportion to the interest which accrues yearly.

It is now proposed that the Fund should be handed over to a carefully selected departmental Committee for the benefit of the officials of the Department. Such a Committee being naturally in closer touch with the wants and claims of the men among whom they live and move, would be in a better position to put the money placed at their disposal to a more liberal use. A statement is hereto annexed as B showing the transactions of the Guarantee Fund for the year 1911-12. It forms an interesting comment upon the request now preferred.

Extraordinary as it may seem fines inflicted upon the subordinate staff are credited to Government. In view of the dubious legality of this procedure, it is suggested that fines should be handed over to the above Committee for the general benefit of the subordinate staff.

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

## ANNEXURE A.

(Vide paragraph 75,227.)

STATEMENT SHOWING THE GROWTH OF THE INDIAN POST OFFICE BETWEEN 1886-87 AND 1912-13.

[N.B.—The figures supplied by the Witnesses were for 1911-12, but the later figures for the year 1912-13 have been obtained from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, by whom the statement has been corrected and completed.]

Classification.	Figures for 1886-7.	Figures for 1912-13.	Percentage of Increase.
Number of Post Offices - - - -	7,097	18,789	164·75
„ of letter boxes - - - -	9,386	48,524	416·98
„ of village postmen - - - -	4,455	8,190	83·84
<i>Mileage of Postal Lines.</i>			
Railway - - - - -	12,710	32,062	152·26
Mail cart - - - - -	3,933	11,122	182·79
Runners and boats - - - -	35,729	91,238	155·36
Steamer - - - - -	11,683	20,071	71·80
Total mileage - - - -	64,055	154,493	141·19
<i>Correspondence and Parcels.</i>			
Postcards - - - - -	67,756,098	435,786,354	543·17
Paid letters - - - - -	125,871,580	403,190,056	220·32
Unpaid letters - - - - -	27,562,688	36,043,619	30·77
(a) Registered letters - - - -	4,791,408	16,930,256	253·35
Newspapers - - - - -	21,606,697	54,956,826	154·35
(b) Book packets - - - - -	5,306,498	56,287,771	960·73
(c) Parcels - - - - -	1,854,775	11,593,563	525·07
<i>Inland Money Orders.</i>			
Number - - - - -	4,821,117	28,624,470	493·73
Amount - - - - -	Rs. 10,68,49,151	Rs. 47,39,38,492	343·56
Commission - - - - -	Rs. 13,37,820	Rs. 55,03,521	311·38
<i>Savings Bank.</i>			
Number of Head Banks - - - -	324	255	-21·30
„ „ Sub „ - - - -	5,724	9,205	60·81
„ „ Accounts - - - -	219,010	1,566,860	615·43
Total balance at credit - - - -	Rs. 4,25,19,344	Rs. 20,61,14,502	384·75
Annual deposits - - - - -	Rs. 4,44,40,499	Rs. 9,14,36,896	105·75
„ withdrawals - - - - -	Rs. 2,58,81,689	Rs. 7,99,28,312	208·82
Number of Government securities purchased - - - -	556	3,461	522·48
„ „ „ „ sold - - - -	28	807	2,782·14
<i>Insurance.</i>			
Number of Insured Letters - - - -	107,413	20,599,237	1,817·12
Number of Insured Parcels - - - -	174,263	647,199	271·39
Value of Insured Letters - - - -	Rs. 2,35,74,205	Rs. 51,96,42,403	2,104·28
Value of Insured Parcels - - - -	Rs. 5,26,06,770	Rs. 15,17,94,215	188·55
Total Value - - - - -	Rs. 7,61,80,975	Rs. 67,14,36,618	781·37
Insurance Fees - - - - -	Rs. 1,80,274	Rs. 8,69,414	382·27
<i>Value Payable.</i>			
Number of articles sent - - - -	596,296	8,815,915	1,378·45
Value declared - - - - -	Rs. 58,78,016	Rs. 10,98,22,633	1,768·36
<i>Telegraph Statistics.</i>			
Number of combined Post and Telegraph offices - - - -	440	2,860	550·00
*Annual cost of Post and Telegraph establishment - - - -	Rs. 1,54,094	Rs. 14,03,266	810·66
Number of messegas sent - - - -	457,557	8,415,817	1,739·29
„ „ „ received - - - -	489,949	7,152,269	1,359·80
Revenue - - - - -	Rs. 5,27,462	Rs. 46,23,789	776·61

(a) Registered letters and packets (including insured and value payable).

(b) Ordinary unregistered packets only.

(c) Including value-payable unregistered packets.

\* Cost incurred by the Post Office in working combined offices.

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR and SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

## ANNEXURE A.—cont.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE GROWTH OF THE INDIAN POST OFFICE BETWEEN 1886-87 AND 1912-13—cont.

Classification.	Figures for 1886-7.	Figures for 1912-13.	Percentage of Increase.
<i>Strength of Staff.</i>			
Number of Superintendents - - - -	120	172	43·33
„ „ Inspectors - - - -	232	506	118·10
Departmental Postmasters - - - -	4,901	6,759	37·91
Extraneous Agents (Branch Postmasters) - - - -	2,214	12,279	454·61
Clerks - - - -	5,342	15,134	183·30
Postmen and other servants - - - -	9,566	27,392	186·35
Road Establishment - - - -	12,098	18,687	54·46
Village postmen - - - -	4,455	8,190	83·84
Signallers - - - -	294	1,172	298·64
Total - - - -	39,222	90,291	130·20
<i>Financial results of the working of Post Office for the year.</i>			
Amount of surplus (+) or deficit (-) - - - -	—Rs. 15,03,095†	+Rs. 28,02,918	

† Includes the cost of keeping up the savings bank accounts and also the charges connected with postal arrangements in Baluchistan Rs. 90,388.

## ANNEXURE B.

(Vide paragraph 75,231.)

THE STATEMENT BELOW SHOWS THE TRANSACTIONS OF THE POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND, 1912-13(a.)

RECEIPTS.			CHARGES.		
—	Government Securities (nominal Value).	Cash.	—	Government Securities (nominal Value).	Cash.
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
Balance of 1911-12 - - -	7, 7,300	(b)3,24,001	Refund of excess realisations.	—	—
Interest given by Government on Rs. 3,00,000 at 4 per cent. from April 1912 to March 1913.	—	12,000	Sums decreed against the Fund.	—	16,118
Interest on Government Securities in 3½ per cent. loans.	—	27,028	Refund to subscribers on account of returnable subscriptions.	—	380
Recoveries against awards made in previous years.	—	825	Rewards for information in in Post Office robbery cases.	—	2,574
Recoveries of special advances	—	7	Compensation to postal servants for loss of private property.	—	231
Recoveries of travelling expenses for medical examination for Post Office Life Insurance.	—	36	Compassionate gratuities -	—	2,872
Government Promissory Notes purchased during the year.	15,000	—	Travelling expenses for medical examination for Post Office Life Insurance.	—	249
			Cost of purchase of Government Promissory Notes.	—	14,400
			Balance on 31st March, 1913	(c)7,82,300	3,27,073
Total - - -	7,82,300	3,63,897	Total - - -	7,82,300	3,63,897

(a) The Statement furnished by the witnesses was for 1911-12: the figures for 1912-13 were afterwards obtained from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

(b) Differs from the closing balance shown in the Annual Report for 1911-12 by Rs. 251, owing to that amount having been charged to the Fund after the publication of the Report.

(c) Market value on 31st March, 1913, was Rs. 7,46,119.



3 November 1913.]

[Continued.]

Messrs. McMINN, SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM called and examined.

75,232. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. McMINN said he was one of the witnesses elected by the non-Indian Superintendents to give evidence. He joined the Department in September 1904 as a Superintendent direct, and had been a Superintendent since in different Divisions, in the Punjab only.

Mr. SRI RAM said he joined as a Probationary Superintendent in September 1904 at Rs. 100 a month. After 16 months he was appointed permanent Superintendent, and sent to take charge of the Division which he was holding before he was appointed. He was elected by the Indian Superintendents as one of the four witnesses to appear before the Commission.

Mr. SINCLAIR said he was appointed Reserve Superintendent in 1907 on Rs. 200, and was confirmed after passing the departmental examination. He had been Superintendent ever since, chiefly in the United Provinces. He had been elected as a representative of the non-Indian Superintendents.

75,233. Mr. McMINN said the written statement was drawn up on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters, and although the Superintendents of Burma did not attend the Conference which was held, they had signed the written statement.

Mr. SRI RAM believed that at the Nagpur Conference the Burmans appointed the Punjab men as their representatives. There were 23 officers present at the meeting which drew up the Memorandum, only 2 being Postmasters. Each circle selected their representatives to attend at Nagpur, and he could not explain why so few Postmasters were selected.

Mr. SINCLAIR said the Gazetted Postmasters were very much fewer than the Superintendents, and therefore the representatives were less.

Mr. SRI RAM said that 13 Indian officers were present at the Conference out of 20, so that the written statement fully represented the views of the Indian members of the Conference.

75,234. With regard to the proportion of direct appointments to promotions from the subordinate staff in the case of Superintendents, Mr. McMINN said that of the 172 now on the list the proportion was 40 per cent. direct and 60 per cent. promotion. If there were two direct appointments to each promoted appointment, that would secure the interests of the Probationary Superintendents, who were often kept waiting for a permanent post owing to promoted subordinates going over their heads. This was because men from the department did not go through a probationary period. To have a larger proportion of direct appointments would also ensure the recruitment of a better class of men as Superintendents. This also appeared to be the opinion of the Directorate, as was evident from the fact that of late years the proportion of direct recruits had borne a rapidly increasing ratio to those appointed from the department. The Probationary Superintendent had to wait for appointment for something like two years, and it was thought that from one year to two years would be sufficient for his training and probation. At present a man had to spend too much time as a Probationary Superintendent.

75,235. With reference to the request made in the written statement that the Probationary Superintendents should be on one list instead of on circle lists, Mr. McMINN said he could give no specific instances of inequalities that had arisen as the result of the present system, and personally he did not agree fully with what was stated in the written statement on that point.

Mr. SRI RAM also said he did not agree personally with this portion of the written statement.

Mr. SINCLAIR remarked that he could not give specific instances, but he agreed with what was said in the written statement; he thought that Probationary Superintendents should be borne on one general list; otherwise the Department would be provincialised.

75,236. With regard to the distinction drawn in the written statement between the Indian direct recruits being graduates and members of the domiciled community undergraduates, Mr. McMINN said by undergraduates was meant men passing the Matriculation Examination, and not necessarily men going to the University. There were really very few Universities to which an Anglo-Indian could go at present, and hostels were not provided for the Anglo-Indians as they were for the Indians. For instance, at Lahore, the Indians could live in a very much cheaper manner than members of the domiciled community. The necessity for the distinction was based entirely on the educational facilities open to the two classes of officers.

Mr. SRI RAM thought that in time to come the distinction would disappear, but as at present the facilities were not the same the distinction might continue for some time.

Mr. SINCLAIR believed the reason for the distinction was that the European School Code provided that Europeans should be educated up to the Matriculation or Cambridge Local standards.

75,237. Mr. McMINN was of opinion that the present age limits for direct recruits to Superintendships were suitable, and suggested selection first and competitive examination afterwards, the system that at one time existed in connection with the Police in India. The preliminary selection might be made by the Postmasters-General and be confirmed by the Director-General. It was not a selection for the post but selection for the right to go up for examination. The considerations to be borne in mind in making the selections should be somewhat the same as now, educational qualifications and good family, men well known in the Province and able to exercise a good influence. The number of candidates selected would have to be two or three times as large as the posts to be filled. At present there were numerous applications, and if the positions were advertised there would be a very much larger number, and it would not be necessary to weed out the applicants by examination. At present there was no regular system for the recruitment of Superintendents. There appeared to be no fixed pay for Probationary Superintendents. Out of those at present on the cadre of Probationary Superintendents some drew Rs. 80, some Rs. 100, one Rs. 140, one Rs. 150 and one Rs. 200 a month. It was unreasonable to expect to get good men on such a low monthly pay as Rs. 80.

Mr. SRI RAM agreed.

Mr. SINCLAIR said he did not believe in competitive examination at all. He thought that selection by the Postmaster-General and confirmation by the Director-General was quite sufficient, i.e., the present system.

Mr. SRI RAM said opinion in the Conference was fairly divided on the question, especially on the proportion of the recruitment from outside and from the department, and also on the question of examination. There was a fairly strong opinion for examination after selection. The idea appeared to be that good social status, high educational qualifications, and strong physique should be the qualities insisted upon.

75,238. With regard to allowances, Mr. McMINN said officers of the department did not halt so long as officers belonging to other departments, and sometimes did not halt for twenty-four hours, and therefore did not draw a daily allowance at all. With regard to transfer allowances, they claimed the reimbursement of the actual expenses incurred. There was also the question of house accommodation. It was sometimes very difficult to get houses in military stations. He knew of an officer who changed his bungalow three times in one year, and in another year seven times, because it was required by a military officer. It was a grievance which was more or less common in many other departments.

Mr. SRI RAM said every other department received Rs. 5 a day, whereas the Postal Department only

3 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. H. McMINN, S. C. SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM.

[Continued.]

received Rs. 4 a day. Almost every department was provided with tents except the Post Office. In many cases officers of that department had to inspect places where no bungalows existed, and had to do the double journey to get to get back to a bungalow, and then were refused travelling allowance.

75,239. With regard to pay, all three witnesses stated that they preferred a time-scale, Mr. McMINN observing that there could be no inequalities in that method.

Lord Ronaldshay then pointed out that in the witness's written statement it was asked first that Superintendents of Post Offices should be placed on a graded scale of pay, and that failing this a time-scale of pay, starting from Rs. 300 and rising to Rs. 900 should be introduced. In reply Mr. SRI RAM said that Conferences were held in different circles, and all decided on the time scale. Somehow or other the idea went round that perhaps the demand might not be accepted, and it would be better to put forward an alternative proposal, and it was only by an accident that the graded scale was put first. What was really wanted was a time-scale, and if that were not granted they would like a graded scale on the lines laid down in the written statement.

75,240. Mr. McMINN said that supposing a time-scale was granted it should be provided that special selection for promotion should take place at a particular stage, about the end of the twelfth year, for Superintendents. If a time-scale were introduced they would not press for officers to be retired compulsorily at the age of 55; that was only pressed for under the graded system. The creation of administrative posts to suit the requirements of promotion could hardly be granted, but pay might be raised on account of the fact that the chances of getting higher appointments were less. The prospects of obtaining higher appointments were less than they used to be; there were a greater number of Superintendents to fill the same number of posts, and therefore a smaller proportion of Superintendents would get those posts, and the others ought to be compensated by increase of pay.

Mr. SRI RAM and Mr. SINCLAIR agreed.

75,241. Mr. McMINN said it was not suggested that Superintendents of a suitable calibre were not obtainable at the present rates of pay. The work of the Post Office was getting more and more complex, and a better class of men was required. He did not think that from amongst the domiciled Europeans the department was getting quite the same class of men as it should get, and he attributed that to the present scale of salaries. Men went into the Railways or Finance in preference because the pay there was higher.

Mr. SRI RAM thought that in the case of Indians the class that was obtained was quite good, and even with increased pay the class would be the same. The men in the Service were not contented with the pay and prospects. Indians went into the Postal Service as freely as into the other Services.

Mr. SINCLAIR agreed with Mr. McMINN.

75,242. With regard to the differences in the pay under a graded system and a time-scale, Mr. SRI RAM pointed out that Rs. 300 to Rs. 900 was the scale of pay determined by most of the Provincial Conferences, but it only came in as an alternative proposal and nobody devoted much attention to it.

75,243. On the question of leave, Mr. McMINN said that the complaint in regard to Sunday attendance did not apply to Superintendents but only to Postmasters.

Mr. SRI RAM considered that it applied to a certain extent to Superintendents, as these officers had to make inquiries and investigations on Sundays.

75,244. With regard to the General Provident Fund, Mr. McMINN said it was open to officers of the department, and all who joined after a certain date were compelled to contribute to it.

Mr. SINCLAIR did not think so many men availed themselves of the privilege.

Mr. McMINN said that personally he preferred being insured in an ordinary Insurance Company.

75,245. On the subject of the amalgamation of the Telegraph and Postal Departments, Mr. McMINN said they had no knowledge of the subject as they had not been informed of the proposals. Superintendents certainly did telegraph work now, as they controlled a number of combined offices, and traffic questions were sometimes sent to them for enquiry. No extra payment had been made for the extra duties entailed.

75,246. With reference to the recommendation of the 1887 Commission with regard to the tenure of Postmaster-Generalships by officers of the department, it was a doubtful question whether the Commission meant that they should hold 50 per cent. of all Postmaster-ships, or that the number should be three. At the present time he thought they should have five.

75,247. With regard to the Guarantee Fund, it was contended that a Departmental Committee should manage the Fund, and that the greater part, if not the whole, of the interest accruing annually should be administered in the interests of the officers of the Department. The other witnesses agreed.

75,248. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. McMINN said they desired at least 50 per cent. of the positions of Postmasters-General, but advanced no claim with regard to the Director-Generalship.

Mr. SINCLAIR said the general feeling was that the position should be always held by an Indian Civil Servant, and with that he was perfectly satisfied, and did not require any change. It was only a question of the Postmaster-Generalships.

Mr. SRI RAM said the Departments should have at least 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships, and if the Postal Officers proved themselves efficient for a larger number of appointments it was not necessary that any should come from outside at all.

Mr. McMINN considered that in the future, with a good class of man coming in, and with increased pay there was no reason why the men belonging to the department should not make efficient Postmasters-General.

Mr. SINCLAIR also agreed to at least 50 per cent.

75,249. On the subject of allowances, Mr. McMINN said the halting allowance and daily allowance were the same, and were only given when an officer stayed at any office outside his headquarters for a full 24 hours. If the mileage allowance was paid the halting allowance was not. The contention was that on the railway an officer should get the daily allowance of Rs. 5 plus the single railway fare and the actual expenses on the railway. A man might spend the whole of his day practically at one place, and all he would get would be his railway fare to that place. On a long journey double first-class fare was received, and that was quite fair.

Mr. SINCLAIR said that when the railway fare was less than the daily allowance the full daily allowance should be given.

Mr. McMINN claimed that nothing less than the daily allowance should be given.

Mr. SINCLAIR said an officer should have the option of claiming the daily allowance or double first class fare.

75,250. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Mr. McMINN said it might happen that an officer would halt at a place and then move on to another place and no halting allowance was given. At present the words were "from midnight to midnight," and it was thought desirable that the words should be "twenty-four hours." In that case if an officer reached his destination at eight o'clock he would get a waiting allowance if he was still there at eight o'clock the next day.

75,251. On the question of educational facilities for Anglo-Indians, Mr. McMINN said an Indian had several Universities to which he could go, and although the Anglo-Indian theoretically could go there also, practically he was unable to do so. Very often he could not afford it. The Indian had hostels provided, but none

3 November 1913.]

Mr. N. W. VAUGHAN.

[Continued.]

least four hours. He quite agreed with the Director-General that 50 per cent. special leave might be a compensation.

75,263. With regard to the General Provident Fund, he believed that about 40 per cent. of the Postmasters joined it and he thought it was a good thing. There was no complaint among the officers who had to subscribe. He did not agree that a Departmental Committee should administer the Guarantee Fund; he thought it should be administered as at present by the Director-General, but a larger proportion of the interest should go towards the service, and he would like to see the money devoted to the families of Postal officers. A certain amount of the Fund at one time went towards meeting losses caused by robberies and so on, but it was found that that was illegal. He considered now that about half the money went towards meeting losses and half towards rewards.

75,264. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said it should be left entirely with the Director-General as to whether the Guarantee Fund should be utilised to recover money losses. The income from the Fund was about Rs. 35,000, and before the Director-General could go beyond that sum he would have to refer the matter to the Government. A certain percentage of the Fund was returned to subscribers when they retired. He did not agree that a Superintendent was able to do the work of a Presidency Postmaster, although he could do the work of a big Post Office. Large Post Offices required men who had been engaged in the work for a long time, and it was not easy for Superintendents to learn it. A Superintendent would not work the office so successfully as a Postmaster, on account of lack of technical qualifications. If the higher appointments were exclusively reserved for Postmasters there would be no ground for objection. There was a feeling that Gazetted Postmasters' prospects were inferior to those of Superintendents.

75,265. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that in 26 years he had risen from Rs. 150 to Rs. 500, the

usual time taken to rise to that grade. There were Superintendents who had salaries of Rs. 500 to Rs. 600, the lowest being Rs. 200. A Superintendent took about 22 years to rise from Rs. 200 to Rs. 600. Whilst Superintendents might find it difficult to carry on the work of Postmasters, Postmasters in the superior grades could very well perform the duties of Superintendents. For the higher offices above Rs. 1,000 he did not think men who had risen from the ranks up to Rs. 600 would be too old. In the gazetted ranks the prospects were not considered good for Postmasters as compared with the prospects of Superintendents. He agreed that 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships must be held by the Indian Civil Service in order that the service might be well managed. It was the nature of the duties that required the various officers to be kept separate, but he did not agree that the higher Postmasters and Superintendents should be kept separate on that ground. The manager of the Dead Letter Office might be a Postal man, but the Head Clerk of the Director-General's Office required special Secretariat training.

75,266. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said that under present circumstances there was a slight diversity of interest between Postmasters and Superintendents, and he proposed to make the two offices interchangeable. It was not necessary for the scheme that Superintendents should also be appointed as Postmasters. He did not agree with the view that the duties of a Postmaster were such as to make him an incompetent Superintendent.

75,267. One of his objections to a Departmental Committee managing the Guarantee Fund was that in a few years' time the Committee would consist of men who had not subscribed to the Fund, and who would have no personal interest in it.

75,268. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness stated that the object of the Guarantee Fund was to provide a guarantee against losses. At one time the contribution was compulsory.

The witness withdrew.

At Delhi, Tuesday, 4th November 1913.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

Sir MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.  
Sir THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.  
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.  
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

H. S. STYAN, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, Punjab Circle.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

C. STREATFEILD-JAMES, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, United Provinces; and  
I. C. THOMAS Esq., M.V.O., M.I.E.E., Director of Construction, Telegraph Department.

(*These two witnesses were examined together upon the written statement given below.*)

*Written Statement containing the Corporate Opinion of the Imperial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department.*

75,269. We, the under-mentioned\* Imperial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department, wish to invite the attention of the Royal Commission on the

Public Services in India to the following conditions which we consider call for remedial measures.

75,270. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—In view of the present position of the Department in connection with its proposed amalgamation with the Post Office it is difficult to offer any remarks on this point. We

\* This written statement was signed by the following officers:—

Messrs. C. Streatfeild-James, R. O. Lees, I. C. Thomas, H. S. Styan, R. T. Gibbs, and R. Meredith, Directors of Telegraphs; Messrs. H. Mayston and L. Truninger, Officiating Directors of Telegraphs; Mr. W. Sutherland, Officiating Postmaster-General (Superintendent of Telegraphs); Mr. J. C. Shields, Officiating Electrical Engineer-in-Chief; Messrs. C. W. Sowerby-Coo, S. Babington, H. S. Pike, G. E. Landon, G. P. Roy, G. W. Talbot, M. F. C. Smith, E. L. Bagshawe, B. C. Wernick, Sunder Singh, J. G. Berrie, M. E. Nigel Jones, C. T. Williams, F. T. de Monte, W. D. Macgregor, J. N. Parker, M. L. Paricha, and G. A. Hopkins, Superintendents of Telegraphs; and Messrs. S. R. A. Wood, M. F. D. J. Sice, J. Fairley, C. Landon, C. Lawton, G. Burlingham, J. North, E. Green, R. S. Purcell, A. C. Board, G. B. Power, A. P. Manning, J. G. P. Cameron, W. S. McMillan, G. E. O. de Smidt, and C. N. Garnier, Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs.

4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

have however been given to understand that under the scheme of amalgamation now under the consideration of the Government of India it is proposed to divide the superior staff of the Department into Engineering and Traffic sections—the former to be recruited in England and India, and the latter wholly in India, with perhaps one or two exceptions. Owing to the special technical requirements of the Telegraph Department and the lack of means of acquiring knowledge of the kind required in India we are of opinion that for many years to come three-fourths of the Engineering staff should be recruited from England, that one-eighth should be recruited from qualified subordinates and one-eighth from Indian Engineering Colleges. We are also further of opinion that all appointments should be subject to open competition from amongst nominated candidates. It is considered that, in England nominations should be given by the Secretary of State and in India by his Excellency the Viceroy.

**75,271. (II.) Systems of Training and Probation.**—We feel that it is of the utmost importance to give the young officers of the Department a thorough training in the duties that they will have to perform.

We accordingly recommend that in future all Engineering Officers whether appointed in England or India should first be attached to the office of the Electrical Engineer in Chief for instruction in every branch of departmental technical work, theoretical and practical, including the more important processes in the Telegraph Workshops. Subsequently arrangements should be made to complete their Engineering training including instruction in the system of Accounts in force in the Department. All officers should be required to pass, within three years of their joining the Department, in addition to the existing examinations, a professional examination on the lines of that now in force in the Public Works Department.

We feel that in the past the omission to give young Officers of the Department any training in administration has severely handicapped them throughout their service. We consider that it is most important to entrust every officer with, and make him responsible for definite duties, and that this sense of personal responsibility cannot commence too soon. As far as possible they should also be attached to the Headquarters offices of the Director-General and the Heads of Circles. Everyone should also be encouraged to keep himself thoroughly up to date in his profession by the liberal grant of Study Leave in Europe and America.

**75,272. (III.) Conditions of Service.**—A very large majority of the Imperial Service Officers at present in the Department were specially trained at Coopers Hill for service in India and the remainder are Electrical Engineers who have now been so long out of touch with the general branches of their profession that it is quite impossible for them, with few exceptions, to look forward to employment in those branches should they be compelled to leave the Telegraph Department; consequently they view with special apprehension anything which is likely to interfere with their present prospects. We have been given to understand, however, that, in the scheme for the amalgamation of our Department with the Post Office, which we believe is now under the consideration of the Government of India, our prospects have not only been safeguarded but that fair treatment has been accorded to us, including some compensation for the loss of the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, and consequently we do not wish to allude further to this matter. In view, however, of that loss, and that in the past the permanent head of the Post Office has invariably been a member of the Indian Civil Service we wish for an assurance that should one of the officers at present in the Telegraph Department be considered to be capable of efficiently filling the post of head of the joint Department he would be eligible for that appointment.

**75,273. (IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The salaries admissible under Department of Commerce and Industry Resolution No. 913-918-115, dated the 2nd of

February 1910\*, are considered to be generally suitable and we have no remarks to offer beyond again drawing attention to the serious loss that the Department has sustained in consequence of the abolition of the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs. In view of this we consider that the pay of the head Officer of the Engineering or Traffic branches, whichever is senior, shall not be less than Rs. 3,000 per mensem if the amalgamation scheme is brought into operation, inasmuch as we were recruited with the definite expectation of attaining such an emolument.

**75,274. (V.) Conditions of Leave.**—It is considered that the conditions on which leave is taken, and the allowances during leave, should be improved. Frequently an Officer applies for leave and, owing to shorthandedness or other reasons, his request cannot be granted. In consequence of this some part of his privilege leave often lapses owing to the limit of three months up to which such leave can be accumulated. Presumably this restriction is in the interests of economy to the State but we respectfully submit that this result is effected at the expense of the individual officers. There appears to be no adequate reason for continuing the limit and we therefore desire to urge strongly that either this should be abolished and that it should be permissible to accumulate privilege leave to any extent or that if this is not found practicable suitable compensation should be given for all such leave which is lost. In our opinion suitable compensation would be the grant of a month's furlough on full pay for each month's privilege leave forfeited. In this event Government might have the option of ordering an Officer to take leave should his health and work, in their opinion, demand it.

We also consider that an officer should be allowed to combine any leave with any other leave due to him and be granted this leave irrespective of when he was last on leave provided that he can be spared. Periods of leave on half-pay should also be commutable into leave on full-pay of proportionately reduced duration.

At present under Article 314 (a) of the Civil Service Regulations, members of the Indian Civil Service on furlough in England are paid leave allowances on certain conditions at a minimum rate of 500*l.* a year and at a maximum of 1,000*l.* a year. In the case of the Telegraph Department the maximum rate is 800*l.* a year, but there is no minimum except in the case of leave on Medical certificate. In the case of young officers, especially if they are married, these furlough allowances are wholly inadequate; many officers thus do not take leave as frequently as they might and their efficiency is impaired. For this reason we urge that the Department should be granted a minimum furlough allowance of 500*l.* a year and that the maximum should be raised to 1,000*l.* a year, subject to the conditions prescribed in Article 314 (c) of the Civil Service Regulations, and that furlough allowances should be calculated on half the salary at the time of taking furlough instead of on the average of the previous three years emoluments.

We also consider that the present restriction under which an officer cannot retire within three months of taking privilege leave without forfeiting such leave should be removed.

**75,275. (VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The scale of pensions at present in force is entirely inadequate for our needs. Memorials to the Government of India have been submitted, but up to the present nothing has been done to improve matters. We understand that in England it is recognised that pensions are deferred pay and taking this into consideration, and the fact that of late years the cost of living both in England and in India has increased enormously, a fact which has been recognised as regards this country by the increased pay which has recently been sanctioned for us, we consider that the case for the grant to us of enhanced pensions is overwhelmingly strong. We therefore strongly urge that pensions on the

4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

following scale should be sanctioned for voluntary retirement :—

On completing 20 years' service					£	
"	"	21	"	"	thirty	350
"	"	22	"	"	sixtieths of	380
"	"	23	"	"	an officer's	410
"	"	24	"	"	average	440
"	"	25	"	"	emolu-	470
"	"	26	"	"	ments for	500
"	"	27	"	"	last three	540
"	"	28	"	"	years sub-	580
"	"	29	"	"	ject to a	620
"	"	30	"	"	limit of	660
"	"		"	"		700

The amount of leave with allowances counting for pension under Article 408 of the Civil Service Regulations also requires increasing. In our opinion a suitable scale would be :—

In 10 years' service -	-	-	1 year.
" 15 " " -	-	-	2 years.
" 20 " " -	-	-	3 "
" 25 " " -	-	-	4 "
" 30 " " -	-	-	5 "
" 35 " " -	-	-	6 "

We do not propose to make any recommendations for the increase of the invalid pensions at present admissible as while they are also entirely inadequate fortunately very few officers have had to retire on them.

In addition to the above the special additional pensions, which are at present admissible to officers who have completed a term of approved service in certain administrative charges, should be continued.

We understand that in England retired Civil Servants are allowed the privilege of commuting a quarter of their pension for a lump sum unconditionally without a medical certificate and without specifying the object for which commutation is required. In a service like ours, in which the widow and children of a deceased officer are entitled to no pension from the State, it is very necessary that a similar privilege should be allowed to us so that their condition may be somewhat ameliorated. We accordingly strongly urge the desirability of this concession and in addition would ask that in the event of an officer dying before taking his pension or within a year of taking it, his family may receive the lump sum which he would have received had he commuted a quarter of the pension to which he was entitled on the date of his death. Such a privilege would be a real boon to all officers and would materially assist them in the task of making adequate provision for their families. Needless to say since our pensions are paid in England at the rate of one shilling and nine pence to the rupee this commutation should be calculated at the same rate. It might also be considered whether it should not be permissible to commute more than a quarter of a pension. We understand that recently an officer of the Finance Department was specially permitted to commute one-third of his pension and we strongly urge that all officers be allowed to commute their pensions unconditionally up to a similar amount.

**75,276. (VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—As in reply to question I. (paragraph 75,270) we have said that we consider that 75 per cent. of the engineering superior staff should be recruited in England and as we consider that few, if any, Indians would go through the necessary workshop and technical training in that country, we are of opinion that it is unnecessary to fix any proportion provided that the recommendation under which 75 per cent. of the staff are recruited in England is accepted.

We are of opinion that the existing division of service should continue but we consider that in the event of a Provincial Service Officer being selected as a Director of Telegraphs, he should be allowed to draw the same pay as an officer of the Imperial Service. We do not consider that the same concession should apply in the case of Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents as appointment to the administrative

grades is made by selection whereas in the case of the other grades this is not so.

**75,277. (VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—We feel very strongly about the subordinate position which the Department of late years has had to take up. At present Directors of Telegraphs rank in the order of precedence far below Postmasters-General and Officers in other Departments with similar powers and responsibilities. This has reacted on the lower grades and as a result the status and prestige of the Department has been lowered with a consequent sense of discouragement and loss of efficiency. We trust that this delicate subject will receive sympathetic consideration and that Directors of Telegraphs will be placed in the same position in the Warrant of Precedence as Postmasters-General.

**75,278. (IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The only other pressing questions to which we wish to allude are those relating to travelling allowance on transfer, daily allowance, and house and local allowances.

The travelling allowance admissible on the occasion of the transfer of an Officer is wholly inadequate. It is understood that in England the rules regulating the grant of travelling allowance on transfer are such that the actual expenses incurred by an Officer in breaking up his home and installing himself in his new one are borne by the State. In India, where transfers must of necessity be more numerous, there appears no reason why an Officer should, as at present, be put to a loss each time he is transferred. We would therefore ask that Officers on transfer be given actual expenses on similar lines to the rules now in force for Subordinates. If this cannot be granted it is considered that the minimum allowance which should be sanctioned is three first-class fares together with the free carriage of luggage up to 40 maunds in weight and of two ponies and a trap or motor, also incidental expenses for getting on board steamers and trains. The rules for journeys by rail should also apply in the case of steamer journeys during transfer. At present an Officer who has to make such a journey is entitled to only his bare fare for that part of his journey and from this is deducted a charge for his messing. Should he be a married Officer with a family he has himself to pay for their passages and on long journeys the expense of this may be considerable.

An Officer returning from furlough under the existing rules has to bear the cost of proceeding to his new station in addition to that of removing his personal effects from the station from which he proceeded on leave. This operates very hardly on Officers, as in addition to the heavy expense on return from leave they are often thereby precluded from the benefit of taking a return ticket by a Steamship Company. We accordingly recommend that in such cases Officers should be allowed travelling allowance from the port from which they left India or their old station, whichever is less, to their new station.

The rule in the Civil Service Regulations which lays down that an Officer must be absent for eight hours in a day before he can draw daily allowance is considered objectionable in that under Article 1067 it applies only to Officers attached to Railways and the Telegraph Department as a whole. The rates of daily allowance admissible to us are in excess of those drawn by Officers of similar standing in other Departments but in view of the fact that many of these Officers enjoy privileges which are not extended to us, the difference in the rates is often insufficient to meet the extra expense we are obliged to incur. We recognise that it may be impossible to increase the rates, but we consider that there is justification for excluding us from the ruling contained in the article quoted and we hope that it may be found possible to treat Officers of this Department in a manner similar to that accorded to Officers of other Departments not attached to Railways.

The effect of the house allowance rules at present in force for Officers stationed at Calcutta, Bombay and



4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

Rangoon and the absence of any local allowances for the larger towns, which are the headquarters of the Local Governments (excepting Madras for which a small house allowance is admissible), is to make service at those places extremely unpopular as the increased cost of living there is tantamount to a punishment. At Calcutta, Bombay and Rangoon for Officers who have their families with them the present House Allowance is considered adequate as regards the cold weather season but there appears to be no good reason why the allowances during the summer should be reduced. House accommodation at these places is in most places procured on annual rents and not on rents varying with the season. Unmarried Officers or Officers who are married but have not their families with them are entitled to no allowance at all. An unmarried man feels the cost of extra house rent and the higher cost of living even although this may not be to the same extent as a married man while the latter who is alone, is not only hindered with the extra cost of high rents and expensive living but also has to pay rent for his wife or family at the same time wherever they happen to be. Generally speaking the work at these places is more important than elsewhere and thus the more efficient officers are adversely affected, in that, in addition to hard work, they have to live in very expensive stations for which they

receive no compensation. It is considered that the only reasonable solution to this difficulty would be the provision by Government of suitable quarters at all the headquarter stations of the Local and Imperial Governments at reasonable rents and as a compensation for the more laborious duties, the grant of suitable local allowances. The need for house allowances would then disappear but in the interim it is considered that the grant of a reasonable house allowance to all Officers unconditionally is imperatively necessary. In this connection we also desire to invite attention to the system under which the less efficient Officers are given the easier appointments although their pay may be the same or larger than that of Officers holding more important charges.

Since the long delay in granting higher pensions and according more liberal treatment in the way of commutation and counting periods of leave with allowance towards pension, has occurred through no fault of the Officers concerned we would urge the desirability of applying any amelioration in these directions to all Officers who were in the service in August 1908 when the last Departmental general memorial on the subject of pensions was submitted to the Government of India—provided that they are still alive.

Messrs. STREATFEILD-JAMES and THOMAS, called and examined.

75,279. (*Lord Ronaldshay*.) Mr. STREATFEILD-JAMES said he came out to India on the 26th January 1879 as an Assistant Superintendent from Cooper's Hill, and had gradually worked up to the position of the senior First Grade Director.

Mr. THOMAS said he joined the Service in the year 1881 as an Assistant Superintendent, after a two years' course at Cooper's Hill, and had been through every grade up to Director, Second Class.

75,280. Mr. JAMES said that both Mr. Thomas and he had signed the written statement put in by their colleagues and were prepared to be examined on the views expressed therein. They had not been given an opportunity as a service, of criticising the scheme of amalgamation, and they had only had a few hints as to what was in it. In any change that might be made by the scheme they naturally asked that their prospects and interests should be guaranteed.

Mr. THOMAS said he had been consulted on all details in the scheme of amalgamation, but that the question whether he was in agreement with the whole scheme was rather a big one which he was not prepared to answer at present.

75,281. On the question of recruitment to the engineering branch, Mr. JAMES thought that his brother officers would be willing to go a little further than they had gone in their written statement in the way of admitting Indians provided that the latter were selected young in India and then given a training in England. The present idea was that nobody but a graduate in Engineering or Science should be selected in England. If Indians, who were graduates either in Science or Engineering, and who had had a training for three years in England were appointed, it would be possible for Indian and English officers to come out on one scale of pay. He was not satisfied with the technical training the Indian was able to obtain in India, as he had no opportunity of visiting works and seeing what was going on in electrical engineering. In India electrical engineering was in its infancy and to get really good men it was necessary to have them trained in England. He thought the State might lend money to cover the expenses of Indians, who went to England, and recover it from them afterwards. The training should be for two or three years. The men should visit various works and make notes, which should be examined from time to time to see whether the work was being done properly. During the training they would have to be given some sort of subsistence

allowance. The men now had to pick up their knowledge in the best way they could. There had been Natives of India who had gone to England, and who had been trained at Cooper's Hill, and they were on the same list as the European officer, and this had proved a success.

Mr. THOMAS agreed with Mr. James.

75,282. Mr. JAMES then discussed the point whether recruitment in England should be made by examination or nomination. He did not press the suggestion in the written statement in favour of the former method. He believed the Public Works Department advertised for men, and that enquiries were made about applicants by the Secretary of State and a Selection Committee, and from what he had heard from Public Works Engineers he believed the men they had been getting out in that way had done very satisfactorily. If a proper educational standard were enforced, suitable officers, whether Indians or Englishmen, could no doubt be obtained by a process of nomination. In fact he would waive the idea of a competitive examination, provided that certain educational qualifications were made compulsory.

Mr. THOMAS on the other hand favoured competition between selected candidates. The examination might be for one post only, but he saw no objection in this.

75,283. Mr. JAMES then turned to the question of training. He attached great importance to a better training for young Engineering officers than was given at the present time. After a man had been in India for five years he became rusty, and should be given about six months' study leave to go to England and bring himself up-to-date. Such leave might be tacked on to any other leave which the officer had earned. During his leave he should receive half pay and his expenses, and should be made to send in periodical reports on what he was doing. It would be open to the Head of the Department afterwards to say whether he was satisfied or not. The details of such a scheme would require to be worked out carefully.

75,284. Mr. THOMAS then dealt with the proposal that recruits for the new Traffic Branch should come mainly from the subordinate ranks. He thought such an arrangement sound and worth trying.

75,285. *Lord Ronaldshay* then pointed out that it had been suggested to the Commission that in order to get rid of the distinction between the Provincial and the Imperial Services in the Telegraph Department.

4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

all officers should get the same pay, but that those recruited in England should draw in addition an "Exile Allowance" which would bring their pay up to the present level.

Mr. JAMES said that if officers were recruited in the way he had suggested, it would not be necessary to do that, because practically all would be appointed in England. Naturally that would be an expensive matter. But he saw no harm in the proposed arrangement.

Mr. THOMAS pointed out that special provision would have to be made for promoted subordinates. Under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed that one-eighth of the Engineering Branch of the service should be recruited from the subordinate ranks, and it was hardly likely that such men would be given the same pay as the Indians who had been to England, and received special training. Some distinction would have to be made between these two classes.

75,286. With regard to the difficulty of getting leave, Mr. JAMES thought that was probably due to the insufficiency of the cadre. He himself had not suffered in the way of furlough, but he had not always obtained the privilege leave he wanted. During the whole of his service he had been granted 54·8 per cent. of the privilege leave he had earned, and had lost 45·2 per cent., either because he could not be spared or for some other reason. That was rather a large amount to lose in 35 years. In some measure it was probably due to his waiting to take three months' leave, whereas if he had applied for two months he might have obtained it. That frequently happened throughout the service. For one reason or another he could get no privilege leave between April 1884 and April 1892. He had thus earned 8½ months' privilege leave, but as he could only take three months of it, he lost 5½ months. Quite recently he asked for privilege leave, but could not be spared. When he left the department in a few months there would be four months' privilege leave due to him, which he should not be able to take.

75,287. With regard to pensions, the present pension rules provided for Rs. 4,000 after twenty years' service, and Rs. 5,000 after 25 years, and there were extra pensions of Rs. 1,000 for three years' active service in certain grades, and a second extra pension of Rs. 2,000, which used to be given to the Director-General and the next senior officer, after 3 years' active service as such. It was now only given to the next senior officer, so that at the present moment he was the only officer earning it. The two last pensions depended entirely on the approval of Government, so that a man might retire after 85 years' service on Rs. 5,000 pension only. The average officer at the end of 20 years' service would be 41 to 43 years of age, but he might be in bad health. As a rule, after 20 years' service, if a man was going to be any good at all he was a very useful man, and was not a man the Government wished to get rid of. The officers of the department asked for a pension extending up to £700 a year after 30 years' service, on a non-contributory basis. Thirty years was a very long service to put in away from one's own country, and when a man went home he wished to live in a little comfort. The Indian Army after 32 years' service received £700, and the Indian Medical Service received the same amount after 30 years and had extra pensions as well. The cost of living in England was very much greater than it was when the present pensions were put into force. He did not think there would be any objection on the part of officers if they were allowed to contribute towards a greater pension. The pension was really so small that it was impossible to commute a portion of it to any useful purpose. Moreover at present pensions were commuted at a very different rate from that on which the pension was paid. The pension was paid at 1s. 9d., and the officer had to take the money for the portion commuted in this country and send it home at the current rate of exchange and therefore lost very considerably. They were allowed to contribute to the General Provident Fund but that

gave a poor rate of interest. Government borrowed money at 3½ per cent. and gave it to their officers at 4 per cent., whereas they wished to have 6 per cent. The General Provident Fund was a recent creation and was not of much use to the senior man. He himself would get at the outside probably about £1,500 from the Fund. Every officer who joined the service now had to subscribe 6¼ per cent. and might subscribe up to 12½ per cent.

Mr. THOMAS said he did not agree with Mr. James' remarks about commutation. The majority of officers would prefer to have the privilege of commuting a fourth of their pension, as it would take the place of insurance to a certain extent. They should be allowed to commute at 1s. 9d. unconditionally. At present, a medical certificate of good health was necessary before commutation could take place and even then a man was not entitled to commute without the sanction of the Government. Officers had to show that they had been unable to make any provision for their family owing to smallness of pay or for other reasons, and it was rather difficult to prove the case. The object no doubt was to prevent a man from unnecessarily alienating a part of his pension and there was a certain amount of reason in that contention, but he thought men should be allowed to accept that risk.

75,288. With reference to house accommodation, Mr. JAMES said the difficulty in obtaining houses was much greater in certain places than in others; it was more felt in large places. In Lucknow no officer could take a house except on a year's lease, and if one was transferred in the middle of the lease one might be let in for six or seven months' rent. The old arrangement by which a house could be taken by the month was dying out in India. He thought the Government might provide official houses at a reasonable rent, and it would probably pay them in the long run. When he left Calcutta he had to pay the difference in the rent, after sub-letting, and that difference amounted to Rs. 1,050, which was rather a large slice out of his salary.

Mr. THOMAS agreed.

75,289. In the matter of transfer allowances, Mr. JAMES considered that the Government should recognise the existence of an officer's family, and should reimburse him for the cost of transferring himself and his family and a reasonable amount of household goods. He himself had had a great many transfers, one being from Calcutta to Lucknow, which cost him, including the Rs. 1,050 already mentioned, Rs. 1,860, and he received a travelling allowance of Rs. 105, so that he lost Rs. 1,755, and that did not include breaking up the house, miscellaneous cartage, and other small charges.

75,290. (Sir Theodore Morison.) Mr. JAMES said he knew of no officer who had attempted to commute his pension with an insurance company. Officers did not want to commute at the average expectation of life, and that was the point of the medical certificate to which they objected. They wanted to get more than an insurance office would give. Also the portion commuted was so very small that in the event of death it would not be sufficient to support the widow. The commutation was not a boon from the Government, if commuted at the average expectation of life, but was a very substantial boon if valued above the expectation of life. The boon that the widow should receive one-fourth the pension commuted when an officer died in service was a costly one, but on the other hand if the pension was not paid Government would not be very seriously hurt by paying a small commutation to the widow.

75,291. With reference to the qualifications for recruits, they should either possess a Science or an Engineering Degree. The possession of an Engineering Degree would enable a man to gain very rapidly all the information he required on any given subject. The proposal was to take a purely academic qualification and then train the man either in England or in

4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

India. It would be very much better if he had a practical training in England before he came out. He would select men after they had taken their Engineering Degrees, at about 20-22, and give them either two or three years' training, probably two years would be sufficient. The Public Works Department recruits had not only to have an Engineering Degree, but also a year's experience of Works, and that would probably be part of the training in England. The Engineering Colleges in India generally did not give a training which would put a man on a par with the engineering training that was given in Glasgow or Manchester. Two years in visiting engineering works on the top of a training at Rurki would be quite sufficient; it would be a mistake to make it three years.

75,292. He had had experience of officers working under a time-scale and he could not agree that it caused men to become slack. If a man's confidential reports were unsatisfactory, his increments could be stopped, and that afforded quite a sufficient safeguard.

75,293. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said he had not had any experience of Colleges other than Rurki.

75,294. With regard to the expenses of Europeans being greater than those of Indians in India, he admitted that the cost of living of educated Indians, who adopted European standards, had risen, but they had not the expenses involved in continually going to England and in sending their families there.

75,295. With reference to the remark in the written statement that few Indians had received technical train in workshops, he thought there was no disinclination on their part to visit large works, but they had not the opportunity given to them. Electrical works in Europe were on a very much larger scale than in India. As to whether the training should be two years or three, might be settled by the Head of the Department, but two years were absolutely necessary. He could not say what work promoted subordinate officers would be doing, but he took it they would come in at about Rs. 370 so as not to interfere with the promotion of officers already in the grades. At the time they were ready for promotion they would not have had the same experience as those recruited and trained in England, and it would probably be necessary to send them to England for a training when they were selected for promotion. He did not think there would be a great number of them.

75,296. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness agreed that abstract scientific training could be given in Indian Colleges. The defect was really in the practical training in workshops. Telegraphy had become very specialised within recent years, and special training was required in telephone work, telegraph work, wireless work, lighting installations and power installations. There were no large workshops in India in connection with the Service and no experimental laboratories. Smaller workshops existed for instrument-making and repairing, but they were quite unable to give the necessary training.

75,297. With regard to the assertions in the written statement that it was most important to entrust every officer with, and make him responsible for, definite duties, and that a sense of personal responsibility could not commence too soon, what was meant was that recruits should have a good training in administrative work in offices as well as practical work. In the old days many an officer was in a sub-division probably for the first ten years of his service, and never saw the work in large offices, and consequently when cases were sent up to him he did not know how to deal with them from an administrative point of view.

75,298. As to the proposal for a salary of Rs. 3,000 as compensation for the loss of the Director-Generalship, that increase was simply asked for because a certain office had been taken away. The idea was that the senior officer, whether a Traffic or Engineering man, might be Director-General, if he was worthy of it,

because he had lost an appointment which he had hoped to obtain. It was really compensation that was being asked for.

75,299. On the point of pay, Mr. JAMES said officers were willing to take the view that the Indian and the European should have the same scale, but that certain allowances should be made to the European.

Mr. THOMAS said the present arrangement was very objectionable from the point of view of the Indian, and it would be less objectionable to give 33 per cent. increase in the form of exile allowance than to give the Indian officer two-thirds the pay of the English officer, although it came to the same thing in the end.

Mr. JAMES said the Indian officer did not like to feel he was not receiving the same pay when he was doing the same work, but he would probably not object to the Englishman, as an exile, having a certain percentage added to his pay.

75,300. On the question of leave, it was a recognised thing that a man could accumulate three months and combine it with three months' furlough. When an officer had accumulated privilege leave, and it could not be granted to him, he should be allowed to go on accumulating it and take it when he could be spared. If the Government gave a month's privilege leave every year, and said that if it were not taken they would not guarantee that it could be taken later on, he thought the officer would have to take the leave when it was due to him.

Mr. THOMAS pointed out that the great distances in India made a month of very little use; a holiday meant probably several days' journey in going and coming and the breaking up of the house. The conditions were quite different from England, and a period longer than a month was necessary if the holiday was to be of any value.

75,301. Dealing with the subject of pension, Mr. JAMES said the officers had always been given to understand that it represented deferred pay and not a compassionate allowance, and it was upon that ground that they desired to commute one-fourth at their own free will. It should be recognised that the accumulation was the personal property of the officers to be disposed of by them, and that the Government had no power to interfere.

75,302. With reference to the remark in the written statement in favour of the distinction between the Provincial Service and the Imperial Service, Mr. JAMES said that this only applied if the present system of recruitment remained the same. If the system of recruitment were changed on the lines indicated by him, then the whole thing would be modified.

75,303. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. THOMAS said that under the new scheme of Amalgamation it was intended that the Engineering work of the Telegraph Department should become entirely dissociated from the Traffic work, which was at present performed by Telegraph Officers. The staff of Engineers would be lessened by more than a half, and the Traffic staff would have to be increased, but there would be a considerable saving in the personnel.

75,304. With reference to the Provincial Service, Mr. JAMES said that the present Provincial Service consisted of officers who are appointed in India. Men who would be considered to be in the Provincial Service at present would be one Director, some Superintendents, and probably some Assistant Superintendents and one Assistant Superintendent apprentice. A man recruited in India received two-thirds of the pay of the Imperial Service and was considered a provincial man.

75,305. Mr. JAMES then said that in years to come it might be possible to have one examination for the Engineering staffs of the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, but he did not object to such an arrangement. In any case the training afterwards would have to be on different lines. A man who took an Engineering degree would be able to devote himself either to Civil Engineering or Electrical Engineering, as the



4 November 1913.]

Messrs. C. STREATFEILD-JAMES and I. C. THOMAS.

[Continued.]

actual mathematical and scientific training was more or less the same for both, the specialisation coming afterwards.

75,306. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. JAMES thought that the men promoted from the subordinate establishment into the Provincial Service would probably come from the same class socially as the men who might be appointed direct. The present Provincial staff lacked a sound knowledge of practical work, although they knew the ordinary A.B.C. of the work. Even trained men became rusty if they did not go to England occasionally. It would be really economical from the Public Service point of view to send the men to England, and it would be worth while paying them to get a good education in England. They should be given every opportunity to turn out the best work. The work required in the Telegraph Department would be much better done by men who had had a better training than could be obtained in India.

75,307. With reference to furlough pay at 1s. 6d. and pension at 1s. 9d., that came into force somewhere about 1893 after he entered the Service, and arose from the agitation of the Service itself. At first furlough allowance was paid at the current rate of Exchange but shortly afterwards it was raised to 1s. 6d. With regard to privilege leave, if an officer was not allowed to accumulate his leave, and was forced to take a month every year, in the event of his wife and children being in England, he would be

unable to go there to see them. It was only by accumulating his three months' leave that the uncovenanted service officer was able to get to England at all. Also it gave him an average of three-fourths pay when he was at home. If only the children were sent to England and the wife remained in India, if he had to take a month every year it would be necessary for him to take his wife to the hills and stay at a hotel or furnish a house, and break up his establishment in the plains, and thus add largely to the expense of living in India.

75,308. Mr. THOMAS said there were certain subordinates who were always provided with free quarters. There were very few houses which could be rented.

Mr. JAMES thought the Government might build houses and charge rents based on a percentage of salary.

75,309. (*Mr. Styan.*) Mr. THOMAS said he did not remember expressing agreement with any portion of the Amalgamation scheme. He was consulted on the drawing up of the scheme on every point, but it did not follow that he agreed with what was ultimately decided. With reference to experimental amalgamation in Bombay, the duties of Traffic and Engineering which were formerly carried on by one set of officers have now been separated. With regard to officers on tour by steamer, he proposed that in journeys by steamer the allowance should be the same as in journeys by rail both for transfers and for ordinary travelling.

The witnesses withdrew.

P. N. MITRA, Esq., Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, Lucknow Division.

*Written Statement on behalf of the Provincial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department.*

75,310. (I.) **Method of recruitment.**—For reasons to be explained later on, the Provincial Service should be entirely abolished. It is suggested that the Superior Establishment of this Department should, in future, be recruited as follows:—

(1) One half of the Officers will be recruited in England. Three-quarters of these should enter by open competitive examination in which only qualified men from the different Engineering Colleges will be admitted. The rest will be recruited from the different British engineering firms and junior officers of the British Post Office by selection.

(2) The other half will be recruited in India. Of these three-quarters will be by open competitive Examination in which only qualified men from the different Indian Engineering Colleges will be admitted. The rest will be recruited from the subordinate staff of the Department by selection.

Candidates for the open Examination in both countries should be between 21 and 25 years of age. They should submit medical certificates of fitness. The standard of examination should be the same in England and India, as far as practicable; the subjects should be the different branches of Electrical Engineering, Theoretical and Practical, Mechanism, Mathematics applied to Electrical Engineering, Chemistry and Surveying.

75,311. (II.) **System of training and probation.**—The recruitment by competitive Examination will guarantee a preliminary training sufficient to meet the requirements of the profession in India. The selections from engineering firms and the British Post Office and from the subordinate service in India will have to be made very carefully so as to secure the same end, viz., the efficient performance of the duties required of a Telegraph Engineer in India.

The college training of the recruits of the Indian Colleges is at present supplemented by a period of training on probation for one year in the Department. Recruits obtained from England do not pass through this supplementary training. This probationary period in the Department is absolutely essential and should

be insisted upon as an indispensable condition in case of all recruits and it should in addition be a probationary period in the strictest sense involving selection and the possibility of rejection at the end of it. Any plea that it is unfair or will deter candidates from England by reason of the attached risk may be met by the grant of free return passages to rejected probationers.

The period of probation should be limited to one year at the end of which the recruit's fitness for service should be considered.

The passing of the Signalling test should be made a condition for the first increment instead of the confirmation as at present.

75,312. (III.) **Conditions of service.**—The conditions of service should be the same for all officers whether recruited in England or in India. At present the conditions differ very considerably and this is the sole cause of the great discontent which prevails among officers recruited in India. Notwithstanding the fact that both classes of officers are recruited for and are required to do exactly the same work and bear the same responsibilities, the conditions of service for officers recruited in England are, in every respect, better than those for officers recruited in India.

75,313. (IV.) **Conditions of salary.**—The present pay of the officers recruited in India is approximately two-thirds of the pay of the officers recruited in England. This is utterly unfair and unsuitable. Under the present system the minimum pay of an Indian trained Superintendent is less than the maximum pay of an Imperial Assistant Superintendent and the minimum pay of an Indian trained Director is less than the maximum pay of an Imperial Superintendent. It therefore sometimes happens that an Indian trained officer has under him an Imperial officer drawing more pay than himself. A case in point is the present Director of Burma Circle (who is an Indian trained officer) drawing less pay than the Superintendent of the Rangoon Division who is working under him. This position is absolutely untenable.

The present scale of pay sanctioned for the Imperial Officers appears to be adequate. The pay granted to the Indian trained element is absolutely

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. N. MITRA.

[Continued.]

inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities. It is therefore desirable that the rate of pay should be the same for all.

In consideration of the fact that the officers recruited in England are put to extra expenditure on account of they themselves and their family going home on leave or returning to India on expiry of leave, it is suggested that a first class return passage to England be given to all officers recruited in England once in 5 years.

**Local Allowances.**—The local allowances at present sanctioned for Indian trained officers are two-thirds of those sanctioned for officers obtained from England. This difference is unjust, for these allowances are given for specific reasons, i.e., as compensation for local disabilities which affect both classes of officers equally.

**Probation period.**—Not only have the Indian trained officers to undergo a probationary period and thereby incur the consequent risk of rejection, but even after completing such probation, the period is not counted for increments and promotion. This causes inequality between the two classes of officers. There should be no distinction whatever in the matter of emoluments of any nature between the two classes of officers. The emoluments should depend solely on services rendered and not on the country of original recruitment.

**75,314. (V.) Conditions of leave.**—Here again there is much disparity between the conditions prevailing as regards the two classes of officers. The leave rules should be the same for all classes of officers. The nature of the work performed being the same, an Indian trained Telegraph Engineer needs leave for his health quite as much as the officers from England.

The following modifications in the Leave rules are suggested:—

(1) Privilege leave may be allowed to accumulate to a maximum of 6 months.

(2) The minimum limit of 6 months for combined leave should be entirely abolished, no limit being fixed.

(3) Furlough up to a maximum of 2 years in the whole service may be allowed on full pay in lieu of 4 years ordinary furlough.

(4) The maximum furlough allowance admissible to officers on leave in India may be increased from Rs. 666 2/3 monthly to Rs. 12,000 yearly.

The leave rules that are now under the consideration of the Government of India are, in other respects, quite adequate; they should be made the same for both classes of officers.

In counting leave towards pensions, there should be no difference between periods spent in India and out of India vide C. S. R. Art. 408.

**75,315. (VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The Pension Rules should be the same for both classes of officers. It is a well and universally established principle that pensions are granted as a retiring provision for services rendered to the State and it is therefore illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have in fact rendered exactly the same service. In other words pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on services rendered and not on the country of original recruitment, for this does not involve any special merit.

Some provision should be made for the families of officers dying in actual service. Though every officer joins the Provident Fund, the amount at his credit is not sufficient in the event of his death for the maintenance of his family or the proper education of his children, who are therefore left in a more or less destitute condition. It is therefore not unreasonable to ask that the amount of pension to which such an officer would have been entitled should be commuted for the benefit of his family.

The pension rules now in force require revision. Conditions of life have undergone many changes since

the times these rules were framed. The cost of living has increased very much. The following scale of pension is suggested.

Years of Completed Service.	Scale or Fraction of Average Emoluments.	Maximum Limit.	
		£	Rs.
10	$\frac{2}{60}$ ths	133½	2,000
11	$\frac{21}{60}$ ths	146½	2,200
12	$\frac{22}{60}$ ths	160	2,400
13	$\frac{23}{60}$ ths	173½	2,600
14	$\frac{24}{60}$ ths	186½	2,800
15	$\frac{25}{60}$ ths	200	3,000
16	$\frac{26}{60}$ ths	230	3,450
17	$\frac{27}{60}$ ths	260	3,900
18	$\frac{28}{60}$ ths	290	4,350
19	$\frac{29}{60}$ ths	320	4,800
20	$\frac{30}{60}$ ths	350	5,250
21		380	5,700
22		410	6,150
23		440	6,600
24		470	7,050
25		500	7,500
26		540	8,100
27		580	8,700
28		620	9,300
29		660	9,900
30		700	10,500

**75,316. (VII.)** Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of services into Imperial and Provincial.—There should be no limitations whatever. Considerations of domicile, race, colour, or creed should have nothing to do with appointments. All should be allowed equal chances for competing in the examinations.

The division of the services into Imperial and Provincial is keenly felt by all Provincial officers of this Department. This distinction between officers who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibilities cannot be justified on any account and will result in splitting up the service into two hostile camps which will greatly injure efficiency. A deep and widespread feeling of suspicion and distrust will gradually spring up between the two classes of officers and this must wreck harmonious working. The Provincial service was the outcome of the Public Service Commission of 1886 and all Provincial service officers in this Department earnestly pray that the present Commission may be pleased to recommend the removal of this long and keenly felt grievance and restore the conditions of service to those that existed before.

**75,317. (IX.) Other points.** (1) *Analogy with other Provincial services.*—The case of the Provincial service officers of this Department is similar in every respect to that of the Provincial service officers of the Public Works Department and the Railways. The former have all been recruited from Roorkee and most of them would have got appointments in the Public Works Department if allowed to take them. Three of them beat the Public Work Department men of their years in the final examination and carried away most of the prizes, including some Civil Engineering subjects. The slight difference made in the conditions of service of the two Provincial services in the last reorganisation has caused a certain amount of disappointment. It is therefore hoped that Provincial service officers of this Department will receive the same treatment as Provincial service officers of the Public Works Department and the Railways. There is no analogy with other Provincial services. In other departments, Provincial service officers are not borne on the same list as Imperial officers, nor are they

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. N. MITRA.

[Continued.]

entrusted with same class of duties and responsibilities.

(2) Great difficulty is experienced by the majority of officers in getting suitable house accommodation in most stations. It is suggested that the Government provide quarters for its officers more freely.

(3) The travelling allowances admissible on transfer under the present rules are universally recognised to be inadequate. More liberal allowances should be given to cover all reasonable charges incurred by an officer breaking up his home and having to move his family from one station to another. This may be

limited to actual certified charges not exceeding 4 First Class Railway and Steamer fares, 2 Third class or Deck fares plus an allowance for 40 maunds of Luggage.

(4) Travelling allowances should be admissible to officers returning from long leave. In cases of officers on leave out of India, these should be calculated from the port of debarkation in India or the station from which leave was taken whichever is less. In case of officers on leave in India these should be given from the place where orders are received or the station from which leave was taken whichever is less.

Mr. P. N. MITRA called and examined.

75,318. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness stated that he joined the Department as Assistant Superintendent apprentice from Rurki in November 1903, and was confirmed in 1905 as Assistant Superintendent and was now in charge of a Division. The written statement sent in represented in the main the views of the whole Service, and he had been elected by vote as a representative of the Service. No conference was held. He drafted the written statement, and circulated it to all officers and asked for opinions and suggestions, which were incorporated, and then the document was printed. There were a few suggestions sent in, but the draft was generally approved.

75,319. With regard to recruitment, three-fourths of the recruits should be by competitive examination, whether in England or India. The written statement was based on the present system in the department, and he did not know anything about the new Amalgamation scheme. The recruitment was three and four every alternate year in England, and two and one in India. If the examination was held in England and in India, both Englishmen and Indians should be eligible to compete in either examination, and as far as possible the examinations should be of an equal standard. He thought it would be quite possible at the present time to carry out an examination in India which would be of the same standard as an examination in England. The curriculum of the Engineering Colleges in India was more or less the same as that of the Colleges in England. At present recruits from India were obliged to undergo a period of probation, whereas those recruited in England had not to do so. That was probably owing to the fact that when the system was introduced the curriculum in India was probably not so high, but it was very much higher now, and good progress had been made in teaching electrical engineering. At present it was necessary for both Indian and English recruits to undergo a period of probation in studying the technicalities of the department, but the period of training of the English recruits was not termed probation and counted for promotion in the service. His suggestion was that one-fourth of the recruits in India should be promoted from the upper subordinate service, the men being selected according to merit and not according to seniority. He did not think it would matter at what age they were selected if they could work properly. A man who had passed nearly the whole of his service in the subordinate grades, if a capable and energetic man, would be quite fit for promotion towards the end of his service. He was also in favour of comparatively young men being promoted, if sufficiently brilliant, and he did not think that would cause any discontent in the ranks of the subordinate service.

75,320. With regard to pay, he suggested it should be exactly the same for the Imperial and the Provincial Services, and that the Provincial Service should be abolished. He was not prepared to say it was necessary to recruit a certain number of Europeans for the Service, but there might be circumstances which would justify it. His own opinion was that a certain number of Europeans was desirable. Recognising that a European officer had certain expenses in

the way of sending home his children to be educated, and had probably to have an establishment in England as well as in India, and pay large sums in passage money in going to and fro, a concession had been allowed in the written statement of a first-class return passage once every five years, and he thought that was sufficient to make up for the additional expenditure the Englishman had to incur. The Indian officer had also to train his children, and his cost of living was sometimes more than that of a European.

75,321. On the subject of pensions, the witness considered that if an officer died during the period of his service his family should be entitled to some consideration. The provision made by the General Provident Fund was not sufficient. The system of pensions was drawn up, no doubt, on an actuarial basis, and if the scheme put forward in the written statement was put into operation the actuarial calculations might be upset, and greater expense would be thrown upon the Government, but he thought that expense ought to be incurred. In connection with travelling allowances, the Service asked that a more liberal scale should be granted, and that the officers should not be put to expense when transferred from one place to another. He himself, for instance, had been transferred from Lucknow to Burma, where he remained for about nine months, and was then transferred back, and he estimated that he lost about 800 odd rupees. His pay was Rs. 535.

75,322. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said he had taken a diploma from the Thomason College in Engineering. The age at which a diploma in Engineering was taken in Rurki was about 21 or 22. He had not been to England. His proposal was that the men should pass their examination in England and come out to India and go through a period of probation with the Indians who entered from the Engineering Colleges in India. He did not think any practical training in England was necessary. A man who had taken an Electrical Engineering degree in a University was quite able to enter the department and do the work at once. He was not aware that it was necessary for a boy who wished to have an electrical engineering career in England to spend at least three years in big works after leaving the University, and pay a heavy fee, in order that he might commence at the bottom of a department in some electrical company. Most of the officers were graduates in science of the different Universities, and obtained a three-years' training in an Engineering College, and he thought that was quite enough to make them of value to the Telegraph department in India.

75,323. (*Mr. Chaulbal.*) The witness considered that officers should obtain study leave to keep themselves up-to-date, and if they did not do so their increments should not be given. If facilities were given, men could go to England and visit large works there. He himself was a B.A. of the Calcutta University with Honours in Science, and he had some knowledge of the subjects which were taught in the Engineering Colleges for the Public Works Department. The B.A. Degree and the Engineering Course at Thomason

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. N. MITRA.

[Continued.]

College he believed was sufficient to enable him to carry on his work when he was first employed in the department, and with that education and training he could have entered the Public Works Department. A class-fellow of his was in the Public Works Department at present.

75,324. (Mr. Abdur Rahim.) The witness said a certain amount of laboratory work was done at the Thomason College, but not much practical work in electrical engineering. The work was mostly theoretical with a small amount of practical, but was quite sufficient for the Telegraph Department.

75,325. (Mr. Styan.) The witness admitted that he himself asked to be sent back from Burma. He quoted his last transfer only to show the inadequacy of travelling allowances. During his ten years' service

he had had about 18 transfers, and very few of these were at his own request. The views expressed with regard to Europeans in the Department were his own, but they had been approved by other officers. It was taken for granted that a certain number of Europeans was necessary, and that the question was not to be discussed. He thought everyone should be given some chance of keeping himself up-to-date, whether Provincial or Imperial, and study leave should be given to both branches. He believed it was a fact that there had only been one college that ever had a training class for telegraphic work, and that class was now closed, but it would reopen if it was found necessary. The College was told by the Department of Commerce and Industry that no more recruitment would be made from that class and the class was closed.

The witness withdrew.

### At Calcutta, Monday, 19th January 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

Sir MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.  
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

G. R. CLARKE, Esq., I.C.S., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

G. W. SCHÖNEMAN, Esq., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office.

*Written Statement relating to the Post Office of India.*

75,326. (I) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The present method of recruitment for the appointment of Superintendent is as follows:—

(1) By nomination from outside the Department for the appointment of Superintendent or Probationary Superintendent.

(2) By selection and promotion from the subordinate ranks of the Department.

The nominations from outside the Department are ordinarily confined to statutory "Natives of India" as defined in Article 37 of the Civil Service Regulations, but the Director-General has power to appoint non-domiciled Europeans to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total staff of Superintendents. The Indian candidates selected are usually graduates of a recognised University.

This system is satisfactory, and, having regard to the qualifications required of a Superintendent and the nature of his duties, it is preferable to selection by competition.

75,327. (II) **Training and Probation.**—Men who are nominated for the appointment of Superintendent from outside the Department are appointed after a short period of training, the duration of which depends on the occurrence of a vacancy to which they can be appointed permanently. Usually they are first taken on as Probationary Superintendents, of which there are one or two appointments attached to each Postal Circle.

All candidates who have been selected for the appointment of Superintendent, whether from outside the Department or from the subordinate ranks, are required to pass a departmental examination, after which they become eligible for appointment.

The arrangement is satisfactory, and I have no suggestions to make.

75,328. (III) **Conditions of Service.**—I have no remarks to offer under this head.

75,329. (IV) **Conditions of Salary.**—The following are the existing grades of pay of Superintendents of post offices:—

1st grade	-	-	Rs. 500—20—600
2nd "	-	-	Rs. 400—20—500
3rd "	-	-	Rs. 300—20—400
4th "	-	-	Rs. 250
5th "	-	-	Rs. 200

In my opinion this grading is inadequate, and should be revised as follows:—

1st grade	-	-	Rs. 500—20—700
2nd "	-	-	Rs. 400—20—500
3rd "	-	-	Rs. 300—20—400
4th "	-	-	Rs. 200—20—300

The two lowest grades of Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 (fixed) tend to retard promotion, and it takes a Superintendent a long time to reach the pay of Rs. 300. Considering the position he is required to occupy and the nature of his duties, it should not take him more than five years to reach the pay of Rs. 300.

As regards the highest grade, a maximum pay of Rs. 700 will be suitable for the most senior Superintendents who are not considered fit for promotion to the higher appointments.

Probationary Superintendents are entertained usually on Rs. 80 or Rs. 100, except in Burma, where the Probationary Superintendent draws Rs. 150. In my opinion Rs. 80 is not a suitable pay for a Probationary Superintendent. I do not consider it a sufficient

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. W. SCHÖNEMAN.

[Continued.]

argument that we can get men on that pay, because we could, no doubt, get men on even less pay, and possibly on no pay at all if the period of probation was not too long. We should give a Probationary Superintendent a sufficient allowance to enable him to maintain himself with some regard to the position for which he is a candidate. He has sometimes to wait two or three years before being appointed as a Superintendent, and has in the meantime to remain at the headquarters of the Postmaster-General, which is always a large and expensive town. I recommend that the minimum pay for a Probationary Superintendent be fixed at Rs. 100, and that there should be another grade of Rs. 125 to provide for those Probationary Superintendents who have been kept waiting unduly long for appointment as Superintendent.

75,330. (V) Conditions of Leave.—6. Under Article 314 (a) of the Civil Service Regulations, relating to "Long Leave—European services," the leave allowance for ordinary furlough is *half the average salary*, and the term "Average salary" is defined in Article 16 to mean "the average of the salary which an officer has earned during so much of the three years preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave."

There does not appear to be sufficient justification for taking "average salary" into account, and the leave allowance for ordinary furlough should be half the salary drawn by the officer on the day preceding that on which he gives up office,—or at all events, half the salary earned by him during so much of the year preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave.

In the case of pensions, the calculations in Article 474 (b) of the Civil Service Regulations take into account "Average emoluments," which term is defined in Article 487 as meaning "the average calculated upon the last three years of service." It is presumed that the ground for taking the *average for the last three years* into account in this case is that an officer might otherwise retire as soon as he had received promotion, and Government might then have to pay pension at a higher rate during the rest of the officer's lifetime.

In the case of furlough allowance, however, the payment at the higher rate would be for a limited period, and, ordinarily, the officer would return to duty at the end of his leave. Under the existing rule, an officer who has not been able to afford to take furlough until he has earned an increase of pay, is obliged to serve another three years after earning the increase before he can afford to take the furlough necessary for him to recuperate his health.

Moreover, in the case of furlough allowance the present rule operates against *all* officers, irrespective of the amount of their salary, whereas, in the case of pension, it operates only against those whose "average emoluments" amount to *less* than the maximum pension admissible to officers of his class. For instance, the rule would operate against an officer who had been drawing a salary of Rs. 2,000 for two years and was proceeding on furlough, whereas, in the case of an officer who had earned his full pension of Rs. 5,000 a year, equal to Rs. 416½ a month, the rule would operate against him only if his average emoluments amounted to less than Rs. 833½.

75,331. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The *maximum* amount of ordinary pensions admissible under Article 474 (b) of the Civil Service Regulations should be raised from Rs. 5,000 a year (or Rs. 416½ a month) to Rs. 6,000 a year (or Rs. 500 a month), and this should not affect the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year which is at present allowed to the officers referred to in Article 475. It is obvious that a scale of pensions which was fixed half a century (or more) ago is not adequate in the present day. It needs no argument to show that the purchasing power of the rupee has diminished greatly in the interval and that the neces-

saries of life cost very much more now than when the present scale of pensions was fixed.

The grant of an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year to the officers referred to in Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations is subject to the provisions of Article 464. Clause (b) of Article 464 lays down that all officiating and temporary service counts towards the minimum of three years effective service required before the concession can be granted, but excepts periods during which an officer officiates for another absent on *privilege leave*. There may possibly be some technical justification for this exception, but it is hardly equitable that an officer who actually performs the duties of the appointment in several privilege leave vacancies should be debarred from counting that officiating service, which may easily amount to a year, merely on the ground that the officer for whom he officiated was absent on *privilege leave*.

In my opinion, the exception in Article 464 should be abolished.

I am also of opinion that all officers should be allowed to commute a portion of their pension not exceeding ¼th without medical examination, and without reference to the purpose for which it is wanted, provided that the commutation is applied for within one year of retirement. A medical examination is necessary only if Government were dealing with the matter on actuarial lines, but it should not be necessary to do this. An officer whose health has suffered on account of strenuous work on behalf of Government during a long series of years has quite as much necessity for paying off his debts or providing for his family as another officer whose constitution was more robust.

As regards the particular purpose for which commutation is wanted, there is, in practice, no effective check on the disposal of the money. The endeavour to apply a check is unnecessarily inquisitorial and leads to much correspondence that should be avoided.

75,332. (VII) Limitations in Employment of Non-Europeans.—There is no such limitation and it is not required.

75,333. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—In 1886-87 there were, besides the Director-Generalship, six appointments of Postmasters-General and the Public Services Commission of that year recommended that "not less than three" of these appointments "should ordinarily be filled by promotion within the Department."

This was generally understood in the Department to mean that not less than one-half the number of the highest appointments referred to above should be open to officers of the Department, but, in practice, it has been interpreted to mean that, no matter how many appointments of Postmasters-General there may be at a given time, the officers of the Department had no claim to more than three of them. For the last two or three years only, have as many as four officers of the Department held appointments of Postmasters-General although the total number of appointments (including the Director-Generalship) was 8 before 1906, 10 from 1906 to 1908, and 11 since 1908.

In my opinion, it should be laid down clearly that not less than one-half the number of the highest appointments should be filled by promotion of officers of the *Post Office* and that if the total number of appointments is an odd number, the officers of the *Post Office* should be given the benefit of the extra appointment. This should, as at present, be subject to the reservation that Departmental officers fit for promotion are available. This will necessitate an explanation being furnished to Government whenever the officers of the *Post Office* are not given a proper share of the higher appointments.

A clear rule on the subject is even more necessary now than hitherto, in view of the proposed amalgama-

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. W. SCHÖNEMAN.

[Continued.]

tion of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments. If any of the higher appointments of the Post Office are given to officers of the Telegraph Department (a telegraph officer has actually been acting as Postmaster-General for over 1½ years), it should be at the expense

of the civilians and not of the officers of the Postal branch.

75,334. (IX) Other Points, within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission.—There are no other points on which I have any remarks to offer.

Mr. G. W. SCHÖNEMAN called and examined.

75,335. (Lord Ronaldshay.) The witness had been 33 years in the postal service, and had served as superintendent and Deputy Director-General. He had also officiated as Postmaster-General. As Deputy Director-General, he was included in the 10 Postmasters-General. He was recruited as an inspector and went through the superintendent's grade.

75,336. There was no rule as to whether appointments to the higher posts should be made from the superintendent or the postmaster branch. The higher posts were filled from either side, but the superintendents obtained most of them. It was a matter of selection, and there was no restriction as to the number of postmasters who might be selected.

75,337. He was satisfied with the present system of recruitment and did not think it desirable to lay down any fixed proportion of Indians. The majority of superintendents at present were Indians. Superintendents were recruited partly direct and partly by promotion. The present proportion was about half and half. This was satisfactory.

75,338. Two years was not too much for a superintendent to be on probation before being given a permanent appointment, but there had been cases in which the period had been three years. The minimum pay for a probationary superintendent should be Rs. 100 with a rise to Rs. 125 for those who were kept waiting for more than two years. Recently the minimum pay had been raised from Rs. 80 to Rs. 100, which was so much to the good.

75,339. An All-India list for probationary superintendents was not necessary. The present system of provincial lists should be retained on the ground that an Indian served better in his own province, and was not always willing to leave it. Any inequalities could be regulated by the Director-General in making appointments.

75,340. There was no objection to laying down a higher educational qualification in the case of Indians, as the field from which they were drawn was much larger than the field of the domiciled community.

75,341. The justification for raising the present maximum of pay to Rs. 700 was that the number of superintendents had largely increased. There were 172 now, as compared with 120 at the time of the last Public Services Commission, while the number of higher appointments was about stationary. Some compensation was needed for the men who did not get the higher appointments. There was no difficulty in securing an adequate supply of superintendents at the present rates of pay, but, looking at the higher appointments which would have to be filled later on, a better class of recruit should be obtained. To achieve that there should be an increase in the superintendent's pay.

75,342. In theory a graded was better than a general incremental system of pay for superintendents, as those who received their increments regularly had not a great incentive to work. At present officers were promoted *ordinarily* from one grade to another by seniority, but grade promotion could be withheld if necessary. It was true that, under a graded system, it was possible that a deserving man might be prevented from receiving promotion owing to the accident of non-retirement or lack of casualties in the higher grades. This being so he was prepared to accept a general incremental system of pay provided that it

contained a selection bar at a given point. This might be put at Rs. 500.

75,343. Of late years the pay of the postmasters had been improved very considerably, and at present they had nothing to complain of.

75,344. The cadre was not large enough to enable men always to obtain the leave to which they were entitled. Furlough allowances were also so low that men did not take what they ought to take, and the rules on the subject ought to be revised. There could be no objection to commutation of furlough if it was left optional, and many members of the service would welcome such a provision.

75,345. Every kind of officiating duty should count towards the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year allowed by Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations, so long as the officer had been actually on duty for three years.

75,346. At present a medical certificate was required for commutation of pension, and probably the man who had worked hardest, and was in bad health, was the very man who could not obtain it. No medical certificate should be required, and there should be no inquisitorial enquiries as to the purpose to which the commutation was going to be put. Commutation should be allowed for not more than a quarter of the pension, as now, but the present restrictions should be removed.

75,347. It was optional with officers who were in the service when the General Provident Fund was started to subscribe to it or not. The provident fund on the existing lines would not be a substitute for commutation of pension.

75,348. (Sir Murray Hammick.) His main objection to the existing rules for commutation was that, if a man asked to commute a portion of his pension in order to secure provision for his widow, it would not be allowed by the Government. The establishment of a family pension fund would not obviate the necessity for commutation of pension, as there were many things for which a man might require money.

75,349. It was not necessary that opportunities be given to senior superintendents, or specially-selected men, to go to England to investigate postal arrangements. All that was necessary could be learned in India. Experience in England was more likely to be of benefit when a man had passed the grade of superintendent.

75,350. Superintendents did not take as much leave as officers in other services because they could not afford it. If paid as well as officers in other services, it might be possible to compel them to take furlough.

75,351. Ordinarily superintendents were promoted to be Deputy Postmasters-General. There might be one or two cases of postmasters being promoted to that line, but they usually went on to be Presidency Postmasters. The pay of the higher appointments in the postmaster's line was much the same as that of the Deputy Postmasters-General. There was no reason why men should not be selected from both lines to be Postmasters-General; but the training that a postmaster obtained in large post offices like Bombay or Calcutta was not sufficiently diversified to fit him for the work. The experience of superintendents made them better men for the post. The promotion of postmasters should be quite exceptional.



19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. W. SCHÖNEMAN.

[Continued.]

75,352. During the last 10 years the Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans, who had come into the department, were not as good a class as they were 20 years and more ago. In these days men could obtain appointments in private firms to a much larger extent than formerly, and also Indians were taken into the department in much larger numbers, and that had affected the recruitment of Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans. Also the educational facilities of the schools were not quite so good as they used to be. A definite set of appointments should not be put aside for the domiciled community in the Post Office. The matter should be left in the hands of the Director-General. There was no danger that the domiciled community would be lost sight of and that the department would cease to be manned in part from that class. The present 10 per cent. for non-domiciled Europeans was quite sufficient.

75,353. He did not think he had been very fortunate himself in the service as he obtained his present appointment only in August last at the age of nearly 52, after 33 years' service.

75,354. The superintendents were not absolutely discontented, but they felt they ought to receive better pay, the present pay, owing to the rise in prices, being insufficient.

75,355. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) At present there were 16 probationary superintendents. There was an Indian Assistant Director-General and an Indian Deputy Postmaster-General. On the 1st September 1912, there was no Indian in the higher posts. The fixing of 10 per cent. for non-domiciled Europeans was to meet the case of field service and of planting districts, where the planters preferred to have European superintendents. The superintendents had to meet the planters in connection with all postal arrangements. The planters had to arrange for post office accommodation, for example, and preferred to deal with a European superintendent. A proper understanding between them was essential.

75,356. Postmasters below Rs. 300 were not gazetted officers.

75,357. Men who came from the subordinate ranks to be superintendents might be inspectors or clerks who had passed the departmental examination. Postmasters below Rs. 300 also had the opportunity of passing the examination and of entering the superintendents' line. There should be no interchange between the two classes of work, as they were entirely different.

75,358. Nominations of men from outside the department were usually made by the Postmaster-General. No advertisement was issued, but a large number of applications came in from time to time and were entered in a register, which was consulted whenever an appointment had to be filled up. It was only once in about three years that it was necessary to select a man. Under the present system men could be obtained with all the qualifications necessary. There was no objection to advertising the posts, and if men possessed qualities suitable for the office, there could, of course, be no objection to their having higher educational qualifications than they frequently had at present.

75,359. The years taken by a subordinate to rise to superintendent's rank varied between seven and ten; but there was no reason why a really competent man, who had been three years in the service, should not go up for the departmental examination and become eligible for appointment as superintendent. He could

not say off-hand how many years it took a man, at the present time, to rise from the lowest to the highest grade of superintendents.

75,360. His statement that it was not desirable to have one All-India list for superintendents and postmasters referred to probationary superintendents. There was at present an All-India register for promotion for superintendents.

75,361. Government officials looked upon pension as deferred pay; but he was not certain whether Government admitted that it was so. The fact remained, however, that men received a certain pension, and if they were entitled to it there was no reason why a portion of it should not be capitalised.

75,362. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The qualifications of a candidate for a superintendentship were education, physique, antecedent social status and power of controlling establishments. The minimum standard of education was matriculation or its equivalent. Men were usually graduates. If a graduate possessed the necessary qualifications for the post, there was no reason why he should not be selected. There was a rough idea of keeping up a proportion as between the various communities in making appointments of probationary superintendents; but otherwise Indians of all classes, Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans were all considered together. The matter was and should be left entirely in the Postmaster-General's hands. With the small number of such appointments it would be very difficult to lay down any fixed proportion for any community. If the Muhammadans or the Hindus complained, the Postmaster-General would consider the complaint. There was no fixed principle either in appointing postmasters, but as a matter of fact nearly all of them were Indians. The postmaster worked up from a subordinate appointment, and if an Anglo-Indian entered as a clerk he could work up in the same way. Postmasters usually began in the very lowest grades of postmasters, and were there practically clerks, and were interchangeable with clerks.

75,363. (*Mr. Clarke.*) The pay of the ordinary superintendent should rise to Rs. 700 a month, and the brilliant man should go beyond. The efficiency bar at Rs. 500 should not prevent the average man from rising to Rs. 700. He had no objection to a time-scale beginning at Rs. 200 and going straight to Rs. 700, so long as there was a point at which the question of efficiency for a promotion to the higher grades was considered.

75,364. Certain Presidency Postmasters had been promoted to be Postmaster-General and there was nothing to prevent a good man in the postmasters' line becoming a Postmaster-General. The administrative work which a Presidency Postmaster had to do was as difficult as the work a Deputy Postmaster-General had to do, and a good postmaster, if fit for promotion, would ordinarily be selected for a Presidency Postmastership.

75,365. The list of applicants for the appointment of probationary superintendent in the department was a very large one, and more than was necessary. Probationary superintendents were selected in the province to which they belonged, and directly they became superintendents were put on to a general list for promotion.

75,366. A senior probationary assistant in charge of a division would, under his proposal to have a higher grade of Rs. 125, draw Rs. 165 (pay Rs. 125 plus acting allowance Rs. 40), but he would agree to their having the pay of the lowest grade of superintendent.

The witness withdrew.

19 January 1914.]

Messrs. R. W. HANSON, C. D. RAE, and H. K. RAHA.

[Continued.]

R. W. HANSON, Esq., Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office ;  
C. D. RAE, Esq., Deputy Postmaster, Calcutta ; and  
H. K. RAHA, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Midnapur Division.

(These three witnesses were examined together upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMin, Sinclair, and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs 75,213–31.)

75,367. Mr. HANSON also wrote :—

I agree generally with the memorandum on behalf of the superintendents and gazetted postmasters of the Post Office, India, which was submitted to the Royal Commission, in June last, by Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, Deputy Postmaster-General, Bombay, subject to the following modifications :—

*Methods of Recruitment.*—It has been stated that domiciled European candidates selected for the post of superintendents should be ordinarily under-graduates.

As the European schools in India teach according to the European Schools' Code, domiciled European or Anglo-Indian candidates should be required to pass the highest examination under this Code.

*Conditions of Salary.*—The pay of superintendents should be fixed according to the time-scale, rising from Rs. 250 to Rs. 800, after 22 years' service, by annual increments of Rs. 25.

The pay of Deputy Postmasters-General and Postmasters-General should also be increased proportionately.

*Conditions of Leave.*—The request for 45 days' privilege leave after 10½ months' service is, in my opinion, not justified.

75,368. Mr. RAHA wrote :—

To secure the admission of the best available candidates into the service, it is desirable that the principal avenue of admission into the service should be an open competition. All superintendents should be appointed from probationary superintendents and no one should be appointed direct. The probationary superintendents should be recruited as follows :—

80 per cent. by competitive examination in India open to selected natives of India who must ordinarily be graduates of an Indian university.

10 per cent. from departmental officials by promotion after passing a departmental test.

10 per cent. by nomination of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General.

In this connection it is submitted that there is at present no necessity for the recruitment of non-domiciled Europeans to the service.

*Conditions of Service.*—The service should be constituted as a Superior Postal Service with pay from Rs. 300 rising to Rs. 1,500 in the manner mentioned below. (The pay of the service at present is Rs. 200 to Rs. 1,400, leaving out of consideration the appoint-

ments of Postmasters-General and Deputy Directors-General.) Rs. 300 to Rs. 500 by annual increments of Rs. 30 in 20 years and three grades of Rs. 1,100, Rs. 1,300 and Rs. 1,500, the three highest grades comprising the appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General, Assistant Director-General, Inspector-General, R.M.S., and Presidency Postmaster. The cadre of this service should include the appointments of postmasters on salaries of Rs. 500 to Rs. 800. Post offices for which such high pay is justified will be in charge of superintendents, as the officers in charge of such offices are expected to possess higher administrative qualifications than are necessary for postmasters in charge of offices on lower pay.

The appointments in the three highest grades referred to above should be filled up from among superintendents according to seniority. No officer who has risen to the top and is still working with diligence and integrity should be passed over. In regard to the pay proposed for the service, besides what has already been stated in the memorandum of Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, I would respectfully point out that, on account of the rapidly-increasing work of the department, it is inevitable that before long there must be considerable devolution of authority from the Postmaster-General to Divisional Superintendents. It is, therefore, absolutely necessary that the pay and status of the service should be raised and that the conditions of the service should be sufficiently attractive.

Postmasters up to the grade of Rs. 400—20—500 should constitute a subordinate service analogous to the subordinate service in the Telegraph Department. Such officers and their offices should always be under the control of a superintendent.

I consider that the pay of the Paymasters-General and Deputy Directors-General should be raised to Rs. 2,000—100—3,000. Half of these appointments, as stated in Mr. Byrne's memorandum, should be reserved as prizes for the postal service and half for members of the Indian Civil Service. Appointments to this rank of departmental officers should, of course, be always by selection, two appointments at least being listed for Indians. Members of the Indian Civil Service selected for the department should be officers of at least 10 years' standing and they should elect for the department once for all. They should undergo a period of training before joining service in this department.

Messrs. R. W. HANSON, C. D. RAE, and H. K. RAHA called and examined.

75,369. (Lord Ronaldshay.) Mr. HANSON was a second grade Superintendent of Post Offices and was at present officiating as Assistant Director-General. His permanent pay was Rs. 500 and his officiating allowance Rs. 160. The greater part of his service had been spent as Divisional Superintendent. He had worked up from a Deputy Postmastership. Mr. RAE was Deputy Postmaster of Calcutta in the first grade of postmasters and had held that appointment since 1909. Previous to that he was in the Government of India Secretariat and in the Director-General's office for about six or seven years. Mr. RAHA began as a probationary Superintendent in 1895 and had risen to be a first grade Superintendent of Post Offices with a pay of Rs. 540.

75,370. Mr. HANSON said the majority of the service accepted the present system of recruitment and Mr. RAE agreed with him. Mr. RAHA, however, preferred a system of competitive examination, as he believed it would secure a much better class of men than was now obtained. The prospects of the service were sufficiently good to attract the very best men.

In order to be assured of obtaining the necessary qualities apart from educational qualifications, he would have competition amongst a certain number of selected men. That system would make an enormous difference in a few years in the personnel of the service.

75,371. Mr. HANSON said that at present probationary superintendents had to serve for not more than two years, and as they had to qualify for and pass a departmental examination, and some of them did not pass straight away, he thought the two years suggested in the written statement was a fair maximum. The period of probation should not be less than one year before a man was put in charge of a division. The representation made in the memorandum was practically carried out now. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA agreed.

75,372. Mr. HANSON said the number of vacancies for superintendents was not very large throughout India, and if 50 per cent. was given to men promoted from the lower grades, the 50 per cent. left for direct recruitments would give only a few vacancies. This would mean that probationary superintendents would



19 January 1914.]

Messrs. R. W. HANSON, C. D. RAE, and H. K. RAHA.

[Continued.]

have to wait far longer than two years before they received an appointment. Everything depended on the number of vacancies that occurred. The position of postmasters in the higher grades had been greatly improved in recent years, and the bulk of the men had a better outlook than formerly, so that more men now elected for the postmasters' line.

75,373. Mr. HANSON then said that a general list for probationary superintendents was not a very important matter from the superintendents' point of view. He did not wish to press the point. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA concurred.

75,374. Mr. HANSON did not know why the distinction was drawn in the memorandum between the educational qualifications of Indians and members of the domiciled community. In his separate written statement he had made a suggestion that, as the European schools in India had a school code, domiciled European or Anglo-Indian candidates should be required to pass the highest examination under that code. He understood from the educational department that very few Anglo-Indian schools taught for the ordinary B.A. degree, and that there was no general desire on the part of Anglo-Indian scholars to go up for that examination. To insist on it for a member of the domiciled community would therefore tremendously handicap his chances, as very few took that degree. Mr. RAE agreed. Mr. RAHA, on the other hand, thought the same educational qualifications ought to apply and was not impressed by Mr. Hanson's reasons. He saw no reason why a domiciled European should not take a college after his school course.

75,375. Mr. HANSON was satisfied with the present age-limits for direct recruitment and asked for an increase in the daily travelling and transfer allowances and more tentage and house accommodation. With regard to travelling allowance, most departments had similar grievances. There were too many restrictions in the rules. When a man went on tour, he should be entitled to his daily allowances. At present, if a man travelled by sea and disembarked in the morning, he received no daily allowance for that day. The department thought it would be valuable to have a committee appointed to revise the Civil Service Regulations, and that such revision would not cause any great loss to Government. The officers who chiefly suffered were superintendents, who were given Rs. 4 a day. If they had to travel by road twenty miles or under, they had to pay their carting expenses, and that was common to all Government departments. The Superintendent of the Railway Mail Service was badly off because he had to travel by rail and have his food in the train or in refreshment rooms and Rs. 4 was quite insufficient. The midnight to midnight rule should also be abolished. If an officer showed that he halted for a certain number of hours, he should get the extra allowance to which he was entitled free of deductions. With regard to house and tentage allowances, the Director-General had provided tents in some divisions in a small percentage of cases and also houses. Other departments also suffered the same inconveniences. It was well known that, throughout the large towns in India, rents were going up and officers had to pay out of all proportion to their salaries. A senior man drawing Rs. 500 a month might be able to pay, but, when a junior man came to take his place, he could not pay the rent his predecessor paid, and the house was lost to the superintendent. Mr. RAHA concurred. Mr. RAE agreed generally, but said that postmasters had not the same grievances, as they received free houses.

75,376. Both Mr. HANSON and Mr. RAHA wished to have a time-scale rather than a graded system. Mr. RAE said postmasters were paid in accordance with the responsibilities of the particular post office over which they presided and therefore a time-scale would not be feasible in that branch of the service.

75,377. Mr. HANSON said that, even if a time-scale were introduced, he would press for officers to be compulsorily retired at fifty-five. There were strong objections to Deputy Postmasters-General and Post-

masters-General being given extension over the age of fifty-five.

75,378. The argument in the written statement about the scarcity of well-paid administrative posts was used to support the claim for an increase of pay for the superintendent. It was true that, with the growth of a department like the Post Office there were chances of the administrative posts being increased in the future. According to Messrs. HANSON and RAE, there had been a falling-off in individual recruits of late years, though some were above the average standard. Increased pay would undoubtedly attract a better class of non-Indians than was now obtained, especially if they knew they would rise on a time-scale with a pension sufficient to retire on. At present two-thirds of the men did not rise beyond the superintendent's grade, and received a pension of from Rs. 250 to Rs. 300 a month, and they knew that in other lines they could be sure of Rs. 800 as pay after twenty-five years' service. Mr. RAHA, however, thought that, if the system of recruitment was changed, it would be possible to obtain better men without increasing the pay, though an increase in pay was very necessary.

75,379. Mr. RAE said postmasters claimed special treatment in the matter of leave on the ground that they had to work on Sundays and holidays. The whole of the department was working, as letters had to be sorted and sent on to their destination, and in larger towns there was a modified delivery. In Calcutta, for instance, there were two deliveries of letters on Sundays. Even on gazetted holidays and Christmas Day, a proportion of the staff was at work. Men obtain relaxation on a holiday roster in turn, but the heads of the offices could take very few holidays, as they had to be present for a certain portion of the day when the mails were being received or were being distributed for delivery. Mr. HANSON and Mr. RAHA said there was no justification for superintendents asking for the same consideration.

75,380. Mr. HANSON said the officers asked for the option of a pension after a twenty-five years' service. It would take a man twenty-two years to rise to the full pay of a superintendent, and then he would have to draw that pay for three years before he got half the maximum, which would make it twenty-five years from the date of his appointment in the lowest grade of superintendent. If he had joined as a probationer, or had been in the lower ranks, he would have had to serve longer. Very few men now retire after twenty-five years' service as the pension was not sufficient.

75,381. Mr. HANSON also said that the General Provident Fund was compulsory for all new entrants, but he did not think it could be considered a substitution for permission to commute a portion of pension. Both Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA agreed.

75,382. With regard to the Telegraph Department, Mr. HANSON said the posts of Director-General and Postmaster-General were the only two in which the Telegraph Department would compete with the Post Office. At present the department had five out of ten Postmaster-Generalships and it was hoped that the proportion would be continued. If the departments were given half the Postmaster-Generalships, they would have no objection to a telegraph officer's being occasionally given one also, provided it was taken from the Indian Civil Service. On the other hand, the whole department acknowledged that the recruitment of members of the Indian Civil Service into the department had been very beneficial.

75,383. Mr. RAE said he was in favour of interchangeability between superintendents and postmasters. The work did not differ much from, and in the higher grades became more and more like, that of a superintendent. The only difference was that the superintendent had a good deal of travelling to do. When the position of Presidency Postmaster was reached it would be found, as in the case of Calcutta, that he actually had two superintendents working under him. Mr. HANSON, on the other hand, said he was not in favour of interchangeability. A postmaster's life was a sedentary one, and it would be

19 January 1914.]

Messrs. R. W. HANSON, C. D. RAE, and H. K. RAHA.

[Continued.]

difficult to find a postmaster who, after a number of years, was physically capable of taking up a superintendent's work, which entailed continuous travelling in all kinds of weather; and many postmasters would not care about it. He objected to its introduction in connection with the officers now in the service because many of the present postmasters had already failed as superintendents. A postmaster was paid according to the importance of the place he occupied, whereas a superintendent was remunerated on entirely different principles. Mr. RAHA agreed with Mr. Hanson.

75,384. (Mr. *Abdur Rahim*.) Mr. HANSON did not think the amalgamation scheme would hurt his service, if 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships were secured to it. As regards the officers of the Telegraph Department, they were no doubt very expert in their own profession; but a Superintendent of Telegraphs by the time he had attained the seniority which would make him a Postmaster-General, would generally have settled down into a groove; and would not be of so much benefit to the department as a younger man who was a member of the Indian Civil Service. A sound knowledge of law on both the Civil and Criminal sides was required in a Postmaster-General and also a good knowledge of banking.

75,385. Mr. HANSON said that, in asking for recruits of good social standing, they referred to men of good family, who had received a liberal education, and had had an all-round training in athletics, which characteristics generally produced the right stamp of officer. Amongst Indians there were some who had adopted the European standard of living, and they were far more acceptable to the department in many ways. He did not mean that men should necessarily have had an education in England. The men who adopted European methods were more respected by the subordinates than those who did not. Mr. RAE was in general agreement with these views. Mr. RAHA, however, said he had never known a Postmaster-General enquire into what style of living was adopted by a candidate, and he could not imagine that the method a man adopted in his dress had ever determined his selection.

75,386. Mr. RAHA then added that the competitive examination he advocated would be a purely academic one. For the work of a superintendent a fairly well-educated man was needed. Indians who are not graduates were not appointed at present, except in the case of a few men who had been taken from the department. A competitive examination would give the best men available and it should be an examination for the whole of India, confined to a certain number of candidates selected from the different centres. That would improve the efficiency of the department.

75,387. Mr. RAE explained that the fact of there being at the present moment no Indian postmaster above the Rs. 400 to Rs. 500 grade was purely accidental, because Indian postmasters had risen to the higher grades. An Indian officer had recently retired from the Postmastership of Delhi; a Madras gentleman was at Bangalore, while the Presidency Postmaster of Madras was another Madras gentleman.

75,388. Mr. HANSON said officers did not take a great deal of furlough, because they had not been able to afford it. If the pay was increased, it followed that the leave allowances would be increased, and men would take more furlough. More men probably took leave now than formerly, and two or three had gone to Europe to study post office methods at their own expense. That was not recognised as a particular advantage in the service, but it gave the officer a wider knowledge, and enabled him to acquire new ideas. There was no necessity to depute an officer specially to

study European systems, but when an officer was on leave in Europe he might be considered to be on duty for a short period if he wished to acquire special knowledge. He himself had been to the Post Office in London, where there was a good deal to be learnt.

75,389. Mr. RAHA said there was a desire on the part of Indian members to go to Europe to study postal methods and some men would avail themselves of the opportunity, if given. The eight years' interval rule was very hard, as people could not take furlough in instalments. If, for example, a man had a month's privilege leave, he should be able to add a month's furlough and take two months' holiday.

75,390. (Mr. *Chaubal*.) Mr. RAE said the promotion of postmasters was mainly by seniority up to the highest grade. There was no general affirmation of the principle of selection.

75,391. Mr. RAHA said that gazetted postmaster-ships above Rs. 300 were mostly held by Europeans and Anglo-Indians. Promotion did not go by seniority from the Rs. 200-300 to the Rs. 300-400 grade. In practice, selection was made from Europeans and Anglo-Indians, and that accounted for the absence of Indians in the higher ranks. There was a feeling amongst Indians that the higher posts were entirely governed by patronage, and it was in order to obviate that feeling that he suggested competitive examination amongst candidates selected from educational institutions. If that were done, perhaps some of the better class of graduates who now went into the executive and judicial services would be attracted into the Postal Department, because the salaries were quite as high.

75,392. (Sir *Murray Hammick*.) Mr. RAHA said that many more Indians had got into the department during the last ten years than formerly, and it was probably because Anglo-Indians and Europeans had held a much larger proportion of the service in the past that there were so many of them now holding higher posts. But even among the men recruited in late years the proportion of Europeans and Anglo-Indians had been too high. The proportion had decreased because a large number of Indians had been appointed to the superintendents' grade of late years, but, looking at the number of appointments made in the last five years, it would be seen that Anglo-Indians and Europeans had been appointed quite out of proportion, so that the proportion which at one time was decreasing was now increasing again.

75,393. With regard to the guarantee fund, Mr. HANSON thought the whole of the interest ought really to be utilised for the benefit of the subordinate staff, and others who subscribed towards the fund. The head of the department *ex officio* should have control of the funds. A good method would be for the Director-General to decide at the beginning of each year how much money could be given, and then the amount should be apportioned out. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA thought it would be better to have an advisory committee to assist the Director-General.

75,394. (Mr. *Clarke*.) On its being pointed out to him that out of forty-three postmasters there were twenty-three Indians and twenty Europeans in the Rs. 200-Rs. 300 grade, Mr. RAHA admitted that the proportion in the postmasters' line was very much better than it used to be. As the service now stood, Indians had 60 per cent. of the total number of appointments. He pressed for a larger percentage; but would not make it definite, as he wished to have a competitive examination by which anyone could get in quite apart from nationality.

The witnesses withdrew.

At Calcutta, Tuesday, 20th January 1914.

PRESENT :

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.  
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.  
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

and the following Assistant Commissioner :—

J. M. COODE, Esq., Director, Traffic Branch.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. MAYSTON, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Bengal; and

J. C. SHIELDS, Esq., Acting Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, Telegraph Department.

(*These two witnesses were examined together upon the written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs 75,269–78.*)

75,395. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. MAYSTON had acted as Director of Telegraphs since December 1912. He joined the service in 1890 as an Assistant Superintendent from Cooper's Hill, and had gone through the ordinary grades to his present position. Mr. SHIELDS had acted as Electrical Engineer-in-Chief since February last. He was appointed originally by the Secretary of State as a temporary Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, and had been through all the grades in the department up to his present position. Both witnesses were signatories to the corporate memorandum, and supported the proposals made therein.

75,396. Mr. MAYSTON knew little about the scheme of amalgamation, except that a separation between the engineering and the traffic branch was proposed. His reason for proposing that three-fourths of the engineering department should be recruited in England, and one-fourth in India was that his experience showed that the more men obtained from England the more efficient the service would be. At present it was not easy to get qualified telegraph engineers in India. If half the engineering branch was recruited in India, it would lead to deterioration in the *personnel*. The recruiting, however, would be very small when the two branches had been separated. Mr. SHIELDS took the same view, but, provided the men recruited in India were sent to England for training for two years, he had no objection to half being recruited in England and half in India.

75,397. Mr. MAYSTON said no doubt training in England would give better officers, but he would still maintain that three-fourths should be recruited in that country. No recruits had come into the department since Cooper's Hill was abolished except those from Rurki, and they were recruited in the same way as Public Works officers.

75,398. Mr. SHIELDS explained that the Public Works Department advertised for men in England, and there was a committee to select the most promising candidates. He proposed a similar method of recruitment, except that, after the men had been nominated by the committee, they should have a competitive examination amongst themselves.

75,399. Mr. SHIELDS then said that he believed that only a very few officers of the department had seen the official scheme for amalgamation, or had been consulted upon it, but he had seen its working to a small extent in Bombay, and it appeared to him that the idea was to place the traffic branch, which previously had been looked upon as a most important part of the work, very much more under subordinates, and under officers who had had no experience of telegraph work at all. Skilled and well trained officers were required for the traffic branch just as much as for the engineering branch.

75,400. Mr. SHIELDS also said that he thought that about six months' study leave every five years on two-thirds pay should be made compulsory. That would necessitate an increase in the cadre, which was too small at present. Mr. MAYSTON considered it would be a good thing to send men on study leave to England as much as possible, but it should be left to the Government of India to decide how often an officer

could be spared. They should go once in every five or ten years. Mr. SHIELDS said there were no facilities for electrical study in India, as there were so many new inventions continually being brought to notice, especially in wireless telegraphy, study leave in Europe was very important.

75,401. Dealing with the question of salaries, Mr. MAYSTON said they were sufficient, except with regard to the head officer of the engineering and traffic branches. He also claimed that if there was a suitable man in the Telegraph Department, he should be regarded as eligible for the Director-Generalship. Mr. SHIELDS said that, under the new scheme, the position of the Engineer-in-Chief would not be anything like that of the old Director-General, who was head of the department under the Government, and responsible to Government. The post of Engineer-in-Chief would be quite a small one compared with that of the Director-General of Telegraphs, even if the pay was raised. One officer at present was a Postmaster-General, and he believed that under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed there should be two. His branch considered they should have more such appointments. These appointments would be regarded as prize billets in that that they would enable Telegraph Officers to qualify in the work of both departments, and thus strengthen their claim for the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs. He understood that Telegraph officers holding the appointments of Postmaster General would draw their ordinary telegraph pay whether this was greater or less than that of Postmaster-General. Both Mr. MAYSTON and Mr. SHIELDS preferred a time-scale to a graded system of pay.

75,402. Neither Mr. MAYSTON nor Mr. SHIELDS saw any objection to the pay being the same for Indians and Europeans, provided that a foreign service allowance was given to the latter, and provided that this carried the same privileges as salary in all respects. Mr. SHIELDS said the officers were afraid some accounts' officer might discover a flaw afterwards, and reduce the leave pay. Mr. MAYSTON said a foreign service allowance might be sanctioned if this would get over the drawbacks from which Provincial Service officers were said to suffer. Mr. SHIELDS, on the other hand, said he would rather see all officers receiving the same pay, if they had equal qualifications and training, which at present they had not. Perhaps, however, it was not possible to justify paying an indigenous officer the high salary it was necessary to pay a man to attract him from a foreign country. Both witnesses would not object to seeing the term "Provincial Service" abolished.

75,403. Mr. SHIELDS added that there was no friction in the department owing to the division into Imperial and Provincial services, but there was a certain amount of discontent amongst Provincial men. It caused, however, no impediment to the smooth working of the department.

75,404. With regard to the difficulty of obtaining leave, Mr. MAYSTON said it was due chiefly to the shortage of officers. Personally he had not suffered, except on one occasion when he applied for furlough and had to wait a year, which meant a loss of a month's privilege leave. Other officers, however, had suffered a

great deal. Mr. SHIELDS had never had any trouble himself, except that he had not been able to take leave owing to the insufficiency of the pay. He should like to see a system under which an officer would be entitled to commute his furlough. The recommendation of the Decentralisation Commission that an officer should have a sort of leave ledger, and be credited with all the privilege leave earned and be allowed to take it whenever he cared to do so, was a very sound one.

75,405. Mr. SHIELDS said that a pension at the end of twenty years' service was privilege which the officers had now, and would be sorry to give up, although it was rarely used. Men on twenty years' service would ordinarily be forty-one or forty-two years of age. It was very difficult to get pension on a medical certificate. Mr. MAYSTON said that after thirty years' service the pension should be 700*l.*, and should be on a non-contributory basis. Members of the Indian Civil Service drew as much in pension. It was true they contributed towards it, but their pension was 1,000*l.* a year.

75,406. Both witnesses agreed that if an increase in pension for 25 years' service and upwards was allowed, officers of their department would be prepared to give up the right to pension after twenty years' service.

75,407. Mr. MAYSTON said that it was compulsory to contribute to the General Provident Fund, but that did not altogether provide what was required, and therefore the officers desired to commute a portion of their pension in order to have a lump sum on retiring. Mr. SHIELDS said the amount received from the General Provident Fund was very small. The officers looked upon the pension as deferred pay to which they had a right. Several men in the service had died leaving nothing for their families. There should be no restrictions on commutation, which should be unconditional.

75,408. Mr. MAYSTON said that the difficulty in obtaining houses only really occurred in large presidency towns and headquarters of Local Governments. Mr. SHIELDS added that house rents in Calcutta were enormous. In the old days bachelors had a house allowance and a presidency allowance, but they now received nothing at all. No house could be obtained in Calcutta on a short lease. The same consideration applied to Bombay and Rangoon. He had spent about 50 per cent. of his service in Calcutta, but being under the old system he had a house allowance, though an inadequate one, when holding his ordinary appointment. In his present acting appointment he got no house or presidency allowance. Other officers, however, had suffered very badly. The present house allowance rules very unjust and officers were regarded it as a great hardship to have to serve in Calcutta.

75,409. Mr. SHIELDS said the State should bear the actual cost of moving an officer from one place to another.

75,410. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. SHIELDS thought that Government should commute pensions on more favourable terms than an insurance office. Officers had some claims on the Secretary of State, whereas they had none on an insurance company. Looking at pension as deferred pay there was a claim to be more favourably treated by the Government than by an insurance company, though he did not think more could be claimed than approximately the actuarial value.

75,411. Mr. MAYSTON said that, if Indians were recruited in England, no proportion should be fixed. There were at present in the department only three or four Indians trained at Cooper's Hill. An Indian trained in an engineering college in Great Britain was much above an Indian who had been trained in India. Mr. SHIELDS agreed.

Mr. SHIELDS said the reason he was recruited separately was that in 1893 an experiment was made of recruiting two officers through the Secretary of State as temporary Assistant Superintendents under a contract for five years, and afterwards they were appointed to the permanent establishment.

75,412. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Asked whether in view of the fact that the proportion of recruitment in England and India was considered by the Telegraph Committee in 1906, and a resolution was passed by Government in 1910, giving effect to the recommendations, Mr. SHIELDS replied that he could not say anything had occurred since then which called for a reconsideration of the question. Officers did not know what was coming under the proposed amalgamation scheme.

75,413. Mr. MAYSTON said that when the Committee inquired into the matter the traffic and engineering were all one branch, but now the proposal to separate them had come forward, and the written memorandum had reference to telegraph engineers. There were no means of training telegraph engineers in India.

75,414. Mr. SHIELDS considered that training for telegraph work could be obtained just as easily in England by an Indian as by any other man. There was no restriction at all. If there was a difficulty it would stand in the way of recruitment of Indians under the proposals that had been put forward.

75,415. Mr. SHIELDS said no appointment was made direct to the upper subordinate establishment, all appointments being made from the signalling establishment. The men in the latter started as telegraphists, and were gradually promoted, and were given a training at Sibpur College, before being appointed Deputy Superintendents.

75,416. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. SHIELDS was of opinion that men trained in the Indian engineering colleges would benefit more by two years' training in England after they had served some time in the department. They should have a period of probation in India as at present, and that period would enable the superior officers to determine which men were fitted to go to England for training.

75,417. In the signalling establishment Mr. MAYSTON pointed out there were three different grades of Deputy Superintendents and in promotion seniority was taken into consideration, though if a man was not considered good enough he did not obtain promotion. In the higher grades they rose according to merit, seniority of course being considered.

75,418. He did not know why there was a preponderance of Anglo-Indians employed in the Telegraph Department, but the question of communal representation was in the hands of Government, and he was not aware upon what basis they proceeded. Out of 38 Superintendents there were seven Indians, who were either recruited from Cooper's Hill or from Rurki. If from Rurki, they joined the Provincial Service on probation.

75,419. He had had experience of the work of Indians trained at Rurki. He did not think the work of the traffic department could be taught in a college at all, but some of the technical knowledge required for the traffic department could be obtained in an Indian college.

75,420. (*Sir Murray Hamnick.*) Mr. MAYSTON said that if Indians were as good as Europeans, they could be recruited in England, and the committee there would select from Europeans and Indians alike with due regard to the qualifications, certificates and degrees possessed by the men. If it were made obligatory that half the recruitment should be made in England from Indians, there would certainly be a great risk that inferior Indians would be sent when no better ones were available there. It would be better therefore, that Indians should be recruited in India by people who knew them, and then be given a thorough training in England.

75,421. Mr. SHIELDS preferred that it should be left entirely to the Secretary of State to send out the best men, whether Indians or Europeans, but if it was necessary to secure a fixed proportion of Indians they should be selected in India. It would be impossible to get 50 per cent. of suitable Indians in England.

75,422. Mr. SHIELDS considered that if the exile allowance was given to Europeans, it should also be given

20 January 1914.]

Messrs. H. MAYSTON and J. C. SHIELDS.

[Continued.]

to an Indian holding one of the upper appointments in the service, because those appointments were made by strict selection. That is to say, the pay for Superintending Engineers and officers of higher rank should be a fixed pay to be drawn by European or Indian alike.

75,423. If the Secretary of State agreed to commutation of pension, Mr. SHIELDS said he would not object to a rule being made that Government should insist on every man in the service giving evidence that he had insured his wife against being left penniless, but for that purpose the pay of the officers should be increased. The officers would welcome a general Pension fund on the same lines as the Indian Civil Service for all the services outside the Civil Service, on a real actuarial basis, to which all members should be obliged to contribute in order to provide for their widows and children but the pay would have to be raised to enable them to subscribe, as no one could save anything on the present rates of pay. The provident fund was quite insufficient for the purpose, and was being continually drawn upon for sickness, sending children to England, &c.

75,424. In the Upper Subordinate Branch of the Telegraph Service the promoted men came direct from the signalling establishment. The idea was to promote them by selection before they became too old.

75,425. (Mr. Coode.) Mr. SHIELDS said he had seen the proposed amalgamation scheme confidentially, and a number of telegraph officers were consulted, but he did not know whether their recommendations were followed. The Department as a whole had had no opportunity of objecting to the separation. It seemed to him that the proposal to make over the control of

traffic to the Postmasters-General was not likely to lead to increased efficiency, as these officers had no experience of telegraphic traffic. The pay of Rs. 2,750 for the Chief Telegraphic Officer was not a sufficient compensation for his loss of dignity. Only one telegraph officer had been tried as Postmaster-General so far, and he had been an unqualified success. If more officers were given a chance they would make good Postmasters-General.

75,426. It was considered to be a hardship that men with a temporary service of five years were not allowed to count that time in their seniority. In his own case, compared with the most junior Cooper's Hill man recruited in the same year, he had lost about Rs. 22,000 or 15 per cent of the total amount he had earned in pay since he came out, and he had been exceptionally fortunate in holding acting appointments.

75,427. (Mr. Chaubal.) When recruited as a temporary engineer no promise was made that after five years he would get permanent employment. But the Director-General of Telegraphs, when the incremental scheme was introduced, recommended that four out of the five years should be allowed to count towards incremental pay, quoting the case of certain temporary engineers who came out on short covenants with His Majesty's Secretary of State and were afterwards brought on to the permanent establishment of the Public Works Department and allowed to count their temporary service, less one year, in regulating their increments on the time scale of pay. The recommendation of the Director-General was disallowed by the Government of India. There had been, however, no breach of any promise made to him.

The witnesses withdrew.

G. P. Roy, Esq., M.I.E.E., Officiating Director of Telegraphs, Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle.

*Written Statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.*

75,428. The Imperial Service Officers of the Telegraph Department have already submitted a Joint Written Statement. The time allowed for the preparation of the Statement was too short. Further, they were not afforded sufficient facilities for a Conference for the consideration of the representation to the Royal Commission on Public Services in India. It is therefore considered necessary to submit a supplementary Statement.

75,429. (I.) **Method of Recruitment.**—In the corporate written statement reference has been made to the Proposed Amalgamation of the Department with the Post Office, and suggestion has been made only for the recruitment of the Engineering Branch of the Department, as the Amalgamation Scheme provides for the recruitment of Traffic Officers in India. No public pronouncement has been made of the details of the Amalgamation Scheme, but if it is finally decided to separate the Engineering from the Traffic, it is doubtful if this separation would lead to efficiency. The Traffic and the Engineering Branches of a Technical Department like the Indian Telegraphs, are so closely related, and inter-dependent on each other, that the separation of the two branches is undesirable. The Traffic Management is a profession demanding professional knowledge and scientific training, and Telegraph Engineering plays a very important part in the management of Traffic. Engineering Training cannot therefore be wholly divorced from the sphere of Traffic Management. It is therefore suggested that 75 per cent. of the Engineering and the Traffic Staff should be recruited from England, 12½ per cent. from qualified Subordinates, and 12½ per cent. from Indian Engineering Colleges. The qualifications and training of officers recruited from England, whether for the Engineering or for the Traffic Branch should be exactly the same, and specialisation of their duties should begin after they had gained some experience in the Department. All candidates should be nominated by the Secretary of State for India in Council, and after nomination they should pass a competitive

examination. The establishment of a Central College for officers of all the Indian Services is considered very necessary, and it is suggested that all recruits for the Indian Telegraph Department should go through a course of practical training in the Central College referred to above.

75,430. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**

—The training of young officers is of vital importance to the Department, and the present system of training is not considered satisfactory. All first entrants should go through a regular course in Traffic, Technical and Engineering subjects. They should be attached to the Presidency Telegraph Offices, and should be made to undertake the duties of Operators, Supervisors and Technical Officers. On completion of this course, they should go through a higher practical training in electrical matters in the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, and then should be sent out on construction under competent officers. On completion of 12 months' training in the manner indicated above, they should be placed in charge of Sub-divisions, the re-introduction of which is a very important factor in the training of the Junior Officers, and in the efficient organisation of the Department. The abolition of the Sub-divisions has considerably handicapped the training of young officers. They have no longer the small units of charge to develop the habit of self-reliance, so indispensably necessary for their training. They are at present merely attached to the Divisional offices, with no very definite responsibilities or powers.

Young officers should be given an opportunity as far as possible of being trained in administrative work. There is at present no scope for such training. The number of Junior Officers attached to the Headquarters Office was three, but this number has recently been reduced to two by the replacement of a Telegraph Officer by a Secretariat Superintendent who has no practical Telegraph experience. The loss of this appointment is viewed by the Telegraph officers with some apprehension.



20 January 1914.]

Mr. G. P. Roy.

[Continued.]

The maintenance of a very high standard of efficiency is absolutely necessary for an ever expanding Scientific Department like the Indian Telegraphs, and in order to accomplish this, every officer should be encouraged to keep himself thoroughly up to date in his professional subjects—General Engineering, Technical and Traffic, by liberal grant of study leave or leave on deputation with adequate allowance in Europe and America. The daily allowance at present granted during the period of study leave is 6s. a day, which is considered entirely inadequate to meet an officer's expenses. It is therefore suggested that it should be raised to 1l. a day, which is the ordinary daily subsistence allowance granted to officers of corresponding rank in England.

75,431. (III.) Condition of Service.—The conditions of the Service have been considerably altered. The Department was all along a part and parcel of the Engineering Establishment of the Public Works Department. In 1905, on the formation of the Department of Commerce and Industry, the Telegraph Department was separated from the Public Works Department and placed under the newly-created Department of Commerce and Industry. In 1908, a Traffic Officer of the British Telegraph Service was brought out to India to remodel the Traffic Branch of the Department, and in 1910 the Department was reorganised by the introduction of the Circle Scheme, and the abolition of Sub-divisions, which resulted in the decentralisation of the Upper half and the centralisation of the Lower half of the Service. In July, 1912, the experimental amalgamation was commenced. No other Department under the Government of India has gone through so many changes within so short a time as the Indian Telegraphs, and these continuous changes in the administration of the Department have caused a considerable amount of anxiety and apprehension amongst the officers of the Department. The Amalgamation Scheme under consideration of the Government of India is still in its confidential stage, and no definite pronouncement, either official or public, on the subject of prospects of the officers of the Department has been made. The officers are therefore not in a position to know how the amalgamation would affect their prospects, and they therefore make no further reference to the scheme under consideration. But they view the loss of the appointment of the Director-General of Telegraphs with great apprehension. The Imperial Officers were recruited and appointed to the Department on the direct understanding that they could aspire to the highest post in the Department. The loss of the appointment referred to above has caused loss of promotion in the lower grades affecting the pensions of some of the officers concerned. In paragraph 5 of the Resolution of the Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830-833, dated the 24th of January, 1913, an extract of which is reproduced,\* the officers were distinctly given to understand that all possible protection would be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the officers of the Department, and they view the non-fulfilment of the promise in the above Resolution with considerable disappointment. The officers of the Department therefore desire that further definite assurance may be given to them protecting their prospects and personal interests, both during the experimental stage of the Amalgamation Scheme, and after its introduction.

The Head of the Post Office has always been a member of the Indian Civil Service. The conditions of the new Service "Post and Telegraphs" will be considerably altered after the Amalgamation of the two Departments—one purely Non-technical and the other Scientific. In view of the sources from which the Telegraph Department draws the greater part of its members, the Telegraph Officers should be eligible, in future, for the appointment of the Director-General

of the Amalgamated Department. Technical training and professional experience are indeed very important factors in the administration of a Scientific Service like the Indian Telegraph Department, which has to keep pace with the modern and progressive Telegraph Administrations in Europe and America. The Telegraph Officers by reason of their technical training and professional attainments must play a very important part in the future development and the Administration of the Combined Department. It is therefore suggested that every opportunity should be afforded to the Telegraph Officers to gain experience in the administration of the Post Office. They further desire a definite assurance that they should be eligible for the appointment of the Director-General.

75,432. (IV.) Conditions of Salary.—The Indian Telegraph Department is so peculiarly constituted that it cannot be compared with any other service in India. The Service is an Imperial one, and the establishment being limited, the officers are liable to frequent, and very long transfers, often at a very short notice. The frequency and the length of the transfers are very much greater than in any other service. The enhanced travelling allowance suggested in the Joint Memorandum will only defray the cost of transfers, but it does not make any provision for the loss entailed in breaking up homes and setting up new ones. The nature of the duties of the Telegraph Officers is such that in addition to an absence on tour from the Head Quarters of a minimum period of 150 days during the year, they are liable to be sent out on the line at a moment's notice, in all kinds of weather. This necessitates the maintenance of Camp Establishment all through the year involving additional expenditure which is not covered by the travelling allowances.

In 1910 the salaries of the officers were very much improved, but there is still room for further improvement in this direction, on account of the special circumstances referred to above. The increased cost of living both in England and in India, the depreciation in the purchasing power of a sovereign, and the increased cost of education for children, justify further increase in the scale of salaries sanctioned for the officers of the Telegraph Department. The pay of the Executive Branch of the Service should, in the opinion of the officers, be raised to Rs. 1,500 by annual increment of Rs. 75 instead of Rs. 50 after ninth year of service, and the commencing salary of the Administrative Grade should be raised from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 1,750. The salaries of the higher Administrative Grades should also be proportionately increased. The present and the proposed salaries are shown in the statement below :—

	Present.	Proposed.
	Rs.	Rs.
1st year -	380	Same as at present.
2nd year -	420	
3rd year -	460	
4th year -	500	
5th year -	540	
6th year -	580	
7th year -	620	
8th year -	660	
9th year -	700	
10th year -	750	775
11th year -	800	850
12th year -	850	925
13th year -	900	1,000
14th year -	950	1,075
15th year -	1,000	1,150
16th year -	1,050	1,225
17th year -	1,100	1,300
18th year -	1,150	1,375
19th year -	1,200	1,425
20th year -	1,250	1,500

\* "The Government of India earnestly desire that in such steps as may be taken towards the amalgamation of the two Services, all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both Departments in all grades."



20 January 1914.]

Mr. G. P. Roy.

[Continued.

Administrative Grades.

Present.	Proposed.
1,500 - - -	1,750
1,750 - - -	2,000
2,000 - - -	2,250
2,250 - - -	2,500
3,000 - - -	3,000

75,433. (V.) Conditions of Leave.—The conditions of leave have been fully explained in the Joint Memorandum already submitted. The only additional point which requires consideration is the grant of furlough combined with privilege leave, the study leave for one month to junior officers of four years' service. Under the existing conditions no furlough is admissible until an officer has served eight years. This period of absence from England is considered too long to enable the junior officers to be sufficiently in touch with the latest Scientific developments of their profession.

75,434. (VI.) Conditions of Pensions.—No suggestion has been made in the Joint Memorandum for the increase of the Invalid Pensions which the officers desire should be provided for. They prefer the following scale of pensions to that put forward in the Joint Memorandum :—

Length of Service.	Scale of Pension. (Proportion of Average emoluments.)	Maximum per Annum.	With Medical Certificate or Voluntary.
Years.		£ s. d.	
10	$\frac{20}{60}$ th	218 15 0	With Medical Certificate.
11	$\frac{21}{60}$ th	240 12 6	"
12	$\frac{22}{60}$ th	262 10 0	"
13	$\frac{23}{60}$ th	284 7 6	"
14	$\frac{24}{60}$ th	306 5 0	"
15	$\frac{25}{60}$ th	328 2 6	"
16	$\frac{26}{60}$ th	350 0 0	"
17	$\frac{27}{60}$ th	371 17 6	"
18	$\frac{28}{60}$ th	393 15 0	"
19	$\frac{29}{60}$ th	415 12 6	"
20	$\frac{30}{60}$ th	437 10 0	Voluntary.
21		459 7 6	"
22		481 5 0	"
23		503 2 6	"
24		525 0 0	"
25		546 17 6	"
26		568 15 0	"
27		590 12 6	"
28		612 10 0	"
29		634 7 6	"
30		656 5 0	"

75,435. (VII.) Such limitation as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.—This has already been dealt with in the Joint Memorandum, but it is considered that a Provincial Officer may be promoted to the Imperial Service under the following conditions :—

- (1) That he has less than 10 years' service.
- (2) That he has an excellent record.
- (3) That he gone through a course of professional training in England for not less than 12 months.

A suitable candidate for transfer from the Provincial to the Imperial Service should be selected by the Head of the Department and every facility should be afforded to him for his training in England.

75,436. (VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—No further remarks are considered necessary.

75,437. (IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding head.—The following additional points deserve consideration under this head :—

- (1) Medical attendance on the families of officers.
- (2) The rate of interest paid on the deposit in the Provident Fund.

As regards medical attendance, it is considered that the fees to be charged by Government Medical Officers for attendance on the members of an officer's family should be fixed. The usual fee charged by a Medical Officer ranges from Rs. 10 to Rs. 16, which is considered out of all proportion to the officer's emoluments. The following scale is recommended :—

Officer's salary.	Medical fees per visit.	
Rs.	Rs.	
250 and under	- - -	2
251 to 500	- - -	3
501 to 750	- - -	4
751 to 1,000	- - -	5
1,001 to 1,250	- - -	6
1,251 to 1,500	- - -	7
1,501 to 1,750	- - -	8
1,751 to 2,000	- - -	9
2,001 to 2,250	- - -	10
2,251 to 2,500	- - -	11
2,501 to 3,000	- - -	15

It is considered that the Provident Fund which at present represents the only provision an officer can make for his family or to supplement his pension, should be materially improved by allowing a higher rate of interest. The present rate of interest is only 4 per cent. which is considered too low for India where business enterprise seldom considers a rate of less than 8 per cent. sufficiently remunerative. The rate of interest may therefore be raised to 6 per cent.

Mr. G. P. Roy called and examined.

75,438. (Lord Ronaldshay.) The witness joined the Indian Telegraph Department in 1904 from the Royal Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, as an Assistant Superintendent. He was first attached to the telegraph workshops and the electricians' office, and then to a Central Telegraph Office for training in traffic. He was placed in charge of a subdivision and worked as a Subdivisional Officer for nearly nine years, and held charge of many important subdivisions in different parts of India. He was personally responsible for the maintenance of telegraphic communication, the disposal of traffic and the execution of constructional and re-constructional works. He was a Superintendent for nearly nine years and Traffic Manager for 10 months. In 1905, when in charge of the Arrakan Division, he laid two cables joining the main land with Ramree Island, the longest cables laid by the department without the assistance of a cable ship. In 1907 he went through a course of traffic training in the United Kingdom and on the Continent at his own expense.

In 1908 he was selected for the post of Traffic Superintendent. In April 1910 he was placed in charge of the Central Telegraph Office of Madras. In 1911 he studied the traffic system in London, Edinburgh, Manchester, and Birmingham, and before returning to India submitted a report on the British telegraph traffic system with recommendations for the improvement of the service in India. In 1911 he was posted in charge of the Rangoon Division and carried out the work of reorganisation of the Telegraph Department there. In June 1912 he was transferred from Rangoon to Nagpur and appointed Traffic Manager of the Central Circle under the Postmaster-General. In May 1912 he acted as Officiating Director of the Madras Circle, and two months later was transferred to the post he now held.

75,439. He was one of the signatories of the corporate memorandum put in by the officers of the department, and had also put in a statement giving his own personal views. The corporate memorandum

20 January 1914.]

Mr. G. P. Roy.

[Continued.]

had been framed on the replies to a circular sent round to all the officers. There had, however, been no proper opportunity to discuss this memorandum as it was drawn up and sent in a hurry.

75,440. The reference in his written statement to the non-fulfilment of the promise contained in the resolution of the Government of India of the 24th January 1912 was based on the fact that the department had lost the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, which they were given to understand from the beginning was one to which they could aspire. That amounted practically to a loss of 1,400*l.* a year. At the time the corporate memorandum was put in there had not been sufficient time to calculate the whole thing out. The additional posts in the higher grades did not afford any adequate compensation. The total number of Director's appointments under the amalgamation scheme was reduced from ten to five.

75,441. Three-fourths of the telegraph engineering staff should be recruited in England and one-fourth in India, instead of half and half, because there had not been sufficient development in electrical science in India, and it was necessary to protect the department against inefficiency. For some years to come it would be necessary to obtain 75 per cent. from England, but as electrical undertakings developed in India that percentage could be reduced. His opinion would not be modified if young engineering graduates were sent from India to England for two years' training.

75,442. His suggestion to promote, under certain conditions, a provincial officer to the Imperial Service, was only with regard to pay.

75,443. The higher pay given to the English recruited branch of the service was intended to compensate them, not only for serving in a foreign country, but for possessing higher qualifications.

75,444. He suggested that the Indian recruited in England should receive the same pay as an Englishman. At the same time, looking at the matter from the point of view of the Indian tax-payer, it was difficult to justify the payment of a foreign service allowance to Indians without European training working in their own country.

75,445. Recruitment should be by open competition from amongst nominated candidates. There should be a personal interview with the candidates, and when selection had been made an examination should be held. If the number of men who came up were not sufficient to fill the vacancies, they would probably have to be taken without a competitive examination.

75,446. Study leave should be given liberally, and should be spent in Europe or America. There were no facilities for acquiring high technical training in India. Men taking study leave should send in a report based on their study, and produce a certificate from the institution to which they had been attached.

75,447. The reason why the salaries asked for in his written statement were higher than in the original corporate memorandum which he had also signed, was because, when the latter was submitted, there had been no time to consider all the points. It might be true that a notification was published in the Gazette in February 1913, in which the officers of the Telegraph Department had been informed of the inquiry and of the points on which they would be questioned, but they had not taken action on this, or really considered their position until much later. This was also the reason why a larger demand for pensions was now being made as well.

75,448. After 20 years' service an officer's age should be about 42, and that was a fair age for a man to retire on a pension of 437*l.* The age-limit for retirement was 55, but an officer should certainly have the option of retiring after 20 years. At present the retiring pension was inadequate, as the cost of living both in India and in England had gone up considerably. It had been officially stated that the purchasing power of a sovereign was now only 16*s.* 3*d.*, and that affected the officer retiring to England, and

the deterioration of the rupee affected the officer retiring to India. The hope held out in the Government of India's despatch No. 43, Public Works Department, dated 28th March 1870, had not been realised. In 1871 the Under Secretary of State for India, speaking on the subject of Cooper's Hill College, and the engineering service, claimed in the House of Commons that the Government had created a new profession on the level of the great Indian services, civil and military, and it was intimated that a grant of enhanced pension to the Imperial officers of the Telegraph Department was under contemplation.

75,449. The fees charged by Civil Surgeons for medical attendance on the families of officers were now too high. It would be cheaper to go to outside practitioners, but official etiquette required that the Civil Surgeon should be the only medical man consulted. The Government ought to be responsible not only for medical attendance on the officers but on their families as well.

75,450. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Personally he did not think the amalgamation was likely to increase the efficiency of the department, but the Government, of course, was not bound to consult the officers of the department. All that the officers desired was that the interests of the service should be well protected.

75,451. (*Mr. Chaulal.*) In India he had only had a preliminary education, and had then joined the University College School in England before going on to Cooper's Hill. He had seen none of the engineering colleges in India. His view was that there was no sufficient development of electrical science in India to give the requisite training was based on his experience in practical work. An Englishman trained in England would turn out better work than an Indian trained in India, but Indians who had taken their education and training in England might be treated as Europeans. He had had experience of one gentleman, who had taken his education in British institutions outside Cooper's Hill, and he was an excellent officer.

75,452. Imported labour had always to be paid more than local labour in the ordinary business of life. He did not think there was much discontent in the service owing to the difference in pay, and he did not think it was likely to cause any discontent in the future.

75,453. Before sending in his personal statement, he had had discussions with several officers, and believed that his requests were regarded by many as reasonable.

75,454. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Efficiency was very important. It was also important that there should be colleges in India fitted to turn out men to discharge the work of the telegraph and other scientific departments. It was, therefore, necessary to encourage Indian colleges, and a beginning might be made by recruiting some appointments in India.

75,455. No doubt the Telegraph Committee took all the facts they had before them into consideration, but the Royal Commission could afford to take the responsibility of revising some of its recommendations.

75,456. That there were very few Indian Deputy Superintendents was explained by the fact that the service was not attractive to Indians. The number of Indian telegraphists was very small in proportion to the Anglo-Indian telegraphists. That was entirely due to the dislike on the part of Indians to the service, owing to the conditions being so severe. There were night duties, and officers had to go away at a moment's notice, and there was considerable hardship in the life.

75,457. There was a difficulty in securing Indians for the signalling establishment. There were two services, one local and one general, and an Indian recruited in Bengal would object to be transferred to Madras or Burma. There was a rule at present that a certain percentage of Indians should be in the signalling establishment, but he did not know what that percentage was. There was no such rule with regard to the upper subordinates. Sometimes great

20 January 1914.]

Mr. G. P. Roy.

[Continued.]

difficulty was found in filling up the vacancies reserved for Indians.

75,458. It was the opinion of the majority of members of the service that the Telegraph Department would suffer from the proposed amalgamation. The Traffic Department also required engineering knowledge. In Europe the telegraph administration was divided into two branches, engineering and traffic, but the conditions prevailing in India prevented the European system of working being adopted in its entirety. In Europe the post office and telegraphs had been worked together from the beginning, whereas in India the two branches had grown up separately, and they were now two huge departments, quite different in character and constitution. In the British service the traffic officer, as a rule, rose from the rank of telegraphist, and went through several courses of technical training in electrical engineering, in polytechnics and similar institutions, and it was recognised that such a knowledge of engineering was indispensable for traffic officers. Facilities for such training were not available in India. In order to keep pace with the latest system of traffic management, it was necessary that a Traffic officer should be in touch with the latest European system of working.

75,459. Under the amalgamation scheme, the Telegraph Department would lose the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, and that disqualified officers from earning the higher pensions. The amalgamation also caused some loss of emoluments in connection with appointments of Postmaster-General. When the experimental amalgamation in Bombay was introduced, a telegraph officer was appointed as Postmaster-General on deputation, and when that officer proceeded on leave shortly it was understood he would be relieved by an officer of the Indian Civil Service. It did not appear clear why the appointment should not be given to a telegraph officer.

75,460. As an example of the hardship arising from frequent transfers, the witness mentioned that during his service of nineteen years he had had no less than 22 transfers. The total mileage travelled alone was 16,913, or an average of 890 miles a year transfer travelling. He did not consider his transfers were unusually frequent, though they might have been

slightly above the average. An officer should be recouped the whole of his expenses of transfer, and some compensation should be given him for breaking up one home and setting up another.

75,461. (Mr. Coode.) The details of the amalgamation scheme had not been communicated to him officially, but he had had an opportunity of seeing them confidentially.

75,462. In the Telegraph Department there were only two officers who had had experience of European traffic management.

75,463. The amalgamation scheme would bring about a reduction in the strength of officers, which would affect the service. Such a reduction was a mistake, and would hamper the growth of the service. The present strength of officers recruited in England and in India was 84, whilst the sanctioned strength was 96. The deficiency was 12½ per cent. and was already felt. Any reduction in the engineering establishment would certainly not improve the efficiency of the service. With the development of the country the Telegraph Department was bound to extend. If the traffic increased, as it had done in the last three years, the department would be confronted with a serious problem; it would not be in a position to meet the requirements of the public, especially as temporary engineers were not available in India. There had been a considerable loss of efficiency in the department during the last few years owing to the abolition of subdivisions. The present unit of a charge was a division and was much too large.

75,464. During the first three months of the experimental amalgamation in the Central Circle he was called upon to report on the experiment, and reported favourably, but at the time of reporting he was not aware of the ultimate *modus operandi* of the traffic branch, which he was under the impression would be entrusted to engineers with traffic knowledge. In submitting the Administration Report he emphasised the fact that traffic management was a profession and required technical knowledge and engineering training. The results obtained by engineering officers in the management of traffic could hardly be regarded as an assurance of the future success of the management of traffic by non-technical officers.

The witness withdrew.

J. W. THURLEY, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (Traffic).

*Written Statement relating to the Telegraph Department.*

75,465. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—Deputy Superintendents are recruited in three different ways, as there are three different classes of Deputy Superintendents, viz., Traffic, General, and Technical.

Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, are recruited from Telegraph Masters who have proved themselves thoroughly capable of dealing with Traffic matters. In this connection it is necessary to mention that before a Telegraphist is promoted to a Telegraph Master, the Telegraphist has to pass a Technical Examination and even then wait his turn for promotion, perhaps for years, while the Telegraphist who secures only a "pass" certificate (*i.e.*, obtaining 65 per cent. of marks) is liable to appear again for this Technical Examination before he is considered eligible for promotion if three years have elapsed between the date of his first examination and date of officiating as a Telegraph Master. It requires a Telegraphist to have about 20 years' service before he is promoted to a Telegraph Master, and perhaps another ten years before promoted to a Deputy Superintendent.

Deputy Superintendents, General, are, however, recruited from Telegraphists between the ages of 25 and 30 years old who have held the appointments of Inspecting Telegraphists or Inspecting Telegraph Masters. A Telegraphist can become a Deputy Superintendent, General, before his 15th year of service.

Deputy Superintendents, Technical, are recruited from Technical Telegraph Masters who had been elected to work in the Technical Branch having gone through a course of instruction in the Electrician's office.

For the purposes of recruitment the subordinate staff is divided into three branches—General, Traffic and Technical. Within the first five years of service or a little later a small proportion of the Telegraphists establishment finds admission into the General and the Technical Branches and the bulk remains in the Traffic.

The number of appointments of higher rank in the Traffic Branch in proportion to the lower is surprisingly small, as will be seen from the statement below:—

—	Deputy Superintendents.			Telegraph Masters—Telegraphists.
	1st.	2nd.	Total.	
General -	24	48	= 72	78
Technical	3	3	= 6	34
Traffic -	24	32	= 56	260 + 2,500.

There is no line between a Telegraphist and a Telegraph Master in this branch.

The result is as may be expected stagnation.

For promotion to the grade of Telegraph Masters the conditions vary considerably in the three branches.

In the Technical Branch there is no bar between a Telegraph Master and a Telegraphist, and the latter goes on drawing a Telegraph Master's pay in due course of his service as a mere matter of routine.

In the General Branch such promotions are made on the recommendation of the Director of a Circle.

From what has been said above it will be seen the three branches, Traffic, General and Technical, are separated and the men in each branch trained on separate lines. This is not at all considered satisfactory as experience has shown each branch is interdependent on the others. An officer should be so trained as to be capable of performing the duties of all these branches.

To meet this the following suggestions are put forward for consideration:—

(1) Careful selection of Telegraphists of and over ten years' service and showing special intelligence and abilities in the performance of their duties as Telegraphists should be made and these Telegraphists put through a thorough examination in ordinary Traffic and Technical matters.

(2) Those securing 75 per cent. and over of marks should then be put through a course of a year's higher training in the Electrician's yard where they should be again examined at the end of this course.

(3) Successful candidates securing 75 per cent. or more marks should be put through a year's Construction training, and examined at the end of this period in all matters relating to the Engineering branch.

(4) Those who secure 65 per cent. or over of marks should be put through a year's training in higher Traffic matters and attached to large offices.

It will be seen that men who successfully pass these tests during a period of three years have really become thoroughly trained officers capable of efficiently conducting work in any of the three branches. The best of these successful candidates should be promoted to Deputy Superintendent, second grade, as vacancies occur.

They may elect to work in the Traffic, General, or Technical branches, subject to transfer to any other branch than their choice as found necessary by the Department. As vacancies occur in the 1st grade the most suitable man or men should be selected on probation for one year during which period his or their work should be very closely watched. As selections will necessarily be made from different circles it is proposed to send six of the Senior Deputy Superintendents so selected to the Presidency Offices (two each to Bombay, Calcutta, and Madras Offices) if required in the Traffic Branch, or to a large Division if required for the Engineering work and their work closely scrutinised.

Selected Deputy Superintendents should work in other Offices or Divisions than those in which they may be working at time of selection. The best men of these six should be then promoted to Deputy Superintendent, I, to fill existing vacancies.

This procedure if given effect to will bring the best men to the top.

**75,466. (II.) Method of training and probation.**—The system of training Deputy Superintendents varies according to the Branch the recruit is required to join.

In the Traffic Branch the selected Telegraph Master is placed in one of the Presidency Offices to acquire a thorough knowledge in Traffic matters. He has to study the nature and volume of traffic dealt with by that office, the means of forming up auxiliary outlets in the event of trouble on the normal routes, the arrangement of staff to deal evenly with the flow of traffic, &c., throughout the day and, in short, how to manage rapid disposal of traffic to and from all directions so far as his office is concerned.

When favourably reported on, his name is registered as eligible for promotion to Deputy Superintendent, Traffic. On a vacancy occurring he is placed on a year's probation generally in a large office.

In the General Branch the selected Telegraphists of 10 to 12 years' service are first attached to Divisions where they are employed in inspecting Railway and Combined Offices and other routine in the Engineering Branch.

At the end of 12 months they are put through a Departmental Examination in Engineering matters and successful candidates enter the Sibpur College for a 4½ months' course in higher mathematics, surveying, etc. On passing this examination they are straightway promoted to Deputy Superintendent II, General.

Deputy Superintendent, Technical, have no special training beyond that already gone through as Telegraph Masters, Technical.

The above shows the three Branches have been separated and work on separate lines. The remarks on this point under recruitment apply here.

**75,467. (III.) Conditions of Service.**—These may be reviewed under the following heads:—

- (a) Nature of Service,
- (b) Promotions, and
- (c) Transfers.

(a) *Nature of Service.*—The nature of service rendered varies according to the Branch the Deputy Superintendent belongs to.

Traffic and Technical Deputy Superintendents work in Traffic Offices, the former are responsible for efficient handling of all Traffic matters while the latter attend to condition of lines, batteries, and all electrical apparatus.

(b) *Promotions.*—Promotion amongst the Upper Subordinates is very slow owing to the small number of appointments open to this grade.

In Government Resolution No. 913—918—115, dated 2nd February 1910, Department of Commerce and Industry, paragraph 20, sanction was accorded to the promotion of Deputy Superintendents to the Superior Branch of the Service to the extent of  $\frac{1}{4}$  of the appointments in that branch, i.e.,  $\frac{1}{4}$  of 84. This arrangement, if given effect to, would result in the promotion of a subordinate once in every two years on the average. The excess then in Superior Service has long been absorbed, yet no subordinate has been promoted to the Superior Service. There is a shortage of officers in the Superior Service, and yet no Upper Subordinate has been promoted to fill the vacancies up to the extent sanctioned in the Government resolution quoted.

It cannot be said with any degree of justice that men in the present subordinate ranks are not fully qualified to fill these vacancies in the Superior Service, while non-compliance with the ruling of Government is keenly felt by the Upper Subordinates.

Looking at the sister Service, the Postal Branch, it will be seen men have risen to much higher positions than it is possible for Telegraph subordinates to attain.

While giving these men all honour for their zeal and abilities it cannot be said they are in any way superior in intelligence to all the members of the subordinate rank of the Telegraph Service.

The Telegraph Department has lost its attraction for smart young men in India as the initial salary and general prospects are decidedly poor for the higher degree of proficiency required of them.

(c) *Transfers.*—Frequent transfers of members of the staff cause considerable pecuniary loss and inconvenience; while it is recognised that transfers must necessarily occur, these should be reduced to a minimum by each Circle maintaining the maximum number of men with a liberal percentage of reserves and thus avoid frequent temporary transfers.

Travelling allowances as controlled by the Civil Service Regulations are altogether inadequate, especially where a man transferred has a large family.

Since an official is transferred for the convenience of the Department, it is only reasonable to ask that the man concerned suffers no great loss in travelling.

Deputy Superintendents should be given the same concession as officers of the Provincial Service when travelling on duty or transfer. It is obvious if he

20 January 1914.]

Mr. J. W. THURLEY.

[Continued.]

has to maintain the dignity of his office and command that respect so essential to control, he must be placed on a higher footing than his subordinates in this respect. At present a Sub-Inspector of the Telegraph Department is given a second-class pass for travelling purposes, thereby bringing him on the same footing as a Deputy Superintendent of the Department. Again, a man transferred to a station under 200 miles from his original station is restricted to only a double second class fare irrespective of the number of members in his family, and luggage he is bound to take with him. It does not appear reasonable that when the distance is under 200 miles the officer should serve public interest at his own cost.

75,468. (IV.) Conditions of Salary.—It is not known whether the pay of the Upper Subordinates is to be increased on the amalgamation scheme coming into force, but it is generally felt that the initial and maximum pays of officers of this branch are inadequate in consideration of the arduous duties performed by them and the great responsibilities they bear.

House rent allowances granted by Government are altogether inadequate to enable any member to secure decent house accommodation anywhere. This question has never received the serious consideration it deserves, nor has the basis on which this allowance is given been sufficiently examined. In the Presidency Towns particularly house rent is steadily increasing every year.

Many men are paying three to four times the allowance granted them for house accommodation. It is not expected that Government will pay full house rent to members of this Department, but afford reasonable relief in this direction, say to Rs. 50 per mensem. Postmasters in Calcutta receive from Rs. 50 to Rs. 100 per mensem as Presidency and House Allowance.

Deputy Superintendents of the General Branch attached to the Presidency Offices (Bombay, Calcutta, Madras) receive house allowance, while others of the same branch elsewhere receive none. Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic and Technical Branches where not provided with free quarters also receive house allowances.

As the position of all Deputy Superintendents is identical this distinction constitutes a grievance and ought to be removed. All Deputy Superintendents should be given house allowance where free quarters are not available.

Presidency Allowance.—Under existing rules Deputy Superintendents in the Technical and General Branches of the Telegraph Department are entitled to grant of Presidency Allowance in Calcutta and Bombay, but it is denied to Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic Branch and no reason is given for such denial. Presidency allowance is a local allowance as defined in Civil Service Regulations, 32 (a) given in consideration of exceptional local circumstances, such as the unhealthiness or expensiveness of the locality or duty or the specially arduous nature of the work. It cannot be said that the pay of the Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, has been fixed with special reference to their residence in Presidency Towns, and as a matter of fact a Traffic Deputy Superintendent draws the same pay whether employed at any station in the cheapest Presidency of Madras or at any other mufasil station or at Calcutta and Bombay. The nature of duties Deputy Superintendents have to perform in Presidency Signal Offices is of a specially arduous nature, and it is only fair that when employed in such offices they should

get the Presidency allowance whether on consideration of the expensiveness of the locality or of the specially arduous nature of their duties.

The pay of Deputy Superintendents in all the three branches is equal and as there is no headquarters station in the mufasil for a Technical Deputy Superintendent it can be said that their pay was fixed in reference to residence in a Presidency Town but they get the allowance and Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic Branch are denied it, which is scarcely reasonable.

75,469. (V.) Conditions of Leave.—The restriction in Civil Service Regulations, 260, requiring an interval of six months to elapse between two periods of absence on privilege leave should be removed.

Privilege leave is kept in reserve to be enjoyed during sickness, but as often as not it happens that an officer falls sick within six months of return from one period of privilege leave and has to be placed on half pay, or if he has exceeded half pay limit on quarter pay even though he had privilege leave due and such dues are thereby forfeited.

The restriction in Civil Service Regulation, 233 (IV.), which requires that when privilege leave is combined with leave of any kind the combined leave must be for not less than six months should also be removed.

It may happen that an officer requires leave for a short period over the amount of privilege leave due at the time to recoup his health. Say an officer has two months and 20 days' privilege leave at a certain time and he falls sick, he requires 3½ months to get cured. If he takes 3½ months leave the whole period is counted on half pay and the privilege leave due is forfeited. In some cases an officer takes six months' leave in such circumstances simply to get advantage of the combined leave. This is not fair to the Department either as it loses the services of the man for the period in excess of 3½ months. Privilege leave is dearly earned and its forfeiture under the above restriction is most unfortunate.

It is only fair to expect that special conditions of service as in the Telegraph Department should ensure special privileges in respect of conditions regarding grant of leave and it is observed that Government recognise this as the condition regarding six months intervals does not apply to officers of the State Railway Revenue Establishment nor to Gazetted Officers of the Opium Department, *vide* note to Civil Service Regulations, 260.

75,470. (VI.) Conditions of pension.—For reasons set forth above the time at present allowed to count as service in respect of periods spent on leave with allowances in Civil Service Regulations, 408, should be increased.

The present and proposed periods are shown below :—

If the total service of an officer is not less than	Period to Count.	
	Present.	Proposed.
15 years - - - -	1 year	1 year
20 do. - - - -	do.	do.
25 do. - - - -	do.	2 years
30 do. - - - -	2 years	do.

MR. J. W. THURLEY called and examined.

75,471. (Lord Ronaldshay.) The witness was transferred from the general to the traffic branch in 1902, and held the position of Deputy Superintendent in the traffic branch since that date. He was an ordinary telegraphist for about eight years, and then entered the technical branch, and was selected for Sub-Assistant Superintendent before being transferred to the traffic department. Before becoming Deputy

Superintendent he himself had had 12 years' service, but at present in the general department a man became a Deputy Superintendent after about 15 years' service, and in the traffic department about 30 years.

75,472. All Deputy Superintendents were recruited from the ranks, there being no direct recruitment of any kind. All the larger telegraph offices were in

20 January 1914.]

MR. J. W. THURLEY.

[Continued.]

charge of Deputy Superintendents, except the three Presidency offices, which were under Superintendents. So far as work and responsibility went, the Deputy Superintendent corresponded with the gazetted Postmaster in the Postal Service, but not in the matter of pay and status. The difference in the duties of a Deputy Superintendent and a Telegraph Master was one of degree. The Telegraph Master had a small section of an office to manage, while the Deputy Superintendent was in charge of the whole office.

75,473. It was necessary that a Deputy Superintendent of Traffic should rise up through the ranks in order to learn the work of the department. The direct recruitment of untrained men would be impossible. A long training in the lower ranks was required.

75,474. The present rates of pay of Deputy Superintendents ran from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500. When the traffic branch was introduced in 1902, traffic officers were paid Rs. 350, but in 1908 the new scale came in, and the pay was raised to Rs. 400 or Rs. 500 for all Deputy Superintendents. There were only 16 officers in the two branches receiving the higher pay. The present pay would not be considered adequate, even if the specific grievances with regard to house and transfer allowances were removed. The responsibilities of a Deputy Superintendent were equal to those of gazetted Postmasters, but the pay was very small in comparison. Deputy Superintendents should be given the opportunity of rising to the same level as gazetted Postmasters. The most that Deputy Superintendents could rise to was Rs. 500, whereas gazetted Postmasters could rise to Rs. 1,200.

75,475. On the traffic side there were several posts above the Deputy Superintendents' class. The Superintendent's pay went up to Rs. 800 or Rs. 1,000, but no Deputy Superintendent was promoted to a Superintendentship. If that bar was removed, and Superintendents were recruited largely by promotion from Deputy Superintendents, the claims of the latter officers would be met.

75,476. A telegraphist selected to become a Deputy Superintendent should be trained for three years in the three different branches so that he might become an all-round competent officer.

75,477. The general branch was responsible for the lines, and the technical branch for the electrical apparatus, whilst the traffic branch dealt with the disposal of messages.

75,478. On the question of leave, the main desire was for greater elasticity. If the restrictions now imposed were removed, the representations put forward with regard to leave would be met.

75,479. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The officers would not press for an increase of salary if a considerable number of Superintendentships were thrown open to Deputy Superintendents, as they would then have something to work for. The proper proportion would be one-fourth. Generally speaking, a man would reach a Superintendentship after 25 years' service, so that he would have 11 or 12 years in the superior service, and would thus have a chance of rising nearly to the top.

75,480. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Assistant Superintendents were recruited from colleges in England or in India. There had been no promotion from the subordinate ranks to the Assistant Superintendent grade. In the same way the Superintendents came in through the colleges, and had never served in any of the subordinate ranks. The officers came in first as Assistant Superintendents in grades running from Rs. 250 to Rs. 800, and then were promoted to be Superintendents. At present the experience obtained by a Traffic Deputy Superintendent was not sufficient to enable him to discharge the duties of an Assistant Superintendent or Superintendent. A Deputy Superintendent of traffic would not know anything about engineering work, while an Assistant Superintendent might be called upon to do both. That was why qualifications were needed in all three branches.

75,481. (*Mr. Coode.*) There were nine Indians holding posts of Deputy Superintendents.

The witness withdrew.

R. G. WALKER, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (General).

*Written Statement relating to the Telegraph Department.*

75,482. [NOTE.—The views embodied in this written statement have been formulated after consulting as many officers of the grade as it was possible to communicate with in the short time at my disposal. These views may, therefore, be taken as representing the general opinion of the entire body of Deputy Superintendents (General), i.e., group (i) below.]

75,483. With a view to prevent possible confusion of the different grades of Deputy Superintendents it seems necessary to explain here that there are three distinct groups of officers in the Telegraph Department bearing this designation, on the same scale of salaries, but on separate cadres for promotion, &c., as detailed below:—

(i) *Deputy Superintendents (General).*—These officers, whose duties are of an exacting character, are chiefly employed on arduous outdoor work as Assistants to Superintendents of Divisions. They are entrusted with the construction and maintenance of Telegraph and Telephone lines and cables, and the preparation of estimates and accounts for the same. They also exercise general technical supervision of Telephone Systems and of a large number of Telegraph Offices worked by Postal Agency. Seven officers of this group at present occupy the responsible positions of Assistants to Directors of Circles, four are attached to the Store Branch (two of these are in charge of the important Store Depots at Bombay and Madras) and one is on deputation to the Traffic Branch as Assistant Traffic Manager in the Central Circle.

(ii) *Deputy Superintendents (Traffic).*—These officers are almost exclusively employed in the larger telegraph

offices on purely indoor traffic work, i.e., all matters relating to the receipt and despatch of telegrams—including the supervision and control of the staff of Telegraph Masters and Telegraphists working under them. A few of these officers are attached as Assistants to administrative Traffic Officers.

(iii) *Deputy Superintendents (Technical).*—These officers are employed on purely technical duties such as the testing of telegraph lines and cables, the maintenance of telegraph and other apparatus in the Presidency Offices and the fitting up of important telegraph and telephone systems and other electric installations.

*Note.*—Each of the above three groups is self-contained and transfers from one group to another are not permissible.

75,484. (I.) *Methods of Recruitment.*—As Deputy Superintendents (General) are now recruited and should continue to be recruited, from the Signalling Establishment, some remarks on the methods of recruitment of Telegraphists are called for.

All that is now required of a candidate for admission to a Telegraph Training Class is to qualify in writing from dictation and to furnish a school certificate up to such standard as the Head of the Circle may prescribe.

For ordinary signalling duties connected with the receipt, despatch and handling of telegrams, these preliminary qualifications may be considered as quite sufficient; but when it is borne in mind that officers of higher rank who might, before completing their career in the Department, be drafted into the Superior Service, are drawn from the ranks of Telegraphists, it



20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. WALKER.

[Continued.]

does not seem sufficient to be guided by these qualifications alone. The question of suitability as regards general deportment, moral tone and disciplinary training should also receive close consideration, as these are important factors in the development of responsible and trustworthy public servants.

While, therefore, not proposing any change in the present method of recruitment in regard to preliminary educational requirements, it is suggested that only lads who come from well-recognised Public Schools, and who give the impression by their general bearing that they would do credit to themselves and to the service, should be considered as eligible for subsequent promotion to Deputy Superintendents, for the reason that, while discharging their duties in that capacity, they will from time to time come in contact with Superior Officers of other services, both Civil and Military.

With this object in view Heads of Educational Institutions who present candidates for the Signalling Branch of the Department should be required to furnish information on these really important points, and Heads of Circles might be asked to interview all candidates and record their personal impressions of them, which opinion should subsequently appear in the Personal Rolls of Telegraphists; and only those who are considered of the right stamp should be ear-marked, so to speak, as eligible for advancement to the Deputy Superintendent grade.

What we certainly need as a prospective recruit for the Deputy Superintendent grade is a lad, be he Indian, Anglo-Indian or European, with an all-round mental, moral, physical, and disciplinary training approaching in some degree at least to the type of vigorous, manly, self-reliant middle class Public School boy at Home.

It is generally conceded that the difficulty in obtaining recruits of the right stamp is the low initial salary offered. It is, therefore, necessary to raise the commencing salary and to place increments for the first few years on a more liberal basis, in order that the Service may attract the sort of recruits we need for the higher posts. In most other Departments and on some of the more important Railways more lucrative openings to commence on are offered to those who are put through a special course of instruction, prior to appointment, and the better class of boys naturally turn to them.

It is, therefore, suggested that the initial salary of a Telegraphist be increased from Rs. 50 to Rs. 60, and that his first few increments be so arranged to make it possible for him to attain to a salary of Rs. 100 in five years, conditional, of course, on his passing what is now known as the "Technical Test."

All officers of the Deputy Superintendent grade are emphatically of opinion that recruitment for their grade should be made, as at present, from the Signalling Establishment. It is considered that direct recruitment from any source outside the Department would not be a sound policy, since, apart from other considerations, it would deprive promising Telegraphists of one of the avenues of advancement now open to them, causing a disastrous block in their ranks and creating a real hardship.

Suitable Telegraphists, with due regard to what has already been said, and with, say, from five to eight years' service as Telegraphists, who elect for the General Branch and have so far done well should before being detailed for a special course of theoretical and practical instruction, and with a view to weeding out possible detrimentals, be once again required to appear before the Head of the Circle. Further, for the sake of uniformity in selection, it is suggested that all candidates approved of by Heads of Circles should be required to appear before the Chief Engineer for final selection.

**75,485. (II.) Methods of training and probation.**—Some modifications are suggested in the present system. The theoretical course should precede the practical. The general opinion is that the present course at the Sibpur Engineering College is too short, and that it should be increased to nine months at least, and that it should comprise lessons in the practical use of all surveying instruments, including

the theodolite. It is all suggested that some time should be spent in the Store Yard, in the Office of the Electrical-Engineer-in-Chief, and in a Presidency Telegraph Office for the purpose of acquiring useful knowledge of (1) the nomenclature of the various patterns of construction stores and tools, (2) technical matters, including cable testing, (3) testing telegraph lines, &c.

The course of instruction to extend over a period of two years, and to be arranged as under:—

(a) Course of instruction in the Sibpur Engineering College for nine months. To pass the examination at present prescribed at the end of that term.

(b) Course in the Store Yard, under the Superintendent of Stores, for three months.

(c) Course in the Office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief for three months.

(d) Course in one of the Presidency Telegraph Offices for three months.

(e) To be employed on a large work of a telegraph line construction or reconstruction, under a capable officer for six months.

*Note.*—Only under (a) would the services of those under training be lost to the Department. Under (b), (c), (d), and (e) they will really be doing useful work while undergoing practical instruction.

On completing their training, as above, to the satisfaction of the Officers under whom they are trained, they should be appointed Inspecting Telegraphists (it would, perhaps, be better to designate them "Telegraph Inspectors"), and posted to Telegraph Engineering Divisions for duty in that capacity. While so employed they should be given every facility for acquiring a comprehensive knowledge of the duties and responsibilities of Deputy Superintendents (General) and of Divisional Office work and routine, including Cash and Store accounts; also of the rules in the various chapters of the Telegraph Code as now prescribed.

At the end of two years they should be required to pass the prescribed Departmental Examination, and, on passing that examination, their names should be brought on to a list of qualified men for promotion to Deputy Superintendent (General). Promotions should be made from this list as vacancies occur, with due regard to age, so that no case would occur of a man, after going through the mill, becoming age-barred. No man should be promoted who has less than 10 years' service and whose age exceeds the limit now fixed.

Until they are promoted to Deputy Superintendents they will continue to do duty as Inspectors (or Inspecting Telegraphists) on the progressive salary of Telegraphists, plus the usual allowance.

The period spent in training and as Inspectors should be considered as a sufficient probation, and no further probation should be imposed on promotion to Deputy Superintendent.

**75,486. (III.) Condition of Service.**—(1) Deputy Superintendents (General) labour under several disabilities, the chief of which are enumerated below:—

(a) *Non-gazetted rank.*—The nature of the duties of these officers is such that they are brought in contact with Superior Officers of other Government Departments and of Railways, in their relations with whom they are placed at a great disadvantage by not being recognised as Gazetted Officers.

(b) *Travelling Allowance.*—The Maximum salary attainable by the Officers of this class having been fixed at Rs. 500, they are technically debarred from any claims to first-class travelling allowances. Even a Deputy Superintendent holding charge of a Division, entrusted with all the powers of a Superintendent (usually a senior officer of the Superior Establishment) and bearing all the responsibilities and performing all the duties appertaining to that office, cannot claim first-class travelling allowances because his total emoluments, including charge allowance, are subject to a maximum of Rs. 500. In no other department of Government does this condition of things exist. Further, a Deputy Superintendent in charge of a

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. WALKER.

[Continued.]

Division may have an Assistant Superintendent working under his orders, in which case the extraordinary anomaly is created of the officer in charge of the Division drawing inferior travelling allowances to those drawn by an officer working under him.

(c) *House Accommodation and House Rent Allowances.*—Quarters are not provided for Deputy Superintendents (General) nor is any house rent allowance granted to them, except in the three Presidency Towns and in Rangoon. On the other hand their *confrères* in the Traffic Branch (Group (2) under the head "Preliminary") who are on the same scale of salaries as themselves, are either provided with free quarters (and furniture) or granted house rent allowance in lieu thereof. Having regard to the indisputable fact that Deputy Superintendents (General) are subject to very frequent and inconvenient transfers, often to places where they cannot find suitable accommodation except at very high rentals, ranging from 12 to 15 per cent. of their incomes, their position in this respect is a very real hardship.

(d) *Conveyance and other Allowances.*—In respect of these also the Deputy Superintendent of the Telegraph Department usually fares worse than Officers of corresponding rank in other Government Departments.

(2) But the greatest hardship of all is the total exclusion of this class of Officers from advancement to Superior Service. An examination of the list of Superior Officers will reveal the fact that it does not contain the name of even a single officer recruited from the Upper Subordinate grade, Government Resolutions on the subject notwithstanding. In practically every other Department of Government Service, and in the Post Office in particular, capable subordinates have been advanced to Superior Service.

(3) It is fervently hoped that these matters will receive very careful and sympathetic consideration and that measures will be adopted without delay for the removal of these disabilities. It is suggested that the fairest and most effective remedy for (a) and (b), and incidentally for (c) and (d), is to place Deputy Superintendents of the Telegraph Department on the same

footing as Superintendents of Post Offices. It cannot be denied that there is just as good material amongst the subordinates of the former Department as there is in the latter, and that the qualifications, responsibilities and duties imposed on Deputy Superintendent (General) are, in every respect, equal to those required of Superintendents of Post Offices, a large number of whom have been recruited from the Subordinate ranks.

(4) In the Post Office such of the Subordinate staff who pass what is known as the Post Office Departmental Examination are borne on a list for promotion to Superintendents, and such promotion carries with it advancement to Gazetted rank, and a title to first class travelling allowances. In the Telegraph Department subordinates who aspire to the rank of Deputy Superintendent (General) after a careful selection, are put through a special course of instruction and training, at the end of which they have to pass a searching Departmental Examination and a stiff medical test of fitness, and yet on promotion they are only reckoned as "Upper Subordinates."

(5) This unmerited slur on the subordinate staff of a sister Department has been very keenly felt for many years past, and has been the subject of memorials from time to time. Prominent attention was drawn to this differential treatment in paras. 9 to 12 of a memorial submitted to H. E. the Viceroy, in January, 1909, by practically the entire body of Deputy Superintendents (General), and the rejection of their prayer in this respect was a bitter disappointment to these officers. Now that a scheme for the complete amalgamation of these two departments has gone up to the Secretary of State for India it is earnestly hoped that it includes a provision for the advancement of this long-suffering class of officers to Gazetted rank and to the title to first class travelling allowances. Of course, in order that they may be technically entitled to these benefits it will be necessary to raise the maximum salary of the grade.

75,487. (IV.) *Condition of Salary.*—(1) Existing conditions of salary, for the three groups of Deputy Superintendents are shown below in a tabulated form:—

Groups.	Total sanctioned Strength.	2nd Class.		1st Class.			
		Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.	Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.	Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.
			Rs.		Rs.		Rs.
General - -	72	48	250-15-325	16	325-15-400	8	400-25-500
Traffic - -	56	32	250-15-325	16	325-15-400	8	400-25-500
Technical -	6	3	250-15-325	2	325-15-400	1	400-25-500

The disregard of proportion when allotting the number in the higher scales for the General Branch, as compared with the number allotted for the Traffic Branch, caused some irritation to the men in the former Branch when the above scale was given effect to, and it is largely responsible for the serious block in promotion that now exists in that Branch. Particular attention is drawn to the fact that there will be, on 1st April next, 10 men in the 325-400 scale of the 1st class and as many as 26 men in the 2nd class who will be on the *maximum* pay of these scales, waiting promotion! A feeling of uneasiness prevails amongst those affected that it is hopeless for them to go beyond the maximum of those respective scales. It seems imperative that something should be done immediately to relieve this block, and that extensions beyond the age of 55 years, another cause of stagnation in promotion, should be effectually stopped, for some years at any rate.

(2) In paragraph 75,486(4), under the head "Conditions of service" it has been pointed out that the subordinates of the Telegraph Department have at least as fair a claim to advancement to the Superintendent Establishment as their colleagues in the Post Office, and if what is therein suggested is given

effect to, and Deputy Superintendents of the Telegraph Department are brought on to the Superior Establishment, on an equal footing and on the same scale or emoluments as may be arranged for Superintendents of Post Offices, as a result of the recommendations of this Royal Commission; no other revision of their salaries need be asked for. It is urged, with the utmost emphasis, that this well-merited consideration be now extended to Deputy Superintendents in return for useful services rendered under most trying conditions and in the face of adverse and discouraging circumstances.

(3) In paragraph 6 of their memorial of 1909 to H. E. the Viceroy, Deputy Superintendents prayed for a revision of salaries, with very sound arguments in support thereof, as shewn below:—

Class III	-	-	-	Rs. 250-25-350
Class II	-	-	-	Rs. 350-25-450
Class I	-	-	-	Rs. 450-25-600
plus eight special appointments on a salary of Rs. 700/-.				

(4) If, for some very cogent reason, it is found impossible to entertain the proposal made in paragraph 75,487(2), it is urged that a revision of their

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. WALKER.

[Continued.]

salaries somewhat on the above lines should now be given effect to, that the maximum attainable be raised to Rs. 900 and that classes be abolished and a time scale be substituted, as shown below:—

*Upper Subordinate Service.*

Deputy Superintendents, (General).	First five years	- Rs. 250-20-350.
	Next six years	- Rs. 350-25-500.

*Superior Service \*(by selection).*

Superintendents special grade.	First five years	- Rs. 500-40-700.
	Last four years	- Rs. 700-50-900.

(5) The above scale would give a man entering the grade of Deputy Superintendent, at about 30 years of age, a tolerable chance of reaching the maximum attainable in time to enable him to retire on full pension.

(6) In considering the above revision due regard has been paid to the prospects of subordinates in other Departments and on State Railways. Even some Company worked Railways are now throwing open their superior Services to their subordinates: therefore, in submitting this scale of revised salaries, Deputy Superintendents (General) are only asking for equitable treatment.

(7) One important point to be borne in mind is that the purchasing value of the rupee is now only about half of what it was 20 or 25 years ago, and that a present day income of Rs. 900 is about equal to an income of Rs. 400 or 500 of a quarter of a century ago; and, moreover, that revisions now made will probably remain stationary for the next two decades, when conditions of life, from a monetary point of view, will probably be still more difficult.

75,488. (V.) *Conditions of leave.—Privilege Leave.*—The present limitation of three months up to which privilege can be accumulated operates harshly, especially in view of the fact that privilege leave cannot always be granted at the time it is applied for. It is considered that such leave should accumulate up to six months.

*Combined Leave.*—Leave of this nature cannot now be taken for a shorter period than six months. This is another rule that operates harshly, for the season that, if a man goes on any period of privilege leave and has the misfortune to fall ill at the end of it, rendering a short extension of his leave necessary, the whole period of his leave is commuted to leave on half pay, and he thereby loses the benefits of the privilege leave he had earned. It is considered that combined leave should be allowed for any period.

*Study Leave.*—Leave of this kind is not granted to the subordinate grades. There seems to be no reason why such leave should be withheld from them. As study leave makes for efficiency it should be granted to all ranks under the same conditions as it is now granted to Superior Officers.

It is notorious that in the Telegraph Department privilege leave is frequently refused, and, owing to the limitations put upon it, leave earned is often entirely lost. It is, of course, admitted that the exigencies of the service may render such refusal of leave unavoidable, but in those cases where privilege leave is thereby forfeited altogether, some pecuniary compensation might be made in the shape of a month's or half a month's pay for every month of privilege leave thus lost.

*Furlough.*—It is recognised that officers recruited from England are entitled to some special indulgence in the way of more liberal furlough rules. Their homes are a long way off and they lose a considerable portion of their furlough in the voyage to and from England. The rigours of the Indian climate must also tell on them more severely than on persons born and brought up in the country. While, however,

conceding all this ungrudgingly, it is considered that the disparity in the rules is too great, especially in their application to the subordinate grades. It is, therefore, suggested that the furlough rules and conditions, in so far as they relate to the subordinate grades, should be placed on a more generous scale.

75,489. (VI.) *Conditions of pension.*—The existing regulations regarding pensions appear to be reasonable, except in respect of the condition that retirement previous to the completion of 30 years' service entails the production of a medical certificate of unfitness. The unanimous opinion of all officers is that the rules should be amended so as to provide for retirement on full pension after completion of 25 years' service without the production of a medical certificate.

It sometimes happens that a man dies before retirement, after rendering between 20 and 35 years' service. Under the present rules the pension earned is, of course, in the nature of the case, entirely lost, and the man's family do not get the benefit they would indirectly derive if the man had lived to enjoy his pension. In such cases the family, even though they may receive a lump sum of money from the recently instituted Provident Fund or from an Insurance Company, are soon reduced to penury. It is thought Government should take this matter into consideration and devise some measure whereby the widow of the deceased officer would become entitled to a reasonable fraction of the pension her husband would have drawn had he lived.

75,490. (VII) *Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of services into Imperial and Provincial.*—It is not known what limitations have been fixed for the employment of non-Europeans in the Telegraph Department but in recent years they have been admitted in larger numbers. Nor is it known if any restrictions on account of nationality are placed on candidates recruited in England for the Imperial Service. Apparently there are none.

As regards the Provincial Branch of the Superior Service, which, as it now stands, has been entirely recruited from the Rurki College, it may be pointed out that, of the 19 officers in that service only three are Europeans or Anglo-Indians and 16 are Indians. This is a ratio enormously in favour of the latter.

In the Subordinate Establishment there is no limitation apparently, and it is generally thought that the existing ratio is satisfactory.

As the controversy with regard to this question appears to be chiefly directed to appointments in the Superior Services further remarks under this head would be out of place and superfluous here.

The existing division of the service into Imperial and Provincial must necessarily cause much heart-burning in the ranks of the latter, but a little consideration would show that there are very sound arguments in favour of officers recruited from England being granted higher emoluments and certain additional privileges. These officers are working in a country thousands of miles away from the land of their birth and they incur enormous expenditure in the up-keep of two establishments very often, in going Home and returning from leave and in the numerous incidental expenses connected therewith, which the Indian recruited officer is saved. It has been argued that for men doing the same work there should be no differentiation in pay, but this argument falls to the ground when it is pointed out that senior and junior officers of the same service, doing the same work, are not paid the same salaries. Would the junior officer be justified in claiming the same remuneration as is paid to his senior since he turns out work of the same nature? However, in order to quench this heart-burning the question of placing all officers on the same scale of pay and granting a personal allowance, equivalent to one-third of his income, to an officer recruited from England, which allowance should be included in his emoluments in calculating leave allowances and pension, is suggested. Of course, the remedy would not, it is feared, be effectual but it seems to be the only way of meeting the case.

\* 25 per cent of superior appointments to be reserved for this class.

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. WALKER.

[Continued.]

It is thought that for purposes of administration the Superior Establishment should contain at least 50 per cent. of officers recruited from England, and further, the system of direct recruitment from outside the Department for the Superior Establishment in this country should be abolished. This would do away with the Provincial Service as it is now composed. The other 50 per cent. of the Superior appointments should be allotted to capable men in the subordinate grades—25 per cent. to Deputy Superintendents (General) and 25 per cent. to Deputy Superintendents (Traffic and Technical). It is emphatically asserted that there is excellent material in the Department itself for such recruitment.

75,491. (VIII) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.—No remarks

Mr. R. G. WALKER called and examined.

75,493. (*Lord Ronaldshay*.) The witness had held the position of Deputy Superintendent in the general branch for nearly 16 years, and was recruited from the signalling establishment. He was a telegraphist for eight years, and a Telegraph Master for seven. He did not represent the service, although he had consulted a good many of his brother officers in the general branch. Deputy Superintendents were divided into general, traffic and technical, and he spoke mainly for the general.

75,494. Signallers with five to eight years' service should be selected for training and instruction with a view to promotion. The present rule was that signallers might be selected for appointments as inspecting telegraphists, provided they had not less than four-and-a-half years' service. The course of training and instruction covered two years in all, and should be followed by two years' service as a telegraph inspector in a telegraphic engineering division. It was usual for theory to come before practice, and he considered a training in Sibpur College would be much more useful to a man before he was put on outdoor work. There might be something to be said in favour of having the practical training before the theoretical, but there was a general agreement amongst the officers that the training at Sibpur should come first. After serving for two years as telegraph inspector, an officer should go up for a departmental examination, and on passing should be eligible for promotion to a Deputy Superintendentship. By the time he was ready for promotion to a Deputy Superintendentship he would have had about ten and-a-half years' service, which was about the same as under the present system, except that a man did not now get the full training suggested. A man now selected as inspecting telegraphist must not be over 28 years of age, and when his turn came for promotion his age must not exceed 35.

75,495. The duties in the general branch of the service were of a very varied character. A considerable amount of technical knowledge was required, and a certain amount of traffic knowledge. When the engineering became separated from the traffic branch, the general Deputy Superintendent would go on to the engineering branch, so that a knowledge of traffic would not then be required. There were difficulties in the way of recruiting directly to the Deputy Superintendentship of the general branch, because a Deputy Superintendent, apart from his technical knowledge, had also to understand signalling, as he might be sent out at any time to open up a telegraph line that was interrupted. It was necessary, therefore, that a Deputy Superintendent should pass through the ranks.

75,496. The cadre was divided into two classes, and the first class was divided into two grades; but there was no difference at all in the work, men were doing from the bottom to the top. Unless a man did badly he would go up in rotation, but he would stop at Rs. 325 until there was a vacancy. The increments were given annually. By the time a man had reached the Rs. 325 grade he would have between 16 and

as regards the Indian Civil Service except that it is considered that it would be a wise policy to always have an Indian Civil Service Officer at the Head of the two Departments which will necessarily require the control of an exceptionally capable officer, specially experienced in administration.

In so far as the Subordinate Service of the Department is concerned, it compares, as already pointed out, unfavourably with the Subordinate Services of other Departments, especially in the matter of advancement to the Superior grades. A comparison on this point is invited.

75,492. (IX) Any other points.—If possible something might be done to reduce the large number of transfers which are more numerous in the Telegraph Department than in any other Department.

20 years service under the present method of recruitment. A signaller was recruited between 16 and 20 or an average of 18, and a man would be about 35 when he reached the Rs. 325 grade. Promotion from the second to the first class, and also from the second to the first grade in the first class was by seniority.

75,497. In 1892 a Government resolution provided as an occasional measure that deserving subordinates might be promoted to the superior establishment, and by a resolution in 1910 the subordinates were promised one-eighth of the superior posts. None of them, however, had yet been received. The reason no doubt was that the amalgamation scheme had not yet come into operation, but that did not help the men whose promotion was blocked.

75,498. By the time a man reached the top grade of Deputy Superintendent he would be between 42 and 50 years of age. One of the top men now was 54. He himself was in the second grade of the first class.

75,499. The responsibilities and powers of a Superintendent were greater than those of a Deputy Superintendent, but the work was the same, and he would promote Deputy Superintendents to be Superintendents by seniority tempered by selection. He did not think there was any objection to interchangeability as between Deputy Superintendents in the three branches, except that there was only one man now in the traffic branch, who had done work as a general Deputy Superintendent, and that was the previous witness, Mr. THURLEY. He had been drafted into the traffic department when the new resolution was published. There would be difficulties in transferring men from the traffic to the general branch as the traffic man had not done any outside work, but the general man could be transferred to the traffic because he had had a training in traffic.

75,500. The division of the service into Imperial and Provincial caused a certain amount of heart-burning; and though there was an unanswerable case for paying the imported a higher pay than the indigenous officer, the discontent might be mitigated by giving the same pay and allowing the European officer a foreign allowance to bring his emoluments up to the present scale.

75,501. It was the general opinion in the service that the head of the amalgamated department should always be an Indian Civil Service officer on account of the administrative work that would have to be done. That was on the supposition that the telegraph officer was going to be compensated for the loss of the Director-Generalship in some other way.

75,502. More elasticity was wanted in connection with leave.

75,503. His objections to direct recruitment in India for the Provincial Service was based on the fact that it was only fair to the subordinate staff that they should have an opportunity of being recruited. The Postal Department was recruited in the same way. Quite 50 per cent. of the officers in the higher departments were recruited from the subordinate ranks.

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. WALKER.

[Continued.]

75,504. The new branch of engineering telegraphists would be a much more specialised branch of work than postal work, and it might be a good thing to encourage the Indian Engineering Colleges by giving them some share in the recruitment to that branch, provided, of course, that a fair percentage went to the Signalling establishment.

75,505. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He had been educated at the Lawrence Memorial School, Ootacamund. If the higher appointments were given by direct recruitment in India, boys of the domiciled community from such institutions would be shut out. Their education was confined to such schools and included a certain amount of technical education.

75,506. (*Mr. Chaulbal.*) Under the amalgamation scheme the group of officers now doing traffic work would go the traffic branch, and those in the general branch to engineering. The technical group would possibly go with engineering, though personally he thought it ought to go with traffic, because the work was largely inside telegraph offices.

75,507. The loss of the Director-General's post appealed to the Deputy Superintendents not from a monetary point of view, but from the point of view of loss of prestige to the whole service. Every officer recruited as an Assistant Superintendent or Superintendent could not possibly rise to the post of Director-General, but had hopes of doing so.

The witness withdrew.

### At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January 1914.

PRESENT :

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.  
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners :—

S. C. MAULIK, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Vizagapatam Division.

J. C. SHERIDAN, Esq., Postmaster-General, Madras,

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. C. A. GOODALL, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Madras.

(*Mr. Goodall was examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs 75,269–78.*)

Mr. H. C. A. GOODALL called and examined.

75,508. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was at present holding the post of director of telegraphs of the Madras circle. He was recruited from Cooper's Hill in October 1886, and attained his present position on the 10th April 1910. He was not a signatory to the corporate memorandum as he was on furlough at the time, but he accepted it as expressing his views.

75,509. He desired to lay special stress on the necessity for an education in England. To this end it was proposed that 75 per cent. of the service should be recruited in England. It was a matter not of colour or creed but of efficiency. If Indians would go to England for their training there was no objection to giving them 50 per cent. of the appointments, but he would prefer not to fix any racial proportions.

75,510. The request that recruitment to the engineering branch in England should be by competitive examination amongst nominated candidates had since been modified. The method now desired was that followed in the case of the Public Works Department, *plus* the requirement of an Engineering or Science degree to be held by the candidate.

75,511. He also attached importance to the grant of study leave to young engineering officers not less than once in five years, as in certain of the other departments. Without this he could not be expected to keep abreast of inventions and new discoveries. The electrical department of the engineering college in Madras was not organised to give a man the opportunity for advanced electrical studies.

75,512. The salaries proposed in the amalgamated scheme were generally suitable except with regard to the head of the engineering branch. If the pay of that post was raised to Rs. 3,000 it would meet the claims of the service with regard to pay, but not with regard to position. It would still be desired that an officer of the telegraph service should be eligible for the director-generalship of the combined department. It was true no officers were recruited with that

promise, but they had always had the director-generalship of telegraphs before them.

75,513. He preferred a time-scale to a graded system. There was no objection to the pay of the provincial and Imperial services being the same, provided a foreign service allowance was granted to Europeans to bring their pay up to the present amount.

75,514. There was some feeling of dissatisfaction in the provincial service about the distinctions between the Imperial and provincial branches, and a solution would be to the advantage of the department. There was the same feeling amongst telegraphists in connection with the local and the general scale, under which they received different rates of pay while doing the same work. The general scale man, however, was liable to be transferred all over India, whereas the local scale officer was only liable to be transferred within certain limits.

75,515. At present there was not much difficulty in regard to leave, but no new officers were now being recruited, and unless the amalgamation scheme came in quickly officers would have to be taken on to relieve the strain.

75,516. The officers desired to retain their right to pension after twenty years' service. If a man desired to retire at forty-two years of age he should not be stopped, but very few would take advantage of the option. The fact, however, that it was there added to the attractiveness of the department.

75,517. The pension should extend up to 700% after thirty years' service and on a non-contributory basis. The figure was based on the pensions of a scientific department such as the Indian Medical Service.

75,518. The general provident fund was open to all officers of the service, and contributions were compulsory up to a certain percentage and voluntary over that. He believed every officer subscribed to the fund. The fund, however, could not take the place of

27 January 1914.]

Mr. H. C. A. GOODALL

[Continued.]

commutation of pension, though, if commutation was introduced, it might not be necessary to compel officers to join the provident fund. If the Government contributed to the provident fund as they contributed to the railway funds, commutation of part of the pension might not be necessary. Officers felt very strongly that they ought to have the right to commute a portion of their pension with the existing restrictions, because they looked upon pension as deferred pay. An officer who died lost his pension, but if he commuted a portion of it that portion remained for his wife and children.

75,519. The expense in connection with houses varied in different localities, and it was only in the large presidency towns that it was abnormal. In Madras it was not so bad as in Calcutta or Bombay, but houses are becoming more expensive. In Madras a small allowance was given. Superintendents received Rs. 45. He himself got Rs. 50.

75,520. In the matter of travelling allowances an officer's family should be recognised, and reasonable household effects allowed. The State should bear the whole cost of removal. He had been told by an officer that every transfer had cost him Rs. 500 over and above what he had drawn from Government. Transfers had not been so frequent of late years.

75,521. (Mr. Chaubal.) The Madras Engineering College had an electrical section, but the apparatus was very limited. Technical instruction in local institutions could not possibly be so good as that given in institutions in Europe, where every facility was offered for practical training. Book work might be done in India as easily as in England, but as large electrical machinery was not made in India men would have to go to England for that part of their training.

75,522. (Mr. Abdur Rahim.) Officers on furlough often visited telegraph workshops and other works to improve their knowledge, but if they wished to recoup themselves any part of the expense they had to obtain permission first. He did not know whether any officers had visited works at their own expense, but no doubt many men had done so. Outside the technical branch it was not of indispensable value to an officer to obtain technical experience on the present organisation of the department. Study leave was necessary to keep an officer's knowledge up to date.

75,523. (Sir Theodore Morison.) The objection of a good many officers to the general provident fund was that it did not make any provision for a man's family

in case he died young. Even if Government paid cent. per cent. to the fund, it would not amount to anything if a man died three years after entering the service. There was a rule that if an officer insured his life the premiums could be deducted from the subscriptions to the general provident fund, and there was a veto on his raising money on the policy. Officers drew upon the provident fund for the purpose of sending their wives or children to England, and that would not be possible under an insurance scheme, but that disadvantage was small compared with the advantage which must accrue in other directions. Any amounts drawn from the provident fund had to be repaid.

75,524. (Mr. Maulik.) Owing to the fact that the conditions of service were going to be altered, men who had to do with technical work as well as engineering would require training, but men who were not going to do technical work would not require technical training. At present there was no necessity for a very high technical training as a technical branch was in existence, but at the same time, if a man had a knowledge of the subject, it often saved the technical officers going out to do the work. Officers should be given an opportunity of keeping their knowledge up to date as the technical department was to be abolished after the amalgamation.

75,525. He was not prepared to say whether the amalgamation scheme would be a success, but the idea was that engineering officers would have to do all the technical work, and for that purpose it was necessary to have 75 per cent. of the men from England with a very high technical training, competent to carry out technical work. The training of young officers who came from Cooper's Hill was very insufficient. He himself went to Calcutta where he stayed for two months, and was then drafted off for field service in Upper Burma, and had no opportunity of learning anything. The Cooper's Hill men were not highly trained in electrical engineering, because this was then only in its infancy when he was at Cooper's Hill.

75,526. It was open to Government, if they saw fit, to give Imperial and provincial service officers the same pay when doing the same work. The provincial service man might get the same pay in the director's grade but not in the superintendent's grade.

75,527. The complaint with regard to the warrant of precedence was that the Directors of Telegraphs were graded considerably below officers of equal status in other services.

The witness withdrew.

J. G. MORGAN, Esq., Superintendent, Telegraph Department, Trichinopoly Division

*Written Statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.*

75,528. (I.) **Methods of recruitment.**—It is suggested that three-eighths of the officers be recruited from English Engineering Colleges, and one-eighth direct from Junior Officers of the British Post Office, who would be willing to join the Indian Service; three-eighths from Indian Engineering Colleges, and the balance one-eighth be recruited from the Indian Subordinate Staff.

75,529. (II.) **Systems of training and probation.**—That officers recruited from the English Engineering Colleges be appointed for a year on probation to the British Post Office, and officers recruited from the Indian Engineering Colleges be appointed for a year on probation to the Indian Service. Both officers recruited from the British Post Office and the Indian Telegraph Department be on probation for one year in the Indian Service.

75,530. (III.) **Conditions of service.**—There should be no distinction between officers recruited in India and England.

75,531. (IV.) **Conditions of salary.**—That the rates of pay should be the same for all. No distinction should

be made in the rates of pay given to officers recruited in England and to the officers recruited in India. That in place of any difference of pay, a first class return passage to England be given to all Non-Indians recruited in England once in five years, and that the number of free passages to be given be restricted as follows:—

2	return 1st class passages after 1st 5 years' service.
3	" " " " " 10 " "
4	" " " " " 15 " "
5	" " " " " 20 " "
5	" " " " " 25 " "
5	" " " " " 30 " "

75,532. (V.) **Conditions of leave.**—That all officers be permitted to accumulate privilege leave to the extent of five months when such leave is to be spent out of India, otherwise the present privilege leave rules to hold good. That the conditions for medical leave and furlough as at present hold for the European Service be granted to all alike.

75,533. (VI.) **Conditions of pension.**—That the conditions of pension as at present hold for the European Service be granted to all alike.



27 January 1914.]

Mr. J. G. MORGAN.

[Continued.]

75,534. (VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-European and the working of the existing systems of the division of services into Imperial and Provincial.—That the distinction of services into Imperial and Provincial should be abolished. This distinction at present is deeply felt by all services. It leaves the impression that Government sanction and stamp the distinction of all services recruited in India known as Provincial Services as being inferior to and quite below the level of the Imperial Service. This treatment is silently very much resented.

75,535. (VIII.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—It is suggested that (a) Government provide private buildings for its officers more freely. (b) That the travelling allowances on transfer be more liberal, and extended to cover all reasonable charges incurred by an officer breaking up his home and having to move his family from one station to another. This may be limited to actual certified charges not exceeding six First Class and three Third Class fares, plus an allowance for 40 maunds of luggage.

Mr. J. G. MORGAN called and examined.

75,536. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was superintendent of telegraphs, Trichinopoly division, and had been elected to represent the members of the provincial service whose views were set forth in the written statement.

75,537. Members of the Imperial and provincial services were all on one list for promotion, and received promotion in turn, and the provincial service officers understood, when they joined, that they were to be treated on an equality. But when the department was reorganised in 1910 rules were brought in by which the provincial service officers lost eight years' seniority. That had now been rectified. Under the present system the pay, pension, furlough, and leave rules differed from those in the Imperial service, but there was one list for promotion. As a matter of policy and equity officers doing the same work should be paid alike. He admitted, however, that there was some difference in the circumstances of an officer recruited in England and of one recruited in India, but believed that the provincial service would object to a foreign service allowance being given to Europeans, and considered that this objection could be justified on economic and political grounds. A foreign allowance would stamp the recipients as "Foreigners" in India. It would be wise to get rid of this idea and avoid such a classification. It is strongly held that equality of opportunity of entering Government service and equality of treatment in all respects once in Government service would remove all grounds of discontent.

75,538. If under the amalgamation scheme a new traffic branch was created, quite separate from the engineering branch, the officers would no longer press for the recruitment of British post office men to the department. Failing that, the type of officers that should be taken from the British post office would be traffic men.

75,539. There was absolutely no difference between the standard of Cooper's Hill and the standard of Rurki College, where he himself was trained. In fact, the students, who passed out of Rurki, were better educated than the men who came from Cooper's Hill, and there was not much difference in practical training as between the two colleges. An engineer trained at the Rurki College had just as much chance of becoming a highly satisfactory engineer as an engineer who was trained at a college in England. That, however, did not apply entirely to the electrical branch, but only to the extent that electrical engineering was made use of in India. A certain amount of efficiency was required in electrical engineering in the telegraph department, but not a great deal, as the department had no work in setting up electrical installations, and all the training necessary could be acquired at an Indian college, supplemented by the training received in the department itself.

75,540. The number of higher posts to be allotted to the subordinate staff should be kept small. Really

suitable subordinates were rare. Moreover they were not sufficiently educated, and had not the necessary social quantities.

75,541. The present rules with regard to leave were faulty in that they did not provide sufficient leave on full pay. Commutation of longer furlough on half pay to shorter furlough on full pay would meet the claims of the department.

75,542. On transfer the Government should meet the cost of moving an officer's wife and family and a reasonable amount of effects.

75,543. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) His recommendation with regard to pay did not mean that this should necessarily be that of the provincial service. What was asked for was equality of treatment, and that, whatever was given to the Imperial officers, should be given to the provincial officers.

75,544. The number of first-class passages recommended in the written statement assumed that the officer was a married man.

75,545. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The Indian college engineers were quite as efficient as any of those who came from England. If the department could be manned efficiently by men from Indian colleges, a suitable scale of salary would be one midway between the present Imperial and provincial scales. The cost of living had gone up, and Indian officers were adopting western styles of living, and they also had heavy expenses in connection with their families.

75,546. It would be possible to get suitable European officers from England on reduced rates of pay. Private firms obtained them on less favourable terms than those given by Government and without pensions.

75,547. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) If something between the Imperial and provincial scales of pay was introduced, Englishmen would still come out to India, because the pay would even so be higher than that which they would obtain in their own country. He objected to officers doing the same work and being paid differently. It was true that it was possible to obtain in India men for even lower salaries than were now given in the provincial service, but that was simply because it was a case of "Hobson's choice." If the question was one of market price he believed an Englishman could be obtained much cheaper than he was being obtained for now.

75,548. (*Mr. Maulik.*) Previous to 1895 the students from Rurki were appointed on the Imperial scale of pay in the Public Works Department, but the pension and leave rules were different.

75,549. The provincial service had progressed backwards as far as the aspirations of the natives of India were concerned, and this was keenly felt by them.

The witness withdrew.

27 January 1914.] Messrs. J. F. RODRIGUES and P. A. KRISHNAMA CHARLU.

J. F. RODRIGUES, Esq., Officiating Presidency Postmaster, Madras; and  
P. A. KRISHNAMA CHARLU, Esq., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Madras,  
were called and examined together.

*(The witnesses were examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs 75,213–31—with which they generally agreed.)*

75,550. (Lord Ronaldshay.) Mr. RODRIGUES was officiating presidency postmaster in Madras, and had held the position for five months. His service had been entirely in the postmaster's line, except for a period of two years when he was superintendent in the postmaster-general's office. He represented the postmaster's side of the department. Mr. CHARLU was personal assistant to the postmaster-general, and held the position of superintendent of post offices. He was recruited direct and had been a superintendent for fifteen years.

75,551. Mr. RODRIGUES held that half the recruits into the grades of superintendents should be by direct nomination from "outsiders" and half by selection from the departmental officials. The general consensus of opinion in the department was in favour of recruitment of outsiders by nomination, and no views in favour of competition or restricted competition had been put forward by the officers at the conference at which the memorandum was drawn up. Mr. CHARLU added that the idea of competition was not new. It had been actually acted upon in the department, for, in the past, candidates were selected from among those who had competed for the Provincial Executive Services but had failed to get one of the guaranteed appointments. Such men had to pass the departmental test for the superintendent's grade.

75,552. At present, Mr. CHARLU said, probationary superintendents were kept waiting for appointments for about two years. That term should be fixed instead of being allowed to vary, because a man ought not to be kept waiting longer than that period.

75,553. Mr. CHARLU did not support the demand contained in the written statement for a general list for promotion for probationary superintendents throughout India. Under the present system superintendents served in their own circles. If there was an all-India list, it might be necessary to enforce service in any part of India. There were great advantages in keeping a man in his own circle, and they would be thrown away if he was sent outside.

75,554. Mr. RODRIGUES thought it was a mistake to speak of undergraduates in connection with the domiciled community, because there was no European University in India. A pass by the matriculation standard satisfied the conditions required for service in the post office. The distinction between Indians and members of the domiciled community in the matter of Educational qualifications was made because the former needed a longer education to get on the same level with the latter in the matter of English. Again, Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans received their education in schools, which did not give a University course, and if they were compelled to graduate at an Indian University, they would practically be cut out of the field of recruitment. The European school course was that of a high school. Mr. CHARLU said that so long as some standard of education was prescribed for Anglo-Indians, he did not desire to object to a distinction between them and Indians. All he asked was that an Anglo-Indian should not be appointed a superintendent merely because he was an Anglo-Indian, and without regard to his education.

75,555. On the subject of travelling and transfer allowances, Mr. RODRIGUES pointed out that officers had to go from one end of India to the other. He himself had been transferred from Simla to Rangoon, from Rangoon to Lahore, from Lahore to Madras, and from Tuticorin to Calcutta, and had to transport the members of his family and his household effects in each case at his own expense. The allowance now

given, whether double second or double first class, was quite inadequate. He had been put to a considerable loss on each transfer. Mr. CHARLU added that a superintendent of post offices had to travel through two districts and sometimes three, whereas an officer of similar standing in another department had to travel only through two or three taluks and could keep his own conveyances. A superintendent had often to pay for his food on a dining car and had expenditure in other directions. On that ground he claimed increased travelling allowance. He had not supported the claim for better daily allowances as he was asking for a higher rate of travelling allowance, and he thought it would perhaps be unwise to ask for too much.

75,556. Mr. CHARLU said that the statement in the memorandum as to the method of pay desired was misleading, as it appeared to show that the officers preferred a graded system. As a matter of fact they desired to have a time-scale.

75,557. Mr. RODRIGUES said it would not be possible to have a time-scale for the postmasters so long as the system of paying officers according to the volume of work in each office prevailed. What the postmasters desired was that, if the pay of superintendents was raised, their pay should be raised in proportion. Thus, if the top grade of the superintendents was made Rs. 700, the top grade of the gazetted postmasters should also be made Rs. 700. Both officers were of the same class, and gazetted postmasters really exercised the powers of superintendents in their own cities. He did not in these remarks refer to the postmasters at Lahore and Rangoon (pay Rs. 600–40–800). They ranked with Deputy Postmasters-General and Presidency Postmasters under the list of chief officers and not with superintendents.

75,558. Mr. CHARLU was of opinion that if a proper time-scale were introduced the officers of this department would probably not press for compulsory retirement at the age of fifty-five. As a matter of fact he thought that some of his colleagues agree with him that it was not necessary to insist upon it as it would be a waste of Government money to retire a capable officer before it was absolutely necessary. Mr. RODRIGUES did not agree and said that the majority at the Nagpur Conference held that officers should retire at the age of fifty-five. When they came to that conclusion they had before them the possibility of their being paid on a time-scale. They understood that the pay of the higher posts of Deputy Postmasters-General, &c., would continue to be graded.

75,559. The justification for increasing the pay, despite the fact that good officers were being obtained on the pay now given, was that twenty years ago, when the pay was fixed, the rupee went much further than it did at present. The cost of living had risen all round. Mr. CHARLU agreed that the cost of living had increased, and maintained that the best class of man was not being obtained on the amount of pay at present offered. If the pay was raised, a much better class of man would join the department.

75,560. Mr. RODRIGUES said the postmasters claimed special treatment in the matter of leave on the ground that they had to work on Sundays and holidays. There was a roster under which officers took their turn at Sunday and holiday duty, but even so, two officers had to divide the day between them, one taking the morning and the other the afternoon. Mr. CHARLU did not think the question of holidays affected the superintendents to the same extent as the postmasters.

27 January 1914.]

Messrs. J. F. RODRIGUES and P. A. KRISHNAMA CHARLU.

[Continued.]

75,561. Mr. RODRIGUES then referred to the fine fund, and said the contention was that it should be thrown in with the guarantee fund and utilised for the good of the officers.

75,562. (Mr. Chaubal.) Mr. CHARLU said that the reservation of 10 per cent. of the superintendships for non-domiciled Europeans was necessary because European superintendents were required in certain emergencies, as, for instance, working with a field force, for famine work, for going out with expeditionary forces, and in hilly divisions where it would be neither convenient nor advantageous for a native of India to be employed. There was no attempt to work out the ten per cent. for each province. It applied to the whole of India.

75,563. Mr. RODRIGUES said that superintendent had to pass a certain length of time on probation, and they were given training in postmaster's work as well as superintendent's work. A gazetted postmaster was quite able to do the work of a superintendent, and a superintendent would not be unfit for the work of work of a postmaster. Interchangeability might improve the general prospects of both postmasters and superintendents. The training, however, which a probationer received as a superintendent, was not enough to make him a valuable postmaster, and he would have to be in charge of an office for some time after his probation before he could be considered to have a thorough knowledge of a postmaster's duties. Mr. CHARLU said a superintendent was quite as much a postmaster in his own way, because the duties of a superintendent included the inspection of post offices, and he could not inspect unless he knew the postmaster's work thoroughly. The postmaster also exercised the functions of a superintendent except in the matter of travelling from place to place. His own opinion was that it would be much better not only for the officers concerned but for the administration if postmasters and superintendents ran on two parallel lines until the one officer rose to be presidency postmaster and the other deputy postmaster-general. Postmasters should be debarred from promotion to deputy postmaster generalships and similar posts altogether, because they had posts which were more advantageous. The position of a presidency postmaster not only gave him the pay of a deputy postmaster-general, but also conveniences which the deputy postmaster-general did not enjoy. Interchangeability below these positions would not be suitable.

75,564. (Mr. Abdur Rahim.) Mr. RODRIGUES said that in asking that domiciled European candidates should be undergraduates the idea was to fix some educational standard, as at present there was none. Most, however, had reached the high school standard. They started with two years' advantage over Indian candidates. There were certain duties which the European was better fitted to perform owing to his mother-tongue and whole environment having been English. A lower standard was not fixed in order to obtain a larger field of recruitment amongst Europeans.

75,565. (Sir Theodore Morison.) Mr. CHARLU said the graded scale put forward would have been a little more beneficial than the time-scale one, considering number of appointments suggested for each grade, but if the number of appointments in the higher grades were reduced, the officers concerned would not profit at all, and it was therefore now thought wiser to accept the incremental system.

75,566. Mr. CHARLU then said that it was a fact that a presidency postmaster could only rise to Rs. 1,200, whereas the deputy postmaster-general went up to Rs. 1,400, but the presidency postmaster had a free house, which was often worth more than Rs. 200. Mr. RODRIGUES said that the postmaster was given rooms in the post office building which was sometimes situated in a noisy and thickly populated quarter of the town. If left to himself, a presidency postmaster would not pay anything like a Rs. 200 rent and would live in a more quiet and salubrious part of the town. The original object in requiring the postmaster to live at the post office was in order that he might be able to deal with any urgent mails coming in and going out, and guard the large amount of cash in his office.

75,567. (Mr. Sheridan.) Mr. CHARLU said there had been a great increase in the work and responsibility of postmasters since the original rates of pay were fixed, and this was why the pay of postmasters was raised from time to time. The recommendations made on behalf of the postmasters and superintendents were also intended to apply to railway sorters. The railway sorters were hard-worked men and should be much better treated than they were at present. They were invalidated much earlier than most post office officials, especially in connection with eyesight. Therefore they were entitled to some consideration.

75,568. Mr. CHARLU then stated that in any scale of pay adopted there should be an efficiency bar. In a graded scale he would place the efficiency bar at Rs. 500, after which a man should only be promoted if found efficient. There should be no departmental examination at this stage, promotion being determined by the head of the circle. Mr. RODRIGUES said there should be a similar bar in the case of postmasters at Rs. 500. It would be rather late in life to hold a departmental examination, but some sort of test was needed. Mr. RODRIGUES said that it would be a fair plan to have a provincial and imperial list of gazetted postmasters, one consisting of those willing to serve only in one province, and the other of those willing to serve anywhere. The rates of pay should not be the same. The man, who was prepared to go wherever he was sent, should receive more consideration than the man who did not wish to leave his province. Mr. CHARLU considered it unnecessary to have a provincial and an imperial list for superintendents because a superintendent was liable to be transferred to any part of India, and if he refused to go, would risk losing his place. A superintendent, however, should be allowed to work as far as possible within his own province, where he had the advantage of a knowledge of the language and of the people.

The witnesses withdrew.

At Bombay, Monday, 9th February 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.  
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.  
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:

S. C. W. ROSE, Esq., Officiating Deputy Postmaster-General, Bombay.

G. W. TALBOT, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Central Telegraph Office, Bombay.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

D. S. CAPTAIN, Esq., Superintendent of the Post Office, Poona;  
C. J. E. CLERICI, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Rajputana Division; and  
D. J. MURTRIE, Esq., I.S.O., Presidency Postmaster, Bombay;  
were called and examined together.

(*The witnesses were examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair, and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs 75,213-31.*)

75,569. (*Lord Ronaldshay*.) Mr. MURTRIE started in the department as a probationer on Rs. 15 a month in July 1884, and remained in the subordinate line till 1900, when he was appointed a Superintendent after examination. Five years later he was appointed an Assistant Postmaster in the Rangoon Post Office, and then came to Bombay, where he acted for 18 months as Presidency Postmaster. He was then transferred to Simla, and acted as Assistant Director-General and Inspector-General of the Railway Mail Service, and was Chief Superintendent and Postmaster of the Coronation Durbar, 1911. He then returned to Rangoon as Postmaster, and was now substantive Presidency Postmaster in Bombay. Mr. CAPTAIN entered the department in 1897 as a probationer on Rs. 60, and after three months' training was appointed an Inspector, and held the position for three years. He then acted as Head Clerk to the Postmaster-General for 18 months. He then passed the Superintendent's examination, and in 1901 was made Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General. In 1902 he was confirmed as Superintendent of Post Offices, and continued to act as Personal Assistant. He was next put in charge of a division and was now Superintendent, second grade, Rs. 400 to Rs. 500. Mr. CLERICI started in the Railway Mail Service 13 years ago, and then went on to the Director-General's Office and to the Postmaster-General's Office, Nagpur. He was now Superintendent in Lower Rajputana, third grade, Rs. 300 to Rs. 400.

75,570. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, under the present system, the Postmasters were recruited exclusively from the subordinate ranks, and although some were very good the average was not quite satisfactory. As the operations of the Post Office became more complicated, and the duties more responsible, it was necessary to have a sprinkling of young and energetic men, who would make competent Postmasters after a suitable training. Therefore a limited number of men should be recruited as Probationary Postmasters, starting on Rs. 100 a month. Mr. MURTRIE favoured this suggestion, but considered that Superintendents should be recruited in the same way. In his written statement he had said that the proportion should be as two to one, but he was inclined to think now that it ought to be in equal proportions, because, if it was made two to one, a larger number of outsiders would be brought in, and the men in the department would be discouraged. The work of a Postmaster was of a technical character, but not so much so that it required men to come from the bottom grade. If a man was placed in a large office, and had intelligence, he soon picked up the work, and on passing the departmental examination ought to make a good Postmaster. Direct recruitment would give a class of men better educated than those at present in the service. On the small pay now given it could not be expected that highly educated men would join the service. Mr. CAPTAIN added that, during the last seven years, 16 probationary Postmasters had been appointed, but recently it had been decided to discontinue the system. It should, however, be continued, in order to obtain

a good class of Postmaster in the future. He believed it was discontinued because the selection was not very happy in some cases, but that might be due to exceptional circumstances, and the difficulty could be overcome by taking suitable precautions in the selection.

75,571. ALL THREE WITNESSES then said that the general sense of the department was in favour of recruitment by nomination. There was no special demand for any system of competition.

75,572. Mr. CAPTAIN explained that probationary Superintendents were kept waiting for appointments for about two years on an average. This was a satisfactory period. In some cases men had to wait for three years, while in others they were appointed within six or 12 months. No one should be appointed to the permanent charge of a division, unless he had gone through at least one year's training, and the maximum should be two years. If a man did not pass the departmental test and give satisfaction within two years he should be asked to leave the department. If a vacancy was not available at the end of two years he would naturally have to wait. Mr. CLERICI concurred.

75,573. Mr. CAPTAIN desired to withdraw the recommendation made in the corporate memorandum in favour of an all-India system of promotion for probationary Superintendents. There was now one list and this might be continued, but the practice by which the Director-General ordinarily appointed a man recruited in a particular province to work in that province, unless the interest of the service required him to serve in another, was advantageous, and should not be given up. A man working in his own province had the advantage of a good knowledge of the vernacular and of the local conditions. Mr. CLERICI, on the other hand, wished for an all-India system because it gave more justice all round. Otherwise a junior might rise above a senior man. A case of the kind had occurred in Bengal, where a Mr. Datta was kept waiting for four years, whilst junior men passed over his head. With an all-India system Mr. Datta might have been sent to serve on the North-West frontier, and he might or might not have liked that personally, but a man who joined the post office ought to be ready to go anywhere. To this Mr. CAPTAIN replied that the circle system was not now slavishly adhered to, and this gave the necessary elasticity. The Director-General, if he found that a man in a particular circle had to wait too long, occasionally drafted him into another circle, and in this way a man from Bengal and a man from the United Provinces had been brought into the Bombay Circle. Another way of meeting the difficulty would be to date seniority from the day that each officer passed the Superintendent's examination, provided he was satisfactory in all other respects. If a man had to wait for four years, he should be graded, when his turn for appointment came, above the men who were junior to him as candidates. Mr. MURTRIE said the department as a whole were now in favour of Mr. CAPTAIN's view, and therefore the recommendation

9 February 1914.] Messrs. D. S. CAPTAIN, C. J. E. CLERICI, and D. J. MURTRIE.

[Continued.]

in the written statement might be regarded as practically withdrawn.

75,574. Mr. MURTRIE said that the European school course did not give to the domiciled community the advantages which Indians possessed. The schools for the domiciled community did not give the instruction necessary for their scholars to become graduates in the Indian Universities. The Cambridge senior examination for the domiciled lad compared very favourably with an Indian graduate's examination for the Indian, and members of the domiciled community passing the Cambridge senior, would, from an intellectual point of view, be on terms of equality with Indian graduates. Mr. CAPTAIN believed that the Cambridge senior was on a par with the Bombay Matriculation or School Final examination, and did not come up to the B.A. standard. His reason for proposing the Matriculation or the Cambridge senior test as suitable for Anglo-Indians was on account of the backward education of the domiciled community, which laboured under special disadvantages. Their education, for one thing, was more costly. The present standard, however, should be gradually raised and brought up to the B.A. standard. If the standard were raised at once, the members of this community would be debarred from getting appointments in the department.

75,575. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the claim for an increased diem allowance was based partly on grounds which were common to other services and partly on special grounds. The charge of a Superintendent was much larger than that of most other executive officers. It usually included two districts. Also the nature of the work was such that only very short halts were made at different places, whereas officers of other departments usually halted for about a week at each place. It was laid down in the departmental rules that a Superintendent should not ordinarily take more than two days for the inspection of a fair-sized sub-office, and one day for the inspection of a branch office. Superintendents had to go round their charge twice a year, whereas most other officers went round only once.

75,576. Mr. MURTRIE allowed that Postmasters received their houses rent-free.

75,577. Mr. CAPTAIN preferred a time-scale of pay, and said that that was the general view of the service. It was only on the assumption that a time-scale would not be granted that the graded system was put forward in the written statement. If the graded system was adopted a suitable number of appointments should be given in the higher grades. When the present first grade of Rs. 500 to Rs. 600 was created it seemed on paper that the officers had an increase, but as the number of appointments in it was only eleven few got a chance of rising to that grade. He did not consider that any efficiency bar was necessary in the case of Superintendents. Every man who worked satisfactorily should have the prospect of rising to the top of the Superintendent's grade. For the higher grades of Deputy Postmaster-General, Presidency Postmaster, Inspector-General, etc., there should be selection. Mr. CLERICI endorsed Mr. CAPTAIN's remarks.

75,578. Mr. MURTRIE said that the time-scale could be applied even to Postmasters to a certain extent. For instance the pay of the Lucknow Post Office was fixed at Rs. 500 to Rs. 600, and supposing a time-scale was in existence, it would be for the Director-General to say that no man should be put into the office unless he had nine year's service. The Director-General could fix a schedule as to the number of years' service a man must have to qualify him to hold charge of some important offices.

75,579. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, if a time-scale were introduced for Superintendents, he would not press for the rigorous application of the fifty-five years' rule for retirement although that was desirable, but he would make it compulsory in the higher offices, because otherwise promotion would be blocked. Mr. CLERICI thought there should be one rule for all, and that all officers should retire at the age of fifty-five,

and that was the view held by the bulk of his colleagues.

75,580. Mr. MURTRIE pointed out that in the year 1907, when Postmasters were drawing a commission on the sale of stamps, they were on the whole better off than the Postmasters of to-day. The commission on the sale of stamps amounted to something like 3½ lakhs, whereas the revised grades of pay, which were fixed for Postmasters on the abolition of the commission system, only cost 1½ lakhs. Therefore, the total emoluments of Postmasters were less to-day than they were before. That had resulted in no deterioration in the personnel because recruitment had been solely from the ranks.

75,581. Mr. CAPTAIN said there would be an improvement in the personnel if the pay was raised. At present a suitable class of men was obtained simply owing to the fact that in the struggle for existence a young man had to accept what was offered, but when he was placed in a responsible position he should be given a suitable wage.

75,582. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the rules did not lay down that officers had to work on Sundays, but the circumstances of the department were such that they had to do so at least on half the Sundays in the year. Mr. MURTRIE added that the hardship was greater in the case of Postmasters than in that of Superintendents. A Superintendent was not bound to work on Sundays except to make up arrears, but a Postmaster had to do so because he was in charge of the office. There was a roster for the clerks, who took so many Sundays off, but every Postmaster had to be at his office for at least two hours in the morning and two hours in the afternoon on every Sunday and on holidays.

75,583. Mr. CAPTAIN said that subscription to the General Provident Fund was compulsory for Europeans, but optional for Indians. In the upper grades, the fund was availed of largely, but not in the lower grades. If the pension scheme were modified, and a suitable Provident Scheme introduced, it would be in the interest of the service as a whole. The work in the post office was very hard, and in many cases officials broke down, after putting in twenty-five or twenty six years' service, before they received their pensions, but if a Provident Fund were introduced, and an officer died before completing his service, his family would get some benefit, instead of, as now, being left destitute.

75,584. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the guarantee fund had been built up by annual deductions from the salaries of postal officials up to about ten years ago, when deductions ceased. At that time eight annas a year were deducted from the pay of every officer, and a large fund had accumulated, the interest of which was mainly utilised in meeting losses which the department suffered through the dishonesty of postal officials. He had no objection to its being utilised in that way, but there was a large balance left over each year, and that balance should be utilised in the interests of the men who had contributed towards the fund, and should not be allowed to go on accumulating as at present. It should be administered by a departmental committee, representing the higher officers and Superintendents and Postmasters. At present the Director-General himself administered the fund. The balance went on accumulating simply because no one had taken the trouble to formulate a scheme for utilising it. Mr. MURTRIE thought there was no fear that the interest would be swallowed up in meeting defalcations, as dishonesty in the post office was quite an exception. Year by year the deductions from the guarantee fund on account of the losses sustained were lessening. Also there was hardly any need to meet the demands from the guarantee fund, because every subordinate gave security, either in cash or by a bond. The Empire Life Assurance Company issued guarantee bonds up to the amount of ten times an officer's salary, and these held good for ten years. After ten years' approved service a man was exempted from furnishing any further security.

9 February 1914.] Messrs. D. S. CAPTAIN, C. J. E. CLERICI, and D. J. MURTRIE.

[Continued.]

75,585. Mr. MURTRIE considered that interchangeability as between Postmasters and Superintendents would make for efficiency. Men working in the Postmasters' line gained very little experience of a Superintendents' work. In the same way a Superintendent had little opportunity of making himself acquainted with postal traffic. If both appointments were interchangeable, when men reached the top, they would be good all-round men. Mr. CAPTAIN, on the other hand, considered that in the present circumstances interchangeability would not make for efficiency, because Postmasters were recruited exclusively from the subordinate ranks, and when a Postmaster reached gazetted rank he was fairly advanced in age, and not active enough to take charge of a division, and he would not care for the change. He thought the two branches should be kept in watertight compartments. Mr. CLERICI did not see any need for interchangeability as matters were working all right now. To this Mr. MURTRIE replied that the younger Postmasters were in favour of interchangeability, and this feeling would grow stronger, if the suggestion for the direct recruitment of first class Postmasters was adopted. At present, when a Superintendent reached high office, he had only seen the work in his own line, and knew nothing of the work of a Postmaster.

75,586. (*Sir Murray Hammick*.) Mr. MURTRIE thought both Postmasters and Superintendents suffered by not knowing each other's work. Promotions to Deputy Postmaster-Generalships were made mostly from the Superintendents, and if Postmasters qualified as Superintendents they would have a better chance of being promoted to the higher appointments. Out of 171 Superintendents the records showed that 34 began life as Postmasters, whilst out of 35 gazetted Postmasters 6 were Superintendents, so that there was interchangeability to some extent already.

75,587. The question of travelling allowances was very much affected by the rule with regard to the day being counted from midnight to midnight. If officers travelled by rail, they received a free pass and a single fare. If they travelled by road, they received mileage, limited to the diem allowance of Rs. 4, unless the journey was beyond twenty miles, when the allowance was eight annas a mile. The officers would be satisfied with either an alteration of the rule governing the twenty-four hours halt, or an increase in the day allowance or the mileage allowance. There were many incidental expenses such as bullock-carts, tongas, coolies and expenses of meals at refreshment rooms, and also their servants had to be paid for. As a rule a Superintendent made out a programme, for three months, and moved from one post office to another as far as possible, but very often circumstances arose which compelled him to change his dates. It paid an officer much better to go a long distance to a post office than to take a short journey. At a head post office it might be necessary to stay a week, and then the officer could draw Rs. 4 for each day's stay, but that only happened once in six months.

75,588. (*Mr. Chaubal*.) Mr. CAPTAIN said that all probationary Superintendents were attached to a head post office for about six months to learn post office work, so that they had a fair knowledge of a Postmaster's work, sufficient to enable them to do the duties of a Postmaster satisfactorily. Head post offices were also inspected by Superintendents twice a year. A probationary Superintendent would not give so much attention to accounts as a probationer who was destined for a Postmastership. For the gazetted Postmasters there were places ranging from Rs. 300 to Rs. 800, whilst the pay in the Superintendents' ranks ranged from Rs. 200 to 600. The higher posts of the Postmasters were not given to Superintendents, but were kept exclusively for the Postmasters. There were many Superintendents who did not wish to be Postmasters, and many Postmasters, who did not like, and were not qualified, to be Superintendents. The qualifications for the two officers were quite different. A Postmaster's work was mostly sedentary and he had not to act in sudden emergencies as a Superintendent often had to do. Unless the system of recruiting Postmasters was radically changed,

interchangeability was bound to be a failure. There were instances in which officers, appointed as Superintendents, had been found unsuitable, and had been drafted into the Postmasters' line, and occasionally, if the Director-General saw that a Postmaster was a competent and active man, he would draft him into the Superintendents' line. He did not mean that both branches should be absolutely watertight, but that interchangeability should be allowed only in exceptional cases at the discretion of the Director-General.

75,589. Under the old system of appointing probationary Postmasters, the Postmaster-General selected a suitable man from amongst the applicants who came forward. Sometimes a man who applied for a Superintendent's appointment and who was considered by the Postmaster-General to be unsuitable for that appointment was offered the post of a probationary Postmaster. The posts were not advertised.

75,590. Inspectors were appointed from the ranks of subordinate Postmasters and clerks in post offices, and to a very limited number by direct recruitment. In the Bombay Circle the pay of Inspectors was Rs. 60, Rs. 80 and Rs. 100. When a man reached the grade of Rs. 40 as a Sub-postmaster or clerk, if the Divisional Superintendent thought he was likely to make a good Inspector, he recommended him to the Postmaster-General, and the Postmaster-General might appoint him. After working for a few years he might be allowed, if competent, to go up for the Superintendent's examination, and on passing the test might, in exceptional circumstances, be appointed Superintendent. Otherwise after reaching the grade of Rs. 100, he remained there until all his juniors came up to the grade and then went to the Postmasters' line on Rs. 100 or Rs. 150, if young enough for promotion.

75,591. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim*.) Mr. CAPTAIN said, that in making the selection of Superintendents or Postmasters, the Postmaster-General was not assisted in any way by the deputies, unless the Postmaster-General knew that the Deputy had seen the man and knew him. There was no hard and fast rule with regard to educational qualifications, but it was generally insisted that an Indian should be a graduate. Directly appointed men were recruited usually between the ages of twenty-one and twenty-five. Superintendents recruited from the department had an age limit of thirty-five years.

75,592. There was no rule prohibiting interchangeability, but in practice Superintendents and Postmasters were kept separate. A young man usually took his degree in the Bombay University between the ages of twenty and twenty-three and the Cambridge senior examination between eighteen and twenty.

75,593. Mr. MURTRIE said that for the Anglo-Indian recruit an education up to the Cambridge senior was good enough, because the field of selection was small, and a concession had to be made in their case. He would not say that a man who had taken the Cambridge senior would be fit to compete for a degree with any chance of success.

75,594. (*Sir Theodore Morison*.) Mr. MURTRIE said there was no difference between a first class Postmaster and a gazetted Postmaster.

75,595. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, when a Postmaster reached the Rs. 200 grade, he entered an all-India list. Up to Rs. 200 he was on a Provincial list. He did not mean that a probationary Postmaster should be appointed a gazetted Postmaster on the completion of his probationary period, but that he should be drafted into the ranks of second class Postmasters, and remain in that rank for about five or ten years before going into the gazetted rank. The pay of a probationary Superintendent should be Rs. 150, and that of a probationary Postmaster Rs. 100. A probationary Postmaster need not be an honours graduate but probationary Superintendents might be. There were many honours graduates from the Indian Universities in the service now, men who had taken first class and second class degrees. The present class of recruit was suitable for the work, and he would admit



9 February 1914.] Messrs. D. S. CAPTAIN, C. J. E. CLERICI, and D. J. MURTRIE.

[Continued.]

that, if the work was efficiently done now, there was no advantage in having a better personnel.

75,596. Mr. MURTRIE said the fact that a bond was required from Postmasters reduced the necessity for having a guarantee fund to meet losses, because the company, which issued the bond, paid for losses up to the extent of the bond, if a fraud was proved against the individual, who had given it. There were not a large number of cases in which the loss could not be traced to any individual, and the department bore such losses.

75,597. (Mr. Chaulbal.) Mr. CAPTAIN said that the rule that 10 per cent. of the appointments of Superintendents should be reserved for non-domiciled Europeans had been in existence for at least twenty years. It was made for special classes of work, such as field service, and service in frontier provinces, where non-domiciled Europeans were considered to be more suitable. He believed the Anglo-Indian and the Indian Superintendents could do the work satisfactorily. The non-domiciled European was quite ignorant of the vernacular, and therefore could not do the work as well as a man recruited in India. Another objection was that he was recruited straight into the grade of Rs. 200 and placed above men recruited in India, and he did not go through the same training as Superintendents recruited in India.

75,598. (Mr. Rose.) Mr. CAPTAIN believed there were men who would not join the service, if they were recruited on one list for Postmasters and Superintendents, as some came in purely for the Superintendents' line. There were Postmasters getting from Rs. 100 to Rs. 200, and also Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards. Their duties in the main were the same, but the importance of the offices differed. The duties of Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards were more like those of second class Postmasters than those of Superintendents. Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards had Superintendents' powers with regard to their own office, and in some cases town offices were under them. In some cases it might happen that a good man, who could not obtain a Superintendent's appointment, would take a Postmastership, but others would rather join other departments than work as Postmasters.

The witnesses withdrew.

R. T. GIBBS, Esq., Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, called and examined.

(Mr. R. T. Gibbs was examined upon the corporate written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs 75,269-78.)

75,600. (Lord Ronaldshay.) Witness said he came out from Cooper's Hill in 1886, and was appointed an Assistant Superintendent, and went through the various grades of the department. He was appointed Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, third class, last year. He agreed with the general memorandum, which had been put in, subject to a few modifications.

75,601. Under the proposed scheme of amalgamation the engineering branch was responsible for the construction and maintenance of telegraph lines. Given a sufficient number of trained officers, it would prove a success and give an efficient service. It was already an improvement over the circle scheme in that it allowed officers to concentrate their energies on engineering matters, without their time being taken up by going into traffic details. The life of an engineering officer was a very strenuous one. He had to be continually on tour, and could seldom halt for more than one day at any one place. The posts in his division covered 5,400 miles, and he had only two officers under him.

75,602. With regard to the traffic branch he could not speak with any certainty, but he thought that under the new scheme there was bound to be a certain loss of efficiency. It appeared to be a retrograde step to give the charge of that branch almost entirely to promoted subordinates. Such officers could not exercise as good a control over the staff as the officers were able to do under the old system. Before the circle scheme came into force in 1910 officers were posted at all the more important stations from a

75,599. Candidates recruited from outside the department would have to have some educational qualification, a good physique and certain social qualifications. For a Superintendent more importance should be attached to social qualifications than for Postmasters, because the Postmaster had not to mix with the district officers to the same extent. The nature of the work compelled a Superintendent to mix with the Commissioner, Collectors, Assistant Collectors, Engineers, Superintendents of Police, Forest officers, etc. Mr. MURTRIE did not agree that a Superintendent was a better man than a first class Postmaster. A first class Postmaster had to be as resourceful a man as a Superintendent. Mr. CLERICI said that a first class Postmaster had much more routine work than a Superintendent. The Postmaster had to deal with a number of men on the spot, whereas a Superintendent had his men scattered about in two or three districts. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the Cambridge senior and the Matriculation should be the lowest educational qualification for the domiciled community, but if any other suitable standard was introduced he would have no objection to it. Mr. CLERICI thought it was not necessary to have a fixed standard for the domiciled community. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the request for an increase of pay for Superintendents was justified on the ground that the cost of living had risen all round, and that pay which was suitable thirty or forty years ago was not now sufficient. Mr. CLERICI said that the work was also growing more difficult and was of a much higher standard. Mr. MURTRIE said he had no figures to show that the calls on the guarantee fund were lessening, but he found from the annual reports that they were somewhat less than they were in years past. Mr. CLERICI pointed out that the interest on the fund was growing, and that therefore the demands must be less. Mr. MURTRIE said that the fund might be disposed of according to the suggestions in the written statement, but if that could not be done it might be donated to Government to form the nucleus of the money needed for building a post office at the Imperial Capital, with a rotunda to hold the records of the history of the post office in India.

traffic point of view, and had a very close control over the staff at their head-quarters offices. When the circle scheme was introduced all officers were concentrated at the most important stations, and there was a loss of efficiency and control. The Telegraph Masters had no superiors near at hand to whom to refer in cases of difficulty. Under the amalgamation scheme he thought matters would not be better. The traffic officers would have far larger areas than they had before, and would have to rely on the Telegraph Masters to a much greater extent than under the circle scheme.

75,603. His suggestion was to bring out officers from the British post office, after ten years' service in England, to serve in India for a period of two years at Rs. 600 or Rs. 1,000 a month. If they could not be obtained at Rs. 600, terms would have to be made with them which might amount to as much as Rs. 1,000. They would not be on any cadre, and they would simply revert to the British post office at the end of the time. Practically they would be in India on deputation.

75,604. An English training was very necessary for engineering officers as there were no adequate facilities in India for electrical instruction. In future there would be still greater difficulty in training officers in India, because electrical science was going ahead very rapidly, and all the best trained officers would be men trained in Europe. He attributed this difficulty both to the deficiencies of the Indian Engineering Colleges, and to the lack of facilities for studying applied electrical engineering in India. He

9 February 1914.]

Mr. R. T. GIBBS.

[Continued.]

was acquainted with the standard taught at Rurki, and did not think it was adequate. There was no chance of seeing large electrical works in India, such as wireless telegraphy, large telephone exchanges, or cable work. At the age of eighteen a native of India should go, either to an English University, or to an English Engineering College, and take the regular course prescribed for an Electrical Engineer, and pass the B.Sc. If that were done, he would see no objection to half the recruitment being in England and half in India.

75,605. He recommended the promotion of subordinates to the amount only of one-eighth. He did not think it followed that, if more chances of promotion were given to Deputy Superintendents, a better class of men would be obtained. The experience officers obtained as Deputy Superintendents was valuable to them, and qualified them for the higher grades of the service, but he was of opinion that promotion to the extent of one-fourth for them would be too much.

75,606. He did not distrust pure nomination but preferred an open competitive examination in order to ensure the best stamp of man being obtained. A certain number of nominated men had come from England since Cooper's Hill closed, and there were six men in the service at present who had not come from Cooper's Hill. He did not think that his scheme of selecting candidates, after they had passed a competitive examination, would lead to invidious distinctions. The needs of the departments were so great that the best stamp of man had to be obtained, and that could only be done by selecting from those who had passed the competitive test.

75,607. In order that engineering officers might be thoroughly trained they should be given six months' study leave every three years, until they became Superintendents. The six months would consist of three months' privilege leave, and three months on deputation, and Government should pay the fare one way and the officer the other. He did not think six months every three years was too long a period for a man to be absent from his work.

75,608. If the Head Telegraph Officer's salary was raised to Rs. 3,000 he did not think he could still press for the Director-Generalship.

75,609. A time-scale was preferable to a graded scale.

75,610. He had read the written statement sent in by the members of the Provincial service, but did not agree with it, and he did not think there was any real grievance in the department. Certainly the Provincial officer had no ground for complaining of the manner in which he was treated by the Imperial officers. The term Provincial service might well be abolished, and the pay might be raised.

75,611. There was no justification for a man recruited in India claiming the same pay as the man recruited from Europe, as the Indian-recruited man had no expense in the way of sending his family to England or of going to England himself. He would not object to the pay being made the same, and a foreign service allowance being given to men recruited in England, and that might mitigate any feeling which might exist in the Provincial service.

75,612. There was some difficulty in obtaining leave, and this was due to the shortage of officers produced by the failure to recruit pending the introduction of the amalgamation scheme. But there was no acute grievance.

75,613. If retirement was allowed after twenty years' service, a man might then be about forty-one years of age, and this was rather young for him to draw a pension from the State. Few, however, would take

advantage of the opportunity, as it would not be worth their while to do so. But the possibility of being able to retire on pension after twenty years' service should not lightly be thrown away, and the possibility appealed to men to join the department. There had, in practice, been very few cases in which men had retired after twenty years.

75,614. The pension asked for of 700*l.*, after thirty years' service, should be on a non-contributory basis, as in India men could save nothing from their pay, whilst in England it was impossible to make both ends meet on 437*l.* 10*s.*, which was the ordinary pension of a man of over twenty-five years' service. The Indian Medical Service had 700*l.*, and the Telegraph Department, like the Indian Medical Service were liable to be called upon for service in the field.

75,615. The difficulty of obtaining houses varied very much in different localities. In giving transfer allowances an officer's family should be recognised, and a reasonable amount of effects allowed for.

75,616. The Provident Fund did not take the place of commutation of pension, and the officers desired power to commute a portion of their pension without any of the restrictions which were now imposed.

75,617. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The only facility in Bombay for studying electrical engineering was the Tata Electrical scheme, which would be opened shortly. At present it was only at Rurki and Sibpur that instruction in electrical engineering could be obtained, and at Sibpur subordinates were also educated. The training at Rurki and Sibpur was not sufficient, and for a long time to come it would be necessary for students to go to England.

75,618. He agreed with the principle that men doing the same work should be given the same pay, but he thought the State should take into consideration the expenses to which an officer might be put. He would not, however, carry that so far as to say that the Government would be justified in paying members of aristocratic families higher salaries than were paid to officers belonging to other families. The expenses of a European in India were not on the same footing. They were inherent in their position as exiles from their own country.

75,619. (*Mr. Chaulbal.*) He was in favour of an officer being paid what he would receive in his own country, plus a certain amount for serving in a foreign country.

75,620. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The best men for the department would be men who were educated in England, and afterwards chosen by the selection board. He would have no selection in India, so that an Indian would have to go to England for training. He would insist upon Indians being educated in England up to the B.Sc., which should be taken in some good University.

75,621. A certain minimum of Europeans was necessary in the telegraph department, and the question of pay depended entirely upon what the best Europeans would take to come out to India.

75,622-77,743. (*Mr. Talbot.*) It was not correct to say that the reason why not more than two Postmaster-Generalships were provided for the telegraph department was that no more than two officers could be found who were duly qualified. The only telegraph officer who had been tried was admittedly successful, and there were other telegraph officers who were just as capable. Young civilians were appointed Postmasters-General without any special training, whereas telegraph officers had a thorough knowledge of their own department, and as telegraph traffic would be amongst the duties of future Postmasters-General, telegraph officers would seem to be eminently fitted for the appointment.

The witness withdrew.

## APPENDIX I.

## LIST OF APPENDICES.

- I. CORRESPONDENCE relating to the SCHEME for the PERMANENT AMALGAMATION of the POSTAL and TELEGRAPH SERVICES in INDIA; viz.:—
  - (i) Despatch from the Government of India to the Secretary of State for India, No. 324, Finance Department, dated Simla, 30th October 1913.
  - (ii) Despatch from the Secretary of State for India to His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council, Telegraph, No. 5, dated India Office, London, 6th March 1914.
  - (iii) Government of India Resolution No. 3062—3066-101 (Department of Commerce and Industry, Post and Telegraph Establishments), dated Simla, the 24th April 1914.
- II. EXTRACT from the GAZETTE OF INDIA of the 20th September 1913, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.
- III. LETTER from the DIRECTOR-GENERAL of POSTS and TELEGRAPHS, No. 168 P.G., dated Calcutta, 11th March 1914, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.
- IV. STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS, on the 1st April 1913, in the POST OFFICE of INDIA.
- V. STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS, on the 1st April 1913, in the TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.
- VI. INDIAN TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT: NOTICE REGARDING FUTURE RECRUITMENT.
- VII. OFFICIALS and NON-OFFICIALS who furnished WRITTEN EVIDENCE to the ROYAL COMMISSION in connection with their INQUIRY into the POST OFFICE of INDIA and TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT, but who were not ORALLY EXAMINED.

## APPENDIX I.

(Referred to in paragraphs 75,146 and 75,152-3—Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.)

CORRESPONDENCE relating to the SCHEME for the permanent AMALGAMATION of the POSTAL AND TELEGRAPH SERVICES in INDIA.

- (i) *Despatch from the Government of India to the Secretary of State for India, No. 324, Finance Department, dated Simla, the 30th October 1913.*

MY LORD MARQUESS,

In our despatch No. 39 (Telegraph Establishment), dated the 13th July 1911, we submitted for Your Lordship's approval a proposal for the combination of our Post and Telegraph Departments under a single head, and we explained that this proposal was a preliminary step towards the amalgamation of those two great Departments, an object which Lord Morley, in his despatch No. 24—Telegraph, dated the 3rd December 1909, desired us to keep steadily in view, taking into consideration the advantages from the points of view of administration, public convenience and economy which might be derived from such amalgamation.

2. As a further step in the same direction, following upon a suggestion made by Your Lordship, we introduced during last year a scheme of experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles (to which Your Lordship's assent was conveyed in your Telegraph despatch No. 21, dated the 16th August 1912), and this arrangement has since continued in operation.

3. After a few months' experience of the working of this experimental amalgamation, our late Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs submitted in November last a complete scheme for the amalgamation of the two Departments throughout India, and we have now the honour to forward the scheme for Your Lordship's approval. Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson has formulated his proposals with the greatest thoroughness and the most complete mastery of his subject, but we have thought it desirable in this despatch to recapitulate in a more concise form the main points at issue, which we shall endeavour to do in the following paragraphs.

4. The fundamental principles of the scheme are the separation of the engineering and traffic work of the Telegraph Department, the transfer of the latter to the control of Postmasters-General, and the recruitment of engineers for engineering work only and of traffic officers for traffic work only. Under the existing organization, the administrative and executive officers

of the Telegraph Department are responsible for both engineering and traffic work, the latter occupying rather more than half of their time. Under the present proposals, telegraph traffic will be transferred to the control of Postmasters-General, who will be assisted in the discharge of their new and additional duties by a group of officers of different degrees of importance and occupying positions corresponding to those of the officers performing analogous duties in the Post Office. These officers will be provided by the reduction in the present numbers of the administrative and executive officers of the Telegraph Department, which will become possible when the latter no longer have to deal with traffic work as well as engineering. Their relief from traffic duties and specialisation in engineering will enable these latter to take over a part of the duties now performed by the superior officers of the Technical Branch, the strength of which will thus become susceptible of some reduction.

5. It will be convenient now to give a summary of the details of the proposed organisation. The present constitution of the Post Office is not affected by the proposals, except in so far as the Director-General of that Department will become also the permanent (as he is now the provisional) head of the Telegraph Department. (This will involve a slight amendment of the Post Office and Telegraph Acts, which will be undertaken in due course.) Under his control, in connection with telegraphs, in the Telegraph Department, will be three branches—Engineering, Traffic, and Technical. A separate Traffic Branch exists already, but it consists only of a small group of Deputy Superintendents—56 in number—and the greater portion of the subordinate staff; and the fact that the engineering staff will in future undertake no traffic duties makes it necessary to provide for a considerable strengthening of the Traffic Branch. Similarly, a Technical Branch consisting of one Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, five Electrical Engineers, six Deputy Superintendents, and 34 subordinates is already in existence; but, as explained above, a part of its duties will in future be taken over by the engineering

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

staff, and the Technical Branch will consist only of subordinates working under the orders of the engineers. The Engineering Branch, on the other hand, will be, in effect, a new creation. It will be formed by selection from the present administrative and executive grades of the Telegraph Department, but will be considerably less numerous, since these officers at present deal with traffic as well as engineering work.

6. The proposed constitution of the Engineering and Technical Branches is described in detail in paragraph 15 of our late Director-General's letter, to which we beg to invite Your Lordship's attention. The total sanctioned strength of the superior staff of the Indian Telegraph Department, as sanctioned in Lord Morley's despatch No. 24 (Telegraph), dated the 3rd December 1909, consists of 96 officers exclusive of a Superintendent of Workshops and a Chief Storekeeper. Of these, six officers formed the headquarters staff, viz., the Director-General, two Directors for Traffic and Construction, respectively, and three Assistant Superintendents; and the remaining 90 officers were employed in the traffic and construction work of the Department or in the Technical Branch. There are in addition 78 Deputy Superintendents engaged in engineering and technical duties. It will be seen that the Director-General proposes that the staff for the engineering and technical branches, which will be relieved of all traffic duties, should be reduced to 111 inclusive of a Chief Engineer and his assistant and a personal assistant to the Director-General, but exclusive of the Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops and the Chief Storekeeper. We are of opinion that no further reduction can safely be made in this direction. Out of this total of 111 officers, the Director-General proposes that the "superior service" should consist of 46 appointments, which is less by four, approximately, than the number admissible for 28 administrative and executive appointments under the proportion adopted in the reorganisation of the Department in 1910. This small saving is obtained by dispensing with the usual leave reserve, which, the Director-General explains, is unnecessary in the Department owing to the fact that there are, below the superior service, a number of Deputy Superintendents performing functions precisely similar to those discharged by the junior members of the superior service, for whom these Deputy Superintendents will, as required, be appointed to officiate, without receiving acting promotion in rank—the total number of officers present on duty always being maintained at the sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superintendents in the lowest grade. The present sanctioned strength of the superior service being 96, the Director-General's proposals will involve a reduction, in this line, of 50 appointments. The questions of the pay and method of recruitment of the Engineering and Technical Branches will be referred to in a later paragraph.

7. Turning now to the subject of Telegraph traffic, we would invite a perusal of paragraphs 17–21 of the Director-General's letter, which explain in detail the constitution of the proposed superior Traffic Branch, to be organised to assist Postmasters-General in the control of telegraph traffic which they will take over from the hands of Telegraph Directors. It is proposed to give each of the eight Postmasters-General an Assistant of the same rank as a Deputy Postmaster-General in the sister Department. The most important telegraph offices, viz., those at Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras will be entrusted to the control of officers of the same rank, while the five offices next in importance, viz., Agra, Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi, and Delhi will be under the supervision of a class of officers to be created, corresponding, approximately, to Superintendents of Post Offices. The first four of the above offices are at present in charge of Telegraph Superintendents (who draw from Rs. 850 to Rs. 1,250 a month), and the last four are now under Deputy Superintendents in the existing Traffic Branch of the Telegraph Department (a class of officers in incremental grades rising from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500). The raising of the status of the officers henceforward to be

in charge of these officers is due to the fact that, under the new scheme, the control of all town departmental offices is to be transferred to the officers in charge of the central telegraph offices. The remaining appointments in the new Traffic Branch will consist of three officers at the headquarters of the Director-General, 19 Assistants to the Chief Traffic officers in Postmasters-General's offices, and an Assistant to each of the officers in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta and Bombay.

The 19 officers referred to above will be constantly engaged in the inspection of subordinate offices, a task which will involve a large amount of touring; and the growing size and importance of the principal telegraph offices will make the work of the Superior Traffic Branch altogether more arduous and responsible than that of the staff at present employed in traffic work.

The new branch will be under Postmasters-General, and the Director-General will be assisted in the control of the work of the branch by an officer whom Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson proposed to style "Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic," but for whom we (agreeing with the present Director-General) prefer the designation "Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic," as indicating more precisely the nature of his duties in the Director-General's office.\* This officer, who will replace the existing Director of Traffic, will be assisted at headquarters by two officers, who will be styled, respectively, "Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic," and "Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic." The result is a total of 40 appointments in the special or superior Traffic Branch, five of which are at present filled by Deputy Superintendents in the ordinary Traffic Branch (whose number will consequently be reduced from 56 to 51), and the final effect of the proposals regarding the three branches of engineering, technical and traffic work, is shown in the latter part of paragraph 20 of the Director-General's letter to be a net reduction of 28 appointments in the total sanctioned strength of the gazetted staff of the Telegraph Department.

Here also the scale of staff proposed does not provide for a reserve for leave and other contingencies, and acting appointments in the lowest grades of the Superior Traffic branch or of Deputy Superintendents will have to be made to maintain the total number of officers present on duty at the sanctioned strength. We have dwelt at some length on the constitution of the new Traffic Branch, in order to bring out as clearly as possible the considerations which have led to the proposal to introduce special conditions of pay and recruitment for this branch, to which we shall refer again in paragraph 13 below.

8. It will be seen that the Director-General proposes to have the following officers at headquarters to assist him in the control of the Telegraph Department: a Chief Engineer with his assistant, an Engineering Personal Assistant to the Director-General, a Deputy Director-General for Traffic with his assistant, and an Assistant Director-General for Traffic. These, combined with the Post Office headquarters staff (which consists of 2 Deputy Directors-General, 4 Assistant Directors-General, and 2 Personal Assistants) make a total of 15 officers at headquarters. We were at first disposed to regard this staff as somewhat excessive, but further consideration has led us to modify our opinion. The proposed strength of the headquarters staff is the same as at present, owing to the fact that it was found necessary early last year to increase the staff of superior telegraph officers in the Director-General's office by abolishing a division, and attaching the Superintendent of Telegraphs, thus set free to assist the Director of Traffic in place of the Assistant Superintendent provided in the reorganisation of 1910. Two Deputy Superintendents employed in the Director-General's office were also replaced early last year by a single Deputy Superintendent, holding a temporary appointment created by us, with the title

\* Corresponding alterations will be made, where necessary, in the designations of the other Traffic officers specified in paragraph 23 of the Director-General's letter.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

of Assistant Director of Traffic. When the amalgamation is introduced, the services of both these officers will still be required, since the fluctuating character of traffic work renders necessary a considerable amount of centralised supervision to arrange, in the interests of economy, for the due distribution of staff to meet local variations in the amount of traffic, and the proposals do not involve any increase in the number of officers at headquarters. The extra expense of the headquarters staff is accounted for partly by the high salary proposed for the Chief Engineer. It must, however, be remembered that this appointment will represent not only the post of Director of Construction on the present headquarters staff, but also the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, which it is now proposed to abolish. Moreover, fully half the work now done by the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will in future be performed by the Chief Engineer, and if in comparing the cost of the present and the proposed headquarters staff, allowance is made for half the pay of the former office, the result is a small saving.

We realise that the control of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, which are constantly in direct communication with corresponding administrations in different parts of the Empire and foreign countries, necessitates much centralisation of work. We recommend, therefore, the Director-General's proposals in this regard for Your Lordship's sanction, subject to our undertaking to examine the position afresh after two years' time, with a view to considering whether in the light of the experience which will have been gained, any reduction can be effected in the staff at headquarters.

9. The pay and allowances proposed for the new appointments are clearly set forth in paragraphs 26-36 of the Director-General's letter, and we consider his proposals to be suitable throughout and recommend them for Your Lordship's sanction. This is subject to the remark that some of the officers for whom Calcutta house allowances are proposed will probably have their headquarters eventually fixed at Delhi, and such officers will then cease to draw the allowances. It is also necessary to explain that the rates of pay proposed for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and for Deputy Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering (*vide* paragraphs 30 and 31 of the Director-General's letter) are those sanctioned in Your Lordship's despatches No. 24-Tel., dated the 3rd December, 1909, and No. 10-Tel., dated the 3rd May 1912, respectively.

We have shown, in paragraph 7 above, that the duties and responsibilities which will devolve upon the second division of the new Traffic Branch are of an exceptional character, and we support the proposal to introduce a special time-scale of pay in their favour, the effect of which will be to give them an average salary of Rs. 458 per mensem, the average pay enjoyed by the ordinary Traffic Branch being Rs. 350 per mensem. The further reasons adduced by the Director-General in the latter part of paragraph 35 of his letter constitute an additional justification for the proposed time scale.

10. We attach to this letter a statement showing in tabular form the proposed organization of the Telegraph Department, the various branches being clearly distinguished from one another, and their designations and scales of pay specified. This conspectus will, we trust, make the general outline of the scheme more readily comprehensible.

11. It will be observed that, whereas there are at present in the Telegraph Department 11 appointments carrying a pay in excess of that of the executive grades (the maximum of which is Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the cases of the Imperial Service and Rs. 850 in the case of the Provincial Service), there will be only five such appointments for some time, and, ultimately, four when the new Deputy Director-Generalship is filled up from the Traffic Branch. This would adversely affect the position of officers now in the service were some steps not taken to protect their interests. We are

pledged by the declarations made in our Resolutions of 1910 and 1912, announcing the reorganisation of the Department and the improvement in its conditions of service, to guarantee to officers now in the Department a position and prospects after the amalgamation not worse than those which they have hitherto enjoyed. In fulfilment of this guarantee, we recommend that the scales of pay now attached to the eleven administrative appointments above referred to, be continued in force so long as there remain in the Department any officers who would, but for the amalgamation, have risen to enjoy them.

12. This proposal is, however, subject to an important restriction. It will be seen that, after taking into account the actual strength of the Department as compared with its sanctioned strength, and the retirements which will take place before the introduction of the scheme, and after providing for the distribution of the new appointments among the existing staff in the manner proposed in paragraph 43 of the Director-General's letter, there remains a surplus of fourteen officers for whom no appointments can suitably be provided in the Department after the introduction of the proposed scheme. Of the 14 surplus officers one, Mr. Elrington, has retired; a second, Mr. Streatfeild-James, retires in the ordinary course in April next; a third, Mr. Overton, is likely to retire at the end of his present leave; and a fourth officer will probably be required for employment in a State Railway telegraph appointment which is now under consideration. Ten officers must, therefore, be induced to retire under conditions which will not afford a ground for reasonable complaint. The Director-General in paragraph 46 of his letter proposes, with this object in view, to offer special pensions on conditions similar to those which were sanctioned, in the case of the Public Works Department in 1887, by Viscount Cross in his despatch No. 13-Tel., dated the 25th August 1887. To this proposal we would add the further recommendation that officers retiring on these special pensions should further be permitted to avail themselves of any leave that might be due to them. We make this recommendation because we consider it of the utmost importance that the inducements to retire should be effectual in the required number of cases.

The premature retirement of a large number of officers, who will be among the senior officers of the Department, would, however, give unduly accelerated promotion to the remaining officers unless some artificial bar were introduced to confine promotion to its normal course. The Director-General proposes, therefore, in paragraph 37 of his letter, to restrict the enjoyment, after amalgamation is effected, of the existing higher rates of pay by the imposition of a time-limit upon promotion to those rates, in the manner described in the table contained in the paragraph referred to. As the Director-General explains, the existing organisation of the Department is of too recent a date to admit of a correct calculation of the probable decrement rate and prospects of promotion; he has, therefore, taken the cases of a few officers now in the Department, the dates of whose promotion to higher grades can be forecasted with reasonable certainty, and has adopted the average rate thus ascertained in fixing the periods of service at which officiating and permanent promotion to the various grades may suitably be allowed, subject, as hitherto, to the operation of selection.

We have carefully considered alternative methods of protecting the interests of officers now in the Department, while guarding against undue advantages being obtained from enforced retirements, and have come to the conclusion that the device adopted by the Director-General is, in all the circumstances, the best practicable.

We would add that, while we do not wish to attach undue weight to actuarial calculations in such a matter, we have such calculations made in order to compare the normal flow of promotion with that assumed by the Director-General in his proposed time-limits, and the result is exhibited in the subjoined table.



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

No. of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Conditions of Appointment			
		Permanent.		Officiating.	
		Normal.	As proposed by Director-General.	Normal.	As proposed by Director-General.
1	Rs. 2,250 Imperial	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 29 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.
	1,800 Provincial				
2	2,000 Imperial	Not less than 28 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.
	1,600 Provincial				
3	1,750 Imperial	Not less than 26 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 25 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.
	1,400 Provincial				
4	1,500 Imperial	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 23 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.
	1,200 Provincial				

Allowing for the operation of selection, we think that the comparison justifies the Director-General's proposals.

There is one further point of which mention must be made in this connection. The time-limits above described have been imposed in restraint of promotion, which would otherwise be unduly accelerated by the premature retirements induced by the offer of special pensions. This cause will cease to operate after a limited number of years, and before the disappearance of all the officers for whose benefit the existing higher rates of pay are proposed to be continued. We consider, however, that the time-limits should remain in force until the end of the period for which the higher rates of pay continue. Considering the liberal and indeed quite exceptional manner in which it is proposed to protect vested interests, and the serious extent to which the prospective economies to be attained by the scheme of amalgamation will be postponed by the continuance of these special rates of pay, we do not consider it unduly severe to maintain a check upon excessively rapid promotion in individual cases.

13. We would next refer briefly to the question of recruitment. This subject has been fully dealt with in paragraph 38 of the Director-General's letter, and we support his proposals that the proportion of officers to be recruited in England for the Engineering Branch should be reduced from five-eighths to one-half, the remaining half being obtained, in equal proportions, by direct recruitment in this country, and by promotions from subordinate ranks. This matter will, however, shortly come under the consideration of the Public Services Commission, and we desire to add that our recommendations in this respect are provisional, and subject to the result of the enquiries made by the Royal Commission.

14. In our letter No. 300 (Financial), dated the 17th October 1912, while proposing the inclusion of a Royal Engineer Officer in the superior service of the Telegraph Department for the charge of wireless stations in India, we explained that that proposal did not involve any extra expenditure in the Department as the superior staff was then below its sanctioned strength. Under the proposed reorganisation, however, this appointment will constitute a net addition to the strength of the superior engineering establishment described in paragraph 6 above, and we take this opportunity of requesting sanction to the continuance of the appointment as a part of that establishment. The extra expenditure involved will be the amount of the pay to which the officer holding the appointment in question will be entitled according to the time-scale referred to in paragraph 2 of our despatch No. 300 Salaries, &c., dated the 17th October 1912.

15. In paragraphs 47 and 48 of his letter the Director-General has proposed a scale of enhanced pensions attainable after a certain term of service in prescribed appointments. We support his proposals in this respect. The corresponding pensions now in force were sanctioned in Your Lordship's Despatch No. 12-Tel., dated the 26th August 1910.

16. There are certain minor matters dealt with in the Director-General's letter, such as the question of his financial powers, and the clerical and menial establishments required after the introduction of the scheme, to which we have not yet been able to devote full consideration, and, in referring to these matters, we would ask that we may be permitted to deal with separately, so far as they lie within our powers, after Your Lordship's orders on the general scheme have been received.

17. The amalgamation scheme, which we have the honour to lay before Your Lordship in this letter, was, in its main features, foreshadowed in paragraph 2 of our Commerce and Industry Department letter No. 39, dated the 13th July 1911. The actual combination of postal and telegraph functions has not been carried lower down the scale than Postmasters-General, and it would be more correct to describe the scheme as one of redistribution of staff and duties than as one of actual amalgamation. A considerable degree of fusion has already taken place, inasmuch as nearly all combined offices (which represent the larger, and constantly increasing, proportion of telegraph offices throughout the country) are under the control of postal officials. We do not anticipate that any further fusion can take place for many years to come. The scheme exhibits in a striking manner the fundamental distinction between engineering and traffic work, and even the differences between postal and telegraph traffic are so pronounced that there is no prospect at present of the two sets of duties being performed by a common establishment. These considerations do not, however, in our opinion, lessen the advantages which we confidently expect will ensue upon the introduction of the scheme. The experimental amalgamation, introduced last year in the Bombay and Central Circles (upon the lines of which the present proposals proceed), has been favourably received by the public, and the officers engaged in the experiment have testified to its beneficial effects upon both engineering and traffic. Each of these branches of work receives under the new system its due share of attention. The existence of a staff specially devoted to engineering encourages the introduction and application of scientific methods and inventions. We have no doubt, in short, that the administration of the Telegraph Department will become more efficient, and the public convenience



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

be thus benefited, by the introduction of the proposed scheme.

Financially, as well as administratively, the proposed distribution of duties will tend to economy, and the Director-General in paragraph 58 of his letter estimates the ultimate savings at not less than three and a half lakhs a year, though these anticipated savings will be postponed to a considerable extent by the measures (which we have described in paragraph 12 above) proposed to be taken for the protection of existing interests. In this connection, it is necessary to observe that we have not adopted the figure for the average pay of an Imperial service officer as calculated at the end of paragraph 58 of the Director-General's letter, but have adhered to that shown in Appendix IV, Statement A., to the despatch from Lord Minto's Government, No. 153-Salaries, dated the 1st July 1909. The alteration does not, however, affect the final estimate of the cost of the proposals.

The effect of the proposed scheme upon the personnel of the Department has received our anxious consideration. One measure for the protection of existing interests has been described in paragraph 12 above. Another measure, having the same object, is the proposal (contained in paragraph 31 of the Director-General's letter) to effect the necessary reduction of Deputy Superintendents General, by making it in the lowest grade. The Director-General has expressed his

belief that the amalgamation will not excite serious opposition or discontent among the members of either Department, providing that existing interests are adequately protected, and we are prepared to accept this view, though we cannot hope that a scheme of this magnitude can be introduced without giving rise to some individual grievances.

With these remarks we have the honour to commend the scheme for Your Lordship's sanction. We request the favour of early orders, as we are anxious to introduce the scheme with effect from the 1st of April 1914, if it is possible to give the Director-General before that date the necessary time for effecting the preliminary arrangements referred to in paragraph 60 of his letter. A further reason why in our opinion delay beyond the date mentioned above is undesirable, is that recruitment has been stopped pending the receipt of Your Lordship's orders on these proposals.

We have the honour to be,

My Lord Marquess,

Your Lordship's most obedient,  
humble Servants,

(Signed)	R. W. CARLYLE.
"	HARCOURT BUTLER.
"	S. A. IMAM.
"	W. H. CLARK.
"	R. H. CRADDOCK.
"	W. S. MEYER.

## ENCLOSURE IN ABOVE.

Letter from the Hon'ble SIR CHARLES STEWART WILSON, K.C.I.E., Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs (No. 464-S.G., Simla, the 13th November 1912) To the SECRETARY to the GOVERNMENT of INDIA, Department of Commerce and Industry.

SIR,—I have the honour to refer to the correspondence ending with Mr. Ley's letter No. 4393-101, dated the 7th June 1912, in which the Government of India sanctioned the experimental amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department in the Bombay and Central Circles from the 1st July 1912. In accordance with the instructions contained in paragraph 4 of that letter full details of the experimental arrangements were communicated to the Bombay and Karachi Chambers of Commerce, the Bombay Mill-owners' Association, the Indian Merchants' Chamber and Bureau and the Bombay Trades Association with a request that I might be favoured not later than the end of October 1912 with the opinion formed by their members regarding the experiment; and the general public were also invited, by means of a Press Communiqué and notices exhibited at all telegraph offices and post offices in the two circles, to communicate before the end of October their views on the success of the experiment. I presume that the remarks of the Government of Bombay and the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces on the subject have been communicated direct to the Government of India.

2. General opinion regarding experimental amalgamation in Bombay and Central Circles.—I submit for the information of the Government of India copies of the letters received from the public bodies specially addressed (Annexure I)\* and also copies of the opinions expressed by the Postmasters-General and the Superintending Engineer, Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, and by the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs (Annexure II),\* from which it would appear that the general opinion in the two circles affected by the experiment is in favour of the scheme of amalgamation. No letters have been received from the general public in response to the invitation mentioned above and it may be assumed, therefore, that the experiment in amalgamation has caused no inconvenience to any one. The references to the question of amalgamating the two departments that have appeared in the press since the experiment was undertaken have been uniformly favourable.

The progress of the experiment has been most carefully watched departmentally and has been freely discussed with all the senior officers and many of the juniors and subordinates of both the departments in my charge. The advantages to be gained from separating the traffic from the engineering work of

the Telegraph Department are freely admitted by practically all the officers of that department and it is generally agreed that the separation can best be effected by the application to the whole of India as a permanent measure of the arrangements that have been in force experimentally in the Bombay and Central Circles since the 1st July last. The feeling of opposition to amalgamation on the part of the telegraph staff which, as the Government of India are aware, was in existence at the time of the publication of the Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, arose from the suspicion that this measure might result in a wholesale reduction of establishment; but, so far as I have been able to ascertain, there would now be no feeling on the part of the officers or the subordinate staff of either the Telegraph Department or the Post Office against the permanent amalgamation of the two departments, provided that the interests and prospects of officers of all grades now serving in the departments are adequately protected.

3. Effect of combination of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department under a single Director-General.—Amalgamation on the basis of separating the engineering and traffic branches, if a suitable scheme could be evolved, has already been recognised as desirable by the Government of India, and my experience in the past few months has satisfied me of the correctness of this view. The Government of India should not, in my opinion, hesitate to abandon the existing administrative organisation of the Telegraph Department which is unnecessarily expensive. The Circle Directors have not been required to perform sufficient work of an important nature, on account of the difficulty of decentralising traffic and the failure to delegate powers when possible. This is due to the tendency to centralisation which has long been a characteristic of the Telegraph Department, and the result is that the Directors have not in fact occupied a position corresponding in responsibility to that of a Postmaster-General as was intended, and there has been much unnecessary correspondence between the two departments. The combination of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department under a single Director-General has already resulted in much greater co-operation between the officers of the two departments, in considerable economies under various heads and in a marked reduction of correspondence and clerical labour owing to the various directions in which work has been simplified.

\* Not reprinted.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

In my opinion, therefore, the success of the experiment in the Bombay and Central Circles and the views expressed by the public bodies consulted amply demonstrate that amalgamation in itself is not only desirable but is obviously the proper step to take in the interests both of efficiency and economy. It will undoubtedly lead to greater telegraph and telephone facilities to the public and will also result in an improved telegraph service owing to the closer control which it will be possible to exercise over the traffic arrangements of the department.

**4. General features and advantages of scheme of amalgamation proposed.**—Under the scheme of amalgamation now proposed, which is on the lines suggested by me in 1905 and follows closely the systems in force in the United Kingdom, Holland, Belgium and Italy, both the engineering and the traffic officers of the future will be solely employed on duties for which they are recruited and specially trained, and the dual control of combined offices which now exists will cease.

The inspection of combined offices and the disposal of correspondence connected with the opening, maintenance and closing of such offices will be transferred to Superintendents of post offices, who are now in a position, with the help of a few subordinates having a knowledge of instruments, to supervise and control the entire work of these offices after they are fitted up. It will thus be possible to effect large economies in respect of supervision and inspection and at the same time to provide not only a suitable staff of specially selected officers solely for the supervision and control of the operating establishment of the more important telegraph offices and of the traffic dealt with in those offices, but also an adequate staff of engineers who will be free to devote the whole of their time and energy to telegraph engineering work and to the proper maintenance and efficient working on the lines of the department.

The existing system under which officers and subordinates trained for telegraph engineering are required to spend half their time on traffic duties, which many of them dislike, is far from satisfactory and has led to some laxity of supervision over the work of the line staff, with the result that the maintenance of lines has been somewhat neglected. I am proposing to provide, for engineering work only, a liberal staff of upper subordinates of the rank of Deputy Superintendent, and, with this provision, maintenance work and petty reconstructions will be much more closely supervised than at present. I am confident, therefore, that under the new system engineering as well as traffic work will be performed more efficiently than now.

Another outstanding feature of the scheme is that competent subordinates will, for the first time, be afforded prospects of advancement to well-paid appointments, both in the engineering and in the traffic branches, with the result, we may hope, that the recruitment of telegraphists, which at present is by no means satisfactory, will be greatly stimulated and improved.

Finally, as shown in paragraph 58 of this report, the scheme will result in a large ultimate saving to Government in salaries of staff. The saving shown in that paragraph is likely to be exceeded, as it is anticipated that closer control will result in further savings on stores, stationery and printing as well as on staff and travelling allowances.

**5. Points of difference from the experimental arrangements in the Bombay and Central Circles.**—The scheme has been tested for some months now in the course of the experimental arrangements sanctioned for the Bombay and Central Circles, and the only point in which it is proposed to depart materially from those arrangements is in respect of the transfer to the proposed Engineering Branch of a portion of the work and duties of the superior staff of the present Technical Branch. This transfer was, however, all along intended. It was actually made experimentally in these two circles from the 1st October, and the experience gained since that time shows that the redistribution works well. In my opinion, and in the opinion of the senior officers of the Telegraph Department,

including the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief himself, it would be extremely wasteful under the altered conditions to provide a special touring staff of electrical engineers to supervise the maintenance of dynamos and batteries, the adjustment of instruments and apparatus, the provision and maintenance of electric lights and fans, the installation and maintenance of telephones, &c., when such work can be done by the ordinary engineering staff now recruited and trained for this very class of work. Even in the case of the smaller wireless telegraph stations the ordinary engineering staff is capable of supervising their erection, maintenance and working and special assistance would usually be necessary only in the case of the establishment of new high-power stations. When the engineers are relieved entirely of traffic duties, there is no reason why they should not undertake all the work ordinarily falling within the scope of electrical engineering, and they are anxious that these classes of work should be allotted to them. I have accordingly provided in my proposals for the abolition of the appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, the reduction of the staff of electrical engineers from five to three, the distribution among the divisions of most of the subordinate staff of the Technical Branch, and the transfer to the divisional engineers and their assistants of all the duties of the present Technical Branch, except research work, the instruction of candidates for appointments in which technical knowledge is required, the conduct of technical examinations, and the testing of instruments at the store depot at Alipore.

Engineering officers and upper subordinates will be encouraged to avail themselves fully of study leave, and so keep themselves abreast of the progress in electrical science.

#### I.—STAFF AND DUTIES UNDER THE PROPOSED SCHEME.

##### (a) Engineering.

**6. Administrative Staff in Circles.**—It has already been indicated in the preceding paragraphs that the fundamental principles of the scheme of amalgamation advocated by me are the separation of the engineering and traffic work of the Telegraph Department, the transfer of the latter to the control of Postmasters-General, and the recruitment of engineers for engineering work only, and of traffic officers for traffic work only. It is generally agreed throughout the Telegraph Department that, roughly speaking, traffic work at present occupies rather more than one half of the time and energy of the administrative and executive officers of the department, and it follows that if this work is handed over to Postmasters-General the present number of administrative appointments in the Telegraph Department must be reduced considerably. Excluding the Directors of Construction and Traffic and the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, whose duties will be dealt with later, the circle scheme provides eight officers of the rank of Director of Telegraphs, each of whom is directly subordinate to the Director-General, for the administration of the Telegraph Department, in respect of both engineering and traffic, in an area co-terminous with a postal circle.

After careful consideration I am of opinion that the administrative control of the purely engineering work of the Telegraph Department should comprise the following four charges:—

- I. The Bombay Circle (less the late Karachi Division), and the Central and Madras Circles.
- II. The Punjab Circle (with the addition of the late Karachi Telegraph Division) and the United Provinces Circle.
- III. The Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam Circles (the Provinces of Bengal and Bihar and Orissa and the Administration of Assam).
- IV. The Burma Circle.

7. The first three of these charges must, I consider, be placed under officers of the standing of the present Circle Directors, and I am satisfied that their time

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

will be fully occupied. The officers selected will control the entire engineering staff within the limits of their extensive charges, and be responsible not only for the design, construction and maintenance of telegraph and telephone lines, but also for the first fitting of telegraph offices, the fitting-up of telephone exchanges, the erection and maintenance of power plant, and all the other circle work which at present devolves on the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, while they will exercise in respect of these duties all the powers which have been delegated to Circle Directors. The responsibilities and duties of these appointments will therefore be of an onerous nature, and it is necessary that they should be in the hands of senior and experienced officers. It would not be wise to centralise control of telegraph engineering work at the headquarters of the Director-General, nor could it be placed in the hands of Postmasters-General having no engineering training; but, even if this were not the case, it is essential, in my opinion, that this branch of the amalgamated department shall be so constituted as to provide within itself a sufficiently attractive career for officers appointed to it, and this would not be possible unless engineering work were decentralised in the manner outlined here.

8. In the case of the Burma Circle, however, I propose that, for the present, the local administrative control of telegraph engineering work should be in the hands of the Postmaster-General. This circle cannot conveniently be linked for engineering purposes with any of the other provinces, its postal and telegraph work is light, and can all be undertaken by one officer with engineering knowledge and administrative ability, while the engineering duties alone would not justify the employment of an administrative engineering officer. Again, the conditions prevailing in Burma are such that special treatment under the scheme of amalgamation is demanded in another respect. Over 66 per cent. of the telegraph lines lie away from railways, and travelling along such lines is extremely difficult. At the same time these lines are of considerable importance, and must be carefully inspected at regular intervals by the engineering staff. The number of engineering officers of executive rank provided for Burma is therefore proportionately larger than in the other circles, but in the case of this circle I am proposing (*vide* paragraph 9) that these officers should give some assistance in traffic work. As I shall show elsewhere in this letter it will be possible for some years to come to provide a telegraph engineer as Postmaster-General, Burma, and, by the time this is no longer possible, Burma and Assam may be linked by railway, and a suitable redistribution of the engineering administrative charges can then be made. I have, therefore, thought it unnecessary to provide a separate administrative engineer for Burma after the appointment of Postmaster-General there ceases to be held by a telegraph officer.

9. **Executive Staff and Assistants.**—Directly subordinate to the engineering administrative officers there must be a sufficient number of executive officers to perform, in respect of telegraph engineering work, the functions now vested in Divisional Superintendents. The question of the number of officers required for this purpose has been minutely discussed with each of the present Circle Directors, and, after the most careful consideration of their views, I am of opinion that, to secure efficient supervision and control, there should be 20 charges, in each of which the engineering work should be under the control of an officer of the same standing, and with the same powers as a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs under the present system of administration, assisted by a sufficient staff of junior officers. The extent of each charge is shown in the map appended to this letter and the number of attached officers to be provided for each division would be approximately as follows:—

## I.—BOMBAY, CENTRAL AND MADRAS CIRCLE.

(a) Late Bombay Division and greater portion of late Belgaum Division—Three attached officers, *i.e.*, Assistant Superintendents and Deputy Superintendents, General.

(b) Late Ahmedabad Division with small portion of the late Karachi Division and greater portion of late Ajmere Division—Three attached officers.

(c) Late Nagpur and Jubbulpore Divisions—Two attached officers.

(d) Trichinopoly and Calicut Divisions—Two attached officers.

(e) Bangalore Division with portions of Madras Division and late Belgaum Division—Two attached officers.

(f) Remainder of Madras Division with whole of Vizagapatam Division—Three attached officers.

## II.—PUNJAB AND UNITED PROVINCES CIRCLE.

(a) Greater part of late Karachi Division and present Quetta Division—Three attached officers.

(b) Amballa Division with portions of Lahore and Bareilly Division—Three attached officers.

(c) Remainder of present Punjab Circle—Four attached officers.

(d) Remainder of Bareilly Division, with greater portions of Lucknow and Agra Divisions—Three attached officers.

(e) Allahabad Division with remainder of Lucknow and Agra Divisions—Two attached officers.

## III.—BENGAL AND EASTERN BENGAL AND ASSAM CIRCLE.

(a) Greater portion of Calcutta Division with small portion of Dacca Division—Three attached officers.

(b) Cuttack Division with greater portion of Bankipore Division and remainder of Calcutta Division—Three attached officers.

(c) Darjeeling Division with portion of Bankipore Division—Three attached officers.

(d) Remainder of Dacca Division and portion of Chittagong Division—Two attached officers.

(e) Shillong Division and remainder of Chittagong Division (Assam Administration)—Three attached officers.

## IV.—BURMA CIRCLE.

(a) Portion of Rangoon Division and greater portion of Moulmein Division—Two attached officers.

(b) Akyab Division and greater portion of remainder of European Division—Three attached officers.

(c) Greater portion of Maymyo Division and remainder of Moulmein Division—Two attached officers.

(d) Sagaing Division and remainder of Maymyo Division—Three attached officers.

The officers holding charge of these divisions will occupy, as regards engineering and technical work, exactly the same position as that now held by Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs in respect of engineering and traffic work. In the case of Burma they will, in addition to their engineering duties, continue to be responsible, as already explained, for some of the traffic work which in other circles is to be separated entirely from engineering. This combination of duties will extend to the inspection of all departmental telegraph offices in that province, except Rangoon (with its local departmental offices), Mandalay, Moulmein and Bassein, and to the submission to the Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's Office of the inspection reports of these offices. It would have been necessary in any case, as already explained in paragraph 8, to provide a proportionately larger number of engineering divisional charges in Burma than in other circles, and the arrangement of giving divisional engineers a certain amount of traffic work will be economical, for the addition of this work to the duties of these officers will not increase their numbers nor necessitate any special training, while it will save at least one appointment in the superior Traffic Branch and will avoid a great deal of expenditure and waste of time in travelling. The Burma circle is peculiar in regard to the number of isolated offices which, though important, have but little traffic, and the long distances to be covered would render the inspection by separate traffic officers alone of even the more important telegraph offices a matter of con-

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

siderable difficulty and expense. The retention of as large a number of divisional charges as four in a circle in which there are under the present system only five divisional superintendents is, therefore, in my opinion fully justified.

**10. Administrative Staff at the Headquarters of the Director-General.**—There now remains for consideration, so far as the Engineering Branch is concerned, the question of the staff required to assist the Director-General at headquarters and to fill the various miscellaneous appointments outside the ordinary divisional cadre. At headquarters I propose that there should be a senior engineer corresponding with the present Director of Construction, who, as head of the Engineering Branch, will hold the most highly-paid appointment in the branch. This officer will be the official adviser of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs on all engineering and technical matters and will be responsible under him for the efficient execution and maintenance of all engineering works; for preparing the specifications for, and carrying out mechanical and electrical tests of, all material and stores in connection with which such tests are required; for the control of all expenditure connected with engineering works; and for inspections which will include investigations regarding the execution of works, maintenance of lines, the control of stores, the operations of the workshop and the keeping up of records. The Superintendent of Workshops, who will, as at present, be recruited from outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department, will be directly under his orders.

**11.** The head of the Engineering Branch, or, as I shall propose later on in this letter to term him, the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, will require the help of one engineer officer as assistant, and I am of opinion that this officer should be of equal rank with the executive officers in charge of engineering divisions. The Chief Engineer will be frequently absent from headquarters on tour, and it is important that his assistant should be competent to relieve him at all times of the duty of dealing with the less important references on engineering questions. The tenure of the appointment of this assistant must, I consider, be limited to three years, and it would be extremely difficult to find an officer of lower rank than a Superintendent who would possess sufficient experience to be of real help to the Chief Engineer, and at the same time be sufficiently junior to render it possible to retain his services as assistant to the Chief Engineer for any appreciable time without injuring his prospects of promotion to divisional rank. One more telegraph engineer will be required at headquarters as Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and, for the reasons stated in my letter No. 147s—G, dated the 29th May 1912, I recommend that this officer also should be of equal rank with the officers in charge of divisions. The tenure of this appointment also will be limited to three years as at present.

**12. Technical Staff.**—The other superior officers required for the Engineering Branch are those whose duties will include the research and instructional work now performed by the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief and the officers of the Technical Branch. As already stated, I do not propose the abolition of this branch, but merely the allocation to divisions of the Deputy Superintendents and other subordinates now employed on technical duties in the various telegraph offices, and the transfer to the executive telegraph engineers of a great part of the work of the electrical engineers of the present Technical Branch. The duties of the Deputy Superintendents and other subordinates of the Technical Branch now employed directly under the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief at Alipore would remain unchanged. If this transfer of duties is effected, it will be necessary to provide only a sufficient number of technical engineers to assist and advise the Director-General and the Chief Engineer in special technical matters, to carry on research work and test instruments at the store yard at Alipore, to conduct classes for instruction in technical matters and to hold technical examinations. For these purposes I consider that the services of three officers, of whom two should be of the rank of Superintendent of Telegraphs, will

be required for six months, while two will be necessary for the remainder of the year. Thus for half the year one of these three officers will be at the disposal of the Director-General for employment on specially important works, such as the fitting of large telephone or telegraph offices, which the local officers could not be expected to undertake. In view of the large amount of instructional work which will devolve upon these officers, especially during the summer months, I recommend that they should be given the assistance of an additional technical Deputy Superintendent, the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents in the Technical Branch being increased by one appointment for this purpose, making the total strength of Deputy Superintendents and subordinates of lower rank in that branch seven and 34, respectively. Of the seven Deputy Superintendents two will be required at the headquarters of the technical engineers at Alipore, one each at Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Lahore under the orders of the administrative engineers and one at Rangoon under the orders of the Postmaster-General, Burma. The sanctioned establishment of 34 subordinates is just sufficient to meet existing requirements and will remain unaltered.

**13. Duties of Technical Staff.**—The actual duties of the three technical engineers, assisted by two Deputy Superintendents and one subordinate of the Technical Branch, will be—

(a) *Instruction.*—Under this head the technical engineers will be responsible, under the Chief Engineer, for the instruction of classes for candidates for the appointments of Deputy Superintendent in the Engineering Branch and of technical telegraphist. The course prescribed for these classes will ordinarily extend to about six months and will include instruction in repeaters, Wheatstone and Baudot apparatus, oil engines, accumulators, electric lights and fans, telephones, cable testing, wireless telegraphy apparatus, elementary mathematics, electricity and magnetism. These officers will also be required to arrange for the instruction of training class instructors, telephone inspectors, and the line staff required for telephone work, as well as of newly-recruited superior officers and of any other officials, including traffic Deputy Superintendents, to whom it may be considered desirable to afford opportunities for acquiring technical knowledge.

(b) *Testing.*—The technical engineers will be in charge of the instrument testing room at Alipore and will be required to carry out all the testing and designing work now performed by the present Technical Branch under the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.

**14.** These duties together with the office work connected with the staff serving permanently or temporarily under their orders, will ordinarily occupy about half the time of the technical engineers and the remainder of their working day will be devoted to research and the study of electric science. This will be connected principally with wireless telegraphy and telephones, but both the research work and the instruction will be practical and suited to the conditions of India. I assume that the services of Captain Evans or some other officer of the Royal Engineers will continue to remain at the disposal of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs so long as required.

**15. Total staff of Engineering Branch.**—The total staff proposed for the Engineering Branch in the foregoing paragraphs is—

Administrative -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1 Chief Engineer</li> <li>3 Circle Engineers</li> <li>20 Divisional Engineers</li> <li>2 Technical Engineers</li> </ul>
Executive -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1 Personal Assistant to the Director-General</li> <li>1 Assistant to the Chief Engineer</li> </ul>
Assistant and Deputy Superintendents' appointments.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>54 Attached officers, i.e., Assistant and Deputy Superintendents</li> <li>1 Assistant Engineer, Technical</li> </ul>

a total of 83 officers. To this number have to be added four Deputy Superintendents required as Personal

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

Assistants to the three Circle Engineers and as Engineering Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Burma, and six Deputy Superintendents for employment in the four telegraph store depôts at Calcutta, Madras, Bombay, and Rangoon. I consider it essential to provide also a special staff of 11 Deputy Superintendents, of whom the services of three can be placed at the disposal of each of the Circle Engineers and of two at the disposal of the Postmaster-General, Burma, for employment on special works. During the past four years it has been necessary to allot on an average about 14 officers annually for such works, and, although under the amalgamation scheme the ordinary divisional staff of engineer officers will have more time to undertake special works in addition to their usual duties than hitherto, there will generally be a number of projects for which the services of special additional officers will be necessary, and it is desirable that there should be officers in each engineering circle available for this purpose without dislocating the ordinary engineering staff of divisions. These Deputy Superintendents will also, when necessary, take the place of divisional officers whom it may be found necessary to employ on special works, and when not employed either in this capacity or directly on special works, they will be utilised in taking the place of officers on leave. This increases the number of Assistant and Deputy Superintendents from 55 to 76 and brings the total number of officers required for the proposed Engineering Branch to 104, excluding the additional Deputy Superintendent for the Technical Branch. Of this total 28 will hold administrative and executive appointments and, calculating on the proportion of 100 : 178 adopted in the reorganisation of the Public Works Department in 1908 and that of the Telegraph Department in 1910, the strength of the superior service of the Engineering Branch should be  $28 \times 1.78 = 49.84$ , that is, with four administrative appointments and 24 executive appointments, there should be a staff of 22 assistants of the superior service. The proportion used, however, provides for a leave reserve of about 18 officers for every 100 executive appointments proposed, but such a reserve is not required in the Telegraph Department and I am of opinion it will be sufficient to provide 18 junior appointments against 28 administrative and executive appointments, making a total establishment of 46 in the superior engineering service.

**15. Proportion of Assistant Superintendents.**—From the application of the Government of India Life and Service tables shown in the statement attached to this letter (Annexure III., Statement A) it would appear that a staff of 23 Imperial Service officers and 23 Provincial Service officers should provide 28 officers with more than 10 years' service, and the present time scales of pay, which I shall propose to continue for engineers, were based on the assumption that executive rank would usually be attained in the 11th year of service. The statement also shows that if, as will probably be the case, the officers appointed direct to the Provincial Service in future are about 21 or 22 years of age, there should be, theoretically, a sufficient number of officers with six years' service and upwards to take the place of the seven administrative and executive officers, who may be expected to be absent on leave at the same time, and the remainder, consisting of 11 officers with less than six years' service, is in my opinion a sufficient number to have in training. According to the statement already referred to a total strength of 46 engineer officers would not ordinarily suffice to provide officers with the proper amount of service to take the place of those unfit for promotion, but in a small service of 46 it should be possible as a general rule to weed out unsuitable officers long before they reach their seventh year of service. Moreover, as I shall explain more fully later in this letter. I propose that one-fourth of the vacancies in the superior engineer establishment should in future be filled by the promotion of qualified subordinates. This arrangement will tend to a slight preponderance of officers of six years' service and upwards over the figures given under the Life and Service tables owing to the fact that promoted subordinates would frequently have to be brought on to the time-

scale of pay of the superior service at a point very near the pay of the sixth year of service. This consideration in itself renders it desirable to fix the total strength of Assistant Superintendents as low as possible, in order to prevent any risk of a serious block in the promotion of young officers appointed direct to the superior establishment.

**16. Proportion of Deputy Superintendents.**—The remaining fifty-eight appointments required in the Engineering Branch will be filled by Deputy Superintendents, General, of whom there are at present seventy-two sanctioned. The balance of fourteen Deputy Superintendents-General will be provided for in a manner which will be described in paragraph 45. As the total number of appointments is fixed on actual requirements, it follows that, when one of the forty-six superior officers proceeds on leave, it will be necessary to appoint a subordinate to officiate as additional Deputy Superintendent during his absence; that is, the total number of officers present on duty will always be maintained at sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superintendents, but Deputy Superintendents will not be appointed to officiate as Assistant Superintendents.

## (b) Traffic.

**17. Staff of superior traffic officers to assist Postmasters-General.**—In the foregoing paragraphs I have dealt with the question of the staff required for the control and supervision of the engineering and technical work only. The traffic work of the department, under the recommendation made in this letter, will pass to the control of Postmasters-General, and it has now to be considered what additional staff should be provided to assist Postmasters-General in the disposal of this important addition to their duties. By traffic work is meant the disposal of all questions connected with the establishment of Government telegraph offices, whether departmental or combined, the supervision and control of all telegraph work performed inside such offices, except the maintenance of wireless and other special telegraph apparatus (such as Baudot, Wheatstone, repeaters, &c.), and the testing of lines in offices in which Technical Branch men are permanently employed; in short, all work which does not come under engineering. The question of the additional staff required when all the traffic work at present performed by Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents is transferred to the Post Office has been discussed in detail with Postmaster-General and Director of Telegraphs and the unanimous opinion, in which I agree, is that each circle should be given the services of one fairly senior officer of about the same standing as a Deputy Postmaster-General with the following staff of assistants:—

Bombay Circle	-	-	Three.
Central Circle	-	-	Two.
Madras Circle	-	-	Three.
Punjab Circle	-	-	Three.
United Provinces Circle	-	-	Two.
Bengal Circle	-	-	Three.
Eastern Bengal Circle and Assam	-	-	Two.
Burma Circle	-	-	One.

These proposals are based on the experience of the actual work which has been gained during the progress of the experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles and I am convinced that they represent the smallest additions to the staffs of Postmasters-General compatible with efficient working. As a matter of fact the Postmasters-General of both these circles at the beginning of the experiment were of opinion that a considerably larger staff of assistants would be needed, but, when they realised that it would be unnecessary for the officers of this branch to inspect the smaller combined offices, they voluntarily reduced their requirements to the number proposed which they have in practice found sufficient. The question of the exact duties to be performed by each officer must be left to the respective Postmasters-General to decide, but it is intended that the officers allotted to



each circle for the superior Traffic Branch in the offices of Postmasters-General will ordinarily divide their time about equally on inspection and office duties, for this branch will also deal with the work connected with the telegraph side of combined post and telegraph offices now performed by the existing staff of Postmasters-General. The services of Inspecting telegraph masters and telegraphists and of Superintendents of post offices will be utilised in the inspection of the less important combined offices. It will be observed that the Deputy Postmaster-General, Traffic (Traffic Manager) in the Burma Circle will be given only one assistant, the reason being, as explained in paragraph 9, that the telegraph engineering officers in this circle will deal with a certain amount of the traffic work.

**18. Staff of Superior Traffic Branch Officers at the Headquarters of the Director-General.**—As head of the Traffic Branch at the headquarters of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, I propose that there should be a senior officer whose duties will correspond with those now performed by the Director of Traffic. This officer will be designated Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic. He will exercise under the Director-General the entire control of telegraph traffic and the staff employed in telegraph offices, and, although his duties will not be so responsible as those of the Chief Engineer, they will be such as to demand the services of a thoroughly efficient and experienced officer. It is desirable that the officer holding the highest appointment in the superior Traffic Branch should be of practically equal rank with the Postmasters-General, whose work, so far as telegraph traffic is concerned, he will to a certain extent control.

Every endeavour has been, and will continue to be, made by me to reduce the number of references on telegraph traffic and establishment questions, but this branch of my office is still very heavily worked and must remain so. As it will also be necessary that the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, should spend a considerable portion of his time on tour, I consider that he should be given the services of two assistants as at present. One of these should be of about the same standing as an Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, and would take the place of the Superintendent of Telegraphs at present attached to my office to assist the Director of Traffic; the second assistant would be a more junior officer holding an appointment corresponding to that of Assistant Director of Traffic recently sanctioned by the Government of India as a temporary measure. I am satisfied that the work which must necessarily come to this branch of my office will occupy the time of these officers very fully.

**19. Miscellaneous appointments in superior Traffic Branch.**—In addition to the officers at the headquarters of the Director-General and of Postmasters-General it is necessary to provide in the proposed superior Traffic Branch for officers to take the place of the Superintendents of Telegraphs in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Agra central telegraph offices, and the Assistant Superintendents in the Calcutta and Bombay offices. An important feature of the scheme of amalgamation is the transfer of the control of all town departmental telegraph offices to the officers in charge of the central telegraph offices, and as a result the Calcutta, Bombay and Madras offices will be very important and responsible charges. I consider it desirable, therefore, that the appointments held by the officers in charge of these three offices should approximate as closely as possible to those held by the senior officers in the proposed superior Traffic Branch of Postmaster-General's offices, as well as by postal officers in corresponding charges. The four next largest offices, viz., Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi and Delhi, will also be important charges which should be held by officers of higher standing than the Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, now in charge. For this reason, and also to ensure that all the officers in the separate superior Traffic Branch, which I propose should be created,

shall have ample practical opportunities of acquiring a thorough knowledge of traffic work, I recommend that special appointments should be provided in this branch for the officers in charge of these four offices also and that these appointments, together with those of the officer in charge of the Agra office, the assistants to the officers in charge of the Calcutta and Bombay offices, the junior assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and the nineteen assistants to the officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices should be placed together in one grade, with approximately the same position and prospects as Superintendents of post offices.

**20. Total Staff of superior Traffic Branch.**—The total staff proposed for the superior Traffic Branch is :—

- 1 Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.
- 2 assistants to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.
- 8 officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices.
- 19 assistants to officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices.
- 8 officers in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, Madras, Agra, Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi, and Delhi telegraph offices.
- 2 assistants in the Calcutta and Bombay central telegraph offices.

Or a total of 40 appointments; against which there will be a reduction of 50 appointments in the present superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, a reduction of 13 appointments in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, after providing for an additional Deputy Superintendent in the Technical Branch, the abolition of the present temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic in the office of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and the reduction of four appointments in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, on account of the creation of four special appointments for the charge of the Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi and Delhi offices referred to in the preceding paragraph. My proposals, if accepted, will therefore result in a decrease in the total sanctioned strength of the department of twenty-eight appointments. The proposed grading of these new appointments is shown in paragraph 35.

**21. Separation of superior Traffic Branch from establishment of existing Traffic Branch.**—In order to ensure quicker promotion to, and in, the superior Traffic Branch, embracing the appointments specified above, I consider it essential that it should be kept entirely separate from the existing establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, employed in Telegraph offices. The branch will eventually be recruited as far as possible from subordinates selected at any stage of their service; but it may also be necessary, as the surplus staff of superior officers is exhausted, to recruit a certain number of officers from outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department in the manner explained in paragraph 41 of this letter, in order to ensure a sufficient reserve of officers specially fitted for the higher administrative traffic appointments, and it is essential to provide a separate cadre to which such officers can be appointed direct with prospects of advancement such as will attract suitable men. The grading for the superior Traffic Branch will facilitate the transfer of men between this branch and the ordinary grades of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, when necessary, and the branch will therefore consist entirely of specially selected and trained traffic officers.

## II.—DESIGNATIONS AND HEADQUARTERS OF REVISED STAFF.

**22. Designation of the Director-General of the combined Departments.**—In paragraph 4 of their Resolution No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, the Government of India decided that I should be



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

styled Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs while administering the Telegraph Department in addition to my own duties as Director-General of the Post Office of India, and I recommend that this title be permanently adopted for the head of the amalgamated departments. As, however, there will in this case no longer be a separate Telegraph Department or a separate Post Office, it will probably be necessary to undertake some simple legislation to provide for the change of title.

**23. Designations of other Officers employed on Telegraph Work.**—As regards the officers employed on telegraph work, I propose that in the case of the Engineering Branch the present designations should be altered as little as possible, and that the designations of the superior Traffic Branch appointments should follow those of the corresponding appointments in the Post Office.

The highest appointment in the Engineering Branch may, I consider, be styled Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.

For the remaining officers of the two new branches I propose the following designations :—

## ENGINEERING BRANCH.

*At Headquarters—*

Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

Assistant to the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.

*In Circles—*

Director, Telegraph Engineering.

Personal Assistant to the Director, Telegraph Engineering.

*In Divisions—*

*Officer in charge.*—Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.

*Attached officers.*—Superior Service — Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.

Upper Subordinates—Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.

*Technical Branch—*

Chief Electrician.

Assistant Electrician.

Deputy Superintendent, Telegraphs (Technical).

Technical Telegraph Master (or Telegraphist).

## SUPERIOR TRAFFIC BRANCH.

*At Headquarters—*

Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India (Traffic).

Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.

Assistant to the Deputy Director of the Post Office, Traffic.

*In Circles—*

Senior Officer in Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's office — Deputy Postmaster-General, Traffic.

Assistants to ditto.—Superintendent of Post Office (Traffic). Officers of the present superior service employed under Deputy Postmasters-General (Traffic) should, however, be styled Assistant Postmasters-General (Traffic).

Officers of the superior Traffic Branch in charge of telegraph offices may be styled Superintendent, "———" office, and the assistants in the Bombay and Calcutta Offices may be designated "Assistant Superintendent, Bombay Office."

**24. Upper subordinates of the existing Traffic Branch** in charge of telegraph offices other than those specified above will continue to be styled Deputy Superintendent, "———" Office.

**25. Headquarters of Officers.**—The headquarters of officers in the Traffic Branches, except in the cases of officers employed in telegraph offices, should be the

headquarters of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General, as the case may be. In the case of the Engineering Branch, the headquarters of the Chief Engineer and his assistant and of the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, should be those of the Director-General. All the officers employed at the headquarters of the Director-General should, I consider, be permitted to accompany the Government of India to Simla every year with the exception of the assistant to the Chief Engineer and one of the assistants to the Deputy Director-General, Traffic. The headquarters of the three Directors of Telegraph Engineering should be fixed at Bombay, Lahore (ultimately Delhi) and Calcutta, and those of the Divisional Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering at the following places :—

## 1.—BOMBAY, CENTRAL AND MADRAS CIRCLE.

(a) Bombay.

(b) Ajmere.

(c) Nagpur.

(d) Trichinopoly for the present, but Coimbatore when office accommodation is available.

(e) Bangalore.

(f) Madras.

## 2.—PUNJAB AND UNITED PROVINCES CIRCLE.

(a) Karachi.

(b) Ambala for the present, but Delhi when accommodation is available.

(c) Lahore.

(d) Lucknow.

(e) Allahabad.

## 3.—BENGAL AND EASTERN BENGAL AND ASSAM CIRCLE.

(a) and (b) Calcutta.

(c) Darjeeling.

(d) Dacca.

(e) Shillong.

## 4.—BURMA.

(a) Rangoon.

(b) Akyab.

(c) Maymyo.

(d) Mandalay.

The area of the divisions generally will be increased greatly under this scheme and it will probably be necessary in the majority of divisions to station at least one attached officer of the Engineering Branch at some place other than the headquarters of the division. This matter should be left to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs to decide according to actual requirements when the scheme of amalgamation is introduced.

## III.—PAY AND ALLOWANCES.

**26. Pay of Director-General, Posts and Telegraphs.**

—The pay of the appointment of Director-General of the Post Office of India, which was fixed at Rs. 3,000 in 1853, was raised in the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 59-Financial, dated the 27th March 1903, to Rs. 3,000 a month for the first five years' tenure (including periods of officiating service) rising thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,500 a month. As a member of the Indian Civil Service, the Director-General also draws exchange compensation allowance at the rate of Rs. 138-14-3, the maximum admissible under rule, and in Mr. Ley's letter No. 1800-33, dated the 27th February 1912, the Government of India sanctioned the grant to me, while administering the Telegraph Department in addition to my own duties as Director-General of the Post Office, of a personal allowance of Rs. 300 a month subject to the condition that my total salary should not exceed Rs. 3,500 a month. Excluding this allowance, the average value of the appointment of Director-General of the Post Office, with the present rate of pay and inclusive of

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

exchange compensation allowance, is about Rs. 3,305\* a month. If it is finally decided to amalgamate the Post Office and the Telegraph Department on the lines recommended in this letter, the responsibilities and duties of the Director-General in charge of the combined departments will practically equal those of the two Directors-General in the past. Both of the departments are expanding rapidly and the officer selected for the combined appointment will necessarily be one possessing high qualifications as an administrator, and ordinarily he will have no further prospects of advancement. As it has already been decided that the earliest opportunity should be taken to withdraw exchange compensation allowance by revising the pay of the appointments in respect of which the allowance is admissible, I am of opinion that there is ample justification for fixing the pay of the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs at Rs. 3,500—100—4,000. Exchange compensation allowance would cease to be admissible and the net increase in the pay of the appointment over that of the Director-General of the Post Office of India would amount to about Rs. 528 a month only.

**27. Pay of Postmasters-General.**—In the case of Postmasters-General also there will be a large increase of work under the proposed scheme as, in addition to their postal duties, these officers will be required to deal with all telegraph traffic questions arising in their circle and to control the staff of all telegraph offices. It would shortly have been necessary as regards these appointments also to propose that the rates of pay should be revised so as to permit of the withdrawal of the exchange compensation allowance, and I consider that this opportunity should be taken to remove all distinction between members of the Indian Civil Service and other Postmasters-General and to abolish the special rate of pay admissible for one Postmaster-General, 1st grade, if a member of the Indian Civil Service. The present pay and grading of Postmasters-General is—

- 1 on Rs. 2,250—50—2,500 = Rs. 2,417
- 3 on Rs. 1,750—50—2,000 = Rs. 5,750
- 6 on Rs. 1,500—50—1,750 = Rs. 10,000

and, of the officers permanently holding these appointments, all but two draw exchange compensation allowance. The average pay of these two officers is Rs. 3,584 and the amount of exchange compensation allowance drawn by the other eight officers is Rs. 901. The average cost of the ten appointments is, therefore,  $18,167 + 901 = 19,068$ . Post Office work is becoming more important every year and the same may be said of telegraph traffic work. Considering the pay given to heads of departments under Local Governments and Administrations and the additional responsibilities that will be imposed on Postmasters-General in connection with telegraph traffic work, I am of opinion that there are good grounds for fixing the minimum pay at Rs. 1,750 and that there is ample justification for allowing two of the Postmasters-General to rise to Rs. 2,500, without compensation allowance, instead of one as at present with compensation allowance. It will be more convenient administratively and also for the purposes of audit if the general practice of giving fixed rates of pay is followed in the case of Postmasters-General, and I strongly recommend the adoption of the following scale of pay without exchange compensation allowance—

- 2 on Rs. 2,500 = Rs. 5,000.
- 2 on Rs. 2,250 = Rs. 4,500,
- 3 on Rs. 2,000 = Rs. 6,000.
- 3 on Rs. 1,750 = Rs. 5,250.

Total - Rs. 20,750.

This scale provides for a total increase of Rs. 1,682 a month or an average increase of Rs. 168 in the value

	Rs.
* Average value	$\frac{3,000 + 3,333}{2} = 3,166 \cdot 6$
Exchange compensation allowance	$\frac{138 \cdot 9}{3,305 \cdot 5}$

of each appointment. The two Postmasters-General holding the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office should continue to draw the local allowance of Rs. 200 a month attached to that appointment and it will be advisable to rule that, if necessary, an officer should be given a personal allowance equal to the difference between his pay under the present scale *plus* exchange compensation allowance and his pay under the revised grading, if the latter is less.

**28. In the Engineering Branch,** I propose that the pay of the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, should be fixed at Rs. 2,750. The post of Director-General of Telegraphs having been abolished, this appointment will be the highest ordinarily attainable by a telegraph engineer and it is necessary to fix the pay at such a rate as will provide reasonably good prospects for existing officers and future entrants. Apart from this consideration, however, the duties and responsibilities of this officer, as explained in paragraph 10, fully justify the pay here proposed. These duties and responsibilities will comprise not only those of the present Director of Construction but also those of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, and his work will include the maintenance of an increasing number of important wireless stations. The average expenditure of the Engineering Branch during the past three years, which would be controlled by this officer under the Director-General's orders, exceeded 40 lakhs a year and his position will correspond closely with that of a Chief Engineer to a Local Government. Exchange compensation should not be admissible.

**29. Pay of Directors, Telegraph Engineering.**—As regards the three Directors, Telegraph Engineering, I recommend that ultimately there should be one appointment on Rs. 2,000 and two appointments on Rs. 1,500 each without exchange compensation allowance. For some years to come these particular rates of pay must remain in abeyance, as the appointments will be held by three of the eleven officers in receipt of the pay of the present administrative grades of the Telegraph Department, which it is proposed elsewhere in this letter should be allowed to remain in force for all officers of the department now in the service. As in the case of the present directorships an officer of the Provincial Service should be eligible for appointment as Director, Telegraph Engineering, if fully qualified to perform the duties attaching to the appointment, and the pay of the appointment, when held by a Provincial Service officer, should be the same as the pay of the corresponding appointments shown in Appendix I. to the Government of India Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913-918—115, dated the 2nd February 1910, viz., Rs. 1,200 and Rs. 1,600 respectively.

**30. Pay of Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—For Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, including the officers employed in the Technical Branch, the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and the assistant to the Chief Engineer, who will be recruited from exactly the same sources as the existing superior service of the Indian Telegraph Department, I recommend the continuance of the Imperial and Provincial Service time-scales of pay sanctioned in Resolutions No. 913-918—115, dated the 2nd February 1910, and No. 4276-4280—133, dated the 4th June 1912, with the conditions stated in paragraph 4 of the latter resolution. As the number of divisional charges will be reduced, and some officers must be deprived of the charges which they now hold, it will be necessary, in the case of efficient men already in the service, to waive the condition that no officer shall draw more than the pay of the eleventh year of service unless he is in divisional charge. The officers mentioned above should also be granted any local allowances (including house allowances) for which officers of the existing superior service are eligible. I recommend, however, that the two Superintendents of Telegraphs employed as Chief Electrician and senior Assistant Electrician should each be granted a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month and the Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

employed as junior assistant, a local allowance of Rs. 50 a month in addition to their pay under the time-scales of their service and the allowance admissible to them under the Calcutta house allowance scheme. Except in very special circumstances, these officers will be stationed permanently at Calcutta and their duties will be arduous and of a less varied nature than those of officers employed on ordinary engineering work. Moreover they will always be specially selected or specially recruited officers, and the experience of the past two years has shown the necessity of fixing the emoluments of superior officers employed on technical work on a slightly higher scale than those of the other officers of the Engineering Branch. The Superintendents employed as Personal Assistant to the Director-General and as assistant to the Chief Engineer will have heavier work and responsibilities than those of Superintendents in divisions, and, as they will be stationed at expensive places, I recommend that these officers, as in the case of Personal Assistants in the Post Office, should be given a local allowance of Rs. 100 each in addition to their pay under the time-scale and should be admitted to the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

**31. Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—In the case of the Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, I recommend that the rates of pay sanctioned in the Resolution of the 2nd February 1910 for Deputy Superintendents, General, should be retained and that, in order to meet the undertaking given to the subordinate staff of the Telegraph Department by the Government of India in their Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry No. 830-33, dated the 24th January 1912, and in Mr. Ley's letter No. 1262-38, dated the 9th February 1912, the reduction of fourteen appointments, which it is proposed to effect in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, should eventually be made in the lowest grade of Rs. 250—15—325. The ultimate grading for the 58 appointments, which it is proposed to retain for Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will then be—

8 on Rs. 400—25—500.  
16 on Rs. 325—15—400.  
35 on Rs. 250—15—325.

Any other arrangement would affect adversely the prospects of the Deputy Superintendents of the Engineering Branch in the lowest grade, but, apart from this, I consider that a proportion of eight better paid appointments on Rs. 400—500 and sixteen on Rs. 325—400 is not too high in a cadre of 58 officers, especially in view of the greatly improved prospects on the traffic side. As will be explained later in this letter, of the fourteen Deputy Superintendents, General, who will not be required for engineering work, thirteen will be employed in traffic appointments and one in the Technical branch and, if necessary, on their present scales of pay.

**32. Local allowances for Personal Assistants to Directors, Telegraph Engineering.**—The four Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, employed as Personal Assistants to the Directors, Telegraph Engineering, and the Postmaster-General, Burma, will all be stationed in expensive towns, and, as their duties will generally be of a more important nature than those of Deputy Superintendents employed on engineering work, I recommend the grant to each of these four officers of a special charge or local allowance of Rs. 50 a month in addition to their grade pay and the allowances for which they are at present eligible under rule, such as the Presidency and Burma allowances. Under the existing rules Deputy Superintendents, General, are not admitted to the benefits of the house allowance schemes. Superintendents of post offices employed as Personal Assistants to Postmasters-General receive a special allowance of Rs. 100 each in addition to the ordinary local allowances.

**33. Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents, Technical.**—In the case of the upper subordinates and subordinates of the Technical Branch also, I recommend the retention of the existing rate of pay and allowances.

The additional appointment of Deputy Superintendent in this branch recommended in paragraph 12 of this letter should, I consider, be made in the lowest grade, and the cadre will then stand as follows:—

1 on Rs. 400—25—500  
2 on Rs. 325—15—400.  
4 on Rs. 250—15—325.

The additional appointment will not, however, be filled up by the promotion of a Technical Telegraph Master so long as it is necessary to hold it against one of the supernumerary Deputy Superintendents, General, not required for the Engineering Branch.

I have carefully considered the question of amalgamating this small cadre with that of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, but I have decided to make no proposal to this effect at present as the prospects of promotion of some of the Deputy Superintendents, Technical, would be materially injured if this change were made. Later it may be possible gradually to merge the two cadres into one as vacancies occur in the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Technical.

**34. Pay of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office Traffic.**—In the superior Traffic Branch I recommend that the pay of the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, should be fixed at Rs. 1,750—50—2,000. As I have already explained in paragraph 18 of this letter, this appointment should be held by a thoroughly efficient and experienced officer who should be practically of equal rank with Postmasters-General, but he will usually be an officer who has spent the greater portion of his service in the superior Traffic Branch and I do not consider that he should be actually graded with Postmasters-General. I have, therefore, proposed an incremental scale of pay representing a combination of the rates proposed for the two lowest grades of Postmasters-General. It will be unnecessary to grant the Deputy-Director-General, Traffic, a local allowance similar to that given to the other Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office, but his appointment should be admitted to the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

**35. Pay and grading of first division of superior Traffic Branch.**—The remaining thirty-nine appointments proposed for the superior Traffic Branch should in my opinion consist of two divisions, in the first of which there would be the three officers in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay and Madras telegraph offices, the eight Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, and the Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic. The work and the duties of the twelve officers holding these appointments will correspond closely with those of Presidency Postmasters, Deputy Postmasters-General, and Assistant Directors-General of the Post Office, respectively, and I recommend that they should be graded as follows:—

2 on Rs. 1,200—40—1,400.  
4 on Rs. 1,000.  
6 on Rs. 800.

These officers should be treated for the purpose of all local allowances (including house rent allowances) in exactly the same way as officers of corresponding rank in the Post Office—the Assistant Director-General, Traffic, being given a local allowance of Rs. 150 a month and excluded from the benefits of the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

**Pay and grading of Second Division of superior Traffic Branch.**—The second division would consist of the five officers in charge of the Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi telegraph offices, the assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, the nineteen assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, and the two assistants to the officers in charge of the Calcutta and Bombay telegraph offices.

The position and status of these officers should approximate to that of Superintendents of post offices, but I do not think it is advisable or practicable, to fix the pay of the former on exactly the same rates as those of Superintendents of post offices. There is no reason why the rates of pay of these two classes of officers should be identical for there is no intention of

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

transferring officers from the one service to the other, nor will the source of recruitment be the same in the two cases. On the other hand, there are practical difficulties in adopting the Post Office grading which is in my opinion unsuitable even in the case of the Post Office. In the first place, the minimum pay of a Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs is Rs. 250, and, as none of the appointments in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch will be inferior to that of a Deputy Superintendent, the minimum pay fixed for the former should not be less than Rs. 250. Further, it is highly desirable that the pay of the officers in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch should be such as will facilitate transfers from and to the grades of Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, for it will frequently be necessary to try officers of the latter class in the superior Traffic Branch and to revert them if they prove unsuitable. I strongly recommend, therefore, the adoption of a time scale of pay rising from Rs. 250 by ten annual increments of Rs. 15 to Rs. 400, and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 600 a month. This scale of pay is based, up to the Rs. 500 stage, on that sanctioned for Deputy Superintendents, while, in continuing to rise to Rs. 600 a month, it provides some prospects with a view to attract capable officers to this important branch of the department, and makes the maximum pay of the scale the same as that now obtainable by Superintendents of post offices. Under the time scale of pay proposed by me the maximum pay of the twenty-seven officers in the lower division of the superior Traffic Branch will exceed Rs. 500 a month, and they will, therefore, under Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations be officers of the first class for the purpose of the travelling allowance regulations and will thus all be placed in the same position in this respect as Superintendents of post offices to all of whom first class travelling allowances were specially granted in 1881. The nineteen officers who will be assistants to the Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, (Superintendents of post offices Traffic,) will have much arduous inspection to perform and it is important that they in particular should be eligible for first class travelling allowances.

I should have greatly preferred to recommend a maximum pay of Rs. 700 for these officers, but I recognise that probably this proposal could not be agreed to by Government without involving the reconsideration of their recent decision on the proposal to increase to Rs. 700 the maximum pay of Superintendents of post offices. I may, however, state here that in my opinion that the latter officers should eventually be granted a time-scale of pay rising to Rs. 700 stronger than ever. When this change is effected, the maximum of the time-scale of pay of the second division of the proposed superior Traffic Branch should also be increased to Rs. 700. I might add that the cost of the latter proposal would be less than Rs. 7,000 a year.

As regards house rent allowances I recommend that the twenty-seven officers in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch should be granted the allowance admissible to the present Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, with the exception of the officer holding the appointment of assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, at headquarters, who should be granted, in lieu of house allowance, a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month similar to that admissible for a Superintendent of post offices holding the appointment of Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

**36. Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents of the ordinary Traffic Branch.**—The establishment of Deputy Superintendents in the existing Traffic Branch will be reduced by the four appointments provided by the superior Traffic Branch for the charge of the Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi Offices, and I recommend that this reduction also should be effected in the lowest grade. This establishment will then be graded as follows:—

8 on Rs. 400—25—500.  
16 on Rs. 325—15—400.  
27 on Rs. 250—15—325.

**37. Continuation to officers now in the service of the higher rates of pay at present in force for the eleven administrative appointments.**—In the preceding paragraphs proposals have been put forward for the provision of five administrative appointments carrying salaries in excess of the maximum of the time-scales of pay which it is proposed to retain for telegraph engineers. Under the existing organization, however, there are at present, omitting the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs in respect of which the Government of India have exercised their right to select an officer outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department, eleven appointments on salaries varying from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,250 a month to which officers now in the superior service of the Telegraph Department may reasonably expect promotion, if qualified, and, in accordance with instructions conveyed to me in paragraph 5 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Commerce and Industry Department No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, that, in such steps as might be taken towards the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both departments in all grades, I propose that the pay and prospects of existing officers of the department should not be affected adversely and that the present grading of eleven high appointments should be maintained for them, except in the case of the highest post, namely, that of Chief Engineer which should take the place of one of the appointments on Rs. 2,250. This arrangement necessarily involves temporary extra expenditure on Government, as for some years a larger number of highly paid appointments must be maintained than is required for my scheme, but this is unavoidable if the interests of existing officers are to be safeguarded, as I understand is the intention of Government. The plan adopted to meet the case must ensure as far as possible that the emoluments of a qualified officer remaining in the service shall not at any stage of his career be less than they would have been if the existing system had remained in force; and on the other hand measures have to be taken to prevent the immediate reduction in the staff of superior officers which I shall propose elsewhere in this letter from resulting in unduly rapid promotion to the higher grades. The latter difficulty could, it is true, be overcome by maintaining an imaginary cadre in which the places of officers who, owing to amalgamation, leave the department permanently, would be taken by dummies who would be moved up in the imaginary cadre in the proper order and would in course of time be shown as filling in their proper turn officiating and permanent appointments in the present administrative grades on the existing rates of pay. Under this system no officer remaining in the service would attain the pay of the existing administrative appointments earlier than if there had been no reduction of staff owing to amalgamation; but the system is undoubtedly objectionable from an audit point of view, and it would be exceedingly difficult in actual practice. Moreover, it has the disadvantage of failing to afford officers the officiating promotions which they would have received if the dummy appointments had continued to be held by the present incumbents, and also of failing to differentiate between dummy appointments representing officers who have prematurely retired, and those representing officers who, even if they had remained in the service, would not have been permitted to proceed beyond the maximum pay of a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs. Further the officers affected would not understand the arrangement clearly and there would always be the danger of their considering that they had been dealt with illiberally.

After careful consideration of the matter, I am of opinion that the only satisfactory manner in which the difficulty can be overcome is the adoption of a system of promotion under which the imposition of a service limit would act as an automatic check on unduly rapid promotion to, and in, the administrative grades.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

These grades are at present filled as follows :—

Name.	Rank.	Pay of Substantive Appointment.	Year of Service on 1st October 1912.	Date of Birth.	Date on which obliged to retire.	REMARKS.
1. F. E. Dempster -	Director, 1st Class -	Rs. 2,250	35th	9-7-58	9-7-13	On leave.
2. C. Streatfeild-James. -	Ditto. -	2,250	34th	18-4-59	18-4-14	
3. R. O. Lees -	Director, 2nd Class -	2,000	34th	17-10-58	17-10-13	Officiating, 1st Class.
4. I. C. Thomas -	Ditto. -	2,000	32nd	4-4-61	4-4-16	
5. J. W. Hensley -	Director, 3rd Class -	1,750	34th	10-3-58	10-3-13	On leave.
6. H. S. Styant -	Ditto. -	1,750	31st	16-12-61	16-12-16	Officiating, 2nd Class.
7. H. E. Chappel -	Ditto. -	1,750	30th	8-3-63	8-3-18	
8. J. M. Coode -	Director, 4th Class -	1,500	28th	13-11-65	13-11-20	Officiating, 3rd Class.
9. R. T. Gibbs -	Ditto. -	1,500	27th	20-5-65	20-5-20	On leave.
10. M. G. Simpson -	Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.	1,600 in the 1,500-2,250 grade.	26th	3-11-66	3-11-21	
11. H. C. A. Goodall -	Director, 4th Class -	1,500	27th	9-6-66	9-6-21	On leave.
12. R. Elrington -	Superintendent -	1,250	31st	22-6-61	22-6-16	Superseded.
13. W. P. Henderson -	Ditto. -	1,250	25th	6-6-68	6-6-23	Superseded.
14. R. Meredith -	Ditto. -	1,250	24th	21-5-67	21-5-22	Officiating Director, 3rd Class.
15. C. W. Sowerby-Coo	Ditto. -	1,250	23rd	15-3-69	15-3-24	Officiating Director, 4th Class.
16. H. Mayston -	Ditto. -	1,250	23rd	30-1-68	30-1-23	On leave.
17. W. Sutherland -	Ditto. -	1,250	22nd	16-12-70	16-12-25	Officiating Postmaster-General and considered as absorbing one officiating vacancy in 4th Class of Telegraph Director.
18. L. Truninger -	Ditto. -	1,250	22nd	29-9-70	29-9-25	Officiating Director, 4th Class.

The circle organisation was in force for too short a time to afford trustworthy data of the years of service in which officers could fairly expect officiating and permanent promotion to the various administrative grades. It seems, therefore, best to consider the cases of a few individual officers. Mr. Meredith, for example, who has just entered his 24th year of service, is already officiating as Director, 3rd Class, on a salary of Rs. 1,750 and, if he remains in the service, must become substantive Director 4th Class, on the 10th March 1913, when Mr. Hensley has to retire. He would receive substantive promotion to the 3rd Class on the 18th April, 1914 in his 25th year of service after the retirement of Messrs. Dempster, Lees and Streatfeild-James and would probably have been officiating in the 2nd Class before that date. His promotion to the substantive rank of Director, 2nd Class, would be due at the latest on the 8th March 1918 in his 29th year of service and his substantive promotion to the 1st Class on the 13th November 1920 in his 32nd year of service. It is almost certain, however, that Mr. Gibbs will retire before he attains 55 years of age and in view of this and other unforeseen casualties it is not only possible, but highly probable, that, if the present system of administration remained untouched, Mr. Meredith would reach the 2nd and 1st Class considerably earlier than in his 29th and 32nd year of service, respectively, and he would certainly officiate in those classes before March 1918 and November 1920.

Mr. Sutherland was appointed to officiate as Director, 4th Class, on the 13th July 1911 in his 20th year of service and, even if no unforeseen casualties

occurred, would become substantive Director, 4th Class, on the 18th April 1914 in his 23rd year of service; 3rd Class on the 8th March 1918 in his 27th year of service; 2nd Class on the 13th November 1920 in his 30th year of service; and 1st Class on the 21st May 1922 in his 31st year of service. Mr. Coode, who is already Director, 4th Class, must attain the rank of Director, 3rd Class, on the 10th March 1913, in his 28th year of service; 2nd Class on the 18th April 1914 in his 29th year; and 1st Class on the 16th December 1916 in his 32nd year. Mr. Gibbs, if he remains in the service, must receive promotion to the 3rd Class of Directors at the latest on the 9th July 1913 in his 27th year of service, to the 2nd Class on the 4th April 1916 in his 30th year; and to the 1st Class on the 8th March 1918 in his 32nd year of service.

Taking the cases of these particular officers as examples, it would seem necessary to allow the various rates of pay of the existing administrative appointments to be attained in the following years of service provided that vacancies existed and that the officers to be promoted were considered fit for administrative rank :—

Grade of Rs. 1,500 = officiating 21st year: substantive 23rd year.

Grade of Rs. 1,750 = officiating 23rd year: substantive 25th year.

Grade of Rs. 2,000 = officiating 25th year: substantive 28th year.

Grade of Rs. 2,250 = officiating 28th year: substantive 31st year.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

I therefore propose the adoption for all officers now serving in the Telegraph Department of the following scale of pay above Rs. 1,250.

No. of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	CONDITIONS OF APPOINTMENTS.	
		Permanent.	Officiating.
1	Rs. 2,750 - - -	No condition - - -	No condition.
1	{ 2,250 Imperial 1,800 Provincial }	Not less than 30 years' service -	Not less than 27 years' service.
2	{ 2,000 Imperial 1,600 Provincial }	" " 27 " " -	" " 24 " "
4	{ 1,750 Imperial 1,400 Provincial }	" " 24 " " -	" " 22 " "
3	{ 1,500 Imperial 1,200 Provincial }	" " 22 " " -	" " 20 " "

In this scale the value of the appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief has been taken at rather less than the mean of the sanctioned pay and has been converted into a fourth appointment on Rs. 1,750 a month. The present incumbent, Mr. Simpson, would have to be given the option of remaining on his present incremental scale of pay or of electing for the revised rates of pay. In the latter case he would take his place in the seniority list immediately below Mr. Gibbs, and his pay would be regulated accordingly.

The officer holding the appointment of Chief Engineer would receive the pay fixed for that appointment (Rs. 2,750) without any restriction as to length of service, but all other officers now in the Telegraph Department would draw pay strictly in accordance with the above scale, irrespective of the duties on which employed, and subject only to the proviso that Government were satisfied that they were in every way fit for promotion and that they had the qualifying service. The ten officers in receipt of these special rates of pay would, however, always be employed as far as possible in the more important appointments under the scheme of amalgamation. Three would hold the proposed appointments of Director, Telegraph Engineering, and, so long as more than four of the present superior officers remained in the service, one of the excess would hold the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic, another would be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma, and a third would practically always be employed as officiating Postmaster-General in some other circle. The remainder of the officers drawing the special rates of pay would be employed in the most suitable manner possible, probably as Chief Electrician and in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta, Bombay and Madras, but as the total number of officers now in the service fell below eleven, these appointments would be filled by officers on the rate of pay fixed for such appointments under the amalgamation scheme. If my proposals in respect of the continuation of the present administrative rates of pay are sanctioned, it will be necessary to provide that, if a vacancy in the proposed scale of pay (whether permanent or officiating) cannot be filled owing to the next senior qualified officer being ineligible by length of service, the remaining vacancies in the chain should be filled as if the ineligible officer had been promoted. For example if there were an officiating vacancy on Rs. 2,250 and the next senior officer fit for promotion had not completed 27 years' service, the vacancy on Rs. 3,250 would remain unfilled, but officiating promotions would be made to the Rs. 2,000 and lower grades, if qualified officers were forthcoming, exactly as if the vacancy on Rs. 2,250 had been filled.

It is of course practically impossible to calculate with any degree of accuracy the financial effect of the adoption of the foregoing proposal, but, as I shall show later in this letter, the services of about 71 of the present superior telegraph officers will be retained after amalgamation is affected, and all these officers have to leave the service before normal conditions will be attained.

This will probably take over 20 years and the maximum cost of continuing these higher rates of pay in the manner recommended by me, over and above the cost of the ultimate establishment proposed for the combined departments, should therefore be Rs. 3,750\* a month or Rs. 45,000 a year to commence with, decreasing annually after a certain number of years until it finally disappeared in about 24 years. Against this extra expenditure has to be set the saving on account of the Postmaster-Generals which one, and later two, telegraph officers will hold.

## IV.—RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING.

38. Proportion of subordinates to be promoted to superior establishment of Engineering Branch.—In connection with the last reorganisation of the Telegraph Department the Government of India in paragraph 31 of their despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 153-Salaries, dated 1st July 1909, laid considerable stress on the desirability of the admission of subordinates to the superior grades of the department and recommended that, while five-eighths of the superior establishment should be recruited from England, one-fourth should be obtained in India and one-eighth by promotion from the subordinate ranks. On the assumption that the annual recruitment of four officers would be necessary to keep the department up to strength this arrangement would result in the promotion on the average of a subordinate once in every two years. I consider that the arguments stated in the despatch referred to above in favour of the promotion of subordinates to an establishment responsible for both engineering and traffic work, apply with equal force to their promotion to a purely engineering cadre, and I am firmly convinced that it will always be possible to select one subordinate every two years who is qualified for promotion to the superior establishment of the proposed Engineering Branch. This establishment will, however, be reduced under the proposals contained in this letter by slightly more than one-half, and it is unlikely that the annual recruitment of more than two telegraph engineer officers will be necessary in future. I recommend therefore that the proportion of the superior staff of the Engineering Branch to be recruited by promotion from the subordinate ranks should be fixed at one-fourth, and that one-half of the establishment should be recruited from England and the remaining one-fourth in India. In paragraph 20 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913-918-115, dated the 2nd February 1910, a promise was made to the subordinates that one-eighth of the vacancies in the superior establishment would be filled by promotions from the subordinate ranks as soon as the excess in the sanctioned strength of officers then existing was absorbed. As, however, recruitment has

\* Cost of present 11 administrative appointments (Rs. 21,000) less cost of four proposed administrative appointments (Rs. 7,500) less maximum pay of seven telegraph superintendents (Rs. 8,750).



APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

been stopped for a considerable time pending the decision on the question of amalgamation, no such promotion has been made as yet, although the excess was absorbed some time ago, and in consequence there is a general feeling among the subordinate staff that the undertaking of the Government of India in this respect has not been fulfilled. There are several upper subordinates now in the service who are believed to be in every respect fitted for appointment to the superior Engineering Branch and I propose, in pursuance of the undertaking given by Government in 1910, that before the method of recruitment described above is brought into effect, three of them should be promoted in the first three vacancies that occur in the superior establishment of the Engineering Branch after the scheme is sanctioned. With this exception the procedure for recruitment described in the Government of India despatch in question, modified as regards appointments in India in the manner directed in paragraph 7 of the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 24-Tel., dated the 3rd December 1909, should remain unaltered and, ordinarily, one officer will be recruited from England annually, the second vacancy yearly being filled by the appointment direct to the Provincial Service of a candidate selected in India and by the promotion to that service of a selected subordinate, alternately.

The question whether the proportion of appointments to be filled by promotions from the subordinate ranks is sufficient should, in my opinion, be reconsidered at the end of seven years, by which time the Director-General will be in a position to report fully on the manner in which these officers have acquitted themselves in their higher appointments and the number of subordinates who have been found qualified to fill these appointments, and also whether any improvement in the class of recruits has resulted from the promotion of subordinates to the superior grades.

I may add that the subordinates selected for promotion to the superior engineering establishment will invariably be men of marked ability, and they will almost invariably be Deputy Superintendents whose pay in their own grade does not exceed Rs. 370 a month. Thus they can be brought on to the time scale of pay of the Provincial Service at the point prescribed by the Civil Service Regulations without affecting adversely the prospects of superior officers of six years' standing and upwards then in the service.

**39. Training and Examination of Officers appointed direct to superior establishment of Engineering Branch.**—As regards the training of officers appointed direct to the superior establishment of the proposed Engineering Branch I consider it necessary, with the object of ensuring that only really suitable officers are retained in the department, to recommend the adoption of more stringent and definite rules than those at present in force. Under the existing system officers appointed direct to the present superior establishment are attached to some large construction work for three months' training in construction duties and then to one of the Presidency telegraph offices for twelve months for training in signalling, traffic management and signal office routine. They are not eligible for their third increment under the time scale of pay until they have qualified in signalling and (if not Indians) have passed in Hindustani by the lower standard, but they are not required to pass a professional examination nor are they required to show that they have any knowledge of accounts. I consider, however, that on the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department with the Post Office and the separation of engineering and traffic work, an officer appointed direct to the superior establishment of the Engineering Branch, whether in England or in this country, should first be attached for a period of six months to the office of the Chief Electrician for a course of instruction in signalling, technical telegraphy (including the adjustment of instruments and apparatus), the nomenclature and care of telegraph stores, and the more important processes of the telegraph workshops. He should then be employed on divisional engineering work in such a manner as will afford him every

opportunity of gaining experience of the work of a telegraph engineer, and should be required to pass, within three years of joining the department, not only the examination in signalling and the lower standard examination in Hindustani required by the existing rules, but also a professional examination similar to that prescribed for assistant engineers of the Public Works Department. The examination should be such as to show that he has an intimate knowledge of the modes of telegraph and telephone construction in use in India; the material used and the sources from which obtained; the management of line staff; the testing of lines; the adjustment and care of all telegraph instruments and apparatus in use in India; and that he is thoroughly acquainted with the accounts rules of the department and the forms of account in use. The examination may be conducted by the Director of Telegraph Engineering in whose administration the candidate is serving; but, as in the case of the Public Works Department, a candidate should not be permitted to appear for it until a special report by his Divisional Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering on points of qualification which cannot be tested by examination such as physical energy, efficiency in practical work and capacity to manage subordinates has been submitted to, and found satisfactory by, the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs. Any increments falling due after the prescribed period of three years should be withheld until the examination is passed, subject, however, to the conditions that the Director-General may, in special cases, afford an officer a reasonable extension of the period of three years without enforcing the penalty of the loss of increments, and may, at his discretion, restore an officer whose increments have been withheld to the position in the incremental scale which he would have held but for his failure to pass the prescribed examination within the prescribed period.

**40. Recruitment and Training of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, should, I consider, be recruited and trained in exactly the same manner as the present Deputy Superintendents, General, except that subordinates of the Technical Branch as well as inspecting Telegraph Masters and Inspecting Telegraphists should be considered eligible, and should be encouraged to qualify, for selection as Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.

**41. Recruitment and Training of Officers for the superior Traffic Branch.**—In the case of the superior Traffic Branch the majority of the appointments will be filled, as the surplus staff of officers belonging to the present superior and upper subordinate establishment is exhausted, by the selection of specially qualified officers from the upper subordinate and subordinate signalling staff of the department. I consider it necessary, however, partly in order to guard against any possibility of a dearth of suitable officers for the highest traffic appointments and partly with a view to obtaining from other sources, including other telegraph administrations, the services when necessary of officers possessing special qualifications, that the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs should be at liberty to make direct appointments to the superior Traffic Branch from outside the ranks of the signalling establishment. It appears to me to be undesirable to place any restrictions on the powers of the Director-General to make such appointments but, if the Government of India consider a limit necessary, I would suggest that he should be given authority to recruit from outside sources not more than one-fourth of the total establishment sanctioned for the superior Traffic Branch. Ordinarily these outsiders would be appointed on probation on a pay of Rs. 200 a month, but it might be advisable occasionally to obtain from England an officer who would enter the scale at any stage considered suitable and take his position accordingly in the seniority list. The probationers as well as the officers selected for trial in the superior Traffic Branch from other branches of the Telegraph Department should be attached to the Chief Electrician's office at Alipore for a course of instruction in signalling and in technical subjects and be employed

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

subsequently during the early stages of their service in the superior Traffic Branch in such a manner as will afford them opportunities of making themselves thoroughly acquainted with traffic control and the management and administration of telegraph offices. All of these officers should be required within two years of their appointment to the branch to pass an examination which will be such as to test their knowledge of the Traffic Instructions, the Telegraph Guide, the code rules relating to the management of telegraph offices and the control of office establishment, the system of accounts and the various forms connected therewith. An officer who fails to pass this departmental examination within the prescribed period, unless it is specially extended by the Director-General, should be reverted to his permanent appointment and in the case of a probationer his services should be dispensed with.

An officer selected from the British Post Office for service in this branch otherwise than as a probationer, would ordinarily be brought out on an agreement for a term of years and provision would be made in his agreement that the retention of his services in India on its termination would be dependent on his passing the departmental examination within the prescribed period. An officer appointed on probation on the special pay of Rs. 200 a month would be transferred to the sanctioned establishment of the superior Traffic Branch in the first permanent vacancy that occurred after he had passed the departmental examination. Subordinates promoted to the superior Traffic Branch will be considerably older than probationers, and if the casualties in the branch average about seven in four years as may be assumed, it would not ordinarily be necessary to recruit a probationer more frequently than about once in four years, and the probationary appointment on Rs. 200 will therefore usually remain unfilled for about two years out of four. Provision has accordingly been made in estimating the financial effect of the amalgamation scheme for only one-half of the cost of this appointment.

**42. Appointments and Promotions requiring the sanction of the Government of India.**—All first appointments to the superior service of the Engineering Branch and promotion to administrative posts in that branch should in my opinion be approved and notified by the Government of India as in the case of the existing superior establishment of the Telegraph Department. As regards the proposed superior Traffic Branch, however, I recommend that the procedure followed in respect of the higher appointments in the Post Office should be adopted, and that the sanction of Government should be obtained only in the case of first appointments (permanent or officiating) to the post of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic, or to the upper division of the branch and in the case of grade promotions in that division which involve supersessions. All other appointments and promotions should, I consider, be left to the Director-General to deal with as in the case of corresponding officers in the Post Office.

## V.—UTILISATION OF EXISTING STAFF.

**43. Number of superior officers of the Telegraph Department now in the service who can be employed in appointments provided under the scheme of amalgamation.**—Under the proposals contained in the preceding paragraphs the sanctioned establishment of superior officers of the Telegraph Department will be reduced from 96 to 46, the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, from 72 to 58 and that of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, from 55 to 51, while the temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic will be abolished, making a total reduction of 69 appointments against which it is proposed to create one appointment of Deputy Superintendent in the Technical Branch and 40 appointments in the superior Traffic Branch. Included in the latter are 21 important appointments which can suitably be filled by superior officers not required for the separate Engineering Branch, namely, those of the

Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic; the Superintendents in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Agra; the Deputy Postmasters-General in charge of the Traffic Branch in each postal circle; and the senior assistant to each of these Deputy Postmasters-General. For these appointments I propose to select 21 of the superior officers now in the service who are considered best fitted for traffic work. These officers will be retained in the Traffic Branch for the remainder of their service on the pay which they would get under the existing system, that is, their pay under the time scale of pay or the special rates of pay which I have proposed in paragraph 37 of this letter to provide for the 11 senior officers so long as any of the present superior officers remain in the service. As far as possible these selections will be made with the consent of the officers. The advantage of utilising the services of the surplus officers in this way is obvious and the arrangement also ensures that the Traffic Branch will be administered properly from the first, and that the selection of subordinates for these higher appointments will be a gradual process as it ought to be. Except in very special circumstances no officer, who is selected for traffic work, should be transferred subsequently to the Engineering Branch, as otherwise promotion to executive rank in that branch would suffer and recruitment would be interrupted. Moreover, the work of the officers selected for the superior Traffic Branch will be more efficient if their future prospects are bound-up with that branch. The more junior of the superior officers now serving will be selected as far as possible for appointments as assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, or as these particular officers will be styled, Assistant Postmasters-General, Traffic, but in order that their prospects of advancement may be as good in the Traffic Branch as if the present system had remained in force, it will be necessary to abolish in their case the bar in the time scale of pay under which an officer is not permitted to go beyond the pay of the eleventh year of service unless he is in charge of a division or its equivalent and to rule that all officers belonging to the present superior service employed in the superior Traffic Branch should be granted all increments under the time scale of pay as they become due, provided their work is satisfactory. Without this provision it would be impossible to induce officers of the existing cadre to join the Traffic Branch, and it is but fair to maintain the present prospects of the officers who will be selected for this branch from the existing superior staff.

One other of the surplus superior officers can be suitably employed as Superintendent of Stores in the appointment of Chief Storekeeper sanctioned in the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 24-Tel. of the 3rd December 1909, and I recommend that a second superior officer should be employed to assist the Superintendent of Stores so long as the services of a surplus officer of the rank of Assistant Superintendent are available. The Store Branch of the Telegraph Department is in urgent need of a complete reorganisation, and this opportunity should be taken to afford the officer in charge, who is greatly overworked, some relief so as to enable him to devote more time to the really salient questions of administration. This important branch of our organisation, I am bound to say, has not received proper attention in the past, and it is essential in the interests of economy that it should have an adequate controlling staff. It should be directly under the Director-General.

If the proposal in paragraph 37 to retain 11 highly paid appointments for the existing staff of telegraph officers is sanctioned, I recommend that one of the officers on such pay should be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma. The appointment will be an acting one for some time as the first three permanent vacancies in the staff of Postmaster-General should be filled by departmental officers. Messrs. Tulloch and C. C. Sheridan would certainly have been recommended to Government for substantive promotion to Postmaster-General to fill the vacancies caused by the retirement of Mr. Jardine and myself in 1913, and Mr. Schone-

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

man would have been recommended for similar promotion when Mr. Tulloch retired in March 1914. I consider, therefore, that in view of the undertaking given by the Government of India that all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the staff of both the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, these three officers should be provided for before a Postmaster-Generalship is permanently filled by one of the telegraph officers referred to above. Further, I propose that when a suitable opportunity occurs, another of these telegraph officers should be utilised in filling one leave vacancy of Postmaster-General which would not in the ordinary course be due to a departmental officer of the Post Office, and thereafter it is likely that it will always be practicable to provide for this second officer of this rank without affecting the prospects and claims of departmental officers of the Post Office. In effect, these two telegraph officers will take the place of civilians for the time being.

While holding the appointment of Postmaster-General a telegraph officer will draw his telegraph pay, whether he is filling a permanent or an officiating vacancy. In the former case he will absorb one appointment of Postmaster-General in the grade to which he would have been promoted from time to time if he had been appointed Postmaster-General on the ordinary scale of pay, and his name will be shown accordingly in the seniority list. The proposal that a telegraph officer holding a Postmaster-Generalship should draw his own pay is made in order to ensure that existing telegraph officers should have as nearly as possible the same prospects of promotion as at present. This would not be the case if it were decided that a telegraph officer appointed Postmaster-General should draw the postal pay as he might at some stage be in receipt of less than his telegraph pay, and acting promotions of telegraph officers would also be affected. It can be arranged without difficulty that the officer selected for appointment as Postmaster-General will be drawing not less than Rs. 1,750, the minimum pay proposed for Postmasters-General, thus avoiding any risk of the complaint that such an officer is inadequately remunerated for the class of work he has to perform.

44. Under the above proposals the services of 25 of the surplus superior officers of the Telegraph Department who will become supernumerary to the authorised establishment can be utilised with advantage until they retire or die. The question of the treatment to be accorded to the remainder of the surplus has been dealt with separately in paragraph 46.

A statement is attached (Annexure III., Statement C) showing exactly how it is proposed to dispose of the existing staff of superior officers and Deputy Superintendents.

45. **Number of upper subordinates of the Telegraph Department now in the service who can be employed under the amalgamation scheme.**—After providing for the employment of 21 superior officers of the Telegraph Department 19 appointments in the proposed superior Traffic Branch remain unfilled. Two of these, namely, the Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and the assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, I propose should be filled by the appointment of one officer outside the establishment of the Telegraph Department and of the existing temporary Assistant Director of Traffic. The remaining 17 appointments will be filled by specially selected Deputy Superintendents of the present Traffic, Technical and General Branches. Fourteen appointments of Deputy Superintendent, General, will remain surplus after the requirements of the Engineering Branch have been met, but two or three of these appointments which are now vacant will not be filled in the meantime, and it will be possible to select about nine Deputy Superintendents, General, for permanent appointment to the superior Traffic Branch. Thus there will remain only two or three Deputy Superintendents, General, unprovided for, and the services of these officers will be utilised temporarily, one in the Technical Branch

against the additional appointment of Deputy Superintendent proposed for that branch, and the remaining one or two in telegraph offices in place of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, selected for the superior branch. These officers will remain on their present scales of pay, and will be treated in every way as if the present cadre of 72 Deputy Superintendents, General, had remained unaltered, that is, they will be treated as supernumerary Deputy Superintendents, General, temporarily employed as Deputy Superintendents, Traffic or Technical. They will return to engineering work as soon as there are suitable vacancies for them in the reduced cadre of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and the appointments in the Traffic and Technical branches temporarily held by them will then be filled up in the ordinary way. The reduction by four of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, necessitated by the transfer to the superior Traffic Branch of the charge of the Rangoon, Lahore, Delhi, and Karachi telegraph offices will be effected immediately by the transfer of four Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, to the new superior branch, and the promotion of junior Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, to take their places in the higher grades, leaving four vacancies in the lowest grade unfilled. I may point out in this connection that the reduction of four appointments in the present establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, will not affect adversely the prospects of men already in the service, owing to the fact that the total number of higher appointments, for which members of the signalling branch will be eligible, will be materially improved by the formation of the superior Traffic Branch.

## VI.—REDUCTION OF EXISTING STAFF.

46. **Retirement on Special Pensions of Surplus Staff of Superior Officers.**—In the preceding paragraphs, I have shown that the establishment proposed for the combined Post and Telegraph Departments will absorb the whole of the sanctioned staff of both departments, with the exception of 50 officers of the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, and that the services of 25 of these officers can be suitably utilised in Postmaster-General's appointments, in the new superior Traffic Branch and in the Stores Branch. Including one apprentice Assistant Superintendent, who will very shortly qualify for permanent appointment, the total strength of the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, owing to the cessation of recruitment during the last few years, is at present only 88 against a sanctioned establishment of 96. The actual surplus staff of superior officers for whom it is not possible to provide appointments under the amalgamation scheme is, therefore, only 17, and against this surplus has to be set the compulsory retirement during 1913 of Messrs. Hensley, Dempster and Lees on attaining 55 years of age. It would be extremely wasteful to retain for an uncertain period 14 highly paid officers as supernumerary to the proposed establishment, and, in view of the undertaking given to the staff of both departments in January last that their interests and prospects would be protected, I would be averse from selecting 14 officers for compulsory discharge with compensation pensions under Article 427 of the Civil Service Regulations. I therefore recommend the offer in general terms for a specified period from the date on which amalgamation is effected of such special pensions as will be likely to induce the requisite number of officers to retire voluntarily. In 1887 it was decided to provide some special inducements for the retirement of officers of a certain standing in the Telegraph Department in order to remove a block of promotion, and the terms offered in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Public Works Department, No. 136-T. E., dated the 21st October 1887, were that for a period of six months all officers who had served for 18 years, of which not less than 16 years had been spent on active service, would be considered eligible for retirement on the following terms:—

(a) The pension which would be due if the officers were retiring on medical certificate.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

(b) An additional pension calculated at the following rate :—

To officers under 50 years of age—Rs. 1,000 per annum.

To officers in their 51st year—Rs. 900 per annum.

“ “ 52nd “ “ 800 “ “

“ “ 53rd “ “ 500 “ “

Officers who had completed their 53rd year were given no extra pension, but were permitted to retire within the prescribed period under the provisions of clause (a) above, and the special terms were applicable subject to certain conditions to officers who completed the qualifying period of service at a date subsequent to that of the resolution quoted.

On the 1st April next the 31 officers shown in the statement annexed to this letter (Annexure III., Statement B.) will have completed 18 years' total service. Of this number, two will retire in the ordinary course in July and October 1913, and one other, Mr. Streatfeild-James, will be nearly 54 years of age, and will be due to retire in April 1914. Of the remainder I have every reason to suppose that at least 13 officers whose services could be spared would apply to be permitted to retire if special inducements were offered similar to those sanctioned in 1887, and I strongly recommend that they should be given an opportunity of doing so. I do not think that it would be necessary to extend these inducements to officers who had not actually completed the qualifying service on the date on which the orders regarding amalgamation are published. I propose that the concession should be granted subject to the conditions in clauses III. and IV. of the Resolution of the 21st October 1887, and that it should be limited to officers who have the qualifying service on the date of the publication of orders on this scheme, and who submit their resignations within six months from that date.

I am not in a position to say which officers would tender their resignations if the above proposals were accepted, or which of the resignations submitted would be accepted, and I am, therefore, unable to estimate the financial effect of the proposal. It seems probable, however, that the majority of the 13 officers, whose retirements it is hoped to effect by these special inducements, would retire in any case as soon as they had completed the qualifying service for the maximum pension admissible under Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations, and the effect of offering the special terms proposed will probably not add very greatly to the pensionary charges of the Telegraph Department. If 16 officers do not retire by the time the scheme of amalgamation is brought into effect, the number of supernumerary officers referred to in paragraph 44 will be increased temporarily.

## VII.—SPECIAL ADDITIONAL PENSIONS.

**47. Special Additional Pensions now Admissible.**—Under the provisions of Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations, special additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,000 a year are admissible to officers of the Telegraph Department appointed in England as rewards of approved service in certain positions, and on the reorganisation of the department in 1910 the Government of India ruled, in Mr. Ley's letter No. 4010-108, dated the 31st May 1910, that the following officers should be considered eligible for these pensions :—

(a) Officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year to those who have rendered three years' approved services as Director-General or as next senior officer in the department (two appointments).

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered approved service as Directors of Telegraphs, 1st, 2nd and 3rd class; the senior Director of Telegraphs, 4th class; or the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief (eight appointments).

(b) Officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective service as Director-General; Directors of Telegraphs, 1st and 2nd class, or the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, provided that in the case of the latter the three years of service have been rendered on a pay of not less than Rs. 1,950 a month (six appointments).

**Special additional pensions proposed for officers now in the service.**—These special additional pensions should continue to be admissible to officers appointed in England now serving in the Telegraph Department, and I accordingly recommend, subject to the present conditions :—

(a) In the case of officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year for three years' approved service as Chief Engineer or in any capacity on the proposed Rs. 2,250 grade.

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year for three years' approved service in the grades of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,750, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,500, the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief's appointment being considered as on Rs. 1,750.

(b) In the case of officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective service as Chief Engineer; in the grades of Rs. 2,250 and Rs. 2,000; or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,750.

I have already proposed that all superior officers of the Telegraph Department should retain their telegraph pay irrespective of the duties on which they are from time to time employed, and if this proposal is accepted, there is no necessity specifically to provide in the terms of Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations for telegraph officers holding the appointments of Postmaster-General or Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and it should be understood that the provisions under "Postal Department" in Article 475 do not apply to telegraph officers holding the appointments mentioned if such officers are ineligible for pensions under Articles 642 or 643 as modified above.

**48. Special additional pensions proposed for officers joining the service after amalgamation is effected.**—As regards the future I consider that the provisions in Article 643 of the Civil Service Regulations should cease to apply to officers appointed to the Telegraph Department after the amalgamation of that department with the Post Office, and that, from that date, the special additional pensions admissible to telegraph officers should be governed by the terms of Article 475 by the alteration of the sub-heading in that article from "Postal Department" to "Posts and Telegraphs" and the inclusion under the revised sub-heading of the appointments of Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, and Director, Telegraph Engineering, the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, thus being eligible for the extra pension of Rs. 1,000.

## VIII.—POWERS.

**49. Powers of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.**—I recommend that, for the present, the powers of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs should be, as regards the Post Office and its establishments, those which have from time to time been delegated to the Director-General of the Post Office, and, as regards Telegraphs and the establishment connected therewith, the present powers of the Director-General of Telegraphs increased, in respect of the appointment of signal office clerks and telephone operators, to the extent recommended in my letter No. 221-C. T., dated the 29th July 1912. A

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

statement of these powers, so far as expenditure of post office and telegraph funds is concerned, is annexed to this letter (Appendix IV., Statement A). The only important difference between the powers exercised by the Director-General of the Post Office and the Director-General of Telegraphs, respectively, is in regard to the entertainment of additional establishment, and I do not consider it possible to assimilate the powers of the Director-General in this respect under the two heads until greater experience of the requirements of the Telegraph Department has been gained and trustworthy data accumulated.

**50. Powers of Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and Postmasters-General.**—The powers now exercised by the Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs should, I consider, be delegated to Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and the powers of the latter officers, where applicable, should also be exercised by the Chief Electrician, the Superintendent of Stores (or Chief Storekeeper) and the Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops. Postmasters-General should be given the powers, in respect of telegraph traffic, exercised by Directors of Telegraphs under the existing system. I recommend, however, that these powers as defined in Appendix II. to the despatch to the Secretary of State No. 153-Sals., etc., dated the 1st July 1909, should be modified, from the date on which the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department is effected, to the extent shown in italics in the further statement annexed to this letter (Annexure IV., Statement B). These modifications, so far as items 1, 4, 9, 13, 14, 19, 21, 26, 38 (in the case of Divisional Superintendents' powers only), 42 (in the case of the Superintendent of Workshops only), 43, 45, 48, 50, 53, 58, 60, 62, 71, 72, 75, 79, and 80 are concerned, have already been effected and the remainder are alterations which the experience gained during the last few months has shown to be necessary.

**51. Additions to powers of Postmasters-General in respect of Post Office Administration.**—I recommend that the powers mentioned in items 12, 61, and 77 of this statement should also be exercised by Postmasters-General in the local administration of the Post Office in order to bring their powers in this respect into line generally with the powers which it is proposed should be exercised by Postmasters-General in the administration of telegraph traffic.

## IX.—ACCOUNTS AND BUDGET ALLOTMENTS.

**52. General procedure for the preparation of accounts and allotment of budget grants.**—I recommend that, for the present, separate accounts should be maintained for the Post Office and for the Telegraph Department, and that the budget estimate for the two departments should be prepared separately. The details of the alterations in accounts procedure that will be necessary will be settled in communication with the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, when the orders of the Government of India on the proposals contained in this letter have been received. The general arrangement will be that Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be provided with funds in respect of engineering work only, including the first fitting of offices. The balance of the funds at present allotted to Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents which will represent establishment and contingent charges on account of the traffic staff and telegraph offices, will be placed at the disposal of the Postmaster-General. Postmasters-General will take the place of Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents in all accounts matters pertaining to traffic management and the maintenance of telegraph offices, and the additional funds necessary for this purpose will be allotted to them from the budget grants provided under the head "Telegraphs." They will keep the separate accounts of the expenditure of these funds now maintained in the Telegraph Department, including a cash book, and will submit these accounts direct to the

audit office. The re-allotment of funds to telegraph offices now effected by Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents will be made by Postmasters-General from the grants placed at their disposal. All officers in charge of telegraph offices will send their accounts direct to the audit office as at present. Practically the whole of the telegraph expenditure controlled by Postmasters-General will be chargeable to "Revenue."

**53. Allocation of salaries of staff.**—The salaries of all officers and menials employed solely in connection with telegraph work, including the clerical establishment of the traffic branch of Postmaster-General's offices, should be debited to "Telegraphs," and should, as far as possible, be paid in such a manner that no accounts adjustments between that head and the head "Post Office" will be necessary.

The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and the Postmasters-General will be engaged on both postal and telegraph work and their salaries should, therefore, be debited partly to "Post Office" and partly to "Telegraphs." Under the instructions contained in Mr. Ley's letter to the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, No. 3026-33, dated the 17th April 1912, my salary, whilst I am in charge of the current duties of the office of the Director-General of Telegraphs, in addition to my duties as the Director-General of the Post Office of India, is being divided between the heads "Post Office" and "Telegraphs" in the proportion of two-thirds and one-third, respectively, and the same proportion has been adopted for the division of the salaries of the Postmasters-General, Bombay and Central Circles, during the experimental amalgamation in those circles. On the other hand the salary of the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, and the charges on account of his office establishment are divided between the two heads in the proportion of four-fifths and one-fifth. I am not aware of the considerations on which the latter proportion was based, but the Accountant-General informs me that considerably more than one-third of his time is taken up by telegraph work and he suggests that a proportion of two-thirds and one-third should be adopted for all cases in which a division of charge on account of salaries is necessary. In 1911-12, the gross revenue receipts of the Telegraph Department amounted to Rs. 1,42,74,275 and those of the Post Office to Rs. 3,20,40,516, and according to these figures the proportion suggested by the Accountant-General appears to be justified. It might reasonably be argued that amalgamation with the Telegraph Department should not relieve the Post Office of anything more than the cost of the revision of salaries necessitated by this measure, and this amounts to Rs. 24,983.3—22,772.5 = 2,210.8, or rather more than one-eleventh of the total of the salaries proposed in this letter for the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and Postmasters-General (including the two Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office of India). It is desirable, however, that the allocation should be the same in every case and it is suggested, as a fair arrangement, that the salaries of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, the ten Postmasters-General and the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, and the cost of the Accountant-General's office establishment should all be debited to "Post Office" and "Telegraphs" in the proportion of four-fifths and one-fifth, respectively.

A fixed contribution (Rs. 28,800) towards the cost to the Post Office of central, controlling and accounts offices is already made by the Telegraph Department in the grant provided by the latter for the working charges of combined offices, and this will continue to be made. No other adjustment between the accounts of the two departments appears to be necessary.

## X.—CLERICAL AND MENIAL ESTABLISHMENTS.

**54. Strength and Grading of Clerical Establishment.**—The question of the clerical establishment required for the offices of the three Directors and twenty Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering and



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

for the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices under the scheme of amalgamation has been discussed in detail with each Postmaster-General and Circle

## Present Distribution.

BOMBAY CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	44
CENTRAL CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	
MADRAS CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	30

Total - - - - - 74

PUNJAB CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	31
UNITED PROVINCES CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	26

Total - - - - - 57

BENGAL CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	29
EASTERN BENGAL AND ASSAM	-	-	-	-	-	-	24

Total - - - - - 53

BURMA CIRCLE	-	-	-	-	-	-	28
--------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

Total - - - - - 28

GRAND TOTAL - - - - - 212

Director and the unanimous conclusion, in which I agree, is that the existing establishments should be distributed as follows :—

## Proposed Distribution.

Director, Telegraph Engineering	-	-	-	-	-	-	7*
Postmaster-General, Bombay	-	-	-	-	-	-	12
" " Central	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
" " Madras	-	-	-	-	-	-	12
Bombay Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
Ajmere Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Nagpur Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Coimbatore Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Bangalore Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Madras Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4

Total - - - - - 65

Director, Telegraph Engineering	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
Postmaster-General, Punjab	-	-	-	-	-	-	12
" " United Provinces	-	-	-	-	-	-	10
Karachi Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Delhi Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Lahore Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Lucknow Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Allahabad Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

Total - - - - - 54

Director, Telegraph Engineering	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
Postmaster-General, Bengal	-	-	-	-	-	-	14
Postmaster-General, Eastern Bengal and Assam	-	-	-	-	-	-	9
Calcutta, West Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
" East Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Darjeeling Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
Dacca Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Shillong Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

Total - - - - - 53

Postmaster-General (for Engineering and traffic work)	-	-	-	-	-	-	11
Akyab Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Mandalay Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Maymyo Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
Rangoon Division	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

Total - - - - - 28

GRAND TOTAL - - - - - 200

With the above distribution there will be a saving of 12 clerks on the present sanctioned establishment of 212 clerks shown in Statement C. of Appendix IV. to the despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 153-Salaries, dated the 1st July 1909. The reduction should, in my opinion, be made in the first instance in the lowest grade of circle and divisional office clerks on Rs. 35 a month, in order to prevent injury to the prospects of the clerks already in the service, and later it may be possible to make a proportionate reduction in the higher grades. Some additional clerical assistance will, however, be required in the majority of the offices detailed above during the transition period, and it may be found necessary to allot temporarily an additional clerk to those engineering divisions in which an attached officer has to be permanently stationed away from headquarters (for example at Quetta in the Karachi Division). I recommend, therefore, that the present sanctioned establishment of 212 clerks should remain unaltered on the understanding that it will be reduced as much, and as quickly, as circumstances will permit. The reductions effected will be reported to Government, and I anticipate an eventual saving under clerical establishment of at least 12 appointments on Rs. 35 a month representing Rs. 5,040 a year.

The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to Postmasters-General for telegraph traffic work will be added to the sanctioned establishment of their

offices, and the clerks themselves should be graded for promotion in these establishments. The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to the offices of Directors, Telegraph Engineering (the Engineering Branch of the Postmaster-General's office in the case of the Burma Circle), and to Divisional Offices should be graded in four separate cadres under the heads of the four engineering circles, by whom promotions, postings, grant of leave, payment, &c., should be controlled in exactly the same manner as the cadres of circle and divisional office clerks are controlled by the present Circle Directors.

The clerical establishment sanctioned in Mr. Ley's letter No. 7391-91, dated the 18th October 1910, for the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief should, I consider, be transferred to my office, where the greater part of the clerical work of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief (deputations, postings and promotions of the staff of the Technical Branch) will in future be performed, and in this case arrangements will be made to supply from my office a suitable clerical staff for the Chief Electrician at Alipore. The latter officer will require the assistance of about two clerks, and a separate establishment for this purpose would not be satisfactory.

55. Grant of concessions to clerks transferred from one station to another.—I also recommend that, as in the case of the experimental amalgamation in

\* Two of these to be transferred from the office of the existing Director of Telegraphs, Madras Circle.



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

the Bombay and Central Circles, any clerk, whom it may be necessary under the amalgamation scheme to transfer to another station, should be granted an advance of one month's pay recoverable in six equal monthly instalments; and that any clerk transferred over a distance exceeding 500 miles should be granted a bonus of two months' pay, subject to a maximum of Rs. 100, and on the understanding that the concession will be refused by the head of the office from which such clerk is transferred should no extra expenditure be caused to the clerk by the transfer.

56. **Distribution of menial establishments.**—As regards menial establishments arrangements will be made to provide a suitable staff of peons, etc., for the offices required under the amalgamation scheme from the establishment of the existing circle and divisional offices. The experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles has resulted in a slight reduction in the number of office servants, and it is probable that a corresponding saving will be effected in each of the other circles, but the establishment cannot be definitely fixed until amalgamation has been effected, and the actual requirements of officers and offices are known. It is probable, however, that it will be possible under peons alone to dispense eventually with the services of twenty of the men included in the present sanctioned establishment of 163 on rates of pay varying from Rs. 9 to Rs. 15 a month.

57. **Grant of concessions to peons transferred to new stations.**—It will be necessary to transfer a certain number of divisional office peons from places at which there will be no divisional offices under the amalgamation scheme and, as such men will be entitled to one fare only of the lowest class, I recommend the grant to them of a bonus of—

- (a) one month's pay, if the distance over which the man is transferred is not more than 500 miles, and
- (b) two month's pay, if the distance exceeds 500 miles.

## XI.—FINANCIAL EFFECT.

58. **Ultimate and immediate financial effect.**—The financial effect of the foregoing proposals, as shown in the proposition statement annexed to this letter (Annexure III, Statement D), will be an ultimate saving of about Rs. 2,98,472 a year, but this amount does not include the savings which have already been reported to the Government of India as actually effected in the Telegraph Department since the 1st April last, when the administration of that Department and of the Post Office were brought together under one Director-General, viz., Rs. 12,000 a year on account of the reduction of temporary clerical establishment in the offices of Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents and Rs. 3,828 a year in the cost of the office establishment of the Director-General of Telegraphs. Moreover, it does not take into account the savings which will be effected in travelling allowances by the reduction in the number of superior officers of the Telegraph Department and the abolition of the touring staff of the Technical Branch, the savings in the rental of office accommodation which will result from the reduction in the number of circle and divisional telegraph charges, nor the savings on account of the anticipated reduction in the permanent clerical and menial establishments sanctioned for the Telegraph Department. The first of these items of saving cannot be estimated; the second will probably exceed Rs. 15,000, the present average expenditure under this head being over Rs. 20,000 a year; the third will amount to Rs. 7,524, the rent of the buildings shown in the margin, and the last will be not less than Rs. 7,500 a year. The total ultimate saving effected by amalgamation will therefore amount to at least Rs. 344,324 a year. This sum leaves out of account the saving of Rs. 50,000 already effected this year in the printing and stationery charges of the Telegraph Department, as it cannot be definitely stated that this saving will be permanent although I have every hope that it will be so, especially as I have arranged to depute an officer for some months to reduce the number of forms and to check the waste which undoubtedly takes place in the larger telegraph offices.

	Rs.
Belgaum Division - - -	45 a month.
Burma Circle } - -	300 "
Rangoon Division }	
Moulmein Division - - -	52 "
Jubbulpore " - - -	50 "
Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle - - -	70 "
Calicut Division - - -	30 "
Vizagapatam Division - - -	30 "
Bareilly Division - - -	50 "
	627

Against the savings has to be placed the expenditure involved in the grant to clerks and menials of the bonus recommended in paragraphs 55 and 57 of this letter. The cost of this concession cannot be calculated, but it will probably be less than Rs. 7,000. The estimated saving will also be reduced for a number of years by additional pensionary charges on account of officers retiring prematurely under the provisions proposed in paragraph 46; by the continuation to officers now in the service of the rates of pay of ten of the existing administrative appointments referred to in paragraph 37; and by the employment, so long as the superior engineer officers are in excess of the establishment proposed for the Engineering Branch, of a number of officers whose emoluments will exceed the salaries which will eventually be attached to the traffic and minor engineering appointments in which the services of these officers have to be utilised in the manner described in paragraph 43. The effect of these three proposals cannot be estimated with any degree of accuracy, but it is certain that the adoption of my scheme for the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department will result in an immediate substantial saving to Government, which will increase materially as the officers now in the service retire or die.

I would explain that, in estimating the financial effect of my proposals, the average value of each appointment, under both the existing and the proposed scales, has been calculated in accordance with the usual rules except in the case of the superior service (Imperial and Provincial) of the Engineering Branch and the superior Traffic Branch. In the case of the Provincial Service of the Engineering Branch the average value of Rs. 621 calculated in the enclosure to the dispatch to the Secretary of State No. 11-Sals., etc., dated the 18th January 1912, has been adopted; while in the case of the Imperial service of the Engineering Branch and in the case of the second division of the superior Traffic Branch, the average value of the time scales of pay has been calculated in a similar manner (Appendix III, Statement E) by taking the distribution of officers over each year of service according to the Life and Service tables of the Government of India. This explains why the figure now adopted for the average pay of the superior officers of the Imperial Service differs from the average value shown in Appendix IV, Statement A, to the despatch to the Secretary of State No. 153-Sals., dated the 1st July 1909.

## XII.—DATE OF EFFECT AND PROVISIONAL ARRANGEMENTS.

59. **Necessity for introduction of scheme at earliest possible date.**—In paragraph 4 of Mr. Ley's letter No. 4393-101, dated the 7th June 1912, the Government of India directed that the experimental arrangements sanctioned for the Bombay and Central Circles should remain in force until the question of their permanency had been decided. Under the scheme now recommended the Madras Circle will be linked with these circles for engineering and technical work, and it would obviously be inconvenient to make any change in the experimental arrangements in force in the latter until the orders of Government on the proposals made in this letter are received. In the case of the other six circles, however, the cessation of recruitment during the past few years has reduced the establishment of superior telegraph officers to a number considerably below that actually required, and the continuance of the present system of telegraph administration for anything more than a short period

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

will certainly necessitate either the resumption of recruitment for the superior staff of the Telegraph Department or the stoppage of all leave to officers of the department. Moreover the staff of both the departments under my charge are naturally extremely anxious about their future position and prospects, and it is very desirable, in my opinion, that amalgamation should be effected at the earliest possible date. I therefore strongly recommend that, if the Government of India approve generally the arrangements now proposed by me, they may be introduced from the 1st April 1913, if practicable; and that if, as seems possible, it is decided to refer my proposals on the subject of the establishment to the Royal Commission which will shortly commence their enquiries in respect of the public services in India, I may be authorised to proceed with the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department on the lines proposed, including the reduction of superior staff and appointments to the superior Traffic Branch on the rates of pay recommended for that branch, as a provisional arrangement subject to such alterations as regards personnel and pay as may be decided upon after consideration of the recommendations of the Commission.

60. **Period required for preliminary arrangements.**—The arrangements for amalgamation recommended in this letter are such that they can be introduced at any time without risk of dislocation of public business, and I need only request that, if the proposed amalgamation is approved, whether provisionally or permanently, the date of effect fixed by the Govern-

ment of India may be one that will leave me two months in which to form an idea as to the officers of the Telegraph Department who can be permitted to avail themselves of the special terms for retirement which it is proposed to offer to officers for a certain standing, to select the most suitable of the remaining officers for the new administrative and executive charges, and to make all other preliminary arrangements.

## XIII.—CONCLUSION.

61. In conclusion, I desire to express the great obligation under which I lie to the Honble. Mr. W. Maxwell, C.I.E., M.V.O. My task of administering the two departments, reorganising the Telegraph Department, and working out the scheme contained in this letter has been an extremely heavy one and, but for his efficient help, in every direction, it would not have been possible to avoid delaying this scheme so long as to promote discontent and suspicion. It is also only right that I should say that most of the details of the scheme have been devised and worked out by Mr. Maxwell from beginning to end, my share in them being confined to criticism and approval.

Mr. Ivor Thomas, M.V.O., and Mr. R. Meredith have all along been in the closest personal touch with us. They have been consulted on every detail, every point has been discussed with them at length, and their valuable counsel and assistance have been ungrudgingly given on all occasions.

I have, &c.,

C. STEWART-WILSON,  
Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

## SCHEDULE OF ENCLOSURES.

- ANNEXURE I.—Letters from public bodies in Bombay and Central Circles regarding experimental amalgamation. (*Not reprinted.*)
- ANNEXURE II.—Letters from Postmasters-General and Superintending Engineer, Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, and from the Accountant General, Post Office and Telegraphs, regarding experimental amalgamation. (*Not reprinted.*)
- ANNEXURE III.—Statements A, B, C, D, and E. General and financial effect of proposals. (A, B, C, and E *not reprinted.*)
- ANNEXURE IV.—Statements A and B. Schedules of powers of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, Postmasters-General, and Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, &c. (*Not reprinted.*)

## ANNEXURE III.

## STATEMENT D.

*Statement showing the ultimate cost of the revised Establishment.*

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.
Director-General of the Post Office of India.	1	3,000 for 5 years and thereafter Rs. 3,000—100—3,500.	3,166·6	Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.	—	3,500—100—4,000	3,833·3
Postmaster-General	1	2,250—50—2,500	2,416·6	Postmaster-General	2	2,500	5,000
" "	3	1,750—50—2,000	5,749·8	" "	2	2,250	4,500
" "	6	1,500—50—1,750	9,999·6	" "	3	2,000	6,000
Two "Local allowances for Deputy Directors - General, Post Office.	—	200	400	" "	3	1,750	5,250
Exchange compensation admissible on the average pay of permanent Director-General and Postmasters-General.	—	6½ per cent.	1,261·7	Two Local allowances for Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office.	—	200	400
				<i>Remainder of Post Office appointments unchanged.</i>			
				ENGINEERING.			
Director-General of Telegraphs.	1	3,000	3,000	Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.	1	2,750	2,750
Exchange compensation allowance.	—	—	138·9	Director, Telegraph Engineering.	1	2,000	2,000
Director of Telegraphs.	2	2,250	4,500	" " "	2	1,500	3,000

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

## STATEMENT D.—cont.

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.
Director of Telegraphs.	2	Rs. 2,000	Rs. 4,000	Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering (including Chief Electrician and one Assistant and also the Personal Assistant to the Director-General and the assistant to the Chief Engineer.)	24	Rs.	Rs.
" " "	3	1,750	5,250	21 Imperial at 866·5.			18,196·5
" " "	3	1,500	4,500	21 Provincial at 621.			13,041
Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.	1	1,500—50—1,750 100—2,250	1,875	Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	18		
Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents. } Imperial officers	48	866·5	41,592				
Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents. } Provincial	36	621	22,356	Two local allowances for the Chief Electrician and his senior Assistant.	—	100	200
				Two local allowances for the Personal Assistant to the Director - General, the assistant to the assistant to the Chief Engineer.	—	100	200
				One local allowance for the junior Assistant Electrician.	—	50	50
Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250	1,030	Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250	1,030
Chief Storekeeper.	1	600—40—800	733·3	Chief Storekeeper.	1	600—40—800	733·3
Deputy Superintendents, General.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6	Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6
" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000	" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000
" " "	48	250—15—325	14,400	" " "	34	250—15—325	10,200
				Four local allowances for Personal Assistants to Directors, Telegraph Engineering.	—	50	200
Deputy Superintendent, Technical.	1	400—25—500	473·2	Deputy Superintendent, Telegraphs, Technical.	1	400—25—500	473·2
" " "	2	325—15—400	750	" " "	2	325—13—400	750
" " "	3	250—15—325	900	" " "	4	250—15—325	1,200
				Traffic.			
				Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	1	1,750—50—2,000	1,916·6
				Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.	2	1,200—40—1,400	2,666·6
				Superintendents, Calcutta, Bombay and Madras offices.	4	1,000	4,000
				Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	6	800	4,800
				Local allowance for Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	—	150	150

APPENDICES.

APPENDIX I. (continued).

STATEMENT D.—cont.

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.
				Assistant to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office Traffic.			
				Superintendents, Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi offices.	27	250—15—400	12,375
				Superintendents of post offices, Traffic, in offices of Post-masters-General.		400—20—700 at Rs. 458·5	
				Assistant Superintendents, Calcutta and Bombay offices.			
				Local allowance for Assistant to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	—	100	100
				Probationary appointment, superior Traffic Branch.	—	$\frac{1}{4}$ of 200 = 100	100
Deputy Superintendent, Traffic.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6	Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, Traffic, in other offices not named above.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6
" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000	" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000
" " "	*32	250—15—325	9,600	" " "	27	250—15—325	8,100
Remainder of Telegraph Appointments unchanged.							
Total	243	—	1,57,663·9	Total	215	—	1,32,791

Saving of 28 appointments and of Rs. 24,872·7 a month or Rs. 2,98,472 a year.

Certified that the entries in the column "Present scale" have been checked and found correct.

CALCUTTA,  
7th November 1912.

S. LEVETT-YEATS.  
Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs.

\* One of these appointments is held vacant against a temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic at the headquarters of the Director-General.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

(ii) *Despatch from the Secretary of State for India, To His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council, Telegraph No. 5, dated India Office, London, 6th March 1914.*

## AMALGAMATION OF THE POSTAL AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENTS IN INDIA.

MY LORD,

I HAVE received and very carefully considered in Council the letter from Your Excellency's Government, No. 324, Finance, of the 30th October last, submitting for my approval a scheme for the permanent amalgamation of the postal and telegraph departments in India.

2. I agree with your Government that the proposals have been formulated by Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson with great thoroughness and mastery of the subject, and, subject to the following observations, I sanction them. I have already communicated to you my general approval of them in my telegram quoted in the margin.\*

3. There are certain matters referred to in the 16th paragraph of your letter, such as the Director-General's proposals regarding the financial powers of certain officers and regarding clerical and menial establishments which you state that you have not yet fully considered. I am willing that you should deal separately with these matters so far as they are within your powers, but for such as may be beyond those powers I will await your specific recommendations.

4. You also state in paragraph 5 that the new scheme will make necessary some slight amendments in the Post Office and Telegraph Acts, and that these will be undertaken in due course. You further promise (paragraph 8) in connection with the proposals for the staff at headquarters that you will examine the position afresh after two years' time with a view to considering whether any reduction can then be effected. I will await your report on the result of this examination.

5. In paragraph 13 you refer to the question of recruitment, and your recommendations in the matter are provisional, and subject to the result of the inquiries of the Public Services Commission. It is on this understanding that my sanction is given.

6. In paragraph 14 you request sanction to the continuance as part of the Telegraph Establishment of the appointment of a Royal Engineer Officer for

the charge of wireless stations in India. I approve this arrangement.

7. The proposals summarised in paragraph 12 of your letter for determining the future salaries of officers at present in the Department appear to me adequate if not generous; and I consider that promotions to a higher rate of pay according to the scale proposed should be subject to the continued efficiency of the officer in question, and that if an officer has been passed over for an appointment which if held by an officer not at present in the service would be paid at Rs. 1,750—2,000, he should not be allowed to draw higher pay than Rs. 1,750, unless subsequently promoted.

8. In respect of compensation pensions, it will no doubt be your intention that inefficient officers should be compulsorily retired under the ordinary rules and should not be considered entitled to the additional pensions now proposed. In reference to the proposal that officers desirous of accepting the special terms of retirement should be allowed to take any leave they may have to their credit, I have no objection provided that the compensation pension is that due in respect of the age of the officer in question when he actually retires.

9. While agreeing to your proposals for the special pensions of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,000 to officers at present in the service, I desire that the qualification of "approved service" should be strictly insisted upon, and that no officer who has been passed over for promotion from the Rs. 1,750 grade, and no officer in that grade at the end of his service who is not declared by the Director-General to be fitted for promotion, should be considered entitled to the special pension.

10. Referring to the statement in the twelfth paragraph of your letter that it is hoped to find employment for one of the redundant officers in a State Railway Telegraph appointment, I desire that the advantage of such transfers should carefully be borne in mind so long as the redundancy of officers continues.

11. Finally, I take note of the belief you express that the amalgamation of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments will not excite serious opposition and discontent among the members of either Department, and I trust that this will be found to be the case.

I have the honour to be,

My Lord,

Your Lordship's most obedient  
humble servant,

(Signed) CREWE.

\* From Secretary of State to Viceroy, Finance Department, 17th February 1914.

Your Despatch, dated 30th October, No. 324, Post Office and Telegraph Department. I sanction introduction of scheme from 1st April next, subject to modification that special pensions granted to officers under paragraph 12, clause 1, of your letter shall be determined by their age on actual retirement, and subject also to my further orders regarding pay of Chief Engineer and appointments which are to qualify for special pensions under Articles 642 and 643, Civil Service Regulations.

(iii) *Government of India Resolution No. 3062—3066-101 (Department of Commerce and Industry, Post and Telegraph Establishments), dated Simla, the 24th April 1914.*

In the Resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, it was announced that, as a preliminary step in the direction of the ultimate amalgamation of the postal and telegraph services in India, the administration of the two existing Departments of Posts and Telegraphs, would, as an experimental measure, be brought together under one head. It was further decided that a single officer of tried administrative capacity should be entrusted with the duty of formulating and carrying out an experimental scheme for the fusion of the two services. Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson, who was then Director-General of the Post Office of India, was selected to hold charge of the combined office of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs with effect from the 1st April 1912.

2. The scope of the experimental scheme devised, with the assistance of the Honourable Mr. Maxwell, C.I.E., M.V.O., by Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson, and

sanctioned by the Government of India, was restricted to the Bombay and Central Postal and Telegraph Circles. It was introduced with effect from the 1st July 1912, and has continued in force since that date.

3. The main principles of the scheme referred to above, and the question of its extension to the whole of India as a permanent measure, were fully discussed with numerous officers of all ranks of the two departments and with members of the commercial community. Expressions of opinion on the experiment were also invited from the general public. Opinion, both official and non-official, has been uniformly and thoroughly favourable. The Government of India have therefore had no hesitation in concluding that the experiment has yielded a full measure of success. Accordingly, with the assent of His Majesty's Secretary of State for India, they have decided that the system which has been in force in the Bombay and Central Postal and Telegraph Circles since the 1st July 1912, shall, sub-

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

ject, particularly in Burma, to certain modifications in minor matters of detail, be finally adopted throughout British India with effect from the 1st April 1914.

4. It was explained in the Resolution of January 1912, referred to above, that the amalgamation of the two services in question involved a complete separation of the Engineering from the Traffic work of the Telegraph Department. The following details indicate the manner in which this is to be effected :—

I. The appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs will be finally abolished, and that of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, which was tentatively created with effect from the 1st April 1912, will become a permanency. The pay of the Director-General will be Rs. 3,500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 4,000 a month, and he will not be entitled to exchange compensation allowance.

II. At Headquarters the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs will be assisted in the administration of the telegraph service by the following staff of officers :—

- 1 Chief Engineer of Telegraphs.
- 1 Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering as Personal Assistant to the Director-General.
- 1 Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering as Assistant to the Chief Engineer.
- 1 Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.
- 1 Officer of the first division of the superior Traffic branch which will now be formed, as Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.
- 1 Officer of the second division of the superior Traffic branch as Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.

The tenure of the appointments of Personal Assistant to the Director-General and Assistant to the Chief Engineer will ordinarily be limited to three years.

III. The appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will be abolished, but three engineering officers will be provided to assist and advise the Director-General and the Chief Engineer in special technical matters, to carry on research work and test instruments in the Store Yards at Alipur, to conduct classes for instructions in technical matters, and to hold technical examinations. Two of these officers will be of the same rank as Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering, and will be designated "Chief Electrician" and "Assistant Electrician" respectively, while the third officer will be of the rank of Assistant Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering, and will be designated "Assistant Electrician." The services of an officer of the Royal Engineers will continue to be placed at the disposal of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs so long as required.

IV. The administrative control of the telegraph engineering work will comprise four charges, namely :—

- (a) The Bombay Postal Circle (less the late Karachi Telegraph Division), and the Central and Madras Postal Circles.
- (b) The Punjab Postal Circle (with the addition of the late Karachi Telegraph Division), and the United Provinces Postal Circle.
- (c) The Bengal and Assam and the Bihar and Orissa Postal Circles (which take the place of the Bengal and the Eastern Bengal and Assam Postal Circles).
- (d) The Burma Postal Circle.

The three first-named charges will be placed under officers of the standing of the present Directors of Telegraph Circles. These three officers will be styled "Directors, Telegraph Engineering." They will control the entire engineering staff within the limits of their charges, and will be responsible not only for the design, construction, and maintenance of telegraph and telephone lines, but also for the first fitting of telegraph offices, the fitting up and working of telephone exchanges, the erection and maintenance of power plant, and all other circle work which at present devolves on the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief. The administrative control of telegraph engineering in the Burma postal circle will be placed in the hands of the Postmaster-General, who will, for the present, be one

of the surplus telegraph officers referred to in paragraph 8 of this Resolution. This circle cannot conveniently be linked for engineering purposes with any of the other provinces; its postal and telegraph work is at present comparatively light, and can all be undertaken by one officer with engineering knowledge, while the engineering duties alone would not justify the employment of an administrative engineering officer.

V. Directly subordinate to the Engineering administrative officers, there will be 20 charges, in each of which the Engineering work will be under the control of an officer of the same standing as a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs under the present system of administration, assisted by a sufficient staff of junior officers (Assistant and Deputy Superintendents). The officers holding these charges will be designated Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering. They will occupy, in regard to Engineering and Technical work, exactly the same position as that now held by Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs in respect of Engineering and Traffic work. In Burma they will, in addition to their Engineering duties, continue to be responsible, as explained in VII. below, for some of the Traffic work which in other Circles is to be separated entirely from Engineering duties. The designations of officers appointed to assist the Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be, for officers of the superior service, Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering, and for upper subordinates, Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering. The sanctioned staff of such officers will consist of 17 Assistant Superintendents and 37 Deputy Superintendents. Four more Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be employed as Personal Assistants to Directors of Telegraph Engineering and the Postmaster-General, Burma, six in the Store Depôts at Alipore, Rangoon, Bombay, and Madras, and 11 as a special staff, from which three will be allotted to each of the Directors of Telegraph Engineering, and two to the Postmaster-General, Burma, for employment on special works. The time scales of pay now in force for the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department will be retained for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering; but in the case of efficient officers already in the service, the condition will be waived that no officer shall draw more than the pay of the 11th year of service unless he holds a divisional charge or a charge which is recognised as of equal importance.

VI. The greater part of the duties hitherto assigned to the superior staff of the Technical branch will be transferred to the Engineering branch, and the Technical branch will in future consist only of the Deputy Superintendents and subordinates employed in the branch. The number of Deputy Superintendents will be increased from six to seven. Their designation will be changed to Deputy Superintendents—Telegraphs (Technical), and they will be employed, two at Headquarters under the orders of the Chief Electrician, and one each in the Bombay, Madras, Calcutta, Lahore, and Rangoon Telegraph offices under the orders of the Directors—Telegraph Engineering (in Burma, the Postmaster-General). The present sanctioned staff of 34 subordinates, styled Technical Telegraph Master or Telegraphist, will remain unaltered.

VII. Traffic work will be controlled at Headquarters, under the Director-General, by the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic referred to under subparagraph (II.) above; and the Traffic work which has hitherto been performed by Directors and Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs will pass to the control of the Postmasters-General in charge of the eight existing Postal Circles. Each Postmaster-General will be given the services, for Telegraph Traffic work, of an officer of about the standing of a Deputy Postmaster-General, with the following staff of Assistants :—

Bombay Circle	-	-	-	-	3
Central Circle	-	-	-	-	2
Madras Circle	-	-	-	-	3
Punjab Circle	-	-	-	-	3
United Provinces Circle	-	-	-	-	2



## APPENDIX I. (continued).

Bengal and Assam Circle - - -	4
Bihar and Orissa Circle - - -	1
Burma Circle - - -	1

By Traffic work is meant the disposal of all questions connected with the establishment of Government Telegraph Offices, whether departmental or combined, the supervision and control of all telegraph work performed inside such offices excepting the maintenance of wireless and other telegraph apparatus (such as Baudot, Wheatstone, repeaters, &c.), and the testing of lines in offices in which Technical branch men are not permanently employed. In the Burma Circle some Traffic duties will devolve on officers of the Engineering Branch. These officers will be required to inspect all departmental telegraph offices in that Province except Rangoon (with its local departmental offices), Mandalay, Moulmein, and Bassein, and to submit to the Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's office the inspection reports on these offices.

VIII. To provide a suitable staff of officers to control the larger telegraph offices and to assist the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and Postmasters-General, a separate superior Traffic Branch will be created consisting of the following 40 appointments :—

- (a) Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic, pay Rs. 1,750—50—2,000.
- (b) Superior Traffic Branch, First Division :—
  - 8 Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.\*
  - 3 Superintendents in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras Telegraph Offices.\*
  - 1 Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.\*
- (c) Superior Traffic Branch, Second Division :—
  - 2 Assistant Superintendents in the Calcutta and Bombay offices.†
  - 19 Superintendents of Post Offices, Traffic, as Assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.†
  - 5 Superintendents in charge of the Agra, Rangoon, Karachi, Lahore, and Delhi telegraph offices.†
  - 1 Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.†

Eventually this branch will consist of specially selected and trained traffic officers, and will be recruited as far as possible from subordinates selected at any stage of their service. All officers appointed to the second division of the branch, excluding the superior officers referred to below, who will draw travelling allowances at the rates at present admissible for Superintendents or Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs, will be treated as officers of the first class for purposes of the travelling allowance regulations the daily allowance admissible being that prescribed in Appendix 25 of the Civil Service Regulations for Superintendents of Post Offices, viz., Rs. 4 a day.

To commence with, 21 appointments in the superior Traffic Branch will be filled by superior officers now serving in the Telegraph Department, who would otherwise form a surplus owing to the reduction of the establishment of Directors, Superintendents, and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs. Such officers will serve on the pay to which they would have been entitled if they had been employed in the Engineering Branch, and will remain, except in very special circumstances, in the superior Traffic Branch, but, as far as possible, the selections for this branch will be made with the consent of the officers. Officers so selected will be granted all increments under the existing time scale of pay for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs as they become due, provided their work is satisfactory, and the rule under which an officer is not permitted to go beyond the pay of the 11th year of service, unless he is in charge of a division or its equivalent, will be waived in their case. Officers belonging to the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department who are employed as Assistants

\* First grade, two on Rs. 1,200—40—1,400; second grade, four on Rs. 1,000; third grade, six on Rs. 800.

† On a time scale of pay rising from Rs. 250 by annual increments of Rs. 15 to Rs. 400 and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 600 a month.

to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, will be designated Assistant Postmasters-General, Traffic.

5. The distribution and ultimate strength, pay, allowances, &c. of the staff of superior officers and upper subordinates sanctioned for telegraph work, will be as shown in the Annexure to this Resolution. The ultimate effect of the decisions set forth in the preceding paragraph will be the substitution of a staff of 46 Telegraph Engineers for the existing establishment of 96 superior Telegraph officers (excluding the Superintendent of Workshops and the Chief Storekeeper); the reduction of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering (hitherto termed Deputy Superintendents, General), from 72 to 58; the increase of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Technical, by one appointment; the reduction by five of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, employed in Telegraph offices, caused by the removal from this cadre of the appointments of Assistant Director of Traffic (temporary) and of Deputy Superintendents in charge of the Rangoon, Karachi, Lahore, and Delhi offices; and the creation of a new superior Traffic Branch consisting of 40 appointments; in all a net reduction of 28 appointments.

6. The establishments now sanctioned do not include leave reserves. In the case of the Engineering Branch the total number of officers present on duty will always be maintained at sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superintendents in the lowest grade to take the place of superior officers absent on leave, &c. Deputy Superintendents will not, however, be appointed to officiate as Assistant Superintendents. Temporary vacancies in the superior Traffic Branch caused by the absence of officers on leave, &c., will be filled by officiating appointments to that Branch, and any vacancies caused by such appointments will be filled in the usual manner.

7. On the Post Office side the only officers directly affected by the scheme of amalgamation herein described are the Postmasters-General. A revision of their pay has already been under contemplation. In view of their increased work and responsibility under the amalgamation scheme, it has been decided to adopt the following scale of pay of these officers, to whom no exchange compensation allowance will be admissible in future :—

	Rs.
2 appointments on - -	2,500 a month.
2 " " - -	2,250 "
3 " " - -	2,000 "
3 " " - -	1,750 "

The pay of these grades will be attainable by any officer holding the appointment of Postmaster-General, whether he be a member of the Indian Civil Service or promoted from the ranks of departmental postal officers. Officers of the Telegraph Department appointed to be Postmaster-General will continue to draw the pay to which they would ordinarily be entitled on the scales laid down for Telegraph officers.

8. The reductions in establishment referred to in paragraph 5 above cannot be effected at once owing to the pledge which has been given by the Government of India that in such steps as may be taken towards the amalgamation of the two services all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both Departments in all grades. The reductions in the establishments of Upper Subordinates will be made in the lowest grades, and will be effected at once, without detriment to the prospects of subordinates, by the transfer of 18 Deputy Superintendents from the present General and Traffic Branches to the superior Traffic Branch, and the temporary employment of three Deputy Superintendents, General, in vacancies in the revised cadres of Deputy Superintendents, Technical and Traffic. The surplus staff will be confined entirely to the superior establishment. Of this surplus 21 officers will be employed in the Superior Traffic Branch in the manner described in paragraph 4 (VII.) above; one will be employed as Chief Storekeeper, and one as Assistant to the Chief Storekeeper; one will be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma, and another will be employed as

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

Postmaster-General in some other circle as soon as a leave vacancy occurs which would not in the ordinary course be filled by a departmental officer of the Post Office. Other excess officers, who will mainly be officers on leave, will be treated as supernumerary to the sanctioned superior establishment of the Engineering Branch. To reduce this excess as rapidly as possible, the following rates of pension and leave concessions are offered as a special concession to senior officers in the Department :—

(I) All efficient officers of the Telegraph Department who have on the 1st April 1914 served for 18 years, of which not less than 16 years have been spent on active service, are eligible for retirement from the Department. Pension on the following scale will be granted to those officers whose resignation may be accepted :—

- (a) The pension which would be due under existing rules if the officers concerned were retiring on medical certificate.
- (b) An additional pension calculated at the following rate—

	Per annum.
	Rs.
To officers under 50 years of age	- 1,000
To officers in their 51st year	- 900
"      "      52nd "	- 800
"      "      53rd "	- 500

Provided that the resignation of the officers concerned is submitted to the Government of India within six months from the date of this resolution.

(II) When an officer has tendered his resignation through his superior officer, it is obligatory that the application should be submitted for the orders of the Government of India, and it cannot be cancelled except with the approval and sanction of Government.

(III) The Governor-General in Council reserves the right to accept or to refuse any application for retirement under these terms, or to postpone the date on which such retirement is to take effect, according to the interests of the public service.

(IV) Officers taking advantage of these concessions will be admitted to any leave that may be due to them preparatory to retirement, but the compensation pension granted will be that due in respect of the actual age on retirement.

9. There are at present 11 superior appointments of which the pay exceeds Rs. 1,250, and to which officers now in the service could reasonably have expected promotion under the present system. It will be seen that, in place of these, only five superior administrative appointments have been provided. In order to safeguard the interests of officers now in the service, and at the same time to guard against unduly rapid promotion consequent on the reduction in the cadre which the concessions mentioned in the last paragraph are expected to effect, it has been decided to adopt the following scale for all officers serving in the Telegraph Department on 31st March 1914.

Number of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Condition of Appointment.	
		Permanent.	Officiating.
1	Rs. 2,750 Imperial.	No condition	No condition.
1	Rs. 1,800 Provincial.	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.
2	Rs. 2,000 Imperial.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.
2	Rs. 1,600 Provincial.	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.
4	Rs. 1,750 Imperial.	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.
4	Rs. 1,400 Provincial.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.
3	Rs. 1,500 Imperial.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.
3	Rs. 1,200 Provincial.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.

The first appointment is that of Chief Engineer and is unconditional. The remaining appointments will be held, irrespective of the duties performed, by officers who have the necessary qualifying service. If a vacancy (whether permanent or officiating) in this scale cannot be filled owing to the next senior qualified officer being ineligible by length of service, the remaining vacancies in the chain will still be filled as though he had been promoted. For the purposes of this scale temporary officers who have been taken on to the permanent cadre will date their service from the time of joining the permanent establishment. This scale will continue in force as long as there remain in the Department any officers now in service who would, but for the amalgamation, have risen to enjoy the rates of pay hitherto admissible to the officers now holding the 11 administrative appointments in question. Promotions to a higher rate of pay according to the scale prescribed above will be subject to the continued efficiency of the officer in question.

10. All officers in receipt of pay at the rate of Rs. 1,500 and upwards, or the Provincial Service equivalent, will be eligible, irrespective of the duties on which they are employed, for daily allowance at the rate of Rs. 7.8.0 a day prescribed for Directors of Telegraphs in item 46 of Appendix 25 to the Civil Service Regulations.

11. Subject to any changes which may be necessary as the result of the inquiries instituted by the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India, the following principles will be observed in the recruitment of officers for the superior telegraph appointments. For the Engineering Branch, approximately one-half of the superior staff will be recruited from England, one-fourth in India, and the remaining one-fourth by promotion from the subordinate ranks; that is to say, ordinarily one officer will be recruited from England annually, the second vacancy in each year being filled alternately by the appointment direct to the Provincial Service of a candidate selected in India and by promotion to that service of a selected subordinate. In the case of the superior Traffic Branch the majority of the appointments will be filled, as the surplus staff of officers belonging to the present superior and upper subordinate establishments is exhausted, by the selection of specially qualified officers from the upper subordinate and subordinate staff of the Department. In order, however, to guard against the possibility of a dearth of suitable officer for the highest Traffic appointments, and with a view to obtaining when necessary from other sources, including other telegraph administrations, the services of officers possessing special qualifications, the Director-General will be at liberty to make direct appointments to the superior Traffic Branch from outside the ranks of the signalling establishments at any position in the scale which may be considered suitable. Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be recruited in exactly the same manner as the present Deputy Superintendents, General, except that subordinates of the Technical Branch as well as Inspecting Telegraph Masters and Inspecting Telegraphists will be eligible, if qualified, for selection as Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.

12. The introduction of the scheme described above will necessitate a redistribution of the clerical and menial establishments of the present Telegraph Department. Any clerk whom it may be necessary to transfer to another station will be granted an advance of one month's pay recoverable in six equal instalments, and any clerk transferred over a distance exceeding 500 miles will be granted a bonus of two month's pay, subject to a maximum of Rs. 100, provided that it is shown that the clerk has actually incurred extra expenditure owing to his transfer. Ultimately certain reductions will be effected in the strengths of the clerical and menial establishments, but their extent cannot at present be determined. In any case due regard will be paid to the interests of men now in the service. The appointment of the clerks allotted permanently to Postmasters-General for Telegraph

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

Traffic work will be added to the sanctioned establishment of their offices, and the clerks themselves will be graded for promotion in these establishments. The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to the offices of Directors, Telegraph Engineering (the Engineering Branch of the Postmaster-General's office in the case of the Burma Circle) and to the Divisional Offices will be graded in four separate cadres under the heads of the four Engineering Circles, by whom promotions, postings, grant of leave, payment, &c., will be controlled in exactly the same manner as the cadres of Circle and Divisional Office clerks are controlled by the present Circle Directors. The clerical establishment sanctioned for the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will be transferred to the Director-General's Office, where the greater part of the clerical work of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will in future be performed, and arrangements will be made to supply from the Director-General's Office a suitable clerical staff for the Chief Electrician at Alipore.

13. The headquarters of officers in the Traffic Branch, except in the cases of officers employed in telegraph offices, will be the headquarters of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General, as the case may be. In the case of the Engineering Branch, the headquarters of the Chief Engineer and his Assistant and of the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs will be those of the Director-General. All the officers employed at the headquarters of the Director-General will, as at present arranged, accompany the Government of India to Simla every year, with the exception of the Assistant to the Chief Engineer and either the Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic or the Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic. The headquarters of the three Directors of Telegraph Engineering will be fixed at Bombay, Lahore (ultimately Delhi), and Calcutta, and those of the Divisional Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering at the following places:—

1. Bombay, Central and Madras Circle—(a) Bombay; (b) Ajmere; (c) Nagpur; (d) Trichinopoly for the present, but Coimbatore when office accommodation is available; (e) Balgalore; and (f) Madras.
2. Punjab and United Provinces Circle—(a) Karachi; (b) Delhi; (c) Lahore; (d) Lucknow; and (e) Allahabad.
3. Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle—(a) and (b) Calcutta; (c) Darjeeling; (d) Dacca; and (e) Shillong.
4. Burma—(a) Rangoon; (b) Akyab; (c) Maymyo; and (d) Mandalay.

The area of the divisions generally will be greatly increased under this scheme. It will, therefore, probably be necessary in the majority of divisions to station at least one attached officer to the Engineering Branch at some place other than the Headquarters of the Division. These postings will be left to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs to be made according to actual requirements in each case.

14. Under Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations certain officers of the Telegraph Department, in accordance with present orders, are eligible for certain special additional pensions. The reorganisation of the Department and the abolition of certain posts render a revision of these orders necessary. It has accordingly been decided that additional special pensions shall continue to be admissible as follows to

officers who were eligible for special additional pensions under Articles 642 and 643:—

(a) In the case of officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year for three years' approved service as Chief Engineer or in any capacity on the Rs. 2,250 grade.

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year for three years' approved service in the grades of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,750, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,500, the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief's appointment being considered as on Rs. 1,750.

(b) In the case of officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective and approved service as Chief Engineer in the grades of Rs. 2,250 and Rs. 2,000, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,750.

(c) No officer who has been passed over for promotion from the Rs. 1,750 grade, and no officer in that grade at the end of his service who is not declared by the Director-General to be fitted for promotion, will be considered entitled to the additional special pensions referred to above.

15. The terms stated in the preceding paragraph are applicable to those officers who were employed in the Telegraph Department on the 31st March 1914, and who are eligible to attain to the special rates of pay mentioned in paragraph 9 above. The grant of additional special pensions to officers appointed subsequently to that date in the posts of Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, Director, Telegraph Engineering, and Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic, will be governed by the provisions of Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations.

16. The scheme of amalgamation above described closely resembles the systems in force in the United Kingdom, Holland, Belgium, and Italy, where Engineering and Traffic Officers are as far as possible employed solely on duties for which they are recruited and specially trained, and it is believed that a three-fold advantage will accrue therefrom. From the point of view of the State, the redistribution of duties, and in particular the abolition of dual control in combined offices, will undoubtedly result in increased economy and efficiency. The public at the same time will reap the advantage of the greater telegraph and telephone facilities which may be expected to result from the increased efficiency of the administration. Finally, the scheme not only assures adequate protection of their prospects to all Telegraph officers now in service, but it also offers them a more congenial range of duties, while affording, for the first time, to competent subordinates a prospect of advancement to well-paid appointments. The Governor-General in Council desires to take this opportunity of expressing his very high appreciation of the manner in which Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson and the Hon. Mr. Maxwell have dealt with the many important and difficult problems involved in the formulation of the scheme of amalgamation now finally approved. In the opinion of the Government of India the scheme adequately provides for the interests of the officers of both Departments while affording an improved service to the public, combined with an ultimate saving in annual expenditure.

## APPENDIX I. (continued).

## ANNEXURE.

Statement showing the Designation of, and other Particulars relating to, the Appointments of Officers to be employed exclusively on Telegraph Work.

Designation.	Number of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Local or other Allowances.	Remarks.
<i>Engineering and Technical Branches.</i>				
Chief Engineer, Telegraphs -	1	Rs. 2,750		
Director, Telegraph Engineering -	1	2,000		
" " "	2	1,500		
Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering (including Chief Electrician, and one Assistant; also the Personal Assistant to the Director-General, and the Assistant to the Chief Engineer).	24	380—40—700— 50—1,250 (Imperial Service) 21 appointments.	Rs. 100 each, as local allowances for the Chief Electrician and his senior Assistant, the Personal Assistant to the Director-General, and the Assistant to the Chief Engineer.	
Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	18	250—25—450  500—35—850 (Provincial Service) 21 appointments.	Rs. 50 as local allowance for the Junior Assistant Electrician.	
One officer of the Royal Engineers for work in connection with the Wireless Telegraph Stations in India.	1	*	- - - - -	*On scale of pay admissible to Royal Engineer Officers employed in the Public Works Department.
Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250		
Chief Storekeeper -	1	600—40—800		
Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	8	400—25—500	Rs. 50 each, as local allowances for the Personal Assistants to the three Directors, Telegraph Engineering, and the Postmaster-General, Burma Circle.	
" " "	16	325—15—400		
" " "	34	250—15—325		
Deputy Superintendent, Technical -	1	400—25—500		
" " "	2	325—15—400		
" " "	4	250—15—325		
<i>Traffic Branch.</i>				
Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	1	1,750—50—2,000		
Deputy Postmasters - General, Traffic.	2	1,200—40—1,400		
Superintendent(s), Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras Offices.	4	1,000		
Assistant Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	6	800	Rs. 150, as local allowance for the Assistant Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	
Assistant to the Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic -				
Superintendent(s), Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi offices	27	250—15—400, 400—20—600.	Rs. 100, as local allowance for Assistant to the Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	
Superintendent(s) of Post Offices, Traffic, in offices of Postmasters-General				
Assistant Superintendent(s), Calcutta and Bombay offices -				
Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, Traffic in other offices not named above.	8	400—25—500		
" " "	16	325—15—400		
" " "	27	250—15—325		

## APPENDICES II. AND III.

## APPENDIX II.

*(Referred to in paragraph 75,187—Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.)*

EXTRACT FROM THE GAZETTE OF INDIA, dated September 20th, 1913, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

*The Hon'ble Mr. Abbott asked :—*

Is there a fund termed "The Guaranteed Fund" accumulated from the earnings of the employees of the Postal Department?

"Will the Government be pleased to state what the present value of this Fund is?"

"Is it a fact that it has become so unwieldy, that a new Fund has had to be opened to divert some of the accumulations for the better handling of the same?"

"Will Government kindly say what it is proposed to do with this sum of money?"

"Will the Government kindly say if to its knowledge a similar Fund exists in any other country in the world?"

*The Hon'ble Mr. Clark replied :—*

Owing to the length of the answer to this question, the information required is laid on the table in the form of a statement :—

(1) There is a Fund called the "Post Office Guarantee Fund" which was started on the 1st January 1883 with the sanction of the Government of India. The following subscriptions were required to be paid by persons employed by the Post Office in appointments below the grade of Deputy Postmaster-General :—

(i) By superior servants excluding postmen and village postmen—the sum of one rupee half-yearly.

(ii) By postmen or village postmen, whether superior or inferior servants, and by inferior servants drawing monthly salaries of more than Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7)—the sum of eight annas half-yearly.

(iii) By inferior servants drawing monthly salaries of Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7) and less, and by any person receiving allowances of Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7) and less from the Post Office,—the sum of four annas half-yearly.

These rates of subscriptions were reduced by one-half in 1894 and the collection of subscriptions to the Fund has been suspended altogether since 1905. Thus a large proportion of the officials now in the service of the Post Office have never subscribed to the Fund.

This Fund took the place of another Fund known as the "Post Office Security Fund," which was established on the 1st April 1873. The latter was of the nature of a Departmental Mutual Society and provided for the realization of enforced subscriptions from persons in the employ of the Post Office, in lieu of the Security which they had previously been required to furnish. Subscriptions from the pensionable class were returnable on resignation or death of subscribers in the proportion borne by the surplus income to the total income of the Fund, but subscriptions from the non-pensionable class were not returnable at all.

Having regard to the serious pecuniary responsibilities devolving on postal employes owing to the introduction of the insurance, money order, value-payable and Savings Bank branches of business, it

was decided, in December 1882, that the return of subsequently paid subscriptions should be stopped. This necessitated the institution of the Guarantee Fund on the 1st January 1883.

(2) The balance of the Guarantee Fund on the 31st March 1913 was Rs. 11,09,372-8-0. Of this sum Rs. 7,82,300 was held in Government Securities, the market value of which on that date was Rs. 7,46,118-10-0.

(3) The Fund, which was started in 1873, was replaced by the Post Office Guarantee Fund in 1883 as explained in paragraph 1. but not for the reasons given in the question. The Guarantee Fund has not become unwieldy nor has any new Fund been opened.

(4) The proceeds of the Fund were originally intended to be applied to the making good, up to a prescribed limit, of losses caused to Government by the neglect or misconduct of any person in the employ of the Post Office and to the cost of keeping the accounts of the Fund. The limits referred to were, at first, Rs. 1,500 in the case of "Superior" servants and Rs. 750 in the case of "Inferior" servants, but these were subsequently increased to Rs. 3,000 and Rs. 1,500 respectively. In view of the prosperous condition of the Fund, it was decided, from time to time, to allow the proceeds to be utilized also for other objects, namely :—

(i) The payment of rewards for furnishing information in Post Office robbery cases, and for specially honest and courageous service on the part of any persons in the employ of the Post Office while in the discharge of their duties.

(ii) The grant of compensation (not exceeding one month's pay) to servants of the Post Office for loss of their private property.

(iii) The payment to certain classes of officials of the Post Office of the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in their journeys to the headquarters of the district in which they are stationed to be examined by the Civil Surgeon for Postal Life Insurance.

(iv) The payment of rewards to the subordinate staff of the Simla-Kalka line (now abolished).

(v) The payment of gratuities in very special circumstances, to the families of deserving Post Office servants left in indigent circumstances by the premature death of the individuals upon whom they depend for their support, and to Post Office officials who are, owing to no fault of their own, physically or mentally incapacitated for further service before they have earned pension. During the current year the sum of Rs. 3,733 has been already sanctioned on this account.

It is not proposed, at present, to utilize the money for purposes other than those mentioned.

(5) It is not known whether a similar Fund exists in any other country.

## APPENDIX III.

LETTER FROM THE DIRECTOR-GENERAL OF POSTS AND TELEGRAPHS TO THE JOINT SECRETARIES,  
ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA, No. 168 P.G., dated Calcutta,  
11th March 1914, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

GENTLEMEN,

WITH reference to the accompanying extracts\* from the Memorandum submitted to the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters of the

Indian Post Office, I have the honour to append for the information of the Commission a copy of Rule 5 of the rules relating to the Post Office Guarantee Fund, which describes the purposes to which the interest of the fund is applied.

2. It will be seen from clause (e) of paragraph II. of the rule that the total amount placed each year at

\* Paragraphs 75,222 and 75,231.

## APPENDIX III. (continued).

my disposal for the purpose mentioned therein has hitherto been limited to 25 per cent. of the surplus of the fund for the preceding year. This limit has now been raised by the Government of India, at my instance, to 75 per cent. of the surplus in question, as will be seen from the copy of the correspondence on the subject which I send herewith. It is anticipated that with this

change the annual unexpended balance of the income of the fund will be reduced to a comparatively small amount. I have thought it right to bring the matter to your notice in case the information might be of use.

I have, &c.,  
W. MAXWELL,  
Director-General.

## ENCLOSURES IN ABOVE.

(i) *Rule 5 of the Post Office Guarantee Fund.*

5. *Purposes to which Fund may be applied.*—This Fund shall be applied in the first place to the purpose of making good any loss that may be caused to Government by the neglect or misconduct of any person in the employ of the Post Office, provided that the sum that may be decreed against the Fund on this account by the Director-General of the Post Office shall not exceed Rs. 3,000 in the case of a superior servant, or Rs. 1,500 in the case of an inferior servant or of a postman or village postman.

## II. The Fund shall then be applied to the purpose—

- (a) of meeting the cost of keeping the accounts of the Fund;
- (b) of paying rewards that may be granted from time to time for the giving of information in Post Office robbery cases and for specially honest and courageous service on the part of any persons in the employ of the Post Office while in discharge of their duties;
- (c) of granting compensation to servants of the Post Office for loss of their private property, subject to the condition that not more than one month's pay may be awarded to any officer;
- (d) of paying, to certain classes of officials of the Post Office, the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in the journey to the headquarters of the district in which they are stationed to be examined by the Civil Surgeon for Postal Life Insurance (*see* rule 2A of the subsidiary rules in Appendix No. 17 of the *Post Office Manual*, Volume V.); and
- (e) of paying gratuities, in very special circumstances, to the families of deserving Post Office servants left in indigent circumstances by the premature death of the individuals upon whom they depend for support and to Post Office officials who are, owing to no fault of their own, physically or mentally incapacitated for further service before they have earned pension, subject to the conditions that in no single case shall the gratuity exceed Rs. 500 and, that the total amount of the gratuity sanctioned in any one year shall not exceed 25 per cent. of the surplus of the Fund of the preceding year.

III. The balance of the Fund, after meeting the aforesaid charges, at the close of the official year may be spent, with the sanction of Government, for the benefit of the persons in the employ of the Post Office who subscribe to it.

(ii) *Copy of a communication from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, To the Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 309, C.F.R., dated 21st January 1914.*

With reference to the correspondence ending with Mr. Rainy's letter No. 9705-265, dated the 23rd October 1908, I have the honour to submit, for the favour of consideration and orders of Government, a proposal to increase the limit of the amount which is placed annually at my disposal out of the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for the grant, in very special circumstances, of compassionate gratuities to deserving postal officials or their families.

2. At present, the amount placed at my disposal each year is limited to a sum equal to 25 per cent. of the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for the

preceding year, and as the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for last year was Rs. 17,471, the sum allotted to me during the current year was Rs. 4,367.

3. In spite of a strict observance of the prescribed conditions, the claims on the allotment for the current year were so numerous that I was obliged to sanction smaller compassionate gratuities than would otherwise have been justifiable. Nevertheless, the allotment for the current year was practically exhausted on the 6th November 1913 by which date the balance available was reduced to Rs. 5. I append a statement marked A giving details of the cases in which gratuities were sanctioned up to that date. Since then, I have received other applications for gratuity, details of which are given in the accompanying statement marked B, which cannot be dealt with at present for want of funds.

4. During the last three years, the average annual surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund amounted to Rs. 19,771 the unexpended balance of that surplus averaging Rs. 16,375 and by the 31st March 1913, the balance of the Fund itself rose to Rs. 11,09,373. The staff of the Post Office on that date consisted of over 92,000\* men and in so large an establishment, it is inevitable that there will always be a considerable number of cases of real hardship caused by the death of the bread-winner of a family for which provision has to be made from the sum placed at my disposal, and I find that the amount is now insufficient to enable me to give assistance in all the really deserving cases.

5. In this connection, I would draw attention to the fact that, in the Memorandum submitted to the Public Services Commission by Superintendents of Post Offices and Postmasters, it has been represented as a grievance that the amount from the Post Office Guarantee Fund which is expended for the benefit of postal officials is disproportionate to the amount of the surplus of that Fund. In my opinion, the relief of distress amongst deserving postal officials or their families is the best object to which the surplus of the Fund could be devoted.

6. I beg, therefore, to ask that Government may be pleased to sanction the limit of the allotment in question being raised from 25 to 75 per cent. of the surplus of the Guarantee Fund for the preceding year, or to 50 per cent. of that surplus, should Government consider that a smaller proportion than 75 per cent. will suffice for the present; and that the increased grant may be allowed for the current year.

(iii) *Letter from G. S. Hardy, Esq., B.A., I.C.S., Officiating Under Secretary to the Government of India, To the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, No. 1001-11-C., Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry (Post Office), Delhi, dated the 20th February 1914.*

In reply to your letter No. 309, C.F.R., dated the 21st January 1914, and in modification of the orders contained in Mr. Rainy's letter No. 9705-265, dated the 23rd October 1908, I am directed to say that the Government of India are pleased to raise, with effect from the current financial year, the limit of the amount which may be expended by you annually out of the Post Office Guarantee Fund on the grant of compassionate gratuities to deserving postal officials or their families, from 25 per cent. to 75 per cent. of the surplus of that Fund for the preceding year.

\* Actually 92,870.



APPENDICES IV. AND V.

APPENDIX IV.

STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the POST OFFICE of INDIA.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).										Muhammadians.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
				Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatriyas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	123	36	18	16	8	9	2	1	4	40	2	5	47	20	2	—
300—400	64	18	8	14	4	4	—	2	1	25	—	4	29	6	3	—
400—500	44	20	4	4	2	4	—	1	2	13	—	4	17	3	—	—
500—600	16	6	7	—	1	1	—	—	1	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
600—700	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	5	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
1,000—1,200	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
3,000—3,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total	277	106	39	35	15	18	2	4	8	82	2	13	97	30	5	—

APPENDIX V.

STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).										Muhammadians.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
				Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatriyas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	474	70	366	9	1	10	1	3	4	28	1	1	30	5	3	—
300—400	78	16	53	3	1	1	—	1	1	7	1	—	8	1	—	—
400—500	24	5	14	3	1	1	—	—	—	5	—	—	5	—	—	—
500—600	9	1	7	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	13	9	—	2	—	—	—	1	—	3	1	—	4	—	—	—
700—800	11	10	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	13	12	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	5	4	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	13	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	13	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
1,400—1,600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total	664	162	441	18	4	13	1	5	5	46	4	1	51	6	4	—

## APPENDICES VI. AND VII.

## APPENDIX VI.

(Referred to in paragraph 75,152—Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.)

## INDIAN TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.—NOTICE REGARDING FUTURE RECRUITMENT.

There are at present no vacancies in the superior establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department, and it is considered unnecessary for the present to recruit any Assistant Superintendents from the United Kingdom.

The arrangements for the future recruitment of the Department, whenever necessary, have not yet been finally settled, but an extract from the Report of the Committee which inquired into the expediency of maintaining the Royal Indian Engineering College at Coopers Hill is appended for general information.

India Office,  
April 1912.

## EXTRACT FROM REPORT ABOVE REFERRED TO.

(Paragraphs 32-34.)

Paragraph 32. *Method of recruiting Engineers.*—First, as to the recruitment of Engineers (for the Public Works Department). Our recommendation is that the Secretary of State should, by advertisements in the public press, call for candidates having the following qualifications:—

- (a) That their age does not exceed 24 years.
- (b) That they have obtained a degree or diploma, or other distinction equivalent thereto, at some recognised and approved institution for engineering education.
- (c) That they have had at least one year's subsequent experience as assistant in the preparation

of the designs for, or in the execution of, some engineering work of importance.

- (d) That they satisfy the usual requirements as to character and nationality.

Selection should be made from the candidates in such way as the Secretary of State may think fit, but we advise that the selection should be entrusted, subject to the final approval of the Secretary of State, to an Advisory Board of which at least one eminent representative of the engineering profession should be invited to become a member. The duty of the Board would be to select the best from amongst the candidates by examining their testimonials and distinctions, by personal interview, and by making such inquiries as to their history and character as might in their opinion be advisable.

Paragraph 33. *Same Method of recruiting for the Telegraph Department.*—The recommendations which have been made in the foregoing paragraph apply equally to the selection of officers for appointment to the Telegraph Department, except that these officers will be required to have spent at least one year as an electrical engineer or in other similar capacity.

Paragraph 34. *Selected Candidates to proceed at once to India.*—Candidates selected for appointment to the Public Works Department and the Telegraph Department should proceed immediately to India without undergoing any further training in this country.

17th August 1903.

सत्यमेव जयते

## APPENDIX VII.

OFFICIALS and NON-OFFICIALS who furnished WRITTEN EVIDENCE to the ROYAL COMMISSION in connection with their INQUIRY into the POST OFFICE OF INDIA and TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT, but who were not orally examined.

1. Munshi Shuja-ud-din Khan, Superintendent of Post Offices, 4th grade, Sind Sagar, near Jhelum.
2. J. A. H. Potter, Esq., 1st grade Sub-Assistant Superintendent, Indian Government Telegraph Department (retired).
3. The Representative Committee of Superintendents of Post Offices, Burma Circle (F. A. V. Sausman, Esq., Chairman, and six Superintendents of Post Offices, being a Representative Committee of Superintendents of Post Offices, Burma Circle).
4. E. A. Doran, Esq., Postmaster-General, Bombay.
5. A. C. Banerjee, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Nagpur Division.
6. Babu Motilal Ghosh, Editor of Amrita Bazar Patrika, Calcutta.
7. Krishan Rao, Esq., and 12 other members of the Signalling Establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department.
8. Nikku Ram, Esq., Officiating Superintendent of Post Offices, Gujrat Division, Punjab.

## INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

## POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.

## A.

**Administrative posts**, Post Office, recruitment, method, *Maxwell*, 75,173; *Schöneman*, 75,336, 75,351.  
**Allowances** (see under Leave and Pay).  
**Amalgamation** of Post Office and Telegraph Department (see under Telegraph Department).  
**Anglo-Indians**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

## B.

**Baniyas and Vaisyas**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - p. 98  
**Brahmans**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98  
**Buddhists**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

## C.

**Captain, D. S., Clerici, C. J. E., and Murtrie, D. J.**, joint evidence - - - 75,569-75,599  
**Charlu, P. A. Krishnama**, evidence of (see *Rodrigues, J. F.*, joint evidence).  
**Civil appointments** on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98  
**Clerici, C. J. E.**, evidence of (see *Captain, D. S.*, joint evidence).  
**Conditions of Service, Post Office:**  
 House accommodation should be provided where necessary, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238; *Hanson*, 75,375.  
 Improvements advocated, *Raha* - - - 75,368  
 Tents should be supplied where necessary and tentage allowed, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226; *Hanson*, 74,375.  
**Conditions of Service, Telegraph Department:**  
 House accommodation, provision advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,278, 75,288, 75,308; *Mitra*, 75,317; *Mayston*, 75,408; *Goodall*, 75,519; *Morgan*, 75,535; *Gibbs*, 75,615.  
 Particulars, *Maxwell*, 75,154; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,272; *Roy*, 75,431.  
 Same for all officers, whether recruited in England or India, advocated, *Mitra*, 75,312; *Morgan*, 75,530.  
 (see also under Upper Subordinate Service.)

## D.

**Deputy Inspectors-General**, pay, scale advocated, *McMinn* - - - 75,217, 75,227  
**Deputy Postmasters-General**, pay, scale advocated, *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Hanson*, 75,367.  
**Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, Recruitment:**  
 System, *Maxwell*, 75,206; *Hanson*, 75,382.  
 System advocated, *McMinn*, 75,248, 75,254; *Mayston*, 75,401.

## E.

**Europeans**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

## F.

**Fines**, should be utilised for benefit of postal officials, *McMinn* - - - 75,222, 75,231  
**Fund** (see Post Office Guarantee Fund and Provident Fund).  
**Furlough** (see under Leave).

## G.

**Gibbs, R. T.**, evidence of - - - 75,600-75,622  
**Goodall, H. C. A.**, evidence of - - - 75,508-75,527  
**Guarantee Fund** (see Post Office Guarantee Fund).

## H.

**Hanson, R. W., Rae, C. D., and Raha, H. K.**, joint evidence - - - 75,367-75,394  
**Hindus**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98  
**House accommodation** (see under Conditions of Service, Telegraph Department, and under Upper Subordinate Service, Telegraph Department).

## I.

**Imperial Service**, Telegraph Department, Division of Department into Provincial Service and (see under Telegraph Department).  
**Indian Christians**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - p. 98  
**Indians:**  
 Limitations in employment in Telegraph Department, *Maxwell*, 75,158; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,276; *Mitra*, 75,316; *Roy*, 75,435; *Morgan*, 75,534.  
 no Limitations in employment in subordinate service of Telegraph Department, *Walker* - - - 75,490  
 no Limitations in employment in Post Office, and none needed, *Maxwell*, 75,149, 75,206; *McMinn*, 75,220; *Schöneman*, 75,332.  
 Telegraph Department not attractive to, *Roy* 75,456-7  
 (see also Recruitment, Telegraph Department.)

## K.

**Kaiyasthas**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98  
**Kshatryas**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

## L.

## Leave, Post Office:

Allowances, increase advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147, *Schöneman*, 75,330, 75,344, 75,351; *Hanson*, 75,388.  
 Cadre not large enough to allow men always to obtain leave to which entitled, *Schöneman* - 75,344  
 Earned, should be granted irrespective of when officer was last on leave, provided he can be spared, *McMinn* - - - 75,218-75,228  
 European service rules to officers drawing Rs. 500 and upwards advocated, *McMinn* - 75,218-75,228  
 Furlough, qualifying period, reduction advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147; *Hanson*, 75,389.

## PRIVILEGE:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147; *McMinn*, 75,218, 75,228.  
 45 days on 10½ months' service:  
 Advocated, *McMinn*, 75,218, 75,228, 75,243; *Vaughan*, 75,262.  
 not Justified, *Hanson* - - - 75,367, 75,379  
 Three years' furlough, leave on medical certificate or on private affairs spent in India should count as service for pension, *McMinn* - 75,218, 75,228

## Leave, Telegraph Department:

Abolition of minimum limit of combined leave advocated, *Mitra* - - - 75,314  
 Allowances inadequate, and increase advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,274, 75,307; *Mitra*, 75,314  
*Shields*, 75,404.

**Leave, Telegraph Department—continued.**

Counting towards pension, should be no difference between periods spent in and out of India, *Mitra* 75,314

Earned, should be granted irrespective of when officer was last on leave, provided he can be spared, *Streatfeild-James* 75,274, 75,286, 75,300

Furlough, commutation of period on half pay to half period on full pay advocated, *Mitra*, 75,314; *Morgan*, 75,541.

Furlough, reduction in qualifying period advocated, *Roy* 75,433

**PRIVILEGE:**

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,274, 75,286, 75,300; *Mitra*, 75,314; *Shields*, 75,404; *Morgan*, 75,532.

Restriction under which officer cannot retire within 3 months of taking, without forfeiting, should be removed, *Streatfeild-James* 75,274, 75,286

Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be granted, *Streatfeild-James* 75,278

Study, advocated, *Roy*, 75,433, 75,446; *Goodall*, 75,511, 75,522, 75,524; *Gibbs*, 75,607.

(see also under Upper Subordinate Service.)

**M.**

*McMinn*, C. H., *Sinclair*, S. C., and *Sri Ram*, joint evidence of 75,213-75,258

*Maxwell*, W., C.I.E., M.V.O., evidence of 75,144-75,212

*Mayston*, H., and *Shields*, J. C., joint evidence of 75,395-75,427

Medical attendance to families, and scale of fees advocated, *Roy* 75,437, 75,449

*Mitra*, P. N., evidence of 75,310-75,325

*Morgan*, J. G., evidence of 75,528-75,549

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 p. 98

*Murtrie*, D. J., evidence of (see *Captain*, D. S., joint evidence).

**P.**

*Parsis*, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 p. 98

**Pay, Post Office:**

Daily, or halting allowance, increase advocated, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238, 75,249-50; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Captain*, 75,575; *Murtrie*, 75,587.

Rates, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Schöneman*, 75,328.

Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,145, 75,175-8, 75,183, 75,211; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,239-42, 75,258; *Schöneman*, 75,328; *Raha*, 75,368; *Hanson*, 75,376, 75,377; *Rae*, 75,376; *Charlu*, 75,556, 75,559, 75,565-8; *Rodrigues*, 75,557, 75,559, 75,566, 75,568; *Captain*, 75,577, 75,579, 75,581; *Murtrie*, 75,578, 75,580

**TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:**

Increase advocated, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Charlu*, 75,555; *Murtrie*, 75,587.

on Transfer, inadequate and increase advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,151, 75,179, 75,191; *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Rodrigues*, 75,555.

(see also under particular appointments, and under Leave Allowances and Superintendents.)

**Pay, Telegraph Department:**

Daily allowance, rule that officers must be absent eight hours before drawing, removal advocated, *Streatfeild-James* 75,278

no Justification for same scale of pay for European-recruited and for Indian-recruited men, *Gibbs* 75,611, 75,617-9

Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,155; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,273, 75,292, 75,294, 75,298-9; *Mitra*, 75,313, 75,320; *Mayston*, 75,401-2; *Shields*, 75,401-2, 75,422; *Roy*, 75,432, 75,443-4, 75,447, 75,452, 75,454; *Morgan*, 75,531, 75,537, 75,543-9; *Goodall*, 75,512-3, 75,608-9.

**Pay, Telegraph Department—continued.**

Temporary service should be allowed to count in seniority, *Shields* 75,426-7

**TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:**

should be Permissible to officers returning from long leave, *Mitra* 75,317

on Transfer, inadequate and increase advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,278, 75,289; *Mitra*, 75,317, 75,321, 75,325; *Shields*, 75,409; *Roy*, 75,460; *Goodall*, 75,520; *Morgan*, 75,535, 75,542.

(see also under Leave Allowances, and under Upper Subordinate Service.)

**Pensions, Post Office:**

Abolition and substitution of system of deferred pay advocated, *Maxwell* 75,148

Commutation of one quarter for lump sum unconditionally advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,148, 75,200, 75,210; *McMinn*, 75,219, 75,229; *Schöneman*, 75,331, 75,346, 75,348, 75,361.

Regulation that period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished, *Maxwell* 75,148, 75,201, 75,229

Scale and qualifying periods advocated, *McMinn*, 75,219, 75,229; *Schöneman*, 75,331, 75,345; *Hanson*, 75,380; *Charlu*, 75,558; *Rodrigues*, 75,558.

**Pensions, Telegraph Department:**

Commutation of one quarter for lump sum unconditionally advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,275, 75,287, 75,290, 75,301; *Mayston*, 75,407; *Shields*, 75,401, 75,423; *Goodall*, 75,518, 75,523; *Gibbs*, 75,616.

Commutation for benefit of families advocated, *Mitra* 75,315, 75,321

Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be granted, *Streatfeild-James* 75,278

Scale and qualifying periods advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,157; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,275, 75,287; *Mitra*, 75,315; *Shields*, 75,405; *Mayston*, 75,406; *Roy*, 75,434, 75,448; *Goodall*, 75,516-7; *Morgan*, 75,533; *Gibbs*, 75,613-4.

(see also under Upper Subordinate Service.)

**Postmaster-General:**

Competition of Telegraph Department with Post Office for appointments, *Hanson*, 75,382; *Gibbs*, 75,622.

Living five months in hills one of the attractions of service, *Maxwell* 75,189

**PAY:**

Revised scale on amalgamation of Telegraph Department and Post Office p. 92

Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Hanson*, 75,367.

Recruitment, method, *Schöneman* 75,351, 75,364

**Postmasters:**

Appointments not popular with Indians, *Maxwell* 75,196

Functions, *Maxwell*, 75,165; *Vaughan*, 75,261.

Leave, special treatment claimed on ground of having to work on Sundays and holidays, *Rae*, 75,379; *Rodrigues*, 75,560; *Captain*, 75,582; *Murtrie*, 75,582.

**PAY:**

Rates, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Schöneman*, 75,343.

Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Vaughan*, 75,260; *Captain*, 75,595.

Preponderance of Anglo-Indians and Europeans in higher grades, *Maxwell* 75,166, 75,171

Probation and Training, system, *Captain* 75,572

Prospects, and higher appointments desired and interchangeability with superintendents advocated, *Vaughan* 75,261, 75,264-6

**RECRUITMENT:**

Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,164; *Vaughan*, 75,260; *Rae*, 75,390; *Raha*, 75,391; *Captain*, 75,570, 75,589.

Method advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,164; *McMinn*, 75,214; *Captain*, 75,570-1, 75,599; *Murtrie*, 75,570, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.

**Post Office :**

- Amalgamation with Telegraph Department (*see under* Telegraph Department).  
 Constitution, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,163  
 Relations with I.C.S. and other Services, *Maxwell*, 75,150; *McMinn*, 75,221, 75,230, 75,246, 75,248; *Schöneman*, 75,333.  
 Service not popular, *Sri Ram* - - - - - 75,257  
 Statement showing growth between 1886-7 and 1912-13 - - - - - p. 19-20  
 Sunday duty, compensation should be given for, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,203

**Post Office Guarantee Fund :**

- Calls on, lessening, *Murtrie*, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.  
 Extract from "Gazette of India" regarding - p. 96  
 Handing of fines over to Committee, advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,205; *Rodrigues*, 75,561.  
 Interest should be utilised for benefit of postal officials, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,222  
 Management, schemes, *Hanson*, 75,393; *Murtrie*, 75,599.

**MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE :**

- Advocated, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,231, 75,247  
 not Advocated, *Vaughan* - - - - - 75,263, 75,267  
 no Great desire for, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,204  
 Objects and history, *Maxwell*, 75,188; *McMinn*, 75,231; *Vaughan*, 75,268; *Captain*, 75,584; *Murtrie*, 75,584.  
 Recovery of money losses should be left to discretion of Director General, *Vaughan* - - - - - 75,264  
 Rules - - - - - p. 97  
 Statement showing transactions, 1912-13 - p. 20

**Probation and Training, Post Office :**

- System, *Maxwell*, 75,145, 75,198; *Schöneman*, 75,327.  
 System advocated, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,215, 75,225  
 (*see also under particular appointments, and under Superintendents.*)

**Probation and Training, Telegraph Department,**

system advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,152, 75,186; *Streafteild-James*, 75,271, 75,283, 75,297; *Mitra*, 75,311; *Roy*, 75,430; *Morgan*, 75,529.  
 (*see also under Upper Subordinate Service.*)

**Provident fund :**

- no Complaint among officers who had to subscribe, *Vaughan* - - - - - 75,263  
 Compulsory for all new entrants, *Hanson* - - - - - 75,381  
 Interest, higher rate advocated, *Roy* - - - - - 75,437  
 Subscription optional, *Schöneman* - - - - - 75,347  
 Subscription compulsory for Europeans, but optional for Indians, *Captain* - - - - - 75,583

**Provincial Service, Telegraph Department :**

- Analogy with Provincial Services of Public Works Department and Railways, *Mitra* - - - - - 75,317  
 Suggested abolition of, and re-organisation of superior staff, *Mitra* - - - - - 75,310, 75,316  
 Division of Department into Imperial Service and (*see under* Telegraph Department).

**R.**

**Rae, C. D.**, evidence of (*see* *Hanson*, *R. W.*, joint evidence).

**Raha, H. K.**, evidence of (*see* *Hanson*, *R. W.*, joint evidence).

**Recruitment, Post Office :**

- Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans not as good class as formerly, *Schöneman* - - - - - 75,352  
 of Indian Civil Service officers, method, *Maxwell* 75,174  
 Indians, proportion larger than formerly, *Raha* 75,392  
 Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144; *Schöneman*, 75,326.  
 System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,197; *McMinn*, 75,214; *Hanson*, 75,367, 75,370, 75,374-5, 75,385; *Raha*, 75,368, 75,370, 75,374, 75,385-6, 75,394; *Murtrie*, 75,574; *Captain*, 75,574, 75,590-1, 75,593.  
 (*see also under particular appointments, and under Superintendents.*)

**Recruitment, Telegraph Department :**

- Method, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,152  
 Notice regarding future recruitment - - - p. 99  
 System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,152, 75,161-2, 75,174, 75,180-2, 75,184-5, 75,207, 75,209, 75,212; *Streafteild-James*, 75,270, 75,281-2, 75,284-5, 75,291, 75,295-6, 75,302-6; *Mitra*, 75,310, 75,319, 75,322-5; *Mayston*, 75,396-7, 75,411, 75,413, 75,418-20; *Shields*, 75,396, 75,398-400, 75,412, 75,414, 75,416, 75,421; *Roy*, 75,429, 75,435, 75,441-2, 75,445, 75,451; *Walker*, 75,504-6; *Goodall*, 75,509-10, 75,521, 75,525; *Morgan*, 75,528, 75,538-40; *Gibbs*, 75,603-6, 75,617, 75,620-1.  
 (*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

**Reorganisation of Superior Staff (*see under* Provincial Service, Telegraph Department).**

**Rodrigues, J. F.**, and **P. A. Krishnama Charlu**, joint evidence - - - - - 75,550-75,563

**Roy, G. P.**, M.I.E.E., evidence of - 75,428-75,464

**S.****Salary (*see* Pay).**

**Schöneman, G. W.**, evidence of - 75,326-75,366

**Shields, J. C.**, evidence of (*see* *Mayston, H.*, joint evidence).

**Sikhs**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - - p. 98

**Sinclair, S. C.**, evidence of (*see* *McMinn, C. H.*, joint evidence).

**Sri Ram**, evidence of (*see* *McMinn, C. H.*, joint evidence).

**Streafteild-James, C.**, M.I.E.E., and **Thomas, I. C.**, M.V.O., M.I.E.E., joint evidence - 75,269-75,309

**Sudras**, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - - p. 98

**Superintendents, Post Office :**

- Functions, *Maxwell*, 75,165, 75,192, 75,208; *Vaughan*, 75,261.

**INTERCHANGEABILITY WITH POSTMASTERS :**

- Advocated, *Rae*, 75,383; *Murtrie*, 75,585-6.  
 not Advocated, *Hanson*, 75,383; *Captain*, 75,585, 75,588, 75,598; *Clerici*, 75,585.  
 Question of, *Rodrigues*, 75,563; *Charlu*, 75,563.  
 no Rule prohibiting, but in practice kept separate, *Captain* - - - - - 75,592

**PAY :**

- Rates, *McMinn*, 75,227; *Schöneman*, 75,328.  
 Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Schöneman*, 75,328, 75,341-2, 75,354, 75,363, 75,366; *Hanson*, 75,367, 75,378; *Raha*, 75,378; *Captain*, 75,595.

**PROBATION AND TRAINING :****All-India list :**

- Advocated, *Sinclair*, 75,235; *Clerici*, 75,573.  
 not Advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,172; *Sri Ram*, 75,253; *Schöneman*, 75,339, 75,360; *Charlu*, 75,553; *Captain*, 75,573.  
 not Important point from Superintendents' point of view, *Hanson* - - - - - 75,373  
 System, *Maxwell*, 75,145; *Schöneman*, 75,327, 75,365; *Hanson*, 75,371.  
 System advocated, *Schöneman*, 75,327, 75,338, 75,349; *Hanson*, 75,371.

**RECRUITMENT :**

- Anglo-Indians, system advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,168; *McMinn*, 75,236, 75,251.

**Indians :**

- Method and proportion, *Maxwell* 75,144, 75,169  
 System advocated, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,214  
 Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,167, 75,170, 75,190, 75,193-4; *McMinn*, 75,234, 75,252; *Schöneman*, 75,326, 75,357-9, 75,362.  
 System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,206; *McMinn*, 75,214, 75,224, 75,234, 75,236-7, *Schöneman*, 75,326, 75,340; *Hanson*, 75,372; *Rodrigues*, 75,551-2, 75,554, 75,564; *Charlu*, 75,551-2, 75,554, 75,562; *Captain*, 75,599; *Murtrie*, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.  
 10 per cent. reserved for non-domiciled Europeans, *Schöneman*, 75,355; *Captain*, 75,597.

**T.****Telegraph Department:****AMALGAMATION WITH POST OFFICE:**

- Accounts and budget allotments, proposal - p. 84  
would not Affect Post Office injuriously, *Hanson* 75,384
- Clerical and menial establishments, proposal, and scheme adopted - p. 84-6, 93-4
- Correspondence relating to scheme - p. 64-95
- Date of effect and provisional arrangements, proposal - p. 86-7
- Designation and headquarters of revised staff, proposals, and scheme adopted - p. 73-4, 94
- Effect - p. 68-9
- Engineering staff and duties, proposals, and scheme adopted - p. 69-72, 91, 92
- Experimental amalgamation in Bombay and Central circles, general opinion - p. 68
- Financial effect of proposals - p. 87
- General features and advantages - p. 69
- Head should be Indian Civil Service officer, *Walker* 75,501, 75,507
- Increase in efficiency doubted, *Shields*, 75,425; *Roy*, 75,429, 75,450.
- Pay and allowances, proposals, and scheme adopted p. 74-9, 93
- Points of difference from experimental arrangements in Bombay and Central circles - p. 69
- Powers, proposal - p. 83-4
- Probable effect on engineering and traffic branches, *Gibbs* - 75,601-2
- Recruitment and training, proposals, and scheme adopted - p. 79-81, 93
- Redistribution of clerical and menial establishments, scheme - p. 93-4
- Reduction of existing staff, proposal, and scheme adopted - p. 82-3, 92-3
- Special additional pensions, proposal, and scheme adopted - p. 83, 94
- Statement showing ultimate cost - p. 87-9
- Statement showing designation of, and other particulars relating to appointments of officers to be employed exclusively on telegraph work p. 95
- Summary of details of proposed organisation, and scheme adopted - p. 64-8, 91-92
- Telegraph Department will lose by, *Roy* 75,458-9, 75,463-4
- Traffic, staff and duties, proposal, and scheme adopted - p. 72-3, 91-2
- Utilisation of existing staff, proposal - p. 81-2
- DIVISION INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL:**
- Abolition advocated, *Mitra*, 75,316; *Morgan*, 75,534.
- Dissatisfaction in Provincial Service, and solution would be to advantage of department, *Walker*, 75,490, 75,500; *Goodall*, 75,514, 75,526
- no Friction in department owing to, but certain amount of discontent among Provincial men, *Shields* - 75,403
- Maintenance advocated, *Streatfeild-James* - 75,276
- Relations with I.C.S. and other services, *Maxwell*, 75,159; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,277; *Goodall*, 75,527.
- Transfers, reduction in number advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,492.

**Thomas, I. C., M.V.O., M.I.E.E.**, evidence of (*see* *Streatfeild-James*, C., M.I.E.E., joint evidence).

**Thurley, J. W.**, evidence of - 75,465-75,481

**Training** (*see* Probation and Training).

**Travelling Allowances** (*see under* Pay.)

**U.****Upper Subordinate Service, Telegraph Department:**

Cadre, divisions and increments, *Walker* - 75,496

**CONDITIONS OF SERVICE:**

Disadvantages, and improvements advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,486.

Exclusion from advancement to Superior Service, hardship of, *Thurley*, 75,467, 75,480; *Walker*, 75,486, 75,497-9, 75,503.

**LEAVE:**

Combined, should be allowed for any period, *Walker* - 75,488

**Privilege:**

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Walker* 75,488

Restriction requiring interval of six months between two periods should be removed, *Thurley* - 75,469

Special conditions of service should ensure special privileges, *Thurley*, 75,469, 75,478; *Walker*, 75,488.

Study, advocated, *Walker* - 75,488

**PAY:**

House rent allowance inadequate, and increase advocated, and should be given in all cases where free quarters are not available, *Thurley*, 75,468; *Walker*, 75,486.

Presidency allowance should be granted to all grades, *Thurley* - 75,468

Rates, *Walker* - 75,487

Scale advocated, *Thurley*, 75,468, 75,474-5, 75,479; *Walker*, 75,487.

Travelling allowance on transfer, increase advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,486.

**PENSIONS:**

Commutation of lump sum for families advocated, *Walker* - 75,489

Scale and qualifying periods advocated, *Thurley*, 75,470; *Walker*, 75,489.

Probation and training, system advocated, *Thurley*, 75,466, 75,476; *Walker*, 75,485, 74,494.

**RECRUITMENT:**

Method, *Shields*, 75,415, 75,424; *Thurley*, 75,465, 75,472; *Walker*, 75,484.

System advocated, *Thurley*, 75,465, 75,473; *Walker*, 75,484, 75,494-5.

Relations with other services, *Walker* - 75,491

**V.**

**Vaughan, N. W.**, evidence of - 75,259-75,268

**W.**

**Walker, R. G.**, evidence of - 75,482-75,507





सत्यमेव जयते